

Case No. 210126

Address: 51 Sherman Street

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for work at 51 Sherman Street a contributing structure located in the South Deadwood Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Keating Resources

Owner: Same

Constructed: 1894/95/1897/1898-99/1903/1909/1916/1933

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A PROJECT APPROVAL

The Historic Preservation Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Project Approval:

General Factors:

- 1. Historic significance of the resource:** It is impossible to talk about this block one building at a time. The entire complex was the handiwork of W.E. Adams, mentioned previously with respect to his grocery store on Main Street. In 1894, Adams built the middle 25 feet of what is now the four-story building on this site. It started as a two-story building which housed Adams' grocery store, with its grand opening January 21, 1895. In 1897, Adams decided to build again, and constructed another 25-foot-wide building to the right of his store, three stories tall. At the same time, he added a third story to his first building. Griffith's Red Anvil Hardware Store was the first floor tenant in the new building. DeMouth's Ark occupied that storefront. In 1909, the fourth floors were added to the other two buildings, and they assumed their current appearance.

Adams turned exclusively to wholesale trade in 1901, and his storefront was occupied by Arnold Brother's Grocery Store. Adams continued to do business from the back rooms of his buildings, but required a more visible presence for his offices. In 1903 he built a tall one-story office building to the right of his three four-story buildings. That building has since been remodeled into what appears to be a two-story building. Notice the iron column on the 1903 building.

Although it closely resembles the columns on the adjacent building, the flower is turned upside down. This column was manufactured in Deadwood by the Black Hills Foundry to match the other columns, which were manufactured out of state. The turned flower may have been done intentionally to differentiate the work, or to avoid potential problems. A one-story brick building was built to the right in 1916 to house Adams' delivery trucks. The final portion of the building was an extension of the garage built in 1933. The bricks used in those buildings are actually street pavers. How Adams obtained street paving brick is a mystery, but he may have purchased them when the streets were paved in 1907, while he was the city's mayor.

In 1941, Adams' company was purchased by Paxton-Gallagher of Omaha, and in 1949 the company announced that they were withdrawing from business in Deadwood and moving their base of operations to Rapid City. These buildings were sold to the Black Hills Mercantile Co. which had been operating out of the

Cudahy Packing Co. Building since 1919 (#82). They constructed the loading dock entrance on the left side of the building in 1951. The upper stories have been occupied as professional offices and residential apartments.

2. **Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:** The applicant requests permission to replace all double hung windows. The existing historical frames will remain and be repaired as necessary. New wood single hung windows will be installed within the existing frames.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: No

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion: On August 5, 2021, staff participated in an on-site consultation with the State Historic Preservation Office to conduct a window conditions analysis. Based on the site visit, it was mutually agreed upon by staff and SHPO that the existing windows were not beyond repair and could be restored and preserved.

It was further explained to the applicant the proposed work would jeopardize their desire to receive the Federal Rehabilitation Tax Credit, the State Property Tax Moratorium, and the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission's Façade Easement program. The SHPO strongly believed the proposed work would not be certified by the National Park Service for the programs and therefore would not meet the standards for the easement or moratorium.

Staff's opinion is based on the review of the proposed project with the following Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Under the review of these standards, it is staff's opinion the proposed replacement of the windows would damage and destroy the historic fabric of the resource and would have an adverse effect to the building and could be an adverse effect to the National Historic Landmark District.



Motions available for commission action:

Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to grant Certification of Appropriateness.

OR

Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to deny Certification of Appropriateness.