

Case No. 230046

Address: 732 Main Street - Garage

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for work at 732 Main Street, a non-contributing structure located in the Deadwood City Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Joel Livengood

Owner: Villagood Properties LLC

Constructed: 1970s

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

The Historic District Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Certificate of Appropriateness:

General Factors:

- 1. Historic significance of the resource:** This structure currently does not qualify for the historic register.
- 2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:** The applicant is requesting permission to mimic the garage façade to replicate a structure that once stood in the same location. Currently it is a garage built in the 1970's. The plan is to use the salvaged 1" wood sheathing planks that were original to the main house adjacent to the garage.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: yes

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion: While there is photographic evidence of a false front structure at this location or near this site, as proposed, the false front façade does not truly mimic the previous building(s) due to the single door or entrance and without additional fenestration. It appears the previous structure had much more of a transparent store front.

Furthermore, since this garage is outside the period of significance it has no historical context and is an intrusion to the fabric of the district. Creating a false front façade may be appropriate if it more closely matches earlier structures within the area of this project as shown in the photographic documentation provided in the application.

The proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource but as proposed would have an adverse effect on the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District by recreating a false sense of history and not meeting the intended standards of the district.

Staff would recommend denying the application as submitted and have the applicant present a proposed design which follows the guidelines and standards set forth by the commission.

Motions available for commission action:

A: Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to grant Certification of Appropriateness.

OR

B: Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to deny Certification of Appropriateness.