

Date: May 18, 2023

Case No. 230047
Address: 874 Main

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for work at 874 Main, a contributing structure located in the Upper Main Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Dale Berg
Owner: BERG, DALE N & SUSAN R
Constructed: c 1935

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A PROJECT APPROVAL

The Historic Preservation Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Project Approval:

General Factors:

1. Historic significance of the resource:

This area of the National Historic Landmark District does not show up in the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. This is a contributing structure built circa 1935 as the garage for the residence across the street at 872 Main.

2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:

The applicant is requesting permission to demolish the current garage. The structure does not match the historic house across the street. The current garage has dry rot in the rafters, it is off the foundation, the doors and windows are broken and/or missing. Currently no vehicles can be parked in it. The applicant would like to construct a new garage in its place. The design would match the applicant's Victorian home across the street by design and color. The siding will be five-inch reveal cedar siding and painted same color as the house. Plans are to also install a small garage door at the rear of the structure to accommodate a side by side.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: Yes

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion:

In June of 2021, the applicant submitted a project approval to sell, remove or demolish this particular garage. After the HP Commission conducted a site visit and made recommendations, the applicant withdrew the application. The applicant is now submitting a new project approval to demolish the garage and construct a new garage which accommodates today's uses and vehicles. A similar design garage was constructed by the Gibbs at 850 Main Street.

The proposed garage attached to the application is compatible to the historic district with appropriate siding, windows, and roof lines. The proposed height could be much greater than the neighboring garage at 21 to 22 feet to the ridge. While this fits within the zoning regulations for height it may appear larger than the existing garage by 8 feet and the neighboring garages in this area. This should be verified prior to any action to determine the impact to the site and setting of this part of the historic districts.

The proposed work and changes does destroy a historic resource and will have an adverse effect on the character of the building and may also have an adverse effect on the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.

Motions available for commission action:

A: If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project DOES NOT Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:

Based upon all the evidence presented, I find that this project **DOES NOT** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval.

If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project will Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:

B: First Motion:

Based upon all the evidence presented, I move to make a finding that this project **DOES** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places. [If this, move on to 2nd Motion and choose an option.]

C: Second Motion:

Option 1: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **NOT ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.

OR

Option 2: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **DENY** the project as presented.

OR

Option 3: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood, but the applicant has explored **ALL REASONABLE AND PRUDENT ALTERNATIVES**, and so I move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.