

Case No. 210178

Address: 51 Sherman Street

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for work at 51, 53 and 55 Sherman Street a contributing structure located in the South Deadwood Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Keating Resources

Owner: Same

Constructed: 1894/95/1897/1898-99/1903/1909/1916/1933

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

The Historic District Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Project Approval:

General Factors:

- 1. Historic significance of the resource:** It is impossible to talk about this block one building at a time. The entire complex was the handiwork of W.E. Adams, mentioned previously with respect to his grocery store on Main Street. In 1894, Adams built the middle 25 feet of what is now the four-story building on this site. It started as a two-story building which housed Adams' grocery store, with its grand opening January 21, 1895. In 1897, Adams decided to build again, and constructed another 25-foot-wide building to the right of his store, three stories tall. At the same time, he added a third story to his first building. Griffith's Red Anvil Hardware Store was the first-floor tenant in the new building. DeMouth's Ark occupied that storefront. In 1909, the fourth floors were added to the other two buildings, and they assumed their current appearance.

Adams turned exclusively to wholesale trade in 1901, and his storefront was occupied by Arnold Brother's Grocery Store. Adams continued to do business from the back rooms of his buildings but required a more visible presence for his offices. In 1903 he built a tall one-story office building to the right of his three four-story buildings. That building has since been remodeled into what appears to be a two-story building. Notice the iron column on the 1903 building. Although it closely resembles the columns on the adjacent building, the flower is turned upside down. This column was manufactured in Deadwood by the Black Hills Foundry to match the other columns, which were manufactured out of state. The turned flower may have been done intentionally to differentiate the work, or to avoid potential problems. A one-story brick building was built to the right in 1916 to house Adams' delivery trucks. The final portion of the building was an extension of the garage built in 1933. The bricks used in those buildings are actually street pavers. How Adams obtained street paving brick is a mystery, but he may have purchased them when the streets were paved in 1907, while he was the city's mayor.

In 1941, Adams' company was purchased by Paxton-Gallagher of Omaha, and in 1949 the company announced that they were withdrawing from business in Deadwood and moving their base of operations to Rapid City. These buildings were sold to the Black Hills Mercantile Co. which had been operating out of the

Cudahy Packing Co. Building since 1919 (#82). They constructed the loading dock entrance on the left side of the building in 1951. The upper stories have been occupied as professional offices and residential apartments.

2. **Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:** The applicant requests permission to replace all double hung window sashes and glass in the building windows. All of the original historical frames and trim will remain and be repaired where necessary. New wood single hung Pella windows will be installed within the existing frames. Supplemental information has been provided from Chamberlin Architects and Pella Windows.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: Yes

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion: The applicant submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for the August 11, 2021, meeting which was denied by the Historic District Commission. The applicant has resubmitted an application to replace the windows with better explanation as to what they would like to do to the windows. A site visit is scheduled to be performed on September 20, 2021, with staff and the Historic Preservation Commission to review a temporary window that has been installed as an example of what the applicant wishes to do to all the windows.

Staff will reserve an opinion on the project based on the evidence submitted and the rules, regulations and guidelines adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission until after the site visit on Monday, September 20, 2021.



Motions available for commission action:

Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to grant Certification of Appropriateness.

OR

Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to deny Certification of Appropriateness.