

Date: February 17, 2023

Case No. 230015
Address: 51 Sherman Street

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for work at 51 Sherman Street, a contributing structure located in the Deadwood Historic Overlay Zone in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: KR Deadwood Sherman Street 2020 LLC
Owner:
Constructed: 1894/95/1897/1898-99/1903/1909/1916/1933

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

The Historic District Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Certificate of Appropriateness:

General Factors:

Historic significance of the resource: It is impossible to talk about this block one building at a time. The entire complex was the handiwork of W.E. Adams, mentioned previously with respect to his grocery store on Main Street. In 1894, Adams built the middle 25 feet of what is now the four-story building on this site. It started as a two-story building which housed Adams' grocery store, with its grand opening January 21, 1895. In 1897, Adams decided to build again, and constructed another 25-foot-wide building to the right of his store, three stories tall. At the same time, he added a third story to his first building. Griffith's Red Anvil Hardware Store was the first floor tenant in the new building. DeMouth's Ark occupied that storefront. In 1909, the fourth floors were added to the other two buildings, and they assumed their current appearance.

Adams turned exclusively to wholesale trade in 1901, and his storefront was occupied by Arnold Brother's Grocery Store. Adams continued to do business from the back rooms of his buildings, but required a more visible presence for his offices. In 1903 he built a tall one-story office building to the right of his three four-story buildings. That building has since been remodeled into what appears to be a two-story building. Notice the iron column on the 1903 building. Although it closely resembles the columns on the adjacent building, the flower is turned upside down. This column was manufactured in Deadwood by the Black Hills Foundry to match the other columns, which were manufactured out of state. The turned flower may have been done intentionally to differentiate the work, or to avoid potential problems. A one-story brick building was built to the right in 1916 to house Adams' delivery trucks. The final portion of the building was an extension of the garage built in 1933. The bricks used in those buildings are actually street pavers. How Adams obtained street paving brick is a mystery, but he may have purchased them when the streets were paved in 1907, while he was the city's mayor.

In 1941, Adams' company was purchased by Paxton-Gallagher of Omaha, and in 1949 the company announced that they were withdrawing from business in Deadwood and moving their base of operations to Rapid City. These buildings were sold to the Black Hills Mercantile Co. which had been operating out of the Cudahy Packing Co. Building since 1919 (#82). They constructed the loading dock entrance on the left side of the building in 1951. The upper stories have been occupied as professional offices and residential apartments.

2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations: The Applicant is requesting permission to install light fixtures on the exterior of the building per the attached scope of work.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: Yes

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion: The size, location and variety of electrical lighting fixtures raises concerns to the overall façade and the impact to the historic character.

Historically, these historic buildings were not washed with artificial lighting. Staff is still concerned with impact to residents and the eventual impact on the night skies. The proposed lighting system has both up lighting and downlighting along with being RGB led allowing the changing of colors. Downlighting and a soft white would be preferred. Staff is concerned with the overall effect of lighting that has been allowed to be installed on the historic buildings and cumulative effect on the site and setting of the district along with the light pollution to other parts of our residential areas above the commercial district.

With this, it is staff's opinion, as submitted, the size and variety of colored lighting options does encroach upon the historic resource and will have an adverse effect on the character of the building at night; additionally, it continues to add to the cumulative adverse effect on the historic character of the local historic district, the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District as well as the continued effect on light pollution.

An option for the applicant to consider is resubmitting downlighting only in front of the building with a soft white light that limits illumination to the building only. The rear of the building could have lights near the doors and the side of the building should only be lit in the area of the proposed and approved outdoor patio rather than the entire side of the building.

Motions available for commission action:

A: Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to grant Certification of Appropriateness.

OR

B: Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to deny Certification of Appropriateness.