

CITY OF COOPER CITY CITY COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Tuesday, September 17, 2024 at 6:30 PM City Hall Auditorium | 9090 SW 50th Place

MINUTES

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Ross opened the meeting at 6:30 PM and led the assembly in the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Present were Commissioners Mallozzi, Katzman, Shrouder, Green and Mayor Ross.

DECORUM - Jacob Horowitz, City Attorney

City Attorney Horowitz read the decorum policy as follows: Members of the Commission, staff members, citizens, and others are required to use civil and appropriate language when addressing the Commission or anyone present at the meeting and must refrain from using profanity, cursing, or exhibiting aggressive or threatening behavior. All comments should generally be directed to the presiding officer and not to individual members of the Commission, staff, or the audience. No personal verbal attacks toward any individual by either the Commission, staff, citizens, or others shall be allowed during any meeting of the Commission. Any persons making impertinent or slanderous remarks or personal attacks or who becomes boisterous while addressing the Commission or who otherwise violates the decorum rules set forth herein shall be barred from further audience before the Commission by the Mayor, or by request of any member of the Commission unless permission to continue or again address the Commission be granted by a majority vote of the Commission members present.

CHANGES TO AGENDA/EMERGENCY MATTERS

No changes or emergency matters.

PROCLAMATIONS/PRESENTATIONS

1. Property Values - Broward County Property Appraiser

Broward County Property Appraiser Marty Kiar thanked the City Commission and Mayor Ross for his 12 years of service to the City. Mr. Kiar thanked City staff for their assistance with new properties. Mr. Kiar explained his office determines the value of every piece of property in Broward County for tax purposes, whether it's residential, commercial, tangible, personal property, or essentially assessed property such as railroads. The reason that process is important is when people pay their property taxes, the amount of taxes they pay is a relationship between the value of the property that we set and the tax rate set by the City, the County Commission, the School Board, and all other taxing authorities. He encouraged the residents to visit bcpa.net, click on your trim notice and if you have any concern with the value of that property, or you're not getting every tax saving exemption you're entitled too to call his office by September 18, 2024. He also spoke on the importance of exemptions including the homestead exemption. He advised in 2023 the taxable value for Cooper City was right about \$4.02 billion dollars. This year there has been a 9.22% increase in taxable value, which is actually higher than the average of the County, and it comes to about \$4.4 billion dollars. This year there has been about \$75.4 million dollars of new construction added to the tax roll the biggest being Bright Star Credit

Union. There are 9,161 homestead exceptions in Cooper City and 263 low income seniors who get a very important senior tax break with 25 long-term seniors who pay no property taxes to Cooper City. We have 640 widows and widowers who receive an exception and 259 veteran exceptions. The average sale price of a Cooper City home is \$843,263 and the median is \$745,000. The average tax value of a single family home in the City is \$334,000. The median sale price for condominiums in the City is about \$228,000 with a medium tax value of \$112,000. He also spoke on title fraud as South Florida is the title fraud capital of the world. Three years a program was started called Owner Alert he encouraged all residents to visit bcpa.net to sign up. He spoke on successful prosecution of criminals committing title fraud. He also spoke on some cases that were prosecuted for fraudulent activity.

Commissioner Mallozzi asked what a quiet title is. Mr. Kiar answered it is when a lawsuit is filed to clear a title.

Mr. Kiar thanked Commissioner Green for his service to Cooper City and the federal government.

2. Pet Adoption - Commissioner Mallozzi (Heard at the Special Recognition Meeting)

Commissioner Mallozzi advised Bentley a 1-year-old dog is available for adoption by contacting the Humane Society of Broward County at www.humanebroward.com or 954-989-3977 Ext 6

PUBLIC SPEAKING

Open Public Meeting/Agenda Concerns –

Gladys Aguero, spoke on the increase in the water rates and the high rates at which the City is proposing to pay the elected officials insurance.

Susana Neville, spoke on Ordinance 24-21 and 24-22 and some benefits not being specified. She also asked what prior elected officials receive lifetime benefits and why some are included and others are not.

Mayor Ross read the list of officials that receive the lifetime benefits as follows: James Curran, Suellen Fardelmann, Chris Fardelmann, Dennis Eisenger, Debbie Eisinger, Scott Kleiman, Lisa Mallozzi, Angelica Palank-Charlotte, Philip Charlotte, Janet Sims, John Sims, Barry Warsch, Patti Webster and Robert Webster.

Christina Portice, asked the City to participate in the Epilepsy Alliance, Florida's Epilepsy Awareness Month in November.

Luis Martinez, the Community Resource Specialist for Epilepsy Alliance, Florida spoke on the importance of training for seizures in schools and daycares. He asked the City of Cooper City to help support the cause and help bring awareness to epilepsy.

Mayor Ross and Commissioner Mallozzi asked that a proclamation be placed on a future agenda raising awareness for epilepsy.

Carol Bilotti, spoke on her concerns of the timing of the FRS insurance coverage for elected officials. She wants the Mayoral race to be decided by the voters.

Fernando Nunez, spoke on a Special Olympic Event being held at Nova University on Saturday, September 21, 2024.

CONSENT AGENDA

Minutes

- 3. August 20, 2024 Strategic Communications Workshop Minutes
- 4. August 27, 2024 Commission Meeting Minutes

Resolutions

5. **Resolution 24-19 (Utilities/Finance)**

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF COOPER CITY, FLORIDA, AMENDING SCHEDULE (A), SCHEDULE (B), AND SCHEDULE (D) OF ORDINANCE NO. 85-10-1, AS AMENDED, RELATING TO MONTHLY WATER RATES, MONTHLY WASTEWATER RATES, AND WATER AND WASTEWATER MISCELLANEOUS CHARGES WITHIN THE CITY; PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE

6. Resolution 24-34 (Utilities)

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF COOPER CITY, FLORIDA, APPROVING AND AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTION OF WATER AND SEWER AGREEMENT WITH JAMAL LOPEZ, JAREL LOPEZ, MICHELLE LOPEZ, AND ANA PENA FOR 2.5 WATER ERC'S AT A TOTAL COST OF \$4,057.05, ATTACHED HERETO AS EXHIBIT "A" AND INCORPORATED HEREIN; AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS TO TAKE ANY AND ALL ACTIONS NECESSARY TO EFFECTUATE THE INTENT OF THIS RESOLUTION; PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

7. Resolution 24-35 (Utilities)

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF COOPER CITY, FLORIDA, APPROVING AND AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTION OF WATER AND SEWER DEVELOPER'S AGREEMENT WITH JAREL LOPEZ, JAMEL LOPEZ, MICHELLE LOPEZ AND ANA PENA FOR 2.5 WATER ERCs AT A TOTAL COST OF \$4,057.05, ATTACHED HERETO AS EXHIBIT "A" AND INCORPORATED HEREIN; AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS TO TAKE ANY AND ALL ACTIONS NECESSARY TO EFFECTUATE THE INTENT OF THIS RESOLUTION; PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

Motion to Approve

- 8. Motion to approve an amendment via change order to P.O. 2024-8655 of the Agreement with Witt O'Briens LLC for managing Federal Assistance Programs. **Finance**
- 9. Motion to approve and authorize VC3 to upgrade four (4) critical network servers. Finance
- 10. Motion to approve two new camera sites on Stirling/Palm Avenue & Stirling/Embassy Drive **BSO**
- 11. Motion to approve the First Amendment to the Agreement with RSC Insurance Brokerage, Inc. (Including its division Gehring Group) D/B/A Risk Strategies Company for insurance brokerage services. Human Resources

- 12. Motion to approve a Piggyback Agreement for the Purchase of Procurement Software from CARAHSOFT TECHNOLOGY CORPORATION **Finance**
- 13. Motion to approve and authorize a contract with Advanced Data Solutions, Inc. for Records Scanning, Indexing, and Disposition Services. **Community Development**
- Motion to approve and authorize a contract with Chen Moore and Associates (CMA) for Consulting Landscape Architect/Arborist Services in the Community Development Department. – Community Development

Commissioners Shrouder and Mallozzi pulled item 14.

MOTION: Commissioner Green moved to approve the consent with the exception of item 14. Commissioner Katzman seconded the motion which prevailed by a unanimous roll call vote. (5-0)

14. Motion to approve and authorize a contract with Chen Moore and Associates (CMA) for Consulting Landscape Architect/Arborist Services in the Community Development Department. – Community Development

Commissioner Shrouder stated the prices listed in the contract are very high and there is an individual who works with neighboring municipalities that we should contact to see if the prices can be brought down.

City Manager Rey has not been able to contact the individual as of yet. He asked for the Commission's support in approving a small amount of funds as the service is needed.

Commissioner Mallozzi would like to higher an arborist and not use a consultant. An in-house employee will care more about the City's needs.

City Manager Rey explained the consultant will assist in plan reviews and he his plan is to have our current Tree Crew Leader certified as an arborist. He explained the trees need trimmed before a storm hits the City.

Commissioner Mallozzi said the City's previous Arborist did both plan reviews and worked in the field.

MOTION: Commissioner Shrouder moved to approve up to \$5,000 dollars to be spent on the consultant firm for Landscape Architect/Arborist Services. Commissioner Green seconded the motion which prevailed by a unanimous roll call vote. (5-0)

REGULAR AGENDA

15. Discussion regarding Killarney Town Twinning and Sister City's Association – Mayor Ross

Mayor Ross advised the City previously had a sign in the City indicating our sisterhood with the Town of Killarney. The sign is currently missing. The Town of Killarney contacted him asking if the City would like to continue the Sister City program with them.

Commissioner Shrouder said the sign may be hidden by overgrown trees as another sign on Griffin Road is not visible.

Conesus was reached to continue the Sister City Program with the Town of Killarney.

16. Discussion and possible action to reconsider Resolution 24-27, specifically Policy 02-008 – Paid Holidays and Policy 02-009 – Sick Leave – Commissioner Green

Commissioner Green advised at the last Commission meeting of August 27th the Commission voted to turn the holidays of Columbus Day, Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve to PTO days. The City's Employee Advisory Committee put forth a recommendation to keep the City Hall closed on those days. Additionally, employees are concerned with talks of converting sick days to PTO days and not having the days roll over. A number of staff have voiced concerns with that conversion. He spoke on an employee who was honored at the Special Recognition Meeting as her son is courageously fighting cancer and sick days are needed in that instance. Commissioner Green advised he spoke to City Manager Rey who told him this change has not been passed as of yet but he would like that information to be said on the record.

City Manager Rey advised the sick leave conversion component is being discussed by the Employee Advisory Committee and we are awaiting their recommendation. There has been no change to the sick days converting to PTO time.

Commissioner Green asked for his colleagues support in reconsidering the three holidays of Columbus Day, Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve that were converted to PTO days. City Manager Rey advised he has no objection to returning to the previous holiday schedule. He wanted to give the employees the choice of either taking those days off or working on those days and possibility leaving the city open for certain services. He said he assured employees that if they wanted to take one of those holidays off that department can close.

Commissioner Shrouder would like to keep the three floating holidays and see if the change works. If all employees want Christmas Eve off the City Manager can recommend to close.

Commissioner Katzman said what he liked about the proposal is that City Hall and services would be open for residents who need services. In speaking with the City Manager the one holiday that was of main concern was Christmas Eve so he proposed to close City Facilities on Christmas Eve and make the other two days floating holidays. He does not believe the City should be closed on Columbus Day. He wants to offer services to the residents but also wants to make the employees happy and he is looking for a compromise.

Commissioner Mallozzi would compromise closing City Hall on Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve and opening on Columbus Day with a PTO day given in exchange. Employees have families and they want to align the days off with their children's schedules. She spoke on her family visiting during Rosh Hashanah as that holiday is a closure day where her family is from. If the City Hall is open on Christmas Eve it places employees in a bad situation where they all want the day off and then management must pick and choose.

Commissioner Shrouder said the City provides more holidays than the County.

Commissioner Mallozzi would like to keep the City Hall closed on Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve.

Mayor Ross said what is not being considered is when the holidays fall on the weekend the PTO time is a win. He advised he celebrates the Jewish holidays so he would elect to work on Christmas.

Commissioner Shrouder said if the City Manager receives a lot of requests for Christmas Eve off the City can then reconsider.

Commissioner Green said the Employee Advisory Committee recommendation was to continue closing the City Hall on Columbus Day, Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve. He supports the committee's request. He looks at this as an opportunity to build up the staff.

Mayor Ross has no issue with Commissioner Katzman's proposal or trying the proposal of the change to PTO days.

MOTION: Commissioner Green moved to reconsider Resolution 24-27, specifically Policy 02-008 – Paid Holidays. Commissioner Mallozzi seconded the motion which failed by the following roll call vote. (4-1)

YES: Commissioners Mallozzi, Katzman, Green and Mayor Ross

NO: Commissioner Shrouder

Commissioner Green made a motion to return in terms of paid holidays to Columbus Day, Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve. Commissioner Mallozzi seconded the motion.

Commissioner Mallozzi asked what happens to a department that have only one or two staff members and they both request off a holiday. City Manager Rey said they will close that department.

Commissioner Katzman said they all want to show appreciation for the employees it is just finding different ways. He personally would want more flexibility, but he understands, and respects the voice of the committee. He proposed a friendly amendment to close the City on Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve and make Columbus Day a personal floating holiday.

Commissioner Shrouder believes this is a reaction to change because the three days of PTO can be used to take off the same holidays as before.

Commissioner Green did not accept the friendly amendment.

MOTION: Commissioner Green moved to return in terms of paid holidays to Columbus Day, Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve. Commissioner Mallozzi seconded the motion which failed by the following roll call vote. (3-2)

- YES: Commissioners Mallozzi and Green
- NO: Commissioner Katzman, Shrouder and Mayor Ross

Commissioner Katzman made a motion to close the City on Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve and make Columbus Day a personal floating holiday. Commissioner Mallozzi seconded the motion.

Commissioner Green clarified that staff will receive a PTO day in lieu of having the City closed on Columbus Day.

MOTION: Commissioner Katzman moved to close the City on Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve and make Columbus Day a personal floating holiday. Commissioner Green seconded the motion which prevailed by the following roll call vote. (4-1)

YES: Commissioners Mallozzi, Katzman, Green and Mayor Ross

NO: Commissioner Shrouder

ORDINANCES ON FIRST HEARING (Public Hearing)

17. Ordinance 24-22 (Commission)

City Attorney Horowitz read "AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF COOPER CITY, FLORIDA RATIFYING AND CONFIRMING A RETIREMENT HEALTH INSURANCE BENEFIT FOR CERTAIN FORMER MEMBERS OF THE CITY COMMISSION; CONFIRMING A RETIREMENT HEALTH INSURANCE BENEFIT FOR CURRENT AND FUTURE MEMBERS OF THE CITY COMMISSION; PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE" by title.

City Attorney Horowitz advised at the last commission meeting he was provided with direction to bring back an ordinance ratifying the retirement health insurance benefit for the City's former and several current elected officials who receive a retirement benefit plan under the City's former personnel manual. That personnel manual goes back to at least as early as 1999 maybe prior. The ordinance before them this evening ratifies that benefit, pursuant to the charter, which was amended in 2002 requiring an ordinance. The other component of the ordinance which the Commission directed was to provide somewhat of a shell or a framework for a future benefit for current and future members of the Commission as drafted. This ordinance does provide a benefit essentially undoing the Commission's intent to withdraw that benefit in 2012, due to some procedural issues which we've discussed and reinstating the benefit, although the ultimate policy, as it relates to the current and future members of the Commission is within their discretion.

Mayor Ross asked for a brief history on the changes.

Commissioner Shrouder provided a brief history on the item. He explained the benefit of the elected officials receiving lifetime benefits was added to a 95 page personnel manual. However, in 2002 a charter amendment was passed requiring all elected official benefits be passed by ordinance. No ordinance was ever passed. So by practice we have former commissioners, before Mayor Ross that receive insurance for life. When trying to track the details it is all done in a personnel manual. When it came to his attention that none of these benefits were done by ordinance he brought it forth to be corrected. The Commission asked City Attorney Horowitz to bring forth an ordinance template to discuss the item. In 2012 the then Commission stopped the lifetime benefits for all future elected officials even though at the time some

elected officials on the dais were not vested as was a requirement to receive the lifetime benefits. City Attorney Horowitz gave the legal advice to not cut the benefit as it may lead to legal ramifications. He explained he pays a portion of the health benefits him and his family receives but some of his colleagues pay zero. As it stands currently himself, Mayor Ross and Commissioner Katzman are not entitled to lifetime benefits but everyone before Mayor Ross would be.

Commissioner Green said this benefit had been in place since 1999. Commissioner Green said the change to the Charter was done in 2002. He asked City Attorney Horowitz in his opinion was everything done properly prior to 2002. City Attorney Horowitz stated prior to 2002 an ordinance was not required. He advised the criteria for the lifetime benefits was for an elected officials to serve three, four year terms. When he voted in 2010 he voted to end the lifetime benefits.

Mayor Ross said however, Commissioner Green voted to keep the benefits for himself.

Commissioner Green said the benefit had been in place since 1999. He also stated he has never taken the City's health insurance since 2010. He receives a stipend in an effort to save the City money. He voted in 2010 to close the benefit to help the City financially. When he voted in 2010 he did not know if he would be reelected to two more terms to receive the benefit.

Commissioner Shrouder said the requirement of being vested was not applicable to the members in 2012. He said if this benefit was still in place and he served three terms the City would be paying his insurance and he would only be 44 years old.

Commissioner Green said a requirement was that the individual had to be 50.

City Attorney Horowitz said part of the challenge in this equation is that the Personnel Manual was amended in 1999, 2001, 2006, 2008, 2010, 2012 and subsequently after that, but for operative purposes, of discussion the language in each of those manuals is not always identical. Commissioner Shrouder is correct in that the 1999 manual references, payment of 50% for those elected officials who had not reached the age of 50. He stated the 50% language was deleted in subsequent versions. He also stated the criteria is elected to three terms and reach the age of 50 years old.

Commissioner Shrouder said there are inconsistent matters going on such as some Commissioners paying more than others and one Commissioners family is being covered when it states only spouses should be covered. The item of Commission benefits came up when the new CFO came on and told him that he owed money for his insurance. He then told the CFO he donates his portion to the City's nonprofit and does not take a salary. When he started looking for the benefits he found that coverages should be paid for. When the item came up he called former Commissioner Curran and told him there could be an aspect that could impact him and he should look into an opinion.

Commissioner Katzman said he asked for the amounts the City has paid for insurance for elected officials and the amounts so far total \$1.5 million dollars. He read the following names and amounts: Suellen Fardelmann \$366,000, John Sims \$290,000 Lisa Mallozzi \$192,000, James Curran \$297,000, Jeff Green \$87,000, Greg Ross \$146,000.

Commissioner Green asked what the amounts are. Commissioner Katzman said the amount the City has paid towards benefits.

Commissioner Katzman continued, Howard Meltzer \$24, Max Pulcini \$24,000, Jeremy Katzman, \$6,400, Ryan Shrouder \$66,000. That totals \$1.478 million dollars not including the benefits for other previous elected officials.

Commissioner Green said there are two separate lists and inaccuracies.

Commissioner Katzman said according to City staff these numbers are accurate and his point is that lifetime benefits need to stop. He is not looking to cut benefits for individuals who are already vested but these lifetime benefits and costs need to end.

Mayor Ross said in 2012 the elected officials closed the lifetime benefit to everyone after them. What concerns him is the matter in which it was done. He has no difficulty in stopping the lifetime benefits in total. City Attorney Horowitz advised taking away benefits invites litigation and there is a case similar to this in Dade County pending. He believes if you're not working for the City you should not receive benefits but he also does not want the City to be open to litigation. He is open to both options.

Commissioner Shrouder said there were different requirements listed in each manual. He does not think elected officials have the same rights as employees. He does not believe they should take the benefits away from those in 2012 who were vested and elected three terms.

Commissioner Green asked how Commissioner Shrouder's comments affect the Commissioners that came in when the benefit was active. City Attorney Horowitz said it is his understanding that it has been the City's practice, that every member of the Commission who was in office prior to 2012, irrespective of whether they had met all of the criteria under the policy at the time if they were in office prior to 2012, was entitled at that time to the benefit of the retirement health insurance package.

Commissioner Shrouder said he has no issue with keeping the benefits for anyone who was vested ending with Mayor Eisenger. He is open to discussion for everyone else.

Commissioner Green said when you are employed by any company and there are benefits in place and you reach the requirement to receive those benefits the company cannot simply take them away.

Commissioner Mallozzi said at the last meeting Commissioner Shrouder said he would not take away the benefit from his friend Debbie. Also, her husband and Scott Kleiman had paperwork ready to file the next day if the benefit was removed. Commissioner Shrouder said while he respects both of them he believes they are wrong and the City would win in litigation. City Attorney Horowitz said there is a matter similar to this being litigated in Miami Dade.

Commissioner Mallozzi said when the matter was voted on in 2012 and there was a mayoral race going on. There was no idea who would be Mayor and it would exclude Mayor Ross.

Mayor Ross said Commissioner Mallozzi could have excluded herself from the lifetime beenfits but did not.

Commissioner Green said when they voted to close the benefits he did not know Mayor Ross would win and he supported him at the time. He does not believe the City would prevail if they try and take a benefit away that was given legally before 2002. The requirement of being elected three terms and being 50 years old has been include in all personnel manuals. For the past 14 years he has always said they need to be fair and equitable to everyone. He believes there should be an opportunity for those who were elected after 2012 to have the benefits with a caveat that they must pay a premium. He believes the individual should be able to take insurance and the City should pay a portion.

Commissioner Shrouder read from the manual as following; I understand that nothing contained in the manual may be construed as creating a promise of future benefits or a binding contract with the city of Cooper City for benefits or for any other purpose. He does not believe the benefits are legal.

Mayor Ross has no difficulty either way. If they are going to ratify the life benefits for the past officials they need to ratify it for all.

Commissioner Shrouder said his opinion is to vest everyone who was vested by 2012 and get the costs for the remainder of the individuals. Those individuals are also on Medicare.

Mayor Ross said they also need to discuss current and future elected officials as well.

Commissioner Katzman said he does not want to give future Commissions lifetime benefits. He is open to discuss individuals who were not vested in 2012.

Commissioner Mallozzi asked what will be done for the individuals that are on the dais currently.

Commissioner Katzman said he does not want to include himself in any lifetime benefits.

Commissioner Shrouder proposes to lock in everyone who was vested in 2012 and satisfied the requirements. Staff could come up with the cost to add anyone else in the plan.

Commissioner Green said the benefit was not automatic for all elected officials. The individual had to serve three terms and be 50 years of age. He would like to continue the benefit for everyone who was elected when he benefit was in place. For the elected officials that came after 2012 if they meet the requirement of three terms and the age of 50 they should have access to the City insurance with the City paying a portion.

Commissioner Shrouder asked what the number would be.

Commissioner Green said staff can look into numbers.

City Manager Rey asked if the contribution would be the total cost. Commissioner Green said it should be the same benefit the employees receive.

Commissioner Shrouder said there are currently different benefit amounts being paid. City Manager Rey said for the elected officials that are on the retirement plan the City pays 100% for them and their spouse. The elected officials currently get the same amount covered as the City employees. Over the years that

contribution and amount has changed. There needs to be a policy made with the numbers directly being stated. Currently there is very little guidance.

Commissioner Shrouder said there are also dependents receiving benefits under the family plan that should not be covered.

City Manager Rey explained the City does not have an employee and spouse plan alone.

Commissioner Shrouder said it is cheaper to list a husband and wife on a single plan than to list them in the family plan.

City Manager Rey said people on Medicare have the employee and spouse benefit option.

Commissioner Green said moving forward after 2012 he would like the opportunity to have insurance available to elected officials at the same rate employees pay with everyone prior keeping the lifetime benefit if they serve three terms and are 50 years of age.

Commissioner Green made a motion that the health benefit remain the same for everyone prior to 2012 consistent with what was in the personnel manual in 1999. Moving forward from 2012 the elected officials that meet the criteria of serving three terms and being 50 years of age are offered the same benefit the employees at the time are being offered. Mayor Ross seconded the motion.

Commissioner Shrouder would like to defer the item until the next meeting and look into the financial impact of Commissioner Green's item.

Commissioner Green moved to table Ordinance 24.21. Commissioner Mallozzi seconded the motion.

City Attorney Horowitz advised the next meeting is September 24, 2024.

MOTION: Commissioner Green moved to table Ordinance 24-21. Commissioner Mallozzi seconded the motion which prevailed by a unanimous roll call vote. (5-0)

ORDINANCES ON SECOND READING (Public Hearing)

18. Ordinance 24-21 (Commission)

City Attorney Horowitz read "AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF COOPER CITY, FLORIDA, RATIFYING AND CONFIRMING THE BENEFIT PLANS FOR THE CITY'S ELECTED OFFICIALS, AS MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED IN EXHIBIT "A," IN ACCORDANCE WITH SECTION 3.06 OF THE CITY CHARTER; PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE" by title.

Commissioner Green motioned to table Ordinance 24-21 until after the November 5, 2024 election. Commissioner Mallozzi seconded the motion.

MOTION: Commissioner Green moved to table Ordinance 24-21 until after the November 5, 2024 election. Commissioner Mallozzi seconded the motion which failed by the following roll call vote. (3-2)

YES: Commissioner Mallozzi and Green

Cooper City, FL

NO: Commissioners Katzman, Shrouder and Mayor Ross

Commissioner Shrouder said this item cannot be tabled as the current benefits being offered are not codified and legal.

Commissioner Mallozzi said the benefits have not been legal for the past 21 years so what is three more months.

Commissioner Katzman stated it is a violation of the Charter.

Commissioner Mallozzi asked if they can delay the ordinance until January 1st. City Attorney Horowitz advised any change to Commission compensation takes affect at the next election. Commissioner Mallozzi believes this matter is being brought up to affect a current candidate.

Commissioner Green said this matter has come up due to the current election going on in the City. Three of the elected officials on the dais are supporting one candidate and the other two are supporting the other candidate. He is asking to put aside this item until after the November election to erase any appearance that it is due to the current election. For the past 21 years the elected officials have never been offered FRS until this ordinance was introduced. He believes there is election interference going on.

Commissioner Shrouder asked City Attorney Horowitz if the Commission are compulsory members of FRS. City Attorney Horowitz said the elected officials have the ability to opt out of participation so he does not believe it is a compulsory requirement. Commissioner Shrouder said when he found out about this issue in July he notified former Commissioner Curran. Commissioner Shrouder explained former Commissioner Curran retired from FRS and there is a requirement where an individual cannot be reemployed with a FRS company for six months. His six months isn't up yet. He believes if he is elected he has to give up his drop money if this ordinance passes. This matter requires an advisory opinion. Commissioner Shrouder said they cannot ask the Commission to not ratify benefits because of one individual.

Commissioner Katzman said Section 3.06 of the Charter states any benefit plans to be provided to the Mayor and Commission shall first be established by ordinance, said ordinance, to be effective immediately upon its passage and final adoption. He has a hard time tabling an item that is in violation of the Charter. They took an oath and it is their duty to follow the Charter. He asked City Attorney Horowitz if the ordinance as drafted prevents anyone from running for office. City Attorney Horowitz answered no. He asked if we know how this ordinance could impact any of the candidates. City Attorney Horowitz said the ordinance before the Commission would provide the Commission with benefits. The same insurance pension and other benefits offered to the lowest paid full time employee, which is a camp counselor, a seasonal position that does not currently receive FRS and would not affect anyone.

Commissioner Mallozzi said this has been wrong for 21 years so an extra two months will not make or break anyone. She feels the item is wrong. Online there is talks that this ordinance will cost the City and mayoral candidate Jamie Curran money. She wants a fair race and does not care who wins the election.

Commissioner Katzman stated he has not endorsed any candidate.

Commissioner Shrouder said he voted to fire the other mayoral candidate from the Special Magistrate position and he is the one that called former Commissioner Curran to alert him of the potential issue and now he is being blamed.

Commissioner Mallozzi wants a fair race without social media rumors. She wants to table the ordinance until after the election.

Mayor Ross said the Commission has a fiduciary duty to do what is necessary for the residents. Leaving this matter to another Commission makes them irrelevant. They are not.

Commissioner Green asked if a seasonal employee receives FRS. City Manager Rey answered no. Commissioner Green said the position of camp counselor is listed and the position does not receive FRS. He asked City Attorney Horowitz if the City's elected officials receive any FRS benefits as said in an email sent to the Commission on August 29th. City Attorney Horowitz read the email from the general counsel office at FRS to the City pension counsel as follows: Elected officials are not a covered group in the FRS for Cooper City as such Cooper City is not a FRS participating employer for the elected official's class. We don't need to analyze any of the other issues below, since they would not apply. Commissioner Green asked if the proposed ordinance would change the elected official's status with regard to FRS. City Attorney Horowitz answered no.

Commissioner Shrouder said he would receive a binding opinion on the matter personally. He also stated that the ordinance does have the Commission receiving FRS benefits the brackets are not the binding part of the ordinance.

Commissioner Katzman said they need to correct the violation to the Charter and he is open to ideas on the benefits.

Commissioner Mallozzi said the position, 101 camp counselor is a part-time position. She asked Recreation Director Stacie Weiss if camp counselors receive FRS. Director Weiss answered no they are seasonal employees. Commissioner Mallozzi said the category above 101, receives FRS. City Manager Rey answered they are part-time. The reference to the position is for the salary aspect.

Commissioner Shrouder said if they do not pass this item they may be compulsory members of FRS. Commissioner Shrouder said in 1964 Cooper City exempted the elected officials from FRS but that is not a solid answer on that matter.

Commissioner Mallozzi asked how it affects the elected officials possibly being thrown into FRS. City Attorney Horowitz said Chapter 121 absolutely allows elected officials to opt out of FRS. He cannot guarantee if a member of the Commission who participates in FRS was to opt out it would be a cure to the issue being discussed. A determination from FRS needs to be sought. The opinion form the general council does help but it is not binding. It is debatable whether or not the members of the Commission are compulsory members.

Commissioner Green said if there are uncertainties and if the Commission is a part of FRS there will be money owed. City Attorney Horowitz said if FRS does determine the elected officials are members FRS can request 12 years of unpaid contributions.

Commissioner Shrouder said the answer to determine if the Commission are compulsory members is not an easy question.

Commissioner Green advised the City moved to FRS as the City was paying 24% for the individuals in the General Employees' Pension Plan.

Commissioner Shrouder said in the long run the General Employees' Pension Plan may have saved the City money.

Commissioner Shrouder moved to approve Ordinance 24-21 striking the language (currently pay grade 101 - camp counselor). His intention was to tie benefits to the lowest paid employee.

Mayor Ross seconded the motion.

Mayor Ross opened the public hearing.

Tena Granit, 20 year resident said they can have the compensation and benefits match the lowest fulltime employee but leave FRS out of the ordinance.

Ray Briant, 30 year resident said the City should be seeking the opinion to protect the City and it does not seem appropriate to discuss the item now. He believes the item should be tabled until after the election.

Commissioner Shrouder said the City does not have the standing to seek an opinion for a former Commissioner's issues. The prudent matter is to comply with their charter obligations.

Gladys Aguero, said two months will not affect a 21 year old issue.

Commissioner Green would like to leave out the FRS portion out of the ordinance until an opinion can be obtained.

Commissioner Shrouder said they do not make rules for one person. They need to follow the charter.

Commissioner Mallozzi said an advisory opinion has been sought by former Commissioner Curran. She would like to remove the FRS component to the ordinance until the opinion is received. She believes the item is inferring.

Commissioner Green said with this ordinance the salary of the elected officials is going up from \$12,000 a year to \$37,125 dollars a year plus the FRS pension benefits. Commissioner Green believes there is election interference happening here. He asked City Attorney Horowitz if he as an elected official can opt out of FRS. City Attorney Horowitz answered if they are participating in the elected official's class, yes. He asked for the City to provide an opinion on what has been discussed tonight. City Attorney Horowitz read Section 121052 Subsection D(1), Any elected officer may elect to withdraw from participating in the Florida retirement system in any manner whatsoever. Upon assuming office, the member shall have a period of six months to notify the administrator of his or her decision to withdraw from the Florida retirement decision altogether. Such elections shall be made in writing, and a copy shall be filed with the employer.

Commissioner Katzman said based on that section this may not affect the individual mentioned.

City Attorney Horowitz would like to incorporate any procedural steps with regard to FRS enrollment if needed into the ordinance.

MOTION: Commissioner Shrouder moved to approve Ordinance 24-21 striking the language (currently pay grade 101 - camp counselor). Mayor Ross seconded the motion which prevailed by the following roll call vote. (3-2)

NO: Commissioner Mallozzi and Green

YES: Commissioners Katzman, Shrouder and Mayor Ross

CITY MANAGER REPORT

No City Manager report.

CITY ATTORNEY REPORT

City Attorney Horowitz advised there was a scriveners issue with the ordinance passed related to swale parking that was intended to have the language requiring all swale parking be in the same direction which was not included. He would like to correct the issue and update the ordinance.

COMMISSIONERS' CONCERNS/REPORTS/ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON NEXT AGENDA

Commissioner Shrouder asked that the correction to the ordinance be placed in the amendments.

Commissioner Katzman commended staff that put on the Touch-A-Truck event.

Commissioner Mallozzi commended staff that put on the Touch-A-Truck event. She also thanked staff for the great experience she had at the Flow Mobile today.

ADDITIONAL PUBLIC COMMENTS (3 MINUTES)

No additional comments.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:04 PM.

The minutes of the September 17, 2024 meeting were approved during the Regular City Commission Meeting of September 24, 2024.

Tedra Allen, City Clerk

ADA NOTICE

This meeting is open to the public. In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, all persons who are disabled and who need special accommodations to participate in this meeting because of that disability should contact the Office of the City Clerk, 954-434-4300 ext. 220, not later than two days prior to such proceeding. One or more members of the City of Cooper City Advisory Boards may be in attendance and may participate at the meeting. Anyone wishing to appeal any decision made by the Cooper City Commission with respect to any matter considered at such meeting or hearing will need a record of the proceedings and, for such purpose, may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Agenda items may be viewed online at www.coopercity.gov or at the Office of the City Clerk, City of Cooper City, 9090 SW 50 Place, Cooper City, Florida, 33328, 954-434-4300.

DECORUM

Members of the Commission, staff members, citizens, and others are required to use civil and appropriate language when addressing the Commission or anyone present at the meeting and must refrain from using profanity, cursing, or exhibiting aggressive or threatening behavior. All comments should generally be directed to the presiding officer and not to individual members of the Commission, staff, or the audience. No personal verbal attacks toward any individual by either the Commission, staff, citizens, or others shall be allowed during any meeting of the Commission.

Any persons making impertinent or slanderous remarks or personal attacks or who becomes boisterous while addressing the Commission or who otherwise violates the decorum rules set forth herein shall be barred from further audience before the Commission by the Mayor, or by request of any member of the Commission unless permission to continue or again address the Commission be granted by a majority vote of the Commission members present.

WEBVTT

1

00:00:00.120 --> 00:00:01.080

A person.

2

00:00:02.840 --> 00:00:04.419

Cooper City Hall: Oh, now you're gonna get in trouble.

3

00:00:05.350 --> 00:00:07.440

Cooper City Hall: Good evening, ladies and gentlemen.

4

00:00:08.310 --> 00:00:26.120

Cooper City Hall: Good evening, ladies and gentlemen. Welcome to the City Commission. Regular meeting today is Tuesday, September the 17, th 2,024, and tonight we have with us, leading our pledge of allegiance is a Boy Scout of America, 1st female nautical troop. So, if you please, join us at the podium and lead us in the pledge.

5

00:00:30.240 --> 00:00:30.900

Cooper City Hall: John.

6

00:00:35.280 --> 00:00:47.779

Cooper City Hall: I pledge allegiance to the flag of United States of America and to the republic for which it stands, one nation, under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

7

00:00:47.880 --> 00:00:48.880

Cooper City Hall: Thank you.

8

00:00:50.990 --> 00:00:52.589

Cooper City Hall: I have a roll call, please.

9

00:00:54.830 --> 00:01:02.660

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi. Yes, Commissioner Katzman, Commissioner Schroeder. Here, Commissioner Green, here, Mayor Ross, and I am here.

10

00:01:03.590 --> 00:01:25.409

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Horowitz, would you please read the decorum policy? Thank you. Good evening, Mayor, and commission for the record. The city's decorum policy reads as follows, members of the Commission, staff, members, citizens, and others are required to use civil and appropriate language when addressing the Commission, or anyone present at the meeting, and must refrain from using profanity, cursing or exhibiting aggressive or threatening behavior.

11

00:01:25.440 --> 00:01:31.880

Cooper City Hall: All comments should be generally directed to the presiding officer and not to individual members of the Commission staff or to the audience.

12

00:01:32.190 --> 00:01:40.100

Cooper City Hall: No personal verbal attacks toward any individual, either by the commission, staff, citizens, or others, shall be allowed during any meeting of the city commission.

00:01:40.380 --> 00:02:08.069

Cooper City Hall: any persons making impertinent or slanderous remarks or personal attacks, or who become boisterous while addressing the Commission, or who otherwise violate the decorum rules set forth herein shall be barred from further audience before the commission by the Mayor, or by request of any member of the Commission, unless permission to continue, or again, address the Commission, be granted by majority vote of the commission members present. Thank you, Mayor. Thank you, Mr. City Manager. Do we have any changes to the agenda or any emergency matters?

14 00:02:08.729 --> 00:02:09.630

Cooper City Hall: No, sir.

15

00:02:09.759 --> 00:02:27.799

Cooper City Hall: actually, I'm going to make a 1 change if it's okay with the Commission. And I ask the Commission to step down to the podium. We did a proclamation earlier tonight, and that was for the kinship proclamation kinship awareness at most of the people were not here

16

00:02:27.800 --> 00:02:41.310

Cooper City Hall: because they thought it started at 6 30. So they've asked if we would please, at least give them an opportunity to have a picture taken, and and I approved it with knowledge. Now of this commission. So please join me.

17

00:02:41.940 --> 00:02:42.630

Cooper City Hall: Hey?

18

00:02:47.720 --> 00:02:49.390

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, you can say, Yeah.

19

00:03:28.000 --> 00:03:32.050

Cooper City Hall: good night. Morning. Would you please join us? Yeah, thank you.

20

00:03:32.550 --> 00:03:42.374

Cooper City Hall: I'll bring you more money in a moment if you don't already know

21

00:03:53.550 --> 00:03:55.089

Cooper City Hall: from record to know that

22

00:04:02.340 --> 00:04:03.030

Cooper City Hall: I guess

23

00:04:08.950 --> 00:04:10.140

Cooper City Hall: that one. Yep.

24

00:04:11.640 --> 00:04:19.380

Cooper City Hall: Can we make him keep that promise? It's on video.

25

00:04:23.520 --> 00:04:25.599

Cooper City Hall: I thank you for

00:04:25.990 --> 00:04:26.690

Cooper City Hall: you've

27

00:04:27.130 --> 00:04:35.659

Cooper City Hall: patience and Marty care is your property appraiser once a year at least. He loves to come to Cooper City

28

00:04:35.700 --> 00:05:00.699

Cooper City Hall: and advise us as to how well his office is doing, which means how well our property values are doing. So, Marty, if you please, step up and welcome again to Cooper City. Thank you so much, Mr. Mayor, I really appreciate you all, giving me the opportunity to say a few words, and I'd say, first, st I want to say, I really love your. We stand with Israel signs on the front. I think that's fantastic, and I really appreciate that. And also I want to thank you as well.

29

00:05:00.700 --> 00:05:25.759

Cooper City Hall: you've been a fantastic mayor for so long for Cooper City. I'm definitely gonna miss you, and I know you know November's coming, but I can definitely tell you. I think that Cooper City today is a better place because of your leadership. So thank you for what you've done. Thank you. And it's true. And before I quickly talk about how our office can help our wonderful Cooper City community. And before I talk about property values and something very near and dear to my heart, which, cracking on title fraud. I also want to thank your staff.

30

00:05:25.770 --> 00:05:55.230

Cooper City Hall: you know. Every single week we work with every single staff in Broward County all 31 cities, and what the cities do is they provide us every single permit that's been pulled, so we can make sure we capture all the value and put it on the tax roll. So we don't lose any value. And we can actually catch all the property taxes that that are you're entitled to, and I can tell you your staff is one of the easiest staffs to work with in Broward County. They really treat our staff very, very well, they return our phone calls. And so I just want to thank you so much for that. With that said for the residents.

00:05:55.230 --> 00:06:16.149

Cooper City Hall: there are a few main functions to our office. The 1st function is, we determine the value of every piece of property in Broward County for tax purposes, whether it's residential, commercial, tangible, personal property, or essentially assessed property which are railroads. And the reason that's important is when people pay their property taxes, the amount of taxes they pay is a relationship between the value of the property that we set and the tax rate set by you. All the county Commission, the School board, and all other taxing authorities.

32

00:06:16.150 --> 00:06:25.289

Cooper City Hall: So the most important thing we want to do is make sure we get it right. And Broward County, as you know, is a massive place. More people live here than 13 States, the District of Columbia and all Us. Territories except Puerto Rico.

33

00:06:25.290 --> 00:06:52.269

Cooper City Hall: and there are more parcels that we appraised and exist in many States, and even though the people in our office do a very good job, and their assessments are very accurate, mistakes can occur, or maybe we have information about their property that they have information about their property that we don't have that can help us bring down their assessed value, which would bring down their property taxes. And right now is a fantastic time for me to come and speak, because September 18th is just a couple days away. That is our drop dead deadline to work on anybody's property. So if anybody, whoever's watching this in Cooper City

34

00:06:52.270 --> 00:07:13.229

Cooper City Hall: go on our website@bcpa.net click on your trim. Notice. It's on there right there, it said. It's not a tax bill. It's going to show you what your proposed taxes are going to be, and it'll also show the value of your property for tax purposes. And if you have any concern with the value of that property, or you're not getting every tax saving exemption you're entitled to. Just call me by September 18.th We'll make sure your value is correct, and you get every exemption you're entitled to. So you can save a lot of money in your property taxes.

00:07:13.280 --> 00:07:15.240

Cooper City Hall: That kind of brings me to the second thing we do.

36

00:07:15.310 --> 00:07:38.290

Cooper City Hall: The second thing we do is we give tax saving exemptions to people that qualify, and there are a lot of exemptions under Florida law that people qualify for the most important one, as you know, is the Homestead exemption. If you live here in Cooper City, it's where you're registered to vote. If you don't vote where your declaration of domicile where your cars registered to it is where you live and you raise your family, you get that very important exemption, and it does 2 things. The 1st thing it does it takes \$50,000 of value off the tax rate and only pay taxes on can save people.

37

00:07:38.290 --> 00:07:54.020

Cooper City Hall: Maybe a thousand bucks at the beginning. But most importantly, it really helps from going forward, because every year, after I have a homestead exemption, the value your tax on cannot go up more than a maximum of 3%. And that is so important right now, because in just a few minutes I'm going to show you what the average sale price of a single family home is in Cooper City, and it's very high.

38

00:07:54.020 --> 00:08:12.100

Cooper City Hall: And the reason that's the case, because people are coming from all over the world. They're coming to Cooper City, and they're paying top dollar for properties. And so I always tell everybody if you lived on your property on January 1st of this year, and you haven't filed for homestead exemption. Please do it. It'll make sure the value you're taxed on won't go up more than 3%, and your taxable value won't Skyrocket with your market value, which would make your property taxes, Skyrocket.

39

00:08:12.100 --> 00:08:32.770

Cooper City Hall: once you get that, there are so many other exemptions. There are exemptions for seniors, for veterans, for people who are visually impaired, for widows, for 1st responders. There are

lots of exemptions under Florida law, and so everybody in Cooper City go on our website@bcpa.net. See what exemptions you're getting. And if there's something you're not getting just contact me by September 18, th just a couple of days from now, and we'll make sure they're reflecting your tax bill, so you can save money.

40

00:08:32.770 --> 00:08:48.859

Cooper City Hall: The next thing, Mr. Mayor, I was hoping to quickly do was just talk about property values. And once again property values are going up in Cooper City, and that's again because people are coming from all over the world, and they're buying property for top dollar to give you an idea in 2,023. If you took all the commercial and residential property and you sold it on the open market.

41

00:08:48.860 --> 00:08:58.820

Cooper City Hall: You have got right about 7.5 billion dollars fast forward just one year. There's been a 7.5 9% increase in market value to right about 8.1 billion dollars.

42

00:08:58.820 --> 00:09:23.809

Cooper City Hall: The taxable value is the value that you're utilizing, that you're setting your millage rate on to determine the amount of money that you need to provide great services to the people of Cooper City, and in 2023 the taxable value for Cooper City was right about 4.0 2 billion dollars. That's a big number, because Cooper city is a pretty big city, but fast forward, just one year. There's been a 9.2 2% increase in taxable value, which is actually higher than the average of the county, and it comes to about 4.4 billion dollars.

43

00:09:23.810 --> 00:09:46.950

Cooper City Hall: To put that in perspective, your operating millage rate is right about 5.8 6 5 0. If you decide to keep that the same, you'll have about 2.2 million dollars more this year than last year to provide great services to the people of Cooper City, and something that's very important to note is the vast majority of people paying that increase in revenue. Are not your existing homesteaded property owners. That's because if you're a homesteaded property owner, the value you're taxed on is capped at 3%.

44

00:09:46.950 --> 00:10:06.180

Cooper City Hall: It's really being paid for by a lot of people coming in and paying top dollar for properties, and a very good amount of new construction that's been added to the tax roll. This year there's been about 75.4 million dollars of new construction added to the tax roll, and the biggest being a Bright Star Credit Union. I think it's an entire area for right? About 16.1 4 million dollars.

45

00:10:06.240 --> 00:10:14.940

Cooper City Hall: You have 9,161 homestead exemptions here in Cooper City you have 263 low income seniors who get a very important senior tax break.

46

00:10:14.940 --> 00:10:25.119

Cooper City Hall: You also have 25 long-term seniors who pay no property taxes to Cooper City, and I really appreciate so much you adopting that because not every city has it. Here's how somebody qualifies for that.

47

00:10:25.120 --> 00:10:49.089

Cooper City Hall: You have to be over 65 years of age, made under last year \$36,613. Been in your home for 25 years or more, and the value of your home had to be under \$250,000. If you get that, you pay no property taxes to Cooper City. I really appreciate you adopting that, because when it comes to your loss of revenue, it's a drop in the bucket. But to those seniors who struggle to make ends meet. It's a lot of money they put in their pocket so they can have a better life. I think it's fantastic. I hope every city follows your lead.

48

00:10:49.220 --> 00:11:02.989

Cooper City Hall: You also have 640 widows and widowers who receive an exemption, and you also have 259, total veterans, exemptions. And what I think is pretty 86 of those actually pay no property taxes because they're fully disabled veterans, and it's all service connected

00:11:03.700 --> 00:11:23.590

Cooper City Hall: right now. The there have been 221 sales here in Cooper City, of single family homes this year. To put it in perspective. It's right on pace for what last year was, and the average sale price of a single family home is \$843,263. That's a very big number. The median is somewhat lower at 745,000, but it's still a very big number.

50

00:11:23.590 --> 00:11:35.239

Cooper City Hall: And to put that also into perspective, your average taxable value is right about \$334,000, which is much lower than that number. That's because when people come to Cooper City they love us so much they stay for a long time, and they get the benefit of that save our home scab.

51

00:11:35.330 --> 00:11:50.599

Cooper City Hall: When it comes to Condominiums you have 55 condominium parcels here in Cooper City. You've had 3 sales so far this year, and the median sale price is right, about \$228,000. But the Median tax advice about \$112,000. And that's the same reason people stay for a long time.

52

00:11:50.750 --> 00:12:15.329

Cooper City Hall: The other thing, Mr. Mayor, and to the commission I was just hoping to quickly talk about is something very near and dear to my hardness, cracking down on title fraud, as you know. And I say this every single year. South Florida is the title, Fraud, capital of the world. It's the capital world, because you have criminals, and that's what they are and what they do is they walk into the recording division of every county every single day in the State of Florida. They file, fake deeds on people's properties, and they take those deeds, and they extort people for money or mortgage rent or sell the property. They do it all the time.

53

00:12:15.330 --> 00:12:26.039

Cooper City Hall: and the reason it's so easy for them is the recording division, for every county has administerial duty. They have to accept whatever documents filed with them. So you have these criminals. They walk in, they file a fake deed, and they do something nefarious with it.

00:12:26.040 --> 00:12:39.100

Cooper City Hall: So the 1st thing we wanted to do was give the people of Broward County the opportunity to fight the fraud before the fraud occurs. And so 3 years ago, we came up with a fantastic program called Owner Alert. It's really a notification program letting people know if there's been a title change to their property.

55

54

00:12:39.100 --> 00:13:04.009

Cooper City Hall: And here's how people can sign up if they go to our website@bcpa.net. They type in their name. They type in their email address, and they type in their parcel id number. If we have their email address on file, that's because we had it with the Homestead exemption, they are automatically verified. If we don't, they have to upload their Florida driver's license or Florida Id. If they don't have that, they have to upload a utility bill or something proving ownership. And then, if any document, legitimate or not, is file changing ownership, they're notified instantaneously by email by text message. They even get a hard copy in the mail.

56

00:13:04.010 --> 00:13:28.519

Cooper City Hall: We've had 260,000 Brad County property owners sign up so far, and so I'm very proud about in Cooper City. 50% of all of your homestead property owners have signed up, and I really appreciate the fact that you all have helped me so much getting the word out. And that's really why we have such a big number here. And just for the residents was very important. This year the Legislature passed a fantastic law. It was voted on unanimously by all Democrats and all Republicans, and the Governor signed it and exempts all information we collect for

57

00:13:28.520 --> 00:13:39.430

Cooper City Hall: owner. Alert program, people's emails, their phone numbers, even the fact that they signed up it exempts it from public disclosure so it can be used for one purpose and one purpose only, and that is to alert somebody. If there's been a title change to their property.

00:13:39.430 --> 00:13:44.009

Cooper City Hall: And then when I started this program, I started getting phone calls from residents, and they would say, Marty.

59

00:13:44.010 --> 00:14:03.200

Cooper City Hall: I got a notification from your office that somebody changed the title on my property, but I didn't do it, and I got more and more and more, and a few people, including Ryan Schroeder, who I really appreciate so much, came up with a really fantastic idea. We decided to try to create a program where we could work with law enforcement, build criminal cases and put the people in jail who are doing this.

60

00:14:03.230 --> 00:14:05.409

Cooper City Hall: So I got the approval from the State of Florida.

61

00:14:05.490 --> 00:14:30.549

Cooper City Hall: and then they got the county commission to fund it, and I then went to sheriff, Tony and I go sheriff Tony, I'm gonna have a new program. My office called our Crimes against property team. And I go. But I have a problem. I'm not law enforcement you are. I can't issue probable cause affidavits, search warrants. I cannot do the job of law enforcement. You can. Can. We work together, and with Ryan's help the sheriff said, absolutely, and he actually has now assigned 3 sheriff's detectives to work for our office. So we can actually do the job of law enforcement.

62

00:14:30.550 --> 00:14:43.690

Cooper City Hall: I then went to see Harold Prior, and I told him how the sheriff and I were working together, and I asked if he would prosecute the people that we bring to him. And he said absolutely, and he actually assigned an assistant State attorney to work with our office to prosecute the people that we bring. And over the past couple of years we've been very successful.

00:14:43.690 --> 00:14:53.579

Cooper City Hall: We've had hundreds of investigations. We've had numerous arrests and convictions, and we've been able to work with the court system to get property back to people in a much more expeditious and cost efficient manner.

64

00:14:53.580 --> 00:15:16.589

Cooper City Hall: And just to give you an idea as to how bad some of the people are that do this, and as the reason why, I really hope everybody signs up for our owner alert program. I just want to give a couple examples of a few convictions we've had recently and just, you know, one or 2 new cases that are arrested that aren't yet convictions. Each one's a little bit different, but it does show how smart the people are that do this. The one I always like to talk about. And actually Ryan was instrumental in helping us catch this group of people

65

00:15:16.590 --> 00:15:22.330

Cooper City Hall: involved 2 wives. They're a married couple. One of the wives worked for one of our hospital districts. The other wife worked in the real estate industry

66

00:15:22.330 --> 00:15:47.260

Cooper City Hall: wife that worked in the hospital district to find out what people would pass on. She would then take their confidential information, including their social security numbers, and give her to her wife in the real estate industry, who would find that they have property in Brock County and heirs here. If they had property and no heirs, they'd file fake deeds on the properties. They'd sell the properties and sell a mortgage. Properties rent the properties, they profit the amount of millions of dollars. Fortunately they were found guilty. They were sentenced to jail, and something I'm very happy about is they had to pay a lot of restitution, including to an elderly person here in Cooper City.

67

00:15:47.290 --> 00:15:49.770

Cooper City Hall: They had to pay about \$210,000.

00:15:49.880 --> 00:16:05.040

Cooper City Hall: Another example happened from a person not from Broward County. He was from Miami-dade County, and he somehow found out there was a senior that was very sick, that owned a 5 acre vacant parcel in southwest ranches, and he came up with a great idea. He made a fake corporation with Tallahassee. He made the officer and director of the corporation the sick man.

69

00:16:05.040 --> 00:16:32.009

Cooper City Hall: He made a fake id saying he was that man. He then filed a fake deed, saying the corporation owned the property. He then walked into a mortgage company in the city of Sunrise, told him he fell on some hard times, but he had a 5 acre parcel in southwest ranches and asked for a half 1 million dollar mortgage, and the mortgage company said, Sure, they'll give it to him. The closing took place at a Burger King and Hialeah, and when they went there you had the bad guy trying to get the money. You had the mortgage company about to be out a lot of money, and you had the smartest person in the room. The notary, who asked for a thumbprint she provided to our office. We opened up an investigation.

70

00:16:32.010 --> 00:16:40.079

Cooper City Hall: Fortunately a man was arrested. He was convicted. He was sentenced to 3 years in Federal prison. Unfortunately he was given the full \$500,000 mortgage spent about 80,000. We've recovered the rest

71

00:16:40.180 --> 00:16:52.080

Cooper City Hall: about 2 months ago we had a pretty big conviction. And this is one of our bigger cases. This case I haven't been able to prove this. I heard that all 9 people involved met each other in jail, and they came up with a scheme in jail. And here's what they decided to do.

72

00:16:52.080 --> 00:17:17.069

Cooper City Hall: They decided to use the court system to steal people's properties. And so the ringleader would file quiet title actions in circuit Court basically lawsuits in Circuit Court saying, this senior, this bank, or this person, no longer wanted the property, the return of service would go to the guy's buddy, who was in a mobile home in Hillsborough County, and he would say, Oh, yeah, I represent

that senior, that bank, that person? Yeah, they don't want the property more put in this guy's name or his company's name. They sold many properties throughout Brera County, so I'm very happy about is the ringleader was actually found guilty. He was sentenced

73

00:17:17.069 --> 00:17:31.060

Cooper City Hall: 8 years in prison, filed by 10 years. Probation. If he violates his probation, he goes to jail for life, and a minor co-conspirator was also found guilty, sentenced to 5 years probation, but was also ordered deported to her home country of Moldova by a Us. Immigration court, and cannot return to the Us.

74

00:17:31.060 --> 00:17:58.969

Cooper City Hall: Another couple examples of cases that haven't yet been convictions, but they're very, very new, and their arrests and I like to talk about this as well. Now the people that are the subjects of these arrests, you know you're innocent until proven guilty. But here are the facts as we know it. One case that came down just a couple of months ago involved 2 victims, one of the victims names was Walter Walter, I think, was an American hero. He served for a long time in the Us. Army, and he was an 18 year member of the Broward sheriff's office.

75

00:17:59.030 --> 00:18:10.160

Cooper City Hall: The other victim was his ex-wife Vivian, who, just a really sweet, wonderful person, and in the 19 seventies Walter and Vivian got married, and when they got married they bought a home in Pembroke Pines.

76

00:18:10.190 --> 00:18:37.540

Cooper City Hall: and they were happy. But a couple of years later they got divorced. Then Walter bought a townhouse about a mile up the road, but for some reason Walter and Vivian kept living together in this in the marital home for decades 2020. Vivian got very sick, and a caregiver came to the home to take care of her. Vivian then passed on, and for the next couple of years Walter had a routine. He would go back and forth between both homes. He would check the email, make sure they're locked. And just that was kind of what he did, until one day the neighbors realized they hadn't seen him in some time.

77

00:18:37.590 --> 00:18:42.670

Cooper City Hall: So they called the Pembroke Pines Police Department. They came, went into the home, and they found that Walter had pastime.

78

00:18:42.760 --> 00:18:51.409

Cooper City Hall: About a week later the home gets broken into, and then miraculously, about 5 min after that happens. The former caregiver showed up to the home.

79

00:18:51.440 --> 00:18:59.369

Cooper City Hall: and the caregiver then calls. The police said, Hey, the home's been broken into, the police. Come, they do the job they're supposed to do, and they leave.

80

00:18:59.490 --> 00:19:02.890

Cooper City Hall: About a week later both the home and the townhouse are cleaned out.

81

00:19:03.000 --> 00:19:32.449

Cooper City Hall: Then 2 alleged fake deeds are filed on both properties and in both situations they tried to sell the properties. They also also allegedly opened up a probate estate in the amount of a million dollars, because they found that Walter actually had that in the bank. Fortunately there were errors. They came forward. They came to our office, and the caregiver and the notary were arrested, and what I think is pretty fantastic is, I think, all the errors are going to be made whole with very little damage.

82

00:19:32.450 --> 00:19:42.690

Cooper City Hall: The last one I wanted to talk about is a much more recent case, and I want to thank you also for your help on this as well, there is a person who made a little bit of a mistake.

00:19:42.750 --> 00:20:06.950

Cooper City Hall: and his mistake was he called our office, and he said, Hey, Marty's office? My 96 year old grandmother in Tamar. She just died, but she left the home to me. How do we get in our name in my name? And our office says, Well, we have to see a deed that is in your name, or maybe a will that's been probated, and he goes. I'll get you that tomorrow. So next day he sends a fake deed and a fake, will, and you know it was fake right off the top, because we're supposed to say county of Broward, say county of Florida, things of that nature

84

00:20:06.950 --> 00:20:26.420

Cooper City Hall: he also. We also found out, during the course of our investigation, that he was squatting in the home, and he found a legitimate buyer for the property, and of course it was fake. So we contacted the lawyer who was that was representing the legitimate buyer for the property, and the lawyer knew that it was fake and wasn't going to go through with it. But the lawyer was very, very helpful, and they said, You know what? I will absolutely hold this closing at my office.

85

00:20:26.420 --> 00:20:43.819

Cooper City Hall: And so they hold the closing. The man shows up. He signs the documents, and they arrest him, but after they arrest him they search his car, and when they search his car they found a treasure trove of information about how he was trying to defraud the Broward County public. They found the identities of 53 broward county residents. They found their credit card information, their PIN numbers, their social security information, their tax return information.

86

00:20:43.870 --> 00:20:51.470

Cooper City Hall: This guy was so smart they found a fake checkbook where he was drawing checks on a very legitimate broward county business, pretending he was an employee in the amount of thousands of dollars.

87

00:20:51.470 --> 00:21:15.980

Cooper City Hall: I wanted to bring those stories up. Mr. Mayor and I can bring up many, many more, because I hope that every single person hasn't signed up for our owner. Alert program. Please do it. It's free to the public. It takes about 2 min, and it'll make sure you protect your most important asset to your home. And the other reason I like to talk about this, I like to scream about this stuff from the rooftops because I want everybody out there to know that they want to do this in Barrack County. They're not welcome here, and we'll make sure they go to jail for a long time if they do it with that said I've had about 10 cups of coffee today a whole bunch of red bull very wired.

88

00:21:15.980 --> 00:21:27.970

Cooper City Hall: and I'm very happy. I'm just really appreciate you all having me today, I do. And, by the way. I'm very, very excited to see my friends the firefighters back there who do a fantastic job for the people of Broward County, without a doubt. Does anybody have any questions.

89

00:21:28.080 --> 00:21:38.130

Cooper City Hall: commission any questions? Oh, definitely. Thank you. Quickly. What's a quiet title? That's a great question. So to quiet title is basically to

90

00:21:38.505 --> 00:21:57.364

Cooper City Hall: get title to you. Follow a lawsuit to get title to a property in your name. You're basically fixing the title. And so if you want a quiet title on property. You think that it's all clouded that has mortgages, whatever it is, you're basically filing a lawsuit to make it to clear the title. So you have. You can take possession of the property. Would you agree with that, Ryan?

91

00:21:57.630 --> 00:22:11.810

Cooper City Hall: Excellent! I'll call you and harass you, and not take up a lot of time. But no, no, Lisa, it's as always. It's so good to see this that you said on your website that way. People can read it and really find out about all the

92

00:22:11.870 --> 00:22:33.899

Cooper City Hall: evil people that are out there. Thank you, and thank you, Lisa, for being so nice to me. When I walked your door 20 years ago, when I was running for the State House. I really appreciate that. So she was so nice. It's 20 years ago, my goodness, but I thank you, Marty. Thank you very much for what you do on behalf of all the residents of Cooper City. Oh, thank you, Mr. Mayor, and if I ask Jeff, is this your last term right now? As well.

93

00:22:33.900 --> 00:22:57.279

Cooper City Hall: you know. I think. So is it, Greg and Jeff? It's your last terms, and I have to tell you. Greg, you've done a great job, and, Jeff, you have as well. You are just a fantastic guy. You know what I love the fact that not only do you dedicate yourself to Cooper City, but you also dedicate yourself to the Federal Government with what you do for the FBI. It's cooper City also is very blessed to have you, and so thank you. But thank you all so much. Everybody have a wonderful day.

94

00:22:57.280 --> 00:22:59.400

Cooper City Hall: Appreciate it. Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Take care.

95

00:23:02.440 --> 00:23:08.279

Cooper City Hall: Moving on to the public speaking. We have 5 different people starting with Gladys Aguero.

96

00:23:12.690 --> 00:23:25.250

Cooper City Hall: Good evening. I'm here to talk on 2 topics. The 1st one is the increase in our water and sewerage Bill, I just didn't understand

97

00:23:25.250 --> 00:23:41.100

Cooper City Hall: down. Thank you. I did not understand why our water and sewer and recycling was being increased since we had a new contract with coastal, because we renegotiated prices.

98

00:23:41.100 --> 00:24:07.660

Cooper City Hall: and nowhere in the agenda do we say? How much is the increase? All it says is that it's being increased, and I think that until the residents of Cooper City are told what is going to be increases? Is it going to be the water? Is it going to be the sewer? Is it going to be the recycle, the garbage or the bulk which part of it is being increased. I don't think this agenda should go forward.

99

00:24:08.540 --> 00:24:14.839

Cooper City Hall: The next thing here I'm talking about is exhibit a on elected officials on the retirement

100

00:24:15.070 --> 00:24:15.844

Cooper City Hall: and

101

00:24:17.500 --> 00:24:22.306

Cooper City Hall: and the insurances that are listed on exhibit a

102

00:24:22.990 --> 00:24:30.040

Cooper City Hall: I was self-employed for many, many years over 40 years as an attorney.

103

00:24:30.430 --> 00:24:44.340

Cooper City Hall: I paid my own health insurance, my own dental, my own vision, my own 401 K. And my own life insurance until I turned 65, and got Medicare.

104

00:24:44.360 --> 00:25:10.929

Cooper City Hall: My sister is a Federal employee for 42 years. My next door neighbor works for the United States Postal service also for 42 years. We are all now retired, and even in our retirement we still have to pay premiums. We still have to pay vision and dental. We still have to pay life insurance.

105

00:25:10.930 --> 00:25:23.120

Cooper City Hall: So I don't understand why, under this exhibit, the commissions is asking vision. 100% covered. Nobody gets that

106

00:25:23.170 --> 00:25:26.309

Cooper City Hall: dental, a hundred percent covered

107

00:25:26.600 --> 00:25:30.909

Cooper City Hall: life insurance, a hundred percent covered

108

00:25:31.380 --> 00:25:39.869

Cooper City Hall: health insurance 93.4% covered. Because even in the Federal government you only get 72%,

109

00:25:39.910 --> 00:25:46.660

Cooper City Hall: and you worked there for 40 years. As a matter of fact, I calculated 72.4,

110

00:25:46.890 --> 00:25:52.490

Cooper City Hall: and then, under your pension vend benefits, it says, not specified.

00:25:52.700 --> 00:25:54.640

Cooper City Hall: so I find it.

112

00:25:55.100 --> 00:26:12.449

Cooper City Hall: You know, very troubling that the Commission who is sitting here is going to take a vote on their own retirement, vision, health and life insurance that just should not be done.

113

00:26:12.500 --> 00:26:19.409

Cooper City Hall: Hard-working people, I bet you thank you. Everybody in here has to pay help.

114

00:26:19.550 --> 00:26:22.699

Cooper City Hall: vision, dental life

115

00:26:23.280 --> 00:26:28.360

Cooper City Hall: contribute if they wanted to. Thank you. Time is up. Thank you very much.

116

00:26:34.530 --> 00:26:35.980

Cooper City Hall: Suzanne and Neville.

117

00:26:43.560 --> 00:26:44.650

Cooper City Hall: Good evening.

00:26:45.643 --> 00:27:07.229

Cooper City Hall: I am the 42 year Federal Service Law Enforcement officer, and when I read Exhibit A, I was very confused, because all my years in in the Federal Government I always paid a portion of all these costs. Even now, in retirement, I pay a very big portion of these costs.

119

00:27:07.230 --> 00:27:16.630

Cooper City Hall: So my question was really on the pension benefits not specified. How could the Commission on, because this is second reading.

120

00:27:16.780 --> 00:27:44.669

Cooper City Hall: Pass something when you do not identify what not specific means. I think the residents of Cooper City have the right to know what is under your pension benefits, because if you're asking for something for life, we shouldn't be providing that for you. I'm sorry you work how many hours a week you work for 12 years. Okay, you can get some benefits, but not benefits for life. Where you put 0 money into it

121

00:27:45.160 --> 00:27:51.060

Cooper City Hall: on the second one I have an issue with is ordinance 2422,

122

00:27:51.420 --> 00:28:13.899

Cooper City Hall: where it says that you want to provide health insurance benefits for certain former members. Why are other members being excluded? Why are not all of them being included? I do not understand. I think the Commission needs to identify which former members, and why some are, and why some are not.

123

00:28:13.900 --> 00:28:31.269

Cooper City Hall: I do believe they are former. They're done. Why are we covering their costs? We're finished with them. Okay, if you want to do something for the ones that are coming in in January, then that's what we do. But the past is the past. We move forward. We don't go back.

124

00:28:31.420 --> 00:28:35.160

Cooper City Hall: I don't know if the city promised them anything. That's not my

125

00:28:35.320 --> 00:28:48.850

Cooper City Hall: right, but I just don't understand that you don't identify who these members are in writing. I'm only can read what's in the written letter there, and you're not telling us why some are included and some are not.

126

00:28:49.170 --> 00:28:51.940

Cooper City Hall: Thank you, thank you. I'll be glad to read the list.

127

00:28:54.080 --> 00:28:55.670

Cooper City Hall: James Curran.

128

00:28:55.880 --> 00:29:05.209

Cooper City Hall: Chris Fardelman, Suelan Fardelman, Dennis Eisinger, Debbie Eisinger, Scott, Kleiman Lisa Melosi, Angel Polank.

129

00:29:05.470 --> 00:29:06.550

Cooper City Hall: Charlotte

00:29:07.040 --> 00:29:14.699

Cooper City Hall: Phillip, Charlotte, Janet Sims, John Sims, Barry Worsh, Paddy Webster, Robert Webster.

131

00:29:15.120 --> 00:29:19.619

Cooper City Hall: There's history to all that, and I'm sure you'll hear the discussion when the item comes up.

132

00:29:22.540 --> 00:29:24.350

Cooper City Hall: Christina Portis.

133

00:29:24.460 --> 00:29:28.319

Cooper City Hall: and I'm going to call separately. After that Lewis Martinez.

134

00:29:32.790 --> 00:29:57.759

Cooper City Hall: Hi! Good evening. I'm here to formally request that the city partake in the epilepsy alliance. Florida's epilepsy awareness month in November. So Louis, as you mentioned, will be coming up shortly. He is actually the community resource officer from epilepsy alliance, Florida, and he can address what he can provide to the city. Last year I well, the last few years

135

00:29:57.760 --> 00:30:07.300

Cooper City Hall: I have worked with both of my children's schools that are in Cooper City to host purple epilepsy days to raise awareness and educate

00:30:07.300 --> 00:30:10.629

Cooper City Hall: everyone on seizure. 1st aid, and safety.

137

00:30:11.250 --> 00:30:40.449

Cooper City Hall: I apologize. That's my son's seizure medication alarm. But yeah. So just trying to do my part to raise awareness like I said, I've already gotten I've worked with the schools previously, and both have already agreed to host purple days this November, so just trying to expand that to the city so that we can educate the community on how to recognize seizures, how to respond to seizures, provide safety. As Lewis will speak. You know, they all

138

00:30:40.450 --> 00:30:47.379

Cooper City Hall: offer complementary training for city. And you know, community members to learn seizure, 1st aid

139

00:30:47.921 --> 00:31:13.359

Cooper City Hall: and then for those of you that are not aware of what epilepsy is it's a seizure disorder. One in 26 individuals in their lifetime will be diagnosed with epilepsy. One in 10 individuals will have a seizure in their lifetime. So even if you don't have epilepsy, you know, it is still beneficial to know how to respond to a seizure in the State of Florida. There are 500,000 individuals and 90,000

140

00:31:13.410 --> 00:31:31.929

Cooper City Hall: children, over 90,000 children in Florida that have epilepsy. So and like, I said, that includes my son who attends a Cooper City school. So I'm just trying to do my part to raise awareness. And hopefully, when he goes out into the community. He's safe and secure. So

141

00:31:32.530 --> 00:31:33.899

Cooper City Hall: thank you. Thank you.

142

00:31:35.890 --> 00:31:37.400

Cooper City Hall: Louis Martinez.

143

00:31:40.680 --> 00:31:50.060

Cooper City Hall: Hello! How are you? You guys? Hear me? Yes, yeah, perfect. Okay. I'm Louis Martinez. I'm the community resource specialist for for epilepsy Alliance, Florida here at Broward County.

144

00:31:50.060 --> 00:32:13.941

Cooper City Hall: And my job is to basically provide information awareness on what epilepsy is and what to do if a seizure happens in your facility. So how she mentioned before, one of the things that we're working on is on House Bill 1, 7, 3, which is training our school personnel. Any of the caregivers that have to do with our kids, whether it's in school daycare centers all the way to our police officers and city officials, we train you on what to do. If a seizure happens and

145

00:32:14.210 --> 00:32:19.570

Cooper City Hall: we are seeing an increase, especially among children seizures happening here in South Florida, especially in Broward County.

146

00:32:19.832 --> 00:32:44.549

Cooper City Hall: You know. I just had a meeting about 2 weeks ago with some of the Broward County School nurses. And we're certifying a lot of the school personnel. And they're telling me a lot of the stories that are happening with these kids. And we just want to kind of bring awareness. Now. November is our epilepsy awareness month. As you can see, I'm wearing purple right now, right? So we're trying to encourage the city of Cooper City to join us, whether it's celebrating a day and everyone wearing purple, whether it's just

00:32:44.550 --> 00:33:06.750

Cooper City Hall: maybe lighting up a city building in purple anything that has to do kind of with purple right to bring awareness on what epilepsy is informing the community about our services. We are, if I want to see 3 nonprofit organization. We've been here epilepsy alliance. Florida has been here in Florida over 50 years, helping Floridians that deal with epilepsy. We have over 1 million cases

148

00:33:06.940 --> 00:33:31.859

Cooper City Hall: over. I'm sorry half a million cases increasing here in South Florida with epilepsy and seizures. Now, when I want you guys to think about that number. We're not only talking about just the individual, right? I want you to think about that number, maybe double or triple, because, as Christina mentioned, you know, right now, she had her alarm for her son. Right? So, in other words, epilepsy impacts those around that person that is epileptic. Does that make sense? And we want to extend that help to that to that

149

00:33:31.860 --> 00:33:55.920

Cooper City Hall: family, to that person. People like Christina right here that she's just an amazing human being, bringing awareness to the community on what to do, not only for her kids safety right, but for anyone that is in that community. It is a huge community, unfortunately, into this day there's a lot of people that are still afraid, maybe even embarrassed, to speak about epilepsy, to speak about that situation, but it is real. It is happening among families.

150

00:33:55.920 --> 00:34:20.579

Cooper City Hall: and you will see, as the days increase, you'll see, as the days pass, and time and time that it's going to become something more and more common among our community. And unfortunately, we don't have a cure for epilepsy. But we do have services. We do have therapists. We do have neurologists. We do have a lot of information out there that the community, you know, will benefit of. So we're just asking, especially in the month of November. I know that it's Thanksgiving month, and a lot of times it gets overshadowed

151

00:34:20.620 --> 00:34:47.319

Cooper City Hall: our epilepsy awareness. Month gets overshadowed with that. But we also, wanna, you know, extend that help and ask all the community partners if they could be part of this, whether you're a school teacher, whether you're someone who owns a daycare. Any city officials you just want to be part of this. Please help us out to bring awareness of what epilepsy is and about the services and help that we have for the community. It's free help. It's very beneficial. And it's something that definitely could help a lot of people. So

152

00:34:47.320 --> 00:35:07.979

Cooper City Hall: I'm just here to just say that. Thanks, Martinez. Thank you. I will be on behalf of myself, and I'm sure my commission will follow. Ask Tedra to please do what's necessary to get that on the agenda for the proclamations in October, so that November will be the month that is recognized. Thank you so much.

153

00:35:08.140 --> 00:35:17.320

Cooper City Hall: I would sponsor a proclamation for you for sometime in November. I have no problem with that. Thank you. That's gonna make me cry. Thank you. I appreciate it. Thank you so much.

154

00:35:18.900 --> 00:35:20.280

Cooper City Hall: Carol Balati

155

00:35:23.110 --> 00:35:24.850

Cooper City Hall: Carol, are you here?

156

00:35:25.180 --> 00:35:26.180

Cooper City Hall: Mono?

157

00:35:34.360 --> 00:35:40.399

Cooper City Hall: I'm Carol Balati. I've been a Cooper City resident for almost 27 years. Nice to see everybody.

158

00:35:40.480 --> 00:35:43.449

Cooper City Hall: My concerns are with this Frs.

159

00:35:43.730 --> 00:35:47.940

Cooper City Hall: New requirement, or whatever the city's trying to pass.

160

00:35:48.120 --> 00:35:51.599

Cooper City Hall: and I have to tell you I'm an Frs retired employee myself.

161

00:35:52.290 --> 00:35:54.939

Cooper City Hall: The timing of this really concerns me.

162

00:35:55.410 --> 00:36:01.109

Cooper City Hall: Okay, you need to let the people vote and decide our mayor. It should not be decided by you guys

163

00:36:01.130 --> 00:36:04.389

Cooper City Hall: passing something at this late state

00:36:04.910 --> 00:36:08.100

Cooper City Hall: to me, appears to be election interference.

165

00:36:08.320 --> 00:36:13.580

Cooper City Hall: It's a very sensitive subject with all of us, after what we've all experienced over these years.

166

00:36:13.890 --> 00:36:27.589

Cooper City Hall: But what's been happening really, really concerns me. Let the people vote. Let the people decide who the mayor is, whatever the outcome, let it be a fair election, not decided by the rules that you pass. Thank you.

167

00:36:32.800 --> 00:36:34.730

Cooper City Hall: Fernando Nunez.

168

00:36:41.410 --> 00:36:44.309

Cooper City Hall: I got the middle way here. One to Orlando.

169

00:36:44.380 --> 00:36:45.810

Cooper City Hall: I got. 3rd place

170

00:36:46.400 --> 00:36:48.339

Cooper City Hall: is the guy.

00:36:48.460 --> 00:36:59.709

Cooper City Hall: We lost one game last sort of 2 game. Saturday 1, 2. This coming up soon. A Saturday race. You guys want to come raise money for race coming up to 1st Olympic race.

172

00:37:00.030 --> 00:37:07.259

Cooper City Hall: And where is that? Nova? Thank you very much. I'll go meet you, Mayor. I'll go, miss you, too. Thank you very much, Fernando.

173

00:37:11.810 --> 00:37:14.959

Cooper City Hall: Anyone else listening to speak who hasn't signed up as yet.

174

00:37:15.580 --> 00:37:16.809

Cooper City Hall: Please step up.

175

00:37:16.830 --> 00:37:19.600

Cooper City Hall: if not anyone, on virtual. No, sir.

176

00:37:19.670 --> 00:37:21.360

Cooper City Hall: we'll close public hearing

177

00:37:21.480 --> 00:37:28.330

Cooper City Hall: move on to the consent. Agenda. Do I have a motion so moved? I'd like to pull 14. Pull 14.

178

00:37:34.160 --> 00:37:35.889

Cooper City Hall: Anything else.

179

00:37:38.040 --> 00:37:46.359

Cooper City Hall: We have 3 through 13. Do I have a motion? Commissioner Green? You motion so moved second and a second by Commissioner Katzman.

180

00:37:46.410 --> 00:37:47.660

Cooper City Hall: Please call the vote

181

00:37:48.920 --> 00:37:50.270

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi.

182

00:37:50.860 --> 00:38:08.850

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Katzman. Yes, Commissioner Schroder. Yes, Commissioner Green. Yes, Mayor Ross. Yes, moving on to item Number 14. Commissioner Schroder. Yes, I I just think the prices here are kind of high. It's going off of the Cma con contract, which is

183

00:38:09.310 --> 00:38:15.290

Cooper City Hall: I I don't want to. I don't want to use the word. Bid it out, because that's not the right word, you know. It's a professional service.

00:38:15.580 --> 00:38:19.281

Cooper City Hall: but I just think it's kind of high. I know there's

185

00:38:19.910 --> 00:38:21.770

Cooper City Hall: There's a lady who

186

00:38:21.830 --> 00:38:32.157

Cooper City Hall: who does this work from Southwest ranches for several cities. Patty Mcclute, Mccloyd, or Hoot Mccloyd. She think she does it for Dania Parkland and everything. She used to work with pines.

187

00:38:32.560 --> 00:38:35.579

Cooper City Hall: so I'd rather at least

188

00:38:35.910 --> 00:38:40.380

Cooper City Hall: reach out and see if there's somebody else who can do this. These services.

189

00:38:40.640 --> 00:38:46.490

Cooper City Hall: If this, if this is what the prices come back like 195 bucks an hour, it's 1 thing, but I think we could probably.

190

00:38:47.120 --> 00:39:08.550

Cooper City Hall: you know, sharpen the pencils, I think, Mississip manager, yeah. And and you and I discussed that yesterday and just have not been able to contact her. So we do need to have this service available. So if you at least approve a few \$1,000 until we can get somebody else on board, I agree with you that the prices are astronomical, because

191

00:39:08.780 --> 00:39:33.440

Cooper City Hall: these are engineering firms, and they really giving you the fully allocated cost of an entire engineering firm as opposed to when you hire one individual. Yeah. So we need to do look into the market. As to who can provide this as an individual versus having, you know, the full loaded cost or or a firm. So. But we do need a few \$1,000 to keep this service available.

192

00:39:33.480 --> 00:39:37.919

Cooper City Hall: So you have that authority, do you not? No, because right now it's already

193

00:39:38.030 --> 00:39:48.250

Cooper City Hall: at my maximum authority. Thank you. So I need 3 \$4,000 at least until you know we can get. You can make a motion for another number.

194

00:39:48.876 --> 00:39:51.330

Cooper City Hall: Let's let me see what you've got.

195

00:39:54.550 --> 00:39:56.609

Cooper City Hall: I'd like to have an arborist.

196

00:39:56.800 --> 00:40:02.899

Cooper City Hall: not a consultant we have. We're Tree City, U.S.A. We have trees

197

00:40:03.160 --> 00:40:10.100

Cooper City Hall: that need to be replaced. We have trees that we have sidewalks that are in desperate need of

198

00:40:10.220 --> 00:40:16.099

Cooper City Hall: repair. We have trees that are in desperate need of reshaping, restructuring.

199

00:40:17.220 --> 00:40:31.889

Cooper City Hall: Everything is neat. I I know you're shaking your head. Yes, I know you're in agreement. But we we need more than just a consultant. A consultant is great, and I I know why you have it here. I read the backup.

200

00:40:32.420 --> 00:40:54.020

Cooper City Hall: I understand that we need them for plan, review, etc. But I think we need them for more than that. And that's why I pulled this, because I understand. We need them to look at plans to, to look at architectural and where? What plants we need, etc. But I think we need someone full time to go around the city and to work

201

00:40:54.130 --> 00:41:19.720

Cooper City Hall: with everything that we have, and to do more with what we have. Because we need to really focus on. We have a whole landscape master plan, and that's great. But unless we fix the problems of all the trees that we have in this city, we're going to be in major trouble. All of these trees need tlc, and we're and they're not getting it. And we were just talking

00:41:19.940 --> 00:41:39.599

Cooper City Hall: one or 2 meetings ago about putting one of our people on the tree trimming crew that that you jobbed out, because, in my opinion, and and there was another person on the Commission that that was in full agreement, that people that work for us have a vested interest

203

00:41:39.950 --> 00:41:48.120

Cooper City Hall: in our city, and that if you work for us and you go, and you're doing a job. And the job is fix this.

204

00:41:48.430 --> 00:42:02.719

Cooper City Hall: But then you see that when you're there to fix a B needs to be done, and C needs to be done. You're our employee. Our employees go above and beyond, and they're also going to fix BC and D,

205

00:42:02.920 --> 00:42:19.630

Cooper City Hall: that's the same exact thing with an arborist. An arborist is not going to go out and just look at one tree. He or she is going to go out and look at the entire block, and in their mind shape the trees and figure out what our workers need to do.

206

00:42:19.720 --> 00:42:41.390

Cooper City Hall: If we have a consultant, they're not going to do that. And if you drive in our city, all of our trees need, they're in desperate need of a work. They're like the sheep. You see on Youtube that they find that have been wandering the fields for 5 years, that are this wide because they have all that extra fur, or whatever sheep

207

00:42:41.400 --> 00:42:55.299

Cooper City Hall: have wool might have been your best analogy. Yeah, but it's the truth. Those are our trees, and the only trees that get trimmed are the ones that the Fp. And L. People come out, and they have the huge bees in them, and that's not good.

00:42:55.300 --> 00:43:11.499

Cooper City Hall: And one of the biggest complaints other than speeding in our city? Are our trees. So to give money to a consultant is not what our city needs. Our city needs an arborist that is going to do what's right for our trees.

209

00:43:12.560 --> 00:43:13.940

Cooper City Hall: Anything further?

210

00:43:15.370 --> 00:43:16.839

Cooper City Hall: Do I have a motion.

211

00:43:17.110 --> 00:43:20.191

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Mayor? I want to clarify a couple of things.

212

00:43:21.090 --> 00:43:24.000

Cooper City Hall: There's a difference between a landscape architect and an arborist.

213

00:43:24.380 --> 00:43:35.059

Cooper City Hall: Okay, the landscape architect is a professional architect. He's somebody who is going to sit in an office review plans that are submitted by by developers, and

214

00:43:35.900 --> 00:43:47.920

Cooper City Hall: is going to be looking at the quantities and type of trees that are being submitted for major major commercial developments. So that is what I call a white collar job.

215

00:43:48.080 --> 00:43:52.510

Cooper City Hall: The arborist is somebody in the field with a blue collar person

216

00:43:52.530 --> 00:43:55.640

Cooper City Hall: who is up there with the tree trimming crews.

217

00:43:56.050 --> 00:43:59.390

Cooper City Hall: teaching them and coaching on how to train tree.

218

00:43:59.750 --> 00:44:04.000

Cooper City Hall: do tree treatment properly. Okay, so this job up here

219

00:44:04.040 --> 00:44:10.110

Cooper City Hall: and this few \$1,000 is, for whenever somebody shows up with plans, this person will review plans

220

00:44:11.200 --> 00:44:32.779

Cooper City Hall: the arborist and the company that we hire, they do have arborists, and I'm trying to get the one person who's in our tree crew leader to become a certified arborist. Certified arbouries is not a professional degree certification that can be achieved, and and I think we have a person there that

00:44:32.780 --> 00:44:42.630

Cooper City Hall: with the right coaching and the right support, he can become the arborist. Now I agree I couldn't agree with you more that the tree situation in the city is

222

00:44:43.470 --> 00:44:57.350

Cooper City Hall: terrible, because for years there has not been any active treatment done. Positions were allocated in the in the budget. But of the 4 people only one position is full.

223

00:44:57.620 --> 00:45:24.539

Cooper City Hall: you know. We're trying to to look at recruit, and we're trying to look at different options but with the contract that we just approved last time in a couple of weeks we're going to start doing for the 1st time in a long time some serious street treatment. Okay? Because all those trees that you say are all the way to the street level under touching the street. If we have a storm they're gonna be. They're gonna be down okay and

224

00:45:25.000 --> 00:45:54.649

Cooper City Hall: we gotta start with the major corridors because you all those trees go down in the major corridors. You're going to not have the ability to provide any kind of services to anybody in emergency response. Our firefighters, our police officers won't be able to get through to those trees, so it is very important that we do that. But I do have a plan of getting somebody to be certified as an Arboys City employee, hopefully, that, you know, can happen over the next few months, because I would like to give the opportunity to that employee to get

225

00:45:55.010 --> 00:45:56.360

Cooper City Hall: that certification.

226

00:45:56.920 --> 00:46:24.790

Cooper City Hall: But but let's not confuse that need with the need to have somebody who is in an office up here reviewing plans. But just so, you know, our old arborist did both of those jobs and did them quite effectively. Just I'm I'm not to argue, but maybe she was certified in both. I don't know her credentials, but she did both. She was sitting in Drc. Reviewed all the plans, went over. What trees? Who went, where what colors, etc.

227

00:46:24.820 --> 00:46:46.939

Cooper City Hall: went, worked with every single developer that we had during her tenure here, and was out in the field and doing, working with the people that cut trees, etc. So again, I don't know what her credentials were. Maybe she was certified in both. I have absolutely no idea. But she did both so we could get someone that could do both. That's a win win for me. But

228

00:46:47.030 --> 00:46:56.490

Cooper City Hall: that's I would just. I just want to make sure that we we work to get that problem sorted out. Thank you. Agree? Agree? Thank you. Do I have a motion? Yes, a motion approved.

229 00:46:56.650 --> 00:46:59.730 Cooper City Hall: \$5,000. Yes, \$5,000.

230

00:46:59.820 --> 00:47:02.270

Cooper City Hall: Do I have a second on that second

231

00:47:02.460 --> 00:47:04.220

Cooper City Hall: any further discussion?

232

00:47:04.270 --> 00:47:05.829

Cooper City Hall: Hearing none. Call the vote.

233

00:47:07.310 --> 00:47:13.780

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi. Yes, Commissioner Katzman. Yes, Commissioner Schroeder. Yes, Commissioner Green. Yes, Mayor Ross. Yes.

234

00:47:13.920 --> 00:47:36.419

Cooper City Hall: moving on to the regular agenda. Item number 15, discussion regarding Killarney Town Twinning and Sister Cities Association. I was contacted by Killarney, essentially advising me that our sign, recognizing the sisterhood we had with the town of Killarney, was missing from Cooper City.

235

00:47:36.420 --> 00:47:47.040

Cooper City Hall: and I don't know for how long it's been missing. I don't know who took it. I don't know where it went. I don't know if anyone knows the history of this. All I know is, it was during Mayor Eisinger's

236

00:47:47.480 --> 00:48:00.900

Cooper City Hall: time that they had a sister city in Killarney. I guess they would like to know whether you wish to continue the sister city program with them, or whether not.

237

00:48:00.980 --> 00:48:27.430

Cooper City Hall: that is a policy that we have to decide. The only other sister cities that I know we have, and I hate calling it sister cities. But it's a very similar type. Program is with Arsali, Italy, and a which I cannot even pronounce. The town in India. Right well can you say the name? I can't. So what do we do for our sister cities? Do we have any sort of policy or not that I'm aware of.

00:48:27.730 --> 00:48:29.150

Cooper City Hall: And where was the sign?

239

00:48:29.300 --> 00:48:37.209

Cooper City Hall: It was on? It was on Griffin Road. I I believe it was on Sterling, but I could be wrong as well.

240

00:48:37.300 --> 00:48:43.009

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, so it it matters not. It's gone now.

241

00:48:43.050 --> 00:48:48.280

Cooper City Hall: It might be in this trees, because the one that says and

242

00:48:48.670 --> 00:49:04.240

Cooper City Hall: what's that was the lady used to be Anne Cole, or something, the County Commissioner. There's a path or something. There's a sign in Griffin and the trees. That's you know, that's our sign. That is, I guess Griffin roads dedicated to her or something, but you can't see it, because the trees are all so maybe the

243

00:49:04.380 --> 00:49:10.320

Cooper City Hall: maybe they can locate the sign. We paid \$10,000 for the sign locating

244

00:49:10.350 --> 00:49:11.420

Cooper City Hall: thing. Member.

00:49:11.440 --> 00:49:19.860

Cooper City Hall: I I don't. I really don't. I think it was done before. What do you mean? Before my time we paid \$10,000 for someone to go locate all our signs and give us. Yeah.

246

00:49:20.280 --> 00:49:22.770

Cooper City Hall: I'm I vote I voted against it.

247

00:49:23.010 --> 00:49:34.660

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, they put it, and I asked for the list, and it was GPS coordinates so I couldn't read it. Well, let me just have a consensus if you would, if you want to continue, and only Killarney is asking, Italy and India are are fine with what we're doing.

248

00:49:35.440 --> 00:49:37.450

Cooper City Hall: You good Commissioner.

249

00:49:37.640 --> 00:49:44.379

Cooper City Hall: you're good, you're good, you're good. Why don't we just put up a like a something in City Hall or something that says arson.

250

00:49:44.540 --> 00:49:57.440

Cooper City Hall: No, you have to put the sign back like they have. They're probably mad because they got it exactly. They've been cleaning for 30 years, and we haven't. It'll cost some money to get another sign, I'm sure. And that's what they're looking for. But

00:49:57.460 --> 00:50:15.319

Cooper City Hall: our consensus is that we do it? Yeah, okay, thank you very much moving on to item number 16. Discussion, possible action to reconsider resolution. 2427. Specifically policy. O. 2 0. 8. Paid holidays and policy. O, 2, 9. Sick leave Commissioner Green.

252

00:50:16.040 --> 00:50:25.169

Cooper City Hall: Thank you. Mayor Ross. At the last Commission meeting on August 27, th we had moved to consent agenda an item

253

00:50:25.984 --> 00:50:40.420

Cooper City Hall: that. Basically the 3 paid holidays that that the employees have enjoyed for a number of years. Columbus Day, Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve. What the commission did then was

254

00:50:41.156 --> 00:50:46.730

Cooper City Hall: make those not take away those days

255

00:50:47.831 --> 00:50:55.270

Cooper City Hall: the the actual days, but taking away the not a lot. Well, let me let me back up.

256

00:50:55.390 --> 00:51:10.237

Cooper City Hall: So those days, in lieu of it being a Columbus Day, Christmas Eve, and New Year's Eve, our employees would have the opportunity to use those 3 day so ever, however, they, however, they chose

257

00:51:11.210 --> 00:51:14.587

Cooper City Hall: During that commission meeting we did receive

258

00:51:15.480 --> 00:51:16.395

Cooper City Hall: the

259

00:51:17.420 --> 00:51:24.250

Cooper City Hall: Employee advisory committee notes from our employees where they had expressed

260

00:51:25.000 --> 00:51:31.300

Cooper City Hall: their desire to continue to have those holidays, Columbus Day.

261

00:51:31.670 --> 00:51:38.729

Cooper City Hall: Christmas Eve, and New Year's Eve. They want that. And so in talking to our employees

262

00:51:39.164 --> 00:51:58.180

Cooper City Hall: the following day they had indicated that, Commissioner, we'd love for the Commission to reconsider that, and I had given them my word that I would bring this back and hoping that this commission will allow for it to revert back to those days

263

00:51:58.400 --> 00:52:05.280

Cooper City Hall: Columbus Day, Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve. Being put it being put back in place

00:52:05.947 --> 00:52:12.090

Cooper City Hall: so that's what that's what I wanted to. I'm hoping that I'll have some support up here from the Commission.

265

00:52:12.260 --> 00:52:13.500

Cooper City Hall: Additionally.

266

00:52:15.326 --> 00:52:18.110

Cooper City Hall: The employees were concerned about

267

00:52:18.290 --> 00:52:23.030

Cooper City Hall: the policy, the manual, the employee manual policy.

268

00:52:23.930 --> 00:52:27.080

Cooper City Hall: I'm gonna get it right. I'm a little tongue tied, but it's gonna come out

269

00:52:27.090 --> 00:52:28.399

Cooper City Hall: at some point

270

00:52:28.900 --> 00:52:34.159

Cooper City Hall: within that policy. There's still ongoing discussion about removing

00:52:34.320 --> 00:52:45.779

Cooper City Hall: taking away the ability for our employees to accrue sick leave, and in its place providing them with. I believe it is 10 Pto. Days.

272

00:52:46.318 --> 00:52:48.150

Cooper City Hall: And I know that

273

00:52:48.250 --> 00:52:50.880

Cooper City Hall: I know that I've heard from a number of our staff.

274

00:52:51.140 --> 00:52:53.099

Cooper City Hall: They do not want that

275

00:52:54.310 --> 00:53:16.500

Cooper City Hall: they lose the. If that happens, they lose the ability to accrue sick leave those Pto days that that would be, provided they don't carry over into the following year. So if they don't use it that year, they lose it, and I'm certainly not in favor of that. I believe that our employees should have the ability

276

00:53:16.520 --> 00:53:38.170

Cooper City Hall: to accrue the sick, leave that it be able to carry over into the following season. I know that earlier at the proclamation and award ceremony, we are recognizing one of our employees whose son has courageously fought cancer.

00:53:38.170 --> 00:53:48.260

Cooper City Hall: It continues to do that. And so I'm thinking about our employees like that. That would need that sick leave to be carried over

278

00:53:48.280 --> 00:53:56.450

Cooper City Hall: into the following year, because you never know what's going to happen. And so I know that I spoke to Mr. Ray

279

00:53:56.580 --> 00:54:04.690

Cooper City Hall: this morning about this. Mr. Ray has assured me that that has not that has not taken place.

280

00:54:05.060 --> 00:54:08.729

Cooper City Hall: And I told Mr. Ray, I need you to tell me that on the record

281

00:54:10.010 --> 00:54:13.030

Cooper City Hall: that has not taken place in terms of

282

00:54:13.100 --> 00:54:14.370

Cooper City Hall: the leave

283

00:54:15.273 --> 00:54:29.470

Cooper City Hall: being converted to 10 Pto days, and the employees not having the ability to accrue sick leave. Am I? Am I correct in what I just left to right, Commissioner? The

00:54:29.840 --> 00:54:38.210

Cooper City Hall: on the sick leave component. We have an employee advisory committee. The employee advisory committee is looking into this.

285

00:54:38.230 --> 00:55:02.669

Cooper City Hall: and they have not provided a recommendation. So we don't know if they provide recommendation to go forward. We don't know what the basis of going forward is going to be so we don't know how it's going to accrue how many days you're going to get. All of that is with the employee advisory committee, and nothing in the approvals that you did at the last meeting change the rules from what they were before.

286

00:55:02.670 --> 00:55:11.479

Cooper City Hall: So so you know. But I did, you know, in my memo, I did say, we're looking into this. Okay? So nothing needs to change today.

287

00:55:11.480 --> 00:55:21.429

Cooper City Hall: because nothing has already nothing has changed. So as it stands right now, the manner in which employees accrue sick time and vacation leave

288

00:55:21.950 --> 00:55:43.870

Cooper City Hall: that is still in place, correct the same way. That was always been okay, the same it and that that information, once you've had the opportunity to discuss that with the employee advisory committee, and they bring forth their recommendation to you. You're going to bring that to the Commission for either approval or

289

00:55:44.090 --> 00:55:50.579

Cooper City Hall: correct. Okay? Correct? Yeah. Because it is one of the policies that require commission approval. If you remember

290

00:55:50.820 --> 00:55:57.819

Cooper City Hall: in what we did last time, we say certain policies will require commission approval. Certain policies will require manager approval.

291

00:55:58.040 --> 00:56:10.471

Cooper City Hall: vacation, and sick leave changes will require commission approval. Okay, so I appreciate that. Thank you, Mr. Ray. But now I'm hoping that my colleagues will support me in

292

00:56:11.326 --> 00:56:24.483

Cooper City Hall: reconsidering the 3 holidays that are in question. Columbus Day, Christmas Eve, and New Year's Eve, and and I have nothing further. I'd like to hear from yeah. And I I as I as I told the Commissioner,

293

00:56:24.980 --> 00:56:52.089

Cooper City Hall: I really don't have an objection, but I wanted to make sure that for the record we understand what I was trying to do, because I thought it was the the possibility of a win win situation. I believe in empowering people to have more control and choices of how they live their lives, and in that sense, having 3 days that you can choose to take. June 19. If you want to

294

00:56:52.100 --> 00:56:53.690

Cooper City Hall: take a

295

00:56:54.110 --> 00:57:13.069

Cooper City Hall: Roshjana or Yokippur if you want to. If that's what your religion, you know calls you for. Yeah, if you want to take Kwansa, you can take, you know, different cultural and religious holidays are more relevant to different individuals. So instead of having the city mandating, you're going to be out just 3 days.

296

00:57:13.470 --> 00:57:23.809

Cooper City Hall: We replace that with saying, you got 3 more days of, you know, floating holiday time, and you choose which ones you want to have so, and then

297

00:57:23.970 --> 00:57:41.954

Cooper City Hall: provided the possibility, not necessarily the reality, of being able to be open to the public at certain times, when we have people here that wanted to to work because they want to take another another holiday. So I was looking at this as being a possibility, or we win win situation.

298

00:57:42.450 --> 00:57:50.110

Cooper City Hall: yes, I I do have heard from some employees who have a concern that at some point management is going to say, well.

299

00:57:50.120 --> 00:58:02.730

Cooper City Hall: everybody needs to be here on the on December 24, th okay, and then and I and I told them, it's like, Well, if I'm here, it's not going to happen if you want, if you, if that's an important holiday for you.

300

00:58:02.810 --> 00:58:05.569

Cooper City Hall: everybody, no, everybody can can take it.

00:58:05.580 --> 00:58:07.439

Cooper City Hall: But I didn't feel that

302

00:58:07.450 --> 00:58:14.299

Cooper City Hall: we, as a city, needed to obligate people to take one down one holiday if they had another holiday that was more important to them.

303

00:58:14.880 --> 00:58:18.180

Cooper City Hall: And but this really is not

304

00:58:18.710 --> 00:58:25.589

Cooper City Hall: mission critical for us to to maintain that that change. So, Commissioner Green, I told you.

305

00:58:25.610 --> 00:58:31.910

Cooper City Hall: I'm okay. If you if you guys want to change, it's it's it's something that we can that I I can live with. I thought it was a win-win.

306

00:58:32.010 --> 00:58:33.639

Cooper City Hall: but if it's not, then no

307

00:58:35.040 --> 00:58:42.849

Cooper City Hall: commission shorter, I I think. It's better to give the employees as 3 floating holidays and

308

00:58:43.140 --> 00:58:52.630

Cooper City Hall: let them see, you know, if it doesn't every year we adopt the holidays. So if it doesn't work out. We can. Just, I think it's more of an issue of change, because it's you're going from

309

00:58:52.680 --> 00:59:03.939

Cooper City Hall: mandating. You take this day off to. Well, if you want to take that one. You can. If not, you pick whatever other one. You know you're, you know, conservative Jewish person. You might take off a lot more of the Jewish holidays.

310

00:59:04.630 --> 00:59:07.900

Cooper City Hall: Then, you know New Year's Eve or Christmas Eve. So

311

00:59:08.000 --> 00:59:10.790

Cooper City Hall: I mean, I feel like we should watch and see how it works this year.

312

00:59:12.020 --> 00:59:14.470

Cooper City Hall: and if everyone wants

313

00:59:14.860 --> 00:59:22.950

Cooper City Hall: Christmas Eve off, then the manager might say, Well, might as well just shut down. I only have one person wants to work it. I wouldn't be opposed to that, but

00:59:22.980 --> 00:59:26.369

Cooper City Hall: I I think it's worth a try letting them see how

315

00:59:26.940 --> 00:59:30.419

Cooper City Hall: how it works. I mean, they're getting the same amount of days just they can use. However, they want

316

00:59:30.730 --> 00:59:33.740

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner catchment. So

317

00:59:34.450 --> 00:59:55.771

Cooper City Hall: what I liked about the proposal was that it was opening City Hall for 3 more days, because our residents contact me, and probably others. When we close they can't get services they can't sign up or pay their water bill. They can't go to the passport office. They can't go to the permitting etc. Or go to the Rock Creek Pool and tennis center.

318

00:59:58.020 --> 01:00:02.850

Cooper City Hall: In my conversation with the manager. We talked about this, and

319

01:00:03.040 --> 01:00:12.800

Cooper City Hall: my understanding was that Christmas Eve was really the day that was of more concern to the employees than the other 2 days. That that is so. That's what I have heard. So

01:00:12.900 --> 01:00:23.265

Cooper City Hall: a proposal would be, make Christmas Eve a closure of city facilities go back to the way it was. But allow 2 floating personal days.

321

01:00:24.650 --> 01:00:31.080

Cooper City Hall: so that people can take off if they if they want to take off on Columbus Day. That's fine, but I don't think City Hall should be closed on Columbus Day.

322

01:00:31.810 --> 01:00:44.130

Cooper City Hall: Most people don't celebrate that holiday for those who do great. But if they, if I want to come in here and yes, I realize that the mail is not delivered and other things. It's a great day to come to the passport office, you know.

323

01:00:44.490 --> 01:00:48.408

Cooper City Hall: So so that's well, I guess Federal Government they'd probably be closed. But

324

01:00:48.800 --> 01:00:53.929

Cooper City Hall: It's a great day. I I just think the more services we offer our residents the better.

325

01:00:53.990 --> 01:01:04.659

Cooper City Hall: I want our employees to be happy. So I'm looking for a compromise here, saying that I'd be open to Christmas Eve being closed 2 personal days replacing New Year's Eve and Columbus.

326

01:01:05.230 --> 01:01:06.040

Cooper City Hall: Thank you.

327

01:01:06.310 --> 01:01:07.900

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Malosi.

328

01:01:09.551 --> 01:01:12.779

Cooper City Hall: So I was thinking in terms of

329

01:01:13.200 --> 01:01:34.340

Cooper City Hall: making. If if there's going to be a compromise, the compromise would be on Columbus Day, because that is not a day that I think is going to make or break anyone, because what I think everybody's losing sight is. Yes, I understand that we want City Hall to be open for services, but you also have to understand that our employees are human beings.

330

01:01:34.570 --> 01:01:42.099

Cooper City Hall: and yes, they have a job. But they also have families. They also want to a lot of their families. Their kids are in school.

331

01:01:42.260 --> 01:02:09.909

Cooper City Hall: They want to potentially go with school, break and maybe see their families that might live far away and use that extra day to go see someone that might not be close by. And you're and sometimes you know that these seasonal times that extra day they might need that little extra day as a decompression day. Can't they just chase it if you let them pick whatever day they want? But here's the thing. When you have

332

01:02:09.910 --> 01:02:17.370

Cooper City Hall: that time. Whether you are, I can tell you right now. I have family that's coming down during Rosh Hashanah. I'm not Jewish.

333

01:02:17.600 --> 01:02:38.890

Cooper City Hall: but I have family that's coming down to visit me because it's Rosh Hashanah, and the schools are closed where my family lives. So they're taking that time because they can. And they're going to decompress down here because they want to see me, because I actually have people that care for me and love me. I know right?

334

01:02:39.110 --> 01:02:46.359

Cooper City Hall: So I actually have people that that want to see me. So they're using that holiday to come down here. Decompress.

335

01:02:46.560 --> 01:02:50.309

Cooper City Hall: get away from the the turmoil that they have up there.

336

01:02:50.530 --> 01:02:51.850

Cooper City Hall: and that's what

337

01:02:52.050 --> 01:02:57.789

Cooper City Hall: our employees also want to do. So, whether you celebrate the holiday or not.

338

01:02:57.950 --> 01:03:13.590

Cooper City Hall: you're going to use that holiday. What you're but you, if you have an entire again. My family's not Jewish, but they're using that Jewish holiday to your advantage. If you have an entire

339

01:03:14.950 --> 01:03:27.079

Cooper City Hall: City Hall that wants to use it, and that place is open. It puts everybody here in a bad situation, because if he is saying All right, City Hall is going to be open

340

01:03:27.590 --> 01:03:36.589

Cooper City Hall: because we want to give this service to our our residents. And now everybody's off. Now you've got to be the bad guy because you're saying, oh, Mr. Smith.

341

01:03:36.590 --> 01:04:01.559

Cooper City Hall: you're going to be working well now, Mr. Smith hates you. You might be smiling to your face, but Mr. Smith hates you, because now he can't take off. Listen, we give more holidays than any other government. It's not a question of what we get personal. So use the Columbus day, because that's not a holiday that I think is gonna make or break

342

01:04:01.560 --> 01:04:08.430

Cooper City Hall: one and use that as the if you want to convert that to a floating holiday. Because if someone wants to take off

343

01:04:08.430 --> 01:04:27.700

Cooper City Hall: an an odd personal day, or whatever, then they can give them leave. The 2 that are here which 2 you. You wanted to use the the day before or after New Year's, and the day before, after Christmas, New Year's Eve the city should shut down New Year's Eve, instead of just letting the person take it off if they want it off

01:04:29.560 --> 01:04:35.659

Cooper City Hall: it. Ryan again. Not. Some people enjoy spending time with their families.

345

01:04:35.730 --> 01:04:56.399

Cooper City Hall: I can take it off. You just indicated that Rosh Hashanah, your family's flying in for Rosh Hashanah. You wouldn't get to take that day off, because it's not on the list. But if I give you the personal because where I live, that is a big holiday right where I used to live, that is a huge holiday. It's a huge holiday in Cooper City, too, but it's not here.

346

01:04:56.420 --> 01:04:58.719

Cooper City Hall: And and Matt, might I add, now.

347

01:04:58.840 --> 01:05:18.240

Cooper City Hall: I think, to the employees, watch out you may get what you wish for, because what you're not counting are the days that the holidays fall on the weekends correct? Oh, my God! That's if now it's going to require. And again, if it falls on the weekend to free before you now you get 3 additional days.

348

01:05:18.290 --> 01:05:25.729

Cooper City Hall: if you do it with you, picking the days, if you do it with us, picking the days, then it's limited.

349

01:05:25.770 --> 01:05:37.599

Cooper City Hall: So I don't think it's a great choice for you, I think, empowering you, and I love the word. Empowering you to choose is a better way to do it. I I would celebrate the Jewish holidays.

01:05:37.610 --> 01:05:39.610

Cooper City Hall: Christmas. I would work.

351

01:05:40.080 --> 01:05:42.430

Cooper City Hall: I would work. It doesn't affect me.

352

01:05:42.750 --> 01:05:45.490

Cooper City Hall: And there are a lot of people in the city like that.

353

01:05:45.640 --> 01:06:01.110

Cooper City Hall: You have to account for all kinds of different people or Christmas Eve, or if Christmas Eve's on a on a Saturday, on a Saturday, the 23, rd we'd be shutting down under that other thing. Am I paying double time when you're working on that holiday? Because that's usually the norm

354

01:06:01.180 --> 01:06:02.639

Cooper City Hall: or time and a half

355

01:06:02.820 --> 01:06:15.749

Cooper City Hall: Christmas? If someone's working, you just said Mayor, that you would work on Christmas. So if you're working on Christmas, that's how much I work on Christmas. Course, it doesn't matter to me. It's another day.

356

01:06:15.750 --> 01:06:33.859

Cooper City Hall: It matters to others, so I'm giving them doing it. The city manager's way, the opportunity to take the time. Why don't we give him the thing, and then if he gets an overwhelming request from the employees for, say, Christmas Eve, then he could just ask us, Hey, can I just shut down Christmas Eve in lieu of one of the days, or something like that.

357

01:06:33.970 --> 01:06:39.760

Cooper City Hall: And and I think the whole point of this in a it's great discussion that we're having.

358

01:06:39.960 --> 01:06:42.739

Cooper City Hall: and to the employees

359

01:06:43.479 --> 01:06:49.490

Cooper City Hall: who are part of the employee advisory committee. The recommendation that they have brought

360

01:06:49.590 --> 01:06:52.139

Cooper City Hall: to the city manager was

361

01:06:52.900 --> 01:06:56.139

Cooper City Hall: just allow that to continue to happen.

362

01:06:56.290 --> 01:07:22.970

Cooper City Hall: Columbus Day, Christmas Eve, and New Year's Eve, if there are other times that they want to take off, and that they and and which has been the norm here in the city. If there are other

holidays or time that they want to take off, they are fully aware that they're going to have to use their personal vacation time in order to do that. And so it's right back for me. I heard what

363

01:07:23.990 --> 01:07:26.990

Cooper City Hall: the employees said through

364

01:07:27.050 --> 01:07:29.400

Cooper City Hall: the employee advisory Committee.

365

01:07:29.990 --> 01:07:38.679

Cooper City Hall: what their preference are. I look at it as this is an opportunity to build up our staff, who's been worn down.

366

01:07:38.850 --> 01:07:45.689

Cooper City Hall: beat down for so many years. We have got to make sure that we are building them up. And one of the ways that we can do that.

367

01:07:46.013 --> 01:07:57.779

Cooper City Hall: It's just hearing them and saying, Okay, if this is what you want, we thought that doing it differently would make it better for you. We hear you, and we're going to allow for you to to be a part of that process.

368

01:07:58.120 --> 01:08:15.400

Cooper City Hall: Thank you. I agree with Commissioner Katzman. I think Columbus Day is the day as a hybrid, if you will, that we can play with. I don't have a problem in doing that. But I I'd say, let's try it. See how it works. Let's see if that doesn't satisfy everyone's

369

01:08:15.510 --> 01:08:21.010

Cooper City Hall: me. I'd like to try it. How it is we just passed it, and I don't have a problem with that, either.

370

01:08:21.160 --> 01:08:22.330

Cooper City Hall: I really don't.

371

01:08:22.580 --> 01:08:26.199

Cooper City Hall: So I'm going to make a motion to reconsider the paid holidays.

372

01:08:26.760 --> 01:08:44.199

Cooper City Hall: Do I have a second on the motion. I want to clarify that, please. You want to make it the motion to where we're going to keep all of them the way that used to be. Yep, I'll second that. It's just a motion, for it's just to reconsider first.st So it's a simple motion to reconsider. Do I have a motion a second on that I did. Yes.

373

01:08:44.340 --> 01:08:54.089

Cooper City Hall: any further discussion on the motion to reconsider not the issue of what's to be reconsidered, just that we reconsider anything further on that, hearing nothing called the vote.

374

01:08:55.439 --> 01:09:02.199

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi. Yes, Commissioner Katzman. Yes, Commissioner Schroeder. Commissioner Green. Yes, Mayor Ross. Yes.

375

01:09:02.649 --> 01:09:30.270

Cooper City Hall: Now let's talk about the reconsideration. I'd like to make a motion to revert back to in terms of the paid holidays, revert back to what it was prior to August 27, th which is Columbus Day, New Year's Eve and Christmas Eve. You have a second second. Any further discussion? Can I add one thing. Discussion? Yes, what about? I don't. I don't know if this really affects any departments. But what if there's a department that only has

376

01:09:30.609 --> 01:09:33.010

Cooper City Hall: one person or 2 people in it?

377

01:09:33.050 --> 01:09:37.279

Cooper City Hall: And they both celebrate that same holiday. Then one of them.

378

01:09:37.670 --> 01:09:39.370

Cooper City Hall: the one person or

379

01:09:39.479 --> 01:09:42.320

Cooper City Hall: one of the 2, would be denied

380

01:09:42.590 --> 01:09:46.020

Cooper City Hall: that holiday logically, because the Department

01:09:46.250 --> 01:10:01.479

Cooper City Hall: needs one or both, or one of those 2 people to run right or wrong. I'm asking the city manager. I'm not asking you, Ryan said, with love. Yes, then we will close our unit. Then what we will close that unit. See, he he is

382

01:10:01.890 --> 01:10:12.590

Cooper City Hall: today. We have 3 days that were fully closed right except for parks, public works, utilities, people, those people are actually working on those days. So we're really talking about City Hall.

383

01:10:13.050 --> 01:10:18.050

Cooper City Hall: And you know, so community development finance clerk's office.

384

01:10:19.680 --> 01:10:24.460

Cooper City Hall: If you end up with a situation that everybody wants to take those 3 days

385

01:10:24.580 --> 01:10:27.610

Cooper City Hall: in the days that would have historically taken them.

386

01:10:27.930 --> 01:10:30.360

Cooper City Hall: then you're no worse off than today.

387

01:10:30.520 --> 01:10:33.530

Cooper City Hall: But if it just happens that you have.

388

01:10:33.590 --> 01:10:37.690

Cooper City Hall: you know, people with different desires as to when to take the time off.

389

01:10:38.300 --> 01:10:42.670

Cooper City Hall: then you do have the opportunity to have more open service to the public.

390

01:10:42.870 --> 01:10:52.869

Cooper City Hall: Yeah. But yeah, if if you have 2 people in one unit and they and they want to close. Then that that day we don't offer whatever that service is, and we just yes, we need to

391

01:10:52.930 --> 01:11:02.339

Cooper City Hall: get good at communicating to the public. What's going to be open or not open on any given days? And we need to have a planned calendar as to when things are going to happen.

392

01:11:02.660 --> 01:11:03.540

Cooper City Hall: Yeah.

393

01:11:03.650 --> 01:11:07.070

Cooper City Hall: But if I'm going, my goal is to respect

394

01:11:07.220 --> 01:11:29.310

Cooper City Hall: what they want to do. No. Now, if in doing this, it turns out that I can provide more service. I can have more days open. Then I'm going to do that. But I'm not going to force somebody to come in on you on this on Christmas Eve, if they don't want to come in because they're going to be disgruntled, and they're going to be not happy about having to be here. So that's not an employee that I want them to

395

01:11:29.310 --> 01:11:38.980

Cooper City Hall: be attending the public if they're grumpy, that they have to be here so that will be counterproductive. So I will close that that section for that day, Commissioner Katzman.

396

01:11:39.450 --> 01:11:43.800

Cooper City Hall: Well, 1st of all, I I want to be clear that I think we all want

397

01:11:44.200 --> 01:11:55.568

Cooper City Hall: to show our appreciation for the employees is just finding different ways, because I know that if it was me as the employee I would want more flexibility, but I understand, and I respect the voice of the Committee.

398

01:11:56.110 --> 01:11:59.509

Cooper City Hall: I would like to propose a friendly amendment to

399

01:11:59.710 --> 01:12:00.540

Cooper City Hall: keep

400

01:12:00.980 --> 01:12:05.110

Cooper City Hall: New Year's Eve, Christmas Eve, and convert Columbus Day to a

401

01:12:05.600 --> 01:12:31.999

Cooper City Hall: personal floating day so that people can choose. Do you accept that friendly amendment? Well, can I? You want to discuss? You can discuss. Yeah, I want to discuss. I think this is an example of not liking change, because there's no logic in it, because you can literally pick the same day that you mandated to take off before, or you couldn't come to work on that day because we didn't take away the holiday. We took away 3 and gave them 3. They can use anytime they want.

402

01:12:32.030 --> 01:12:41.050

Cooper City Hall: So your whole Rosh Hashanah story would work better if you could use those 3 when your family came in, and September, October, whenever it is

403

01:12:41.310 --> 01:12:52.970

Cooper City Hall: as opposed to mandating it be Christmas Eve, New Year's Eve, and whatever whatever else, here's the other thing that the employees probably don't realize. Every year we re-adopt the holiday list

404

01:12:53.050 --> 01:13:03.059

Cooper City Hall: every year. We don't readopt the the personal days so you could get it right back, and next year you may lose the holiday. So you're gaining 3 in perpetuity

405

01:13:04.210 --> 01:13:11.849

Cooper City Hall: or refusing change and holding on to the mandated 3 that you get this year, it makes no sense. But if

01:13:11.990 --> 01:13:21.530

Cooper City Hall: you know it's not change, I just want to make sure that the amendment the amendment has been made do as the maker of the motion. Do you accept the amendment?

407

01:13:21.750 --> 01:13:24.950

Cooper City Hall: No, I'm gonna stick with what the call about

408

01:13:25.980 --> 01:13:29.619

Cooper City Hall: a vote on the amendment. No, you're on your guys. Yeah.

409

01:13:31.160 --> 01:13:33.650

Cooper City Hall: no change. Vote on no change. Exactly.

410

01:13:34.040 --> 01:13:35.350

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi.

411

01:13:36.080 --> 01:13:43.149

Cooper City Hall: Yes, for Joe Commissioner Katzman. No Commissioner Schroeder, no. Commissioner Green. Yes, Mayor Ross. No

412

01:13:44.070 --> 01:13:49.229

Cooper City Hall: any other motions. I like to make a motion to give off Christmas Eve.

01:13:49.280 --> 01:13:50.589

Cooper City Hall: New Year's Eve

414

01:13:50.760 --> 01:13:54.960

Cooper City Hall: and make Columbus Day a floating holiday. Do I have a second

415

01:13:55.720 --> 01:14:01.989

Cooper City Hall: just better than nothing. Try it for one year, and sit and see how it works, and then let the manager decide.

416

01:14:02.560 --> 01:14:08.870

Cooper City Hall: I'm sorry. Is that a second or not. Okay, do I have a second? I'll second that for discussion. We have a second for discussion.

417

01:14:09.160 --> 01:14:10.520

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Cashman.

418

01:14:11.190 --> 01:14:13.359

Cooper City Hall: Nothing further, Commissioner Green.

419

01:14:16.310 --> 01:14:23.239

Cooper City Hall: So I want to make sure that's the floating holiday, and if our employees, if they want to continue to take that.

420

01:14:23.310 --> 01:14:28.239

Cooper City Hall: that will be at their discretion. Is that correct, Mr. Ray. That is correct, sir. Okay.

421

01:14:29.670 --> 01:14:31.140

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Schroeder.

422

01:14:32.450 --> 01:14:36.710

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi. I'm gonna support it because it's a compromise

423

01:14:37.660 --> 01:14:38.720

Cooper City Hall: called Vote

424

01:14:40.040 --> 01:14:46.289

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi. Yes, Commissioner Gatsman. Yes, Commissioner Schroeder. Commissioner Green. Yes, Mayor Ross. Yes.

425

01:14:46.890 --> 01:14:48.030

Cooper City Hall: moving

426

01:14:50.440 --> 01:14:59.600

Cooper City Hall: moving on to pay for no choice. Let her not go there moving on to consider

427

01:15:00.140 --> 01:15:25.989

Cooper City Hall: ordinance on 1st reading ordinance, 2422, Jacob. It's item number 17. Thank you, Mayor Commissioner, for the record. The item is an ordinance of the city of Cooper City, Florida, ratifying and confirming a Retirement Health Insurance Benefit for certain former members of the City Commission, confirming a Retirement, health insurance benefit for current and future members of the City Commission fighting for conflicts, severability of fighting for an effective date and Mayor Commission, if I may just very briefly, at your last commission meeting.

428

01:15:25.990 --> 01:15:42.339

Cooper City Hall: may recall that I was provided with direction to bring back an ordinance ratifying the retirement health insurance benefit for the city's former and several current elected officials who receive a retirement benefit plan under the city's former personnel. Manual

429

01:15:42.619 --> 01:15:56.050

Cooper City Hall: that personnel manual, we know, goes back to at least as early as 1999. I believe it goes back somewhat prior to that. The ordinance before you this evening ratifies that benefit, pursuant to your charter, which was amended in 2,002 requiring an ordinance.

430

01:15:56.330 --> 01:16:16.620

Cooper City Hall: the other component of the benefit which the Commission excuse me of the ordinance which the Commission directed was to provide somewhat of a shell or a framework for a future benefit for current and future members of the Commission as drafted. This ordinance does provide a benefit essentially undoing the Commission's intent to withdraw that benefit in 2,012,

431

01:16:16.620 --> 01:16:35.630

Cooper City Hall: because, due to some procedural issues which we've discussed and reinstating the benefit, although the ultimate policy, as it relates to the current and future members of the Commission, is within your discretion. Thank you, Mayor. Thank you. If you would just give a slight history because of the statements made by some of the public. The residents in in the public

432

01:16:35.630 --> 01:16:47.740

Cooper City Hall: may not understand what is now required, and why it's required. What is now required is not, can I? Can I give it? This is my item, but fair enough.

433

01:16:47.740 --> 01:16:51.500

Cooper City Hall: No, thank you. So

434

01:16:51.839 --> 01:17:11.510

Cooper City Hall: glad, Gladys, I didn't get your last name and your neighbor. What happened was the easiest way to to get hundreds of thousands of dollars worth of benefits without the public knowing is to slide it through like a 95 page manual, 2 or 3 lines that no one knows about. And that's what happened. And

435

01:17:11.990 --> 01:17:13.949

Cooper City Hall: we had a charter amendment

436

01:17:14.030 --> 01:17:27.510

Cooper City Hall: not too long ago, 22 years ago, in in 2,002 that required any benefits that we receive must be done by ordinance, which means you have to do a public reading of it twice and bring it forward, and we have no ordinances

01:17:27.660 --> 01:17:31.860

Cooper City Hall: with any of those benefits. So by practice. We have

438

01:17:33.280 --> 01:17:35.960

Cooper City Hall: commissioners, former commissioners, and

439

01:17:37.800 --> 01:17:41.999

Cooper City Hall: everybody. Before Mayor Ross gets insurance for life.

440

01:17:42.600 --> 01:17:50.619

Cooper City Hall: and when you try to track it down it comes back to these personnel manuals that were adopted, not by ordinance.

441

01:17:50.660 --> 01:18:02.750

Cooper City Hall: but by resolution, dealing mostly with employees, and so like in, for example, if you look at the 1,999 one. It's on page 74, of 85 pages, where it adds these

442

01:18:02.910 --> 01:18:10.389

Cooper City Hall: benefits, where you get hundreds of thousands of dollars. So when this item and the next item, when this came to my attention, that

443

01:18:10.430 --> 01:18:20.169

Cooper City Hall: none are, none of our benefits were adopted by ordinance as required by law. I don't think it's procedural. Mr. Horowitz calls it procedural. I don't think it's procedural. I think it's

01:18:20.230 --> 01:18:22.479

Cooper City Hall: it's more than procedural. So

445

01:18:23.170 --> 01:18:48.659

Cooper City Hall: I said, we need to ratify that. And what we asked, or what I thought we asked. Last meeting was for Mr. Horowitz to come back with some type of template. So we can have that tough conversation. Now as to these insurance for life. Now, what happened? The history of it was in 20 in 2,012. The Then Commission stopped that benefit for anyone 1st elected after them.

446

01:18:48.860 --> 01:18:51.720

Cooper City Hall: even though they weren't all vested at the time.

447

01:18:51.760 --> 01:18:57.599

Cooper City Hall: And so anyone 1st elected in 2,012 no longer receives insurance for life.

448

01:18:57.690 --> 01:19:01.160

Cooper City Hall: Anyone before that does and

449

01:19:01.270 --> 01:19:03.759

Cooper City Hall: like we said, that's through a bunch of

450

01:19:04.640 --> 01:19:13.309

Cooper City Hall: personnel manuals that are almost 100 pages, and and were, I guess, voted on, probably on a consent agenda who knows? So

451

01:19:13.770 --> 01:19:16.550

Cooper City Hall: right now, the issue we have is

452

01:19:16.690 --> 01:19:24.169

Cooper City Hall: we have people who are have been receiving this benefit for years, and Mr. Horowitz is telling us that it was his advice that we don't cut it off.

453

01:19:24.620 --> 01:19:39.859

Cooper City Hall: regardless of whether we think it was done right or not. And and we have to have that tough conversation that was supposed to happen, or maybe happened in 2,012, I don't know but wasn't done by law. And and so that's where we're at right now. The the way it's proposed like.

454

01:19:39.900 --> 01:19:43.090

Cooper City Hall: it's even kind of hard to understand what we get right now. So

455

01:19:43.160 --> 01:19:55.239

Cooper City Hall: I have to pay a portion of my. I pay my employee portion like you guys would in in the Federal government for my family on my insurance. But some of my colleagues get 100% paid for.

456

01:19:55.340 --> 01:20:16.610

Cooper City Hall: and it there's really no rhyme or reason to why it happens. Even if you looked at those personnel manuals, it says if you're retired, only you and your spouse would be 100% covered. But your

dependents you would pay for, and they're not doing that right now at the city. So there's really there's no rhyme or reason as to who's getting what and it's all over the place.

457

01:20:16.830 --> 01:20:18.320

Cooper City Hall: And so

458

01:20:18.760 --> 01:20:23.819

Cooper City Hall: now here lies the tough decision on, you know, as it currently stands.

459

01:20:23.850 --> 01:20:26.679

Cooper City Hall: The 3 of us are not entitled to this

460

01:20:27.050 --> 01:20:28.569

Cooper City Hall: not legal benefit.

461

01:20:29.300 --> 01:20:34.690

Cooper City Hall: Everyone before that would be. When I say legal. I'm saying it wasn't adopted by ordinance, which is, which was

462

01:20:34.890 --> 01:20:56.309

Cooper City Hall: has been required by our city charter for 22 years. So in 22 years, every single time they went and got benefits again. It was never done, never advertised as an ordinance, which is 2 readings. It was actually like a I think, one or 2 lines in a 90 something page manual. So the question is, I don't personally have any interest in cutting off

01:20:56.660 --> 01:20:58.170

Cooper City Hall: people who were vested.

464

01:20:59.170 --> 01:21:04.640

Cooper City Hall: I do think we need to ratify that. And we have to have a tough conversation. How we're going to do that yep, absolutely.

465

01:21:04.700 --> 01:21:13.490

Cooper City Hall: Can we weigh in on this, since we've not allowed to explain why he put it on. Well, that's Commissioner Green. Okay, thank you very much, Mayor Ross.

466

01:21:14.457 --> 01:21:21.789

Cooper City Hall: I've heard the discussion that has gone on. What has not been said is that this particular benefit

467

01:21:21.970 --> 01:21:23.459

Cooper City Hall: has been in place

468

01:21:23.750 --> 01:21:47.809

Cooper City Hall: back since 2,000 and or 1,999. Mr. Horowitz, quite possibly at at least as far back as 1999. It is contained within the July 1999, personnel manual. Okay, so back to 1999, Commissioner strouter. You made mention of the fact that in 2,002 all of that had to be ratified. So what you're saying in essence is that

01:21:47.840 --> 01:22:00.619

Cooper City Hall: this was d1. 0, I'm going to ask Mr. Horowitz this Mr. Horowitz, prior to 2,002 this to your legal opinion.

470

01:22:01.270 --> 01:22:20.940

Cooper City Hall: Was it done properly, as far as you can see, dating back to 1,999, or before prior to 2,002, the commission benefits did not require an ordinance. Okay? So I want to make sure that the that the public hears that prior to 2,002, it did not require an ordinance.

471

01:22:21.060 --> 01:22:41.720

Cooper City Hall: 1st and foremost, I know that at at the last Commission meeting that some of my colleagues had made mention of the fact that once I got up here in 2,010, after I had, after I would have been in position to receive that benefit. And let me just talk about what the criteria is

472

01:22:41.720 --> 01:22:54.969

Cooper City Hall: which is still in place today. The criteria for that health insurance benefit is that you would have to have been elected to 3 full time 3, 4 year terms

473

01:22:55.120 --> 01:23:06.669

Cooper City Hall: in the city. It is not an it's not a given for a 1 term elected official or 2 term elected official. It is 3, 4 year terms.

474

01:23:06.840 --> 01:23:14.909

Cooper City Hall: So when I, when I arrived up here in 2,010, that benefit had been in place since 1,999.

01:23:15.440 --> 01:23:22.710

Cooper City Hall: The steps that I, the vote that I casted was for us to close that benefit.

476

01:23:23.750 --> 01:23:43.349

Cooper City Hall: but for you to keep the benefit, to keep the benefit that was in yourself to keep the okay. I had no control over the fact that that benefit had been in place since 1,999 since 1,999. And we weren't, and we none of us was up here.

477

01:23:43.400 --> 01:23:55.460

Cooper City Hall: I didn't even realize that until 2,010, that that was an actual benefit that had been in place since 1,999 to your point, Mr. To Mayor Ross

478

01:23:55.640 --> 01:24:02.360

Cooper City Hall: when I came up here in 2,010 Mayor Ross, I've never taken the city's health insurance and

479

01:24:02.380 --> 01:24:13.310

Cooper City Hall: please contact Hr. The city manager. I have taken a stipend. If anybody wants to see it as public record, I have my own insurance with

480

01:24:13.350 --> 01:24:14.840

Cooper City Hall: the Federal Government.

481

01:24:15.060 --> 01:24:19.859

Cooper City Hall: I I deliberately did not take the insurance here

482

01:24:20.360 --> 01:24:31.959

Cooper City Hall: in an effort to save the city money. The city does provide me and others a few others up here with the stipend, who has insurance with their other employers.

483

01:24:31.980 --> 01:24:35.470

Cooper City Hall: I decided I voted back then.

484

01:24:35.610 --> 01:24:41.450

Cooper City Hall: based on where we were as a city financially, to close that.

485

01:24:41.960 --> 01:24:52.620

Cooper City Hall: So I want to make sure that that is clear in the minds of folks that are sitting here and that are watching. I did not. I didn't close a benefit.

486

01:24:54.200 --> 01:24:57.130

Cooper City Hall: moving forward, knowing that

487

01:24:57.570 --> 01:25:04.860

Cooper City Hall: I was going to receive the the benefit. I had no idea. In 2,000. I didn't know if I was going to be elected to 3 4 year terms, Mayor Ross.

01:25:04.900 --> 01:25:09.469

Cooper City Hall: so I can't. I can't! I can't. I couldn't just automatically assume that that was going to happen.

489

01:25:09.700 --> 01:25:18.089

Cooper City Hall: and I don't believe anybody can to Commissioner Commissioner Schroeder's point. It is something that we have to think about

490

01:25:18.130 --> 01:25:19.500

Cooper City Hall: moving forward.

491

01:25:19.600 --> 01:25:27.340

Cooper City Hall: And that's what this discussion is about tonight. I just wanted to provide some further clarification as to

492

01:25:27.440 --> 01:25:29.950

Cooper City Hall: my thought process

493

01:25:29.970 --> 01:25:34.390

Cooper City Hall: when I came on the dais in 2,010. Thank you, Mayor rossorder.

494

01:25:34.590 --> 01:25:48.899

Cooper City Hall: Yeah. And and so, and this is really, it's easier to think of. This is not as what we currently receive. But this is like the retirement health insurance, so to say. But in 2,012, when they voted to stop it, it didn't stop with everybody vested then

495

01:25:48.910 --> 01:25:51.770

Cooper City Hall: that would say, anybody vested now gets it.

496

01:25:51.810 --> 01:25:55.289

Cooper City Hall: The language says anybody 1st elected after us.

497

01:25:55.360 --> 01:25:57.169

Cooper City Hall: even though we're not vested yet.

498

01:25:57.340 --> 01:26:10.219

Cooper City Hall: So that would be like me saying right now, I don't know if I'm going to elect to another term. I'll tell you right now if this benefit continued. You know what it cost the city, because when you know, if I if I do 3 terms, I would leave at like 44 years old.

499

01:26:10.390 --> 01:26:30.750

Cooper City Hall: and that would mean for 21 years. The city would be paying for. You know, it's a lot of money again depends on which rule you're looking at. If you're looking at the 1,999 rule. You have to be. No, this you pay 50% up until no, no, it's it also says that you have to be at least 50 years of age. Jacob, what's it? Say it says you pay 50%

500

01:26:30.750 --> 01:26:42.269

Cooper City Hall: of it up until you're 50, right? So it's page 74. Thank you, Commissioner part part of the challenge in this equation the Personnel Manual was amended in 99

501

01:26:42.270 --> 01:26:49.300

Cooper City Hall: in 2,001 in 2,006 in 2,008 in 2,010, and 2,012,

502

01:26:49.430 --> 01:26:53.689

Cooper City Hall: and and subsequently after that, but for for operative purposes, purposes of discussion.

503

01:26:53.720 --> 01:27:05.619

Cooper City Hall: the language in each of those manuals is not always identical, and Commissioner Schroder is right. The 99 manual references, payment of 50% for those elected officials who had not reached the age of 50.

504

01:27:06.060 --> 01:27:10.240

Cooper City Hall: Okay, thank you, Mr. Horowitz, but does it say in any of the other amended

505

01:27:10.350 --> 01:27:17.960

Cooper City Hall: manuals that you have read through. i i believe that the I believe the 50% language was deleted in subsequent versions.

506

01:27:17.980 --> 01:27:21.840

Cooper City Hall: I'm talking about the the age that you have to be in order.

01:27:21.920 --> 01:27:26.800

Cooper City Hall: The criteria elected to 3 terms reach the age of 50 years old

508

01:27:27.410 --> 01:27:28.540

Cooper City Hall: even at that.

509

01:27:29.020 --> 01:27:45.859

Cooper City Hall: What? Yeah. You know, you said 44. I said, 50. Okay? All right. So that would, you know, 50 to 65, 15 years of it, you know it. So it's a big thing. But the problem is every single time one of those has been changed. None of it has done been done by ordinance, which is what it's required, you know.

510

01:27:45.920 --> 01:27:58.210

Cooper City Hall: and so it's got to be ratified even today, even if and I don't know which language you want to go off of, because if you go off the 99 claiming that was a legal one, because it didn't require ordinance. Then.

511

01:27:58.300 --> 01:28:12.030

Cooper City Hall: you know, that's why I picked that one, because any of them after that is definitely not, was definitely not passed the right way. It's supposed to be, but also the personal manual, like on the front page of it, says, this is not a contract for benefits this doesn't give you. This is just tells you how we're doing it.

512

01:28:14.090 --> 01:28:15.990

Cooper City Hall: then we get to today.

01:28:16.000 --> 01:28:20.360

Cooper City Hall: The current Commissioners pay more than the former commissioners, and I don't know how that is

514

01:28:20.370 --> 01:28:23.420

Cooper City Hall: so like. Some of the people up here don't have to pay anything

515

01:28:23.570 --> 01:28:28.610

Cooper City Hall: so, and and we have retired commissioners that are.

516

01:28:29.040 --> 01:28:32.019

Cooper City Hall: even though the plan only covers them and their spouse

517

01:28:32.690 --> 01:28:34.260

Cooper City Hall: one of the versions of it.

518

01:28:34.330 --> 01:28:37.360

Cooper City Hall: There's the city's still paying for their entire family.

519

01:28:37.700 --> 01:28:38.900

Cooper City Hall: So

01:28:39.580 --> 01:28:42.239

Cooper City Hall: it needs to be cleaned up. I don't care what you guys want to do.

521

01:28:42.350 --> 01:28:45.469

Cooper City Hall: We just have to. My intent is we ratify it.

522

01:28:45.700 --> 01:29:10.700

Cooper City Hall: and we are able to give to the Hr. Department. This is the rules, because right now we couldn't figure out who has to pay what and why. And this all came, came up, and and so Miss Pilate asked about the next item which came up with this item, and I know Miss Pilate very well, and I think you know we have a good understanding of each other. How both items came up was because the new Finance person.

523

01:29:10.990 --> 01:29:22.759

Cooper City Hall: when they, when he came in he told me I owed a lot of money for my my insurance, and I said, Well, one, I've been donating my portion to the city's nonprofit and number 2, I don't take a salary.

524

01:29:22.970 --> 01:29:28.430

Cooper City Hall: And so when I started getting into what I, you know, okay, show me where the benefits are, why do I? Even

525

01:29:28.590 --> 01:29:39.029

Cooper City Hall: then I found something that said all of our insurance supposed to be paid for, and then that was in 2,014, and so that opened this huge can of worms. And then, when it's going to come up with the next item, when the next item came up.

526

01:29:39.700 --> 01:29:51.510

Cooper City Hall: I don't know if if former Commissioner Curran told you guys but I called him up and said there could be an aspect of this that would impact you. So you should look into it, too. So I know I heard this election interference thing.

527

01:29:51.510 --> 01:30:09.959

Cooper City Hall: but and you did that so nicely. Mr. Kern wouldn't have known about it if I didn't call him and tell him, and I only did that because a mutual friend of mine said you got to tell him because you don't want them so not to get into that one, because that could be a spirited thing. But at the end of the day all these benefits have to be ratified by ordinance because we have been required to do it for 22 years, and we haven't done it

528

01:30:10.170 --> 01:30:17.359

Cooper City Hall: at all. So you guys tell me what? How much of the public's money you want to spend? I stand to benefit the most as the youngest.

529

01:30:17.930 --> 01:30:23.320

Cooper City Hall: This would be a phenomenal thing, but I don't think it's right to, you know. Have the city pay for.

530

01:30:23.490 --> 01:30:35.730

Cooper City Hall: you know, insurance for, however, 50 from 50 to 65, or 44 to 6, whatever you, whatever it is. But I'm open to doing whatever you guys want as long as we ratify by ordinance, and then the residents can

01:30:35.840 --> 01:30:42.680

Cooper City Hall: theoretically throw things at us as as opposed to site, sliding it into a personnel. Manual commission. Katzman.

532

01:30:44.594 --> 01:30:52.609

Cooper City Hall: Well, I will say that I think the city is spending an astronomical amount, and I will echo the the some of the residents.

533

01:30:52.971 --> 01:31:00.840

Cooper City Hall: I just was speaking with the city manager and the finance through, and the finance director through him, because I asked for a list of all the

534

01:31:00.960 --> 01:31:10.309

Cooper City Hall: amounts that we've paid, and it's not complete. But I can tell you that the list that I have in front of me, and that I think my colleagues have in front of them. It totals

535

01:31:10.450 --> 01:31:13.370

Cooper City Hall: 1.5 million dollars

536

01:31:13.727 --> 01:31:20.269

Cooper City Hall: I don't have that page. You don't have this page. I want to know how we have something without backup.

01:31:20.290 --> 01:31:22.115

Cooper City Hall: How's that happen? I don't have

538

01:31:22.670 --> 01:31:44.949

Cooper City Hall: I have this. Where's that little list that you have? They're in the back. You have more copies of that, so I can read it for everybody. \$366,000, John Sims \$290,000, Lisa Melosi, \$192,000, James Curran, 290,

539

01:31:45.060 --> 01:31:47.970

Cooper City Hall: \$7,000, Jeff Green.

540

01:31:47.980 --> 01:32:01.300

Cooper City Hall: low, Baller over here. \$87,000, Greg. Ross 146 low low number no, No. 80. So 87, \$87,000 for what these are your

541

01:32:01.390 --> 01:32:03.780

Cooper City Hall: since day, one of being

542

01:32:03.950 --> 01:32:28.590

Cooper City Hall: a Commissioner. How much money that has been paid toward your benefits! But I don't have health insurance. You get a stipend \$325 a month. Compare adds up for 14 years. I'm just reading the document given. Can I just read the document. You can challenge it if you'd like Greg Ross, \$146,000. Howard Meltzer. \$24. Don't know how that happened.

01:32:29.195 --> 01:32:36.770

Cooper City Hall: Mossimopolcini. \$24,000 myself, Jeremy Katzman. \$6,400, \$6,400,

544

01:32:37.360 --> 01:33:02.789

Cooper City Hall: Ryan Schroeder. \$66,000. I'm rounding either way that totals 1.4 7 8 million dollars, and that does not include several elected officials who are getting those benefits that I will read from the monthly sheet that I have, also that I believe we all have in front of us. Bartleman, Eisenman, Hayling, Charlotte Warsh Webster.

545

01:33:03.520 --> 01:33:09.739

Cooper City Hall: I'm just. I'm just putting it out because we don't have backup on on the agenda of how much money

546

01:33:10.020 --> 01:33:20.349

Cooper City Hall: I didn't put this item. No, no, but I'm saying is, that's the problem. So do you want us to post this? No, I want to know why we don't have backup.

547

01:33:20.370 --> 01:33:36.310

Cooper City Hall: I agree we should have transparency. We should send the spreadsheet out to the Commissioner Katzman to. And I'm going to agree with Commissioner Schoder. This is inaccurate, because we have one list that that have a number of folks on there, and then we have another list.

548

01:33:37.550 --> 01:33:51.030

Cooper City Hall: We have another list that doesn't. Well, you're talking about the lifetime. Yeah, right? You're talking about a lifetime benefit. I want to make sure that I'm hearing you correctly. So, Commissioner Katzman. On one list we have Eisinger

01:33:51.030 --> 01:34:14.540

Cooper City Hall: Klein Farleman Webster warsh. And on this list you don't have that correct. So that's what I just went and asked the manager to go. Okay, so this is not in. So this is not a it doesn't mean it's inaccurate. It just means that it's not complete. It's not complete, but it's not accurate, because it has, for, like me, like 2,300. And remember we they didn't take out my contribution to that right?

550

01:34:14.540 --> 01:34:34.010

Cooper City Hall: So you have to like I don't know. So I contribute. But Commissioner Melosi doesn't have to contribute. So I contribute like, 10,000 a year. Okay, well, this is what am I? Am I reading something that's completely inaccurate. Or am I reading something? That's true? So so, according to our city staff.

551

01:34:34.200 --> 01:34:45.639

Cooper City Hall: this is an accurate depiction of the benefits that have been paid out to commissioners. I'm asking for the updated list with everybody's name, and I'm asking them to post this as backup to the agenda, so everyone can see it.

552

01:34:45.980 --> 01:34:49.910

Cooper City Hall: My, my point is that it's it's

553

01:34:50.070 --> 01:35:03.870

Cooper City Hall: this. This spending has got to stop especially lifetime, I, I think, is a is a huge issue. I'm not looking to cut benefits because I don't think it's legal for people who are already vested.

554

01:35:03.910 --> 01:35:09.240

Cooper City Hall: But I think, moving forward, we need to stop this, and we need to put it into an ordinance.

555

01:35:09.750 --> 01:35:18.580

Cooper City Hall: I'm sorry there's nothing from the audience at this point. Thank you. I haven't weighed in as yet, and I think it's appropriate this time.

556

01:35:20.920 --> 01:35:23.809

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Malosi, Commissioner

557

01:35:24.080 --> 01:35:26.449

Cooper City Hall: Green, and Jamie Curran.

558

01:35:26.680 --> 01:35:28.200

Cooper City Hall: the 3

559

01:35:28.290 --> 01:35:29.710

Cooper City Hall: that voted

560

01:35:29.920 --> 01:35:35.440

Cooper City Hall: in 2,000. What was it? 10 or 1212 right, and

01:35:35.480 --> 01:35:38.369

Cooper City Hall: what they voted for was to close off

562

01:35:38.860 --> 01:35:42.400

Cooper City Hall: that lifetime benefit, and I commend them for that

563

01:35:42.590 --> 01:35:44.170

Cooper City Hall: had they done it.

564

01:35:44.430 --> 01:35:47.650

Cooper City Hall: including themselves, but they failed to do that.

565

01:35:48.260 --> 01:35:54.840

Cooper City Hall: See? They wanted to get those benefits, and for everyone who comes after them. And I was the 1st one that came after

566

01:35:55.230 --> 01:35:57.450

Cooper City Hall: said, No, nothing for you.

567

01:35:57.760 --> 01:35:58.670

Cooper City Hall: So

01:35:59.200 --> 01:36:03.539

Cooper City Hall: what disturbs me is the way it was done.

569

01:36:03.580 --> 01:36:09.589

Cooper City Hall: But more importantly, and Commissioner Green has always said this and correct me if I'm wrong.

570

01:36:09.690 --> 01:36:11.710

Cooper City Hall: what's good for one is good for all.

571

01:36:12.340 --> 01:36:15.419

Cooper City Hall: You gotta be equal, and and you do have to be fair.

572

01:36:15.740 --> 01:36:18.860

Cooper City Hall: So I had no difficulty in saying.

573

01:36:19.000 --> 01:36:21.550

Cooper City Hall: then let's stop it in total.

574

01:36:21.630 --> 01:36:23.619

Cooper City Hall: That stops the bleeding.

01:36:23.880 --> 01:36:32.169

Cooper City Hall: and everyone's on equal footing, not really because you had all these individuals who have received it for quite a number of years.

576

01:36:32.400 --> 01:36:37.660

Cooper City Hall: and then you have the future and current commission not getting anything

577

01:36:37.810 --> 01:36:39.049

Cooper City Hall: that's not fair.

578

01:36:39.550 --> 01:36:54.209

Cooper City Hall: So when you look at it, you say, how do you do it? Well, I know that. Our attorney, and being an attorney rightfully so, said to take away benefits, invites litigation. I know that.

579

01:36:54.910 --> 01:36:59.029

Cooper City Hall: And candidly, there's a case in Dade County pending.

580

01:36:59.150 --> 01:37:10.650

Cooper City Hall: and we don't know what the ruling is. And candidly, it's not on all fours meaning. It's not the exact issue that we have. I think there's included pension and ours does not

581

01:37:10.870 --> 01:37:15.140

Cooper City Hall: so, and that matters, you know, quite a lot in in deciding a case.

01:37:15.230 --> 01:37:26.810

Cooper City Hall: So I I turn around and I say, well, what? What could be fair? I'd love to change the lifetime. Because if you're not working

583

01:37:26.830 --> 01:37:34.479

Cooper City Hall: for the city. You shouldn't be getting those benefits. You know it it to me it's rudimentary. It's fundamental.

584

01:37:35.855 --> 01:37:45.649

Cooper City Hall: However, there are so many people who are collecting, and I'm not looking for litigation for the city either.

585

01:37:45.880 --> 01:37:52.569

Cooper City Hall: So you have to take a look and say, What can you do? Well, maybe we can change that 50 year old

586

01:37:53.490 --> 01:38:11.646

Cooper City Hall: variable and put it to 65. Yeah, but there's anybody exactly. So. So that's not, you know whether it's an issue or not, it is an issue. But it doesn't, it doesn't help the situation. Yeah, because everyone else is on Medicare properly, Bingo. And

587

01:38:12.050 --> 01:38:26.479

Cooper City Hall: for me, if if everyone says, Let's cut it all. I'm good with that. If everyone says no, we want to give the benefits to those who've had it. But we want to be fair and equal, as Commissioner Green has always said. Then let's give it to

01:38:26.740 --> 01:38:46.520

Cooper City Hall: the Commission. Now, that's a lot of money. Now you've got guys like me who are not as young as Commissioner Schroeder, who would merely have a supplement to Medicare. So it's not paying what a lot of people have been expensing out. And and it's exorbitant.

589

01:38:46.640 --> 01:38:51.219

Cooper City Hall: It's not their fault in essence, because that's medical insurance.

590

01:38:52.220 --> 01:38:56.819

Cooper City Hall: I'm willing literally to give it up if we give it up for everyone.

591

01:38:57.130 --> 01:38:59.280

Cooper City Hall: It's not that big a deal to me.

592

01:38:59.420 --> 01:39:03.980

Cooper City Hall: But hearing what Jacob has said, I don't think that's a smart idea.

593

01:39:04.110 --> 01:39:13.749

Cooper City Hall: and so if you give it to everyone, then you have to keep it as the same variables as they've been collecting on. And now that it is a very

594

01:39:13.780 --> 01:39:14.900

Cooper City Hall: big number.

01:39:14.990 --> 01:39:17.430

Cooper City Hall: If anyone has a

596

01:39:17.950 --> 01:39:34.809

Cooper City Hall: possibility of changing it to where it's even more fair, I'm more than willing to listen. So there's a few things because we're talking in concepts, but we still have to pick which one of those manuals, if you were going to vest people, we're going to vest on because they do have different

597

01:39:35.620 --> 01:39:38.459

Cooper City Hall: different things, like the 50% or whatever

598

01:39:39.210 --> 01:39:45.250

Cooper City Hall: in 2,012 there was a decision made, and so I see it as one. I don't think that

599

01:39:47.056 --> 01:39:55.360

Cooper City Hall: and I and I know that 2 of the people that are watching are probably Mr. Eisenger and and Mr. Kleiman, who, I think, are very good lawyers.

600

01:39:55.950 --> 01:39:59.419

Cooper City Hall: and I know they would sue us, because that's what I would do if I were them.

601

01:39:59.480 --> 01:40:01.529

Cooper City Hall: But I don't.

602

01:40:01.660 --> 01:40:03.700

Cooper City Hall: I don't think that

603

01:40:04.900 --> 01:40:05.810

Cooper City Hall: public

604

01:40:05.940 --> 01:40:26.869

Cooper City Hall: elected officials don't have the same rights as employees because of the change in the Florida Constitution. It's a public trust. It's it's you don't have a property right? And so it's not the same as like taking away from an employee. But the people who were vested when the city decided to change it. I don't. I don't believe we should. We should affect that. So in 2,012

605

01:40:27.240 --> 01:40:32.579

Cooper City Hall: I don't know where the list is but the ones that were vested, meaning. They had elected to their 3 terms.

606

01:40:33.520 --> 01:40:40.370

Cooper City Hall: To me. Without a doubt they should, they should still get it now, I'm not sure which one they're going to get. The 2,012, one, the 2,011, or whatever we have to make that decision.

607

01:40:40.390 --> 01:40:42.979

Cooper City Hall: I don't know if there's any difference, Jacob.

01:40:43.280 --> 01:40:49.100

Cooper City Hall: and and those different variations, it might not matter, because I think everybody then

609

01:40:49.190 --> 01:40:51.750

Cooper City Hall: yeah, everybody, then, is probably on Medicare.

610

01:40:52.010 --> 01:41:19.119

Cooper City Hall: Right? I I believe everybody the time they've been yeah. So they're all in the supplement or whatever. But so that's like an easy one for me. I you know I the 20. If you were vested in 2,012, when that's it. Now for the individual. Yes, now we have to talk about spouse. No, no! If the whole thing was, in my personal opinion, if the whole thing was vested in in 2,012. Give it to him. That's fine, right? But what about the the Commissioners that weren't vested in 2,012? That changed the rule. Going, you know?

611

01:41:19.439 --> 01:41:25.819

Cooper City Hall: Well, no, it's it's probably Commissioner Sims, too, wasn't I mean, when was he? When was he elected to?

612

01:41:26.520 --> 01:41:30.990

Cooper City Hall: He was invested then because he would have got vet, you know he he left in 2,018

613

01:41:31.150 --> 01:41:34.970

Cooper City Hall: 2018, so 20. So in 2012 he wasn't vested to his 3rd term.

01:41:36.800 --> 01:41:40.660

Cooper City Hall: So Mr. And I have a question for Mr. Horowitz

615

01:41:40.860 --> 01:41:43.679

Cooper City Hall: cause I hear what Commissioner Schauer is saying.

616

01:41:43.950 --> 01:41:53.189

Cooper City Hall: So if commissioners came in after 2,000 1,999, or up into, or 2,000,

617

01:41:53.370 --> 01:41:55.769

Cooper City Hall: cause you came in in 2,012, correct.

618

01:41:57.040 --> 01:42:08.669

Cooper City Hall: came in 2,000. Well, that would have been after we had. We did that in 2,000, and we did that before you. You got up here right. The folks the folks that came up before, or

619

01:42:09.380 --> 01:42:10.830

Cooper City Hall: was here

620

01:42:11.130 --> 01:42:12.990

Cooper City Hall: when that was in place.

01:42:13.040 --> 01:42:15.610

Cooper City Hall: And I'm 1 of those individuals.

622

01:42:15.900 --> 01:42:17.859

Cooper City Hall: So I'm asking the question.

623

01:42:18.410 --> 01:42:21.609

Cooper City Hall: I hear what Commissioner Schroeder is saying about

624

01:42:21.790 --> 01:42:34.209

Cooper City Hall: well, it should be 2,012. Well, I was here 2,010. How does that affect? Oh, Commissioner Current was here 2,005 or 6, 2,008. Commissioner Melosi. I don't. 2,006.

625

01:42:34.540 --> 01:42:36.240

Cooper City Hall: How does that impact

626

01:42:36.410 --> 01:42:37.850

Cooper City Hall: those folks.

627

01:42:38.130 --> 01:42:39.530

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Horowitz.

01:42:40.130 --> 01:42:44.700

Cooper City Hall: is that is because that particular benefit was in place

629

01:42:44.920 --> 01:42:46.199

Cooper City Hall: in play

630

01:42:46.350 --> 01:42:47.719

Cooper City Hall: when they

631

01:42:48.500 --> 01:42:49.940

Cooper City Hall: were elected.

632

01:42:49.950 --> 01:42:51.999

Cooper City Hall: and they met the

633

01:42:54.260 --> 01:42:59.830

Cooper City Hall: no, if it was in place, which would. The criteria was in place, which said.

634

01:43:00.350 --> 01:43:10.160

Cooper City Hall: If you are 50, and you have served 3, 4 consecutive terms, you're elected for 3 consecutive terms.

01:43:10.880 --> 01:43:30.599

Cooper City Hall: That's a benefit to them, is it. So what we're contemplating tonight, are we contemplating taking away that benefit right out the gate? I'm a no brainer on that 1st group. No, no, I want to. I want to hear from, because I want to hear how it impacts the second group, the

636

01:43:30.620 --> 01:43:50.079

Cooper City Hall: practice of the city. And again, I've I've been involved with the city since 2,019. A lot of this discussion predates my involvement as well, but my understanding is that it has been the city's practice, that every member of the Commission who was in office prior to 2,012, irrespective of whether they had met all of the criteria under the policy at the time.

637

01:43:50.080 --> 01:44:08.630

Cooper City Hall: if they were in office prior to 2,012, was entitled at that time to the benefit of the retirement health insurance package if they if they were in office, if they were in office. Correct that. That is, that is how that has been historically interpreted by the city. Okay? So elected prior to 2,012. Okay, so

638

01:44:09.010 --> 01:44:16.920

Cooper City Hall: what Commissioner Schroder is proposing. And I want to make sure. Commissioner Schroeder, you're proposing what?

639

01:44:16.950 --> 01:44:28.459

Cooper City Hall: So no, first, st I'm saying, I'm saying, ending with with Mayor Eisinger, Mary Eisinger and everyone. Before that, I have absolutely no problem investing the rest. You guys, I'm open to the whatever discussion you guys want to have.

640

01:44:28.570 --> 01:44:46.629

Cooper City Hall: doesn't you know it's just a personal opinion, you know, I'm not saying I'm right on it. The only thing I'm saying I'm right on is, it has to be adopted by ordinance. Right? But if you go, but any reasonable logical person, if you start employment with any firm, with any company, and there are benefits in place

641

01:44:46.980 --> 01:44:59.039

Cooper City Hall: when you start and you are, and you vested, and you reach whatever the requirements are the criteria. I don't believe that you can take away that benefit and say, Oh, you know what. Wait a minute.

642

01:44:59.170 --> 01:45:10.820

Cooper City Hall: We want to. We want to undo potentially undo that we want to make it available for some. But if you came in we we want to take it away from it. I I

643

01:45:10.820 --> 01:45:35.320

Cooper City Hall: I respectfully disagree with that commission, those ones. And that's why I picked it because they didn't invest yet, and I can tell you there's a lot of Frs employees that disagree with it, too, when the Governor did that to them, and they had to start contributing 3%. And they still will tell you. I remember Pink Slip, Rick, you know, and all that, but you know what happened. They fought it, and they said we got when we got this job. This is what they said. And now you're taking 3%. And they fought it to the Florida Supreme Court. And they said, Too bad! Right, and everyone was. And

644

01:45:35.320 --> 01:45:47.140

Cooper City Hall: so I'm not saying that it's it's the right thing to do. I'm just saying legally, Yeah, but you're talking about. They yeah. But they had to pay into. It wasn't being taken away from them that there's but

645

01:45:47.140 --> 01:45:56.769

Cooper City Hall: the the benefit wasn't being taken away. They were now having to contribute to Frs correct? Yeah, you're right. They thought 3% was taken away. Okay.

646

01:45:58.790 --> 01:46:25.910

Cooper City Hall: whatever you guys want to do. So at the last meeting you said, well, I can't take that benefit away from my friend Debbie. I'm being honest. I'm not going to take it away from those people that were. I'm hoping it's not a question of your friend. It's also a question of the fact that her husband and Scott Kleiman had paperwork ready to file the next day if you did. No, it's not. No, I would. I would tell them right now. I respect both of them, and I think they're both wrong. If I litigated. I think that we would prevail, because

647

01:46:25.910 --> 01:46:42.020

Cooper City Hall: that 1st of all, that manual, this is not a contract. You have an attorney that's telling you not to touch this. But yet policy decision. It's a policy decision. And as one of the people, I'm giving you my opinion.

648

01:46:42.230 --> 01:46:43.480

Cooper City Hall: the fact that

649

01:46:44.220 --> 01:46:55.850

Cooper City Hall: is, it guaranteed we would lose Jacob. It is not guaranteed that we would lose. What's the percentage, Jacob? I'm not going to give you a percentage Commissioner. I appreciate the question if you were a betting man, what would? What side would you bet on?

650

01:46:56.000 --> 01:47:18.660

Cooper City Hall: i i i think it is. It is an issue that's being litigated as we speak in Miami-dade County. The difference is they they got their benefits the correct way. The other component to that issue is is the mayor indicated. There's a pension component. And there's a statutory component under Chapter 112,

with regards to the process in which those benefits were conferred. So it it is not identical, but it is similar.

651

01:47:18.660 --> 01:47:31.059

Cooper City Hall: So we're not talking about a pension component at this point. That's correct. We go to Hr. And we tell them to start paying us money right? And in 20 years they figure it out.

652

01:47:31.060 --> 01:47:46.400

Cooper City Hall: And and we say we've been getting it for 20 years. Well, no. But it said you had to pass it by ordinance, and we didn't do that. Well, you've got a problem you can say we'll be getting for 20 years. No like we didn't adopt it the right way you are. I think you're talking about apples and oranges, and they are 2 separate fruits.

653

01:47:47.040 --> 01:47:49.199

Cooper City Hall: So you're also talking about

654

01:47:49.270 --> 01:47:50.650

Cooper City Hall: how

655

01:47:51.460 --> 01:47:55.460

Cooper City Hall: that we specifically excluded

656

01:47:55.670 --> 01:48:06.219

Cooper City Hall: you, Mr. Mayor, and that is 100%. Not true. 1st of all, no one knew excluded, and then everybody followed. 1st of all, I'm talking

01:48:06.260 --> 01:48:07.640

Cooper City Hall: 1st of all.

658

01:48:08.260 --> 01:48:26.220

Cooper City Hall: Wow! I thought it was dialogue. But no, no, no! Now I'll keep doing spoken correctly. You go right ahead. And I have not spoken once. Yeah, you have. Go ahead. No, I have not. I'm not gonna argue. Okay. You shouldn't, because you would be wrong if you did so. 1st of all.

659

01:48:27.620 --> 01:48:33.270

Cooper City Hall: when Commissioner Green and I voted on that we were in office, we were elected.

660

01:48:33.420 --> 01:48:41.529

Cooper City Hall: We voted there was a race going on a mayoral race that was going on. No one was elected mayor.

661

01:48:42.290 --> 01:48:44.269

Cooper City Hall: and this was before

662

01:48:44.540 --> 01:48:59.639

Cooper City Hall: a commission of someone that will later be a Commissioner had an incident, and the person had to drop out of a race. So this was before anyone was elected, or was then what? Yes, when you peed. Yes.

01:48:59.640 --> 01:49:15.519

Cooper City Hall: when you were arrested, etc. So this was before any of that. Yes, okay, whatever. This was before any of that happened. So there was no idea. That's my motion. I'm speaking.

664

01:49:16.110 --> 01:49:36.099

Cooper City Hall: There was an idea motion pending. Let's bang a gavel and be let me run the meeting. You wanted to speak. Go right ahead. There was no idea who was going to be elected, so not the issue. It is the issue. You're sitting here taking it personally. You cut me off. No one cut

665

01:49:36.100 --> 01:49:56.669

Cooper City Hall: a specific person off Number one, Commissioner. You could have included yourself in that, and you failed to do so. So don't sit there saying, Look at us! We tried closing the loop and and stopping the bleeding. You could have stopped it with you, no one. And Jamie. And again I'm being interrupted, and if I ever did that to you.

666

01:49:56.670 --> 01:50:12.999

Cooper City Hall: Heck would would break loose. But I guess it's okay. I have to get you fact straight before you? No, because the fact is not, that is not the fact, because there is no one as a crystal ball, and no one knew that either Commissioner Green or myself would get elected. 3 terms

667

01:50:13.470 --> 01:50:36.220

Cooper City Hall: end of story voting for now for me, saying, I don't know. I might get elected another. Yeah. But if I do, I'm gonna it's hundreds of thousands of dollars worth of benefits like. Come on, let's not be silly. You said it stops for anybody 1st elected after this date. I'm gonna remember every single time that everybody gets to interrupt speaking. Just please.

668

01:50:36.910 --> 01:50:42.740

Cooper City Hall: yeah. And and I was just gonna echo, I was gonna echo what was said

669

01:50:42.770 --> 01:50:45.920

Cooper City Hall: that race. So

670

01:50:46.360 --> 01:50:51.980

Cooper City Hall: when we voted to close that there was a race going on, I didn't know who was going to win. Quite honestly, May Ross.

671

01:50:52.230 --> 01:51:04.609

Cooper City Hall: I didn't know who was, and I was supporting you, by the way, and I told you that fy, if that means anything but the fact of the the fact of the matter is.

672

01:51:05.120 --> 01:51:11.359

Cooper City Hall: and I'm trying. I want to make sure that we're not getting lost in the weeds here. I don't believe that

673

01:51:11.480 --> 01:51:12.810

Cooper City Hall: the city.

674

01:51:13.430 --> 01:51:17.290

Cooper City Hall: I believe that the city this commission, can do whatever it wants

01:51:17.710 --> 01:51:25.760

Cooper City Hall: in terms of an ordinance, and what that ordinance is going to say, I don't believe that the city

676

01:51:28.550 --> 01:51:35.660

Cooper City Hall: I don't believe that the city would prevail if they tried to take away a benefit that had been in place.

677

01:51:36.915 --> 01:51:39.394

Cooper City Hall: I believe that when? When?

678

01:51:41.340 --> 01:51:47.440

Cooper City Hall: because what? I heard Mr. Horowitz say that it was legally, it was done legal.

679

01:51:47.630 --> 01:51:57.929

Cooper City Hall: dating back to 1,999, and I know that there had been amendments, Mr. Horowitz. You said that there had been amendments.

680

01:51:58.130 --> 01:52:01.949

Cooper City Hall: but in terms of the actual benefit

681

01:52:02.800 --> 01:52:05.970

Cooper City Hall: for someone that was elected to 3

01:52:06.260 --> 01:52:07.350

Cooper City Hall: terms

683

01:52:07.730 --> 01:52:09.779

Cooper City Hall: that never changed. Correct.

684

01:52:09.900 --> 01:52:14.360

Cooper City Hall: So there's been, there's been amendments. But the fact that the benefit.

685

01:52:14.930 --> 01:52:16.840 Cooper City Hall: the health insurance benefit

686

01:52:17.100 --> 01:52:20.210

Cooper City Hall: 4 elected officials that met

687

01:52:21.180 --> 01:52:26.590

Cooper City Hall: the requirement of 50, being 50 years of age.

688

01:52:26.750 --> 01:52:31.579

Cooper City Hall: and being elected to 3 consecutive terms

01:52:32.180 --> 01:52:34.980

Cooper City Hall: throughout all of the amendments that you mentioned.

690

01:52:35.180 --> 01:52:37.020

Cooper City Hall: Did that ever change

691

01:52:37.620 --> 01:52:48.679

Cooper City Hall: that that benefit was included in every version of the personnel manual between 1,999 and 2,012. Okay, so if it's been in the Manual since then.

692

01:52:51.410 --> 01:52:53.929

Cooper City Hall: I come on board or

693

01:52:53.980 --> 01:52:59.028

Cooper City Hall: forgive me, Commissioner Melosi, Commissioner Sims, Commissioner Curran,

694

01:52:59.770 --> 01:53:06.080

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner, Eiser Eisinger, and then Debbie Eisenger, Mayor Debbie Eisinger, Commissioner Jeff Green.

695

01:53:06.700 --> 01:53:08.450

Cooper City Hall: we all come on board

01:53:08.840 --> 01:53:10.590

Cooper City Hall: that's still in place.

697

01:53:10.900 --> 01:53:13.400

Cooper City Hall: That was still that was still in place.

698

01:53:13.500 --> 01:53:16.550

Cooper City Hall: I don't believe that the city can go back. And now

699

01:53:17.810 --> 01:53:27.190

Cooper City Hall: pick and choose. Okay. Well, we're going to take from. We're going to take from some, but we're not going to take from all, I think that we are going to open ourselves up

700

01:53:27.270 --> 01:53:41.269

Cooper City Hall: for liability. If the Commission decides to do that moving forward. Mayor Ross, you are! You are absolutely correct, I have said, and I'll say tonight I have said

701

01:53:41.330 --> 01:53:45.820

Cooper City Hall: for the past 14 years that I've been up here on the day is

702

01:53:45.890 --> 01:54:15.420

Cooper City Hall: that whatever decisions that we make, we have to make sure that it is fair, and that it is equitable, and that we are doing the right thing for everybody, and that's not lost on me. And I've and

I've thought about that. And I have said, and I have prayed about that. I'm like God. I want to make sure that whatever decision that I make moving forward, that it is the right decision. And I'm not just thinking about the folks that was before this Commission. I'm thinking about the Current Commission, at least, actually.

703

01:54:15.420 --> 01:54:19.589

Cooper City Hall: yeah, I'm thinking about us up here and moving forward the Commission

704

01:54:19.640 --> 01:54:22.470

Cooper City Hall: future Commission future commissions.

705

01:54:24.580 --> 01:54:28.930

Cooper City Hall: If we're gonna if we've offered that benefit, that benefit has been in place

706

01:54:29.530 --> 01:54:31.610

Cooper City Hall: since 1999.

707

01:54:32.920 --> 01:54:34.170

Cooper City Hall: The folks

708

01:54:34.240 --> 01:54:36.359

Cooper City Hall: that have come in

01:54:36.660 --> 01:54:42.799

Cooper City Hall: after 2,000 after January 1, st 2,012, and that would be you commit, Mayor Ross.

710

01:54:43.190 --> 01:54:45.810

Cooper City Hall: that there should be

711

01:54:46.330 --> 01:54:47.400

Cooper City Hall: some

712

01:54:53.890 --> 01:54:55.330

Cooper City Hall: opportunity.

713

01:54:56.460 --> 01:54:57.640

Cooper City Hall: for

714

01:54:57.670 --> 01:55:04.500

Cooper City Hall: if you have met the if you've met there, and you did meet there, for you, and anybody that comes

715

01:55:04.720 --> 01:55:06.140

Cooper City Hall: after

01:55:06.340 --> 01:55:09.660

Cooper City Hall: should have the opportunity to have

717

01:55:09.720 --> 01:55:12.589

Cooper City Hall: the health insurance benefit with the caveat.

718

01:55:12.960 --> 01:55:14.470

Cooper City Hall: that they

719

01:55:15.105 --> 01:55:20.570

Cooper City Hall: that they will be, that they would pay their whatever the premiums

720

01:55:21.170 --> 01:55:22.290 Cooper City Hall: R.

721

01:55:22.690 --> 01:55:27.579

Cooper City Hall: Moving forward when I retire from the Federal Government. I can keep my insurance

722

01:55:27.700 --> 01:55:40.939

Cooper City Hall: when I leave the Federal Government. State law already requires that. Well, okay, just let me buy into the plan. But but there, but I have to, but I can. I have to continue to pay

01:55:41.090 --> 01:55:42.290

Cooper City Hall: my premium.

724

01:55:42.610 --> 01:55:48.939

Cooper City Hall: And so 2,012 January, any, any elected official, 2,012

725

01:55:49.180 --> 01:55:52.570

Cooper City Hall: and forward if they meet the requirement.

726

01:55:52.670 --> 01:55:54.680

Cooper City Hall: Okay, that's a benefit.

727

01:55:55.030 --> 01:56:02.300

Cooper City Hall: They have an opportunity to have that benefit, but they have to pay a premium whatever that represents.

728

01:56:02.942 --> 01:56:11.729

Cooper City Hall: Moving forward. I I just understand what you're saying. Are you saying the pro rata that we're paying now will be the pro rata that we pay in the future.

729

01:56:11.880 --> 01:56:21.380

Cooper City Hall: Oh, I'm asking. Be a member of the plan like he like you could. If you can't get insurance on your own. You can go onto the city's plan, and you got to pay whatever the cost of city

01:56:21.600 --> 01:56:27.340

Cooper City Hall: access to the plan. Basically, you're saying access to the group. I'm saying access. You have access to the plan.

731

01:56:27.370 --> 01:56:33.959

Cooper City Hall: and you would pay a portion of that. But the city would be responsible for paying.

732

01:56:34.250 --> 01:56:35.450

Cooper City Hall: Well, that's

733

01:56:36.080 --> 01:56:40.830

Cooper City Hall: that's that's the. That's that's what I'm that's where I'm at folks.

734

01:56:42.880 --> 01:56:46.840

Cooper City Hall: I realize that it's not the most popular thing. But as I look at

735

01:56:47.110 --> 01:56:51.979

Cooper City Hall: what we're doing in terms of running a city we have, we? We have

736

01:56:52.050 --> 01:56:56.459

Cooper City Hall: vendors that we have to pay, and the vendors that we have to pay.

01:56:56.945 --> 01:57:01.509

Cooper City Hall: The the whatever we pay them included in there are benefits

738

01:57:02.810 --> 01:57:04.560

Cooper City Hall: that we have to pay.

739

01:57:04.900 --> 01:57:13.820

Cooper City Hall: It's the unfortunately, it's the cost of doing business. I am not I am. I don't feel comfortable with saying publicly

740

01:57:13.910 --> 01:57:16.939

Cooper City Hall: that we have, that we're going to undo

741

01:57:17.430 --> 01:57:20.400

Cooper City Hall: what's already been done, what's already been in place.

742

01:57:20.620 --> 01:57:28.299

Cooper City Hall: not through, not by anyone up here, but it was already in place. I don't see how you go back, and you undo that.

743

01:57:28.470 --> 01:57:56.519

Cooper City Hall: and and I don't. I don't dispute that and and I, I take what Commissioner Schroder said and what Commissioner Green said to heart, and that is, and and it's a the legal theory, you know.

Promissory estoppel they were lying. Can I read you one legal thing right on this manual page? Right in the beginning it says, I understand that nothing contained in the manual may be construed as creating a promise of future benefits or a binding contract with the city of Cooper City for benefits or for any other purpose.

744

01:57:56.610 --> 01:58:25.879

Cooper City Hall: So that little thing where we slid in all this insurance also says in there nothing in this thing can be construed as a contract. So let's just be straight up. I don't think it's legal. I don't want to take it away. We have the right to invest it. We should just tell the public, hey, what's gonna cost? Instead of beating around the bush saying all this stuff, we might get sued. And and again, I I have no difficulty in that again. I said it before. If you pull the benefits, I'm good. If you give the benefits, I'm good.

745

01:58:25.880 --> 01:58:39.450

Cooper City Hall: it does not matter. It's not going to make me or break me. But it's not about me. It's about the future, the Current Commission and the future commissions. And it's what Commissioner Green has always said, you got to be fair.

746

01:58:39.520 --> 01:58:43.110

Cooper City Hall: So if we're going to go ahead and have

747

01:58:43.400 --> 01:58:45.629

Cooper City Hall: the ratification

748

01:58:45.830 --> 01:58:54.469

Cooper City Hall: of the former commissions and all the life benefits, then the only alternative you have is to do it in the future

01:58:54.810 --> 01:59:05.160

Cooper City Hall: period. That's what is fair. I know you of all you, of all people, and and I can't give a straight face on that one. Well, I know it because you're going to cost this sitting

750

01:59:05.570 --> 01:59:17.370

Cooper City Hall: hundreds of thousands of dollars. But you know what we wanted, young blood, and and we got young blood. There is a way. I I think there's an easy approach.

751

01:59:17.600 --> 01:59:19.370

Cooper City Hall: They're not an easy approach. But

752

01:59:19.920 --> 01:59:23.770

Cooper City Hall: I I this is my personal opinion. Now I'm

753

01:59:23.790 --> 01:59:32.429

Cooper City Hall: and I want to vest the people who were vested up until that time. So I'm okay, moving forward with that. And then if you guys want to get the cost on the rest.

754

01:59:32.860 --> 01:59:52.979

Cooper City Hall: And then that argument you could have, we could have that debate, whether we do it or we don't. That's in public. But I do want to vest the people who are. We're already vested can you clarify what you mean by all? Yeah, the ones that had hit 3 terms. And when they when the city decide when the City Commission, yeah, when the City Commission decided to stop it. 01:59:53.220 --> 02:00:04.229

Cooper City Hall: Those people had hit 3 terms, so that would end it with Commissioner or Mayor Eisinger. The rest of you. If you. If we want to do it, we could do it. But we got to let the public know that we're getting a huge benefit. You know. We got to be honest about it

756

02:00:04.330 --> 02:00:06.840

Cooper City Hall: so, and and we probably need the numbers.

757

02:00:06.860 --> 02:00:16.709

Cooper City Hall: you know, because in fairness we have to give Staff some type of direction and come up with some numbers because I was trying to do it with them today. And it is like some people's pay. We don't even know how it's

758

02:00:16.950 --> 02:00:35.640

Cooper City Hall: whoever knows the person who does the adp inputting gets the best deal, because some some pay, some some pay nothing. There's like no rhyme or reason to it. Right, Mr. Manager. Clearly I'm getting the least according to this sheet. That that is true, and if you look into this form.

759

02:00:35.780 --> 02:00:49.180

Cooper City Hall: the people that are retired, get better benefits than the people that are here today, but not on on the rule, because on the rule, it says just them and their spouse. But currently, the way it's operating, we don't. We don't paying for the dependents, too, because we don't have a plan

760

02:00:49.210 --> 02:01:04.989

Cooper City Hall: or the dependent on spouse. We have it, dependent on family. But 2 individual plans would still be cheaper than than the family plan. If you look, because I think on the mayor, his is like 1,000 something. So if you had their spouse as an independent plan, too, it'd still be cheaper than

02:01:05.060 --> 02:01:13.859

Cooper City Hall: yeah. And and yeah, we can go back to the insurance company and create a plan for just depending on spouse, which is what that all

762

02:01:14.060 --> 02:01:16.120

Cooper City Hall: you know a manual call form.

763

02:01:16.310 --> 02:01:18.149

Cooper City Hall: But we have not done that. So

764

02:01:18.540 --> 02:01:30.599

Cooper City Hall: yeah, or or something, you know, and and like I said, the ones that were are vested beef. And and I'm not just picking it because they're vested. Then they're also on on the Medicare now. So it's not a huge. It's a supplement.

765

02:01:30.760 --> 02:01:40.180

Cooper City Hall: you know. So that that is the thing is this cost does like matriculate down eventually because of when you're 65, you roll into the to the supplement.

766

02:01:43.240 --> 02:01:48.850

Cooper City Hall: this is a straight policy decision. Whatever we do. We just got to let the public know what it's going to cost.

02:01:49.580 --> 02:01:53.840

Cooper City Hall: For my own reasons. I I am comfortable voting, investing

768

02:01:53.920 --> 02:02:22.799

Cooper City Hall: everyone who had been elected 3 terms in 2,012 when the Commission made that policy decision to change it. And then I'm open to the argument on anything else. But that's at least what I'm comfortable on without without indicating. And and to me it's it's off, one and one for all. If if you have that motion. You need to make the motion for the current in the future as well. You can't bifurcate and say we're going to treat them one way, and then we haven't decided, and we'll figure it out.

769

02:02:24.810 --> 02:02:40.470

Cooper City Hall: Not fair to those I I would take current out, because that this is like a retirement one, and it does need to be separated, you know. So I would say the ones retired. So like Melosi Melosi, not current, not about people so like Melosi

770

02:02:40.600 --> 02:02:49.370

Cooper City Hall: fills 2 roles because she's a current, and she's a retired, you know. So like when I'm saying you have the people who are retired.

771

02:02:49.940 --> 02:02:53.499

Cooper City Hall: and the people who are currently up here. And then it's 2 separate things.

772

02:02:53.760 --> 02:02:58.359

Cooper City Hall: I think the current benefits that we receive should be done on the next ordinance

02:02:58.728 --> 02:03:04.930

Cooper City Hall: and the vesting of those retirement, or whatever that called in that section needs to. I don't know whatever you guys want to do.

774

02:03:05.130 --> 02:03:11.830

Cooper City Hall: Well, I go ahead. Commission. 2 things. Number one. Mr. Horowitz. Would that

775

02:03:12.190 --> 02:03:14.590

Cooper City Hall: clean up the clean this up legally?

776

02:03:19.070 --> 02:03:33.429

Cooper City Hall: It's a start. Lawyers who probably see it right away. And then, second, I don't. I don't think the residents and I don't have an appetite to give future commissioners lifetime benefits.

777

02:03:33.660 --> 02:03:38.160

Cooper City Hall: That's just where I am on on that, and I'm good. I'm open to discussing the

778

02:03:38.410 --> 02:03:40.999

Cooper City Hall: the people who are in purgatory. But

779

02:03:41.410 --> 02:03:43.670

Cooper City Hall: These people that are what in purgatory

02:03:44.790 --> 02:04:00.149

Cooper City Hall: well, that's the best term I can come and commission attachment. Who in? Who are those people that are in the people? Who are? They weren't last week? Right? No, but who I? I don't know the people who were not vested. I don't know who that is.

781

02:04:00.260 --> 02:04:09.030

Cooper City Hall: I don't know who that is, either, but it's some people who are not best who are invested as well. I'm not. We're not included in this. You are technically because the mayor is saying

782

02:04:09.090 --> 02:04:10.140

Cooper City Hall: correct.

783

02:04:10.710 --> 02:04:18.222

Cooper City Hall: Oh, I'm just listening. I won't interrupt you. Oh, the sky is falling, because that's a 1st

784

02:04:21.300 --> 02:04:27.130

Cooper City Hall: as per what was as per what was said here tonight the other nights. It's

785

02:04:27.950 --> 02:04:37.370

Cooper City Hall: you guys as well. And you were just also talking about it. If this is including you, you had said that you would cost the city a boatload of money because you're so young.

02:04:38.030 --> 02:04:40.550

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, so 35, 36.

787

02:04:40.790 --> 02:04:42.010

Cooper City Hall: Okay.

788

02:04:42.410 --> 02:04:44.580

Cooper City Hall: I also am young, despite the beard.

789

02:04:45.404 --> 02:04:49.375

Cooper City Hall: He's over 40% professor.

790

02:04:50.900 --> 02:04:58.810

Cooper City Hall: whatever. However old you are, I really could care less. But the 2 of you, in theory are now also in this

791

02:04:59.260 --> 02:05:25.860

Cooper City Hall: talk. Don't put. I'm a lot younger. I also don't care how old you are. Keep annoying people. Let's see how long that last. I'm like Commissioner Green. I take the stipend, but that doesn't matter, for this is a retirement benefit. I didn't take anything. No, no, that's all. Thank you for caring wouldn't. That's nice. Someone that actually has morals and ethics. So

792

02:05:27.010 --> 02:05:31.350

Cooper City Hall: it's everybody that's up here is included in this conversation.

02:05:31.500 --> 02:05:34.349

Cooper City Hall: So if this is going to get cut off.

794

02:05:35.020 --> 02:05:40.119

Cooper City Hall: then this is going to get cut off after you all are done.

795

02:05:42.270 --> 02:05:51.939

Cooper City Hall: No. Is that your proposal? Is that your proposal? No, I'm asking. I'm asking that you brought this up. I I'm saying that. No, I I certainly would not keep anybody

796

02:05:52.150 --> 02:05:54.399

Cooper City Hall: in my mind. I'm 1

797

02:05:54.430 --> 02:05:59.450

Cooper City Hall: person. I don't think that people who haven't served.

798

02:05:59.680 --> 02:06:08.310

Cooper City Hall: who are, who are up here who haven't been elected to 3 terms would be included in in the future, like, okay, so that's what I'm saying. So

799

02:06:08.520 --> 02:06:10.060

Cooper City Hall: after this.

800

02:06:10.600 --> 02:06:12.180

Cooper City Hall: people that are here.

801

02:06:13.060 --> 02:06:19.040

Cooper City Hall: the people that are sitting here. This is the conversation that we had years ago.

802

02:06:19.090 --> 02:06:21.209

Cooper City Hall: not cutting anyone off.

803

02:06:21.810 --> 02:06:38.580

Cooper City Hall: But this is the exact this is a and slash. His proposal doesn't include us. I don't. I wouldn't be included, and he wouldn't be included, neither of you. So then your conversation saying that you would cost the city money is does not apply.

804

02:06:38.770 --> 02:06:53.249

Cooper City Hall: So the mayor said all or nothing which would mean me. I would cost a lot of money. Okay? So he said, no to the people who warrant. And I said, I'm okay with everyone Eisen before. So there's your purgatory? Jeff asked, who's in purgatory. So okay, so then, you're saying that

805

02:06:53.770 --> 02:06:59.680

Cooper City Hall: you are out. You are out. The only proposal his proposal? Yes, the mayor's was no.

02:06:59.900 --> 02:07:01.249

Cooper City Hall: my dears meal.

807

02:07:01.260 --> 02:07:03.579

Cooper City Hall: Actually, I'm gonna let her finish.

808

02:07:04.010 --> 02:07:19.670

Cooper City Hall: You want nothing. You want nothing. The mayor's the only one that really cares. It's not a want. But I'm asking. So if you don't care, and you don't care, and he's the only one that cares. Then the proposal, if he cares, and neither of you do, doesn't make a difference what he wants.

809

02:07:19.670 --> 02:07:39.699

Cooper City Hall: No, we we can't make a rule for what we want. Make a rule for what you want if you don't want it. Yes, you can, because you're voting on it the benefits. It's the point that the the residents we have to have don't want to have to pay for it, but if you don't want it, you're voting yes or no. So if you don't want it, you're voting. No, so it does.

810

02:07:39.700 --> 02:07:51.580

Cooper City Hall: Do you understand what I'm saying no, I want it. I don't think I could vote for it. It's a difference, you know. I would like \$300,000, 400,000, but I don't. I don't think I could keep a straight face and vote for it.

811

02:07:55.180 --> 02:08:04.929

Cooper City Hall: It would be better if we could slide it in on the consent agenda, like they did from 1,999 to to 20, whatever. But you might have. Another person like me finds it

02:08:05.190 --> 02:08:10.441

Cooper City Hall: after Irwin tells me I owe him a bunch of money for the insurance, I donated.

813

02:08:11.400 --> 02:08:15.420

Cooper City Hall: and I didn't take the salary. So you guys can thank Irwin for this

814

02:08:16.320 --> 02:08:17.520

Cooper City Hall: Berlin sauce.

815

02:08:18.040 --> 02:08:21.360

Cooper City Hall: We need to come to a policy decision.

816

02:08:22.750 --> 02:08:24.810

Cooper City Hall: and I am open.

817

02:08:25.980 --> 02:08:29.630

Cooper City Hall: What do you? What? What do you? What's your proposal, Commissioner Malizzi?

818

02:08:29.640 --> 02:08:32.629

Cooper City Hall: Sell us. What do you? Where do you want to stop? It started.

02:08:35.080 --> 02:08:45.270

Cooper City Hall: you guys have to figure out what you want to do. It's not about us. We've already said, we're not. We don't. We're 2 2 people up here, but we're not. We're saying we do not.

820

02:08:45.470 --> 02:08:51.809

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, I can count. And it's 1, 2. But my point is, we've already said that we're not

821

02:08:52.100 --> 02:08:55.609

Cooper City Hall: at least under the current situation. We're not looking to

822

02:08:56.320 --> 02:08:57.910

Cooper City Hall: include ourselves

823

02:08:57.970 --> 02:09:01.410

Cooper City Hall: in a lifetime benefit package.

824

02:09:01.710 --> 02:09:04.589

Cooper City Hall: I got a proposal. I said that about myself. I have a proposal.

825

02:09:04.750 --> 02:09:16.850

Cooper City Hall: My proposal, and I'm flexible. This is is to vest everyone, or you know, to to lock in everyone who was vested in 2,012, and let me finish, and

02:09:17.030 --> 02:09:27.459

Cooper City Hall: the staff could come up with what the cost would be to do anything other than that, so that we can actually put it on the agenda and know what we're voting on, and see

827

02:09:27.850 --> 02:09:29.010

Cooper City Hall: I disagree

828

02:09:29.160 --> 02:09:31.189

Cooper City Hall: so alright.

829

02:09:31.990 --> 02:09:36.960

Cooper City Hall: I would rather you vote for everyone to have it. I'll vote no, and then I get, you know.

830

02:09:37.380 --> 02:09:41.730

Cooper City Hall: granted insurance for life, and I'll say I didn't vote for it Melosi gave to me.

831

02:09:41.860 --> 02:09:44.810

Cooper City Hall: I don't know how much it was gonna cost. We didn't ask.

832

02:09:45.300 --> 02:09:54.229

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, but we don't have a crystal ball, and we don't we? You can't say for certain that you're going to get elected for a 3rd time, and that's and and no no, but therein is the

02:09:54.680 --> 02:10:07.579

Cooper City Hall: I I think that's why they had the requirement in place, because it wasn't a given. It wasn't an automatic. If you were elected to one term, you would have, you would have had to been elected to 3

834

02:10:07.820 --> 02:10:13.140

Cooper City Hall: terms in order to be an and be 50 in order to be

835

02:10:13.380 --> 02:10:16.430

Cooper City Hall: in a position to receive that benefit.

836

02:10:17.410 --> 02:10:22.680

Cooper City Hall: So it's it's it's not a guarantee, it's not a guarantee.

837

02:10:22.850 --> 02:10:32.370

Cooper City Hall: And I and I I think that's what I'm hearing to some extent that oh, if you get elected once you're automatically going to get elected 2 more times, and

838

02:10:32.861 --> 02:10:40.239

Cooper City Hall: that's not the case. I mean, we have. We have former elected officials that were one term elected officials

02:10:41.290 --> 02:10:52.789

Cooper City Hall: dating back to 2,018. And so you can't. We can't automatically assume that folks that get elected that they're gonna get elected again and again it it's

840

02:10:52.810 --> 02:11:06.219

Cooper City Hall: they they probably won't. So why don't you make a proposal? A motion to do whatever version you want, because under theory, we can't assume it. Yeah. But, Commissioner Trotter, I've already said what I was going to say. I said that everybody that

841

02:11:06.500 --> 02:11:10.580

Cooper City Hall: prior to 2,012 when the benefit was on the books.

842

02:11:10.590 --> 02:11:18.279

Cooper City Hall: It continues for those individuals, January 1st to 2,012.

843

02:11:18.900 --> 02:11:21.789

Cooper City Hall: Those folks that came after that.

844

02:11:21.900 --> 02:11:22.860

Cooper City Hall: that

845

02:11:24.440 --> 02:11:50.519

Cooper City Hall: throughout the course of however long, that they're an elected official, if it's at a minimum 3 times and they're 50, they should have access to that benefit with the caveat that they're

going to. There will be a contribution to that benefit from from from them. And what would that? What would that number be? Well, that's a number that I believe that we have a finance department. We should

846

02:11:50.520 --> 02:11:58.162

Cooper City Hall: kick that back to them. Kick back, kick that to our staff here and let them come up with something that

847

02:11:59.140 --> 02:12:00.630

Cooper City Hall: moving forward.

848

02:12:01.240 --> 02:12:03.010

Cooper City Hall: that the Commission.

849

02:12:03.840 --> 02:12:07.280

Cooper City Hall: as as Mr. Horowitz said, it's a starting point

850

02:12:09.290 --> 02:12:11.602

Cooper City Hall: point of clarification, Commissioner.

851

02:12:12.340 --> 02:12:16.140

Cooper City Hall: so that contribution is equal to the cost

02:12:16.270 --> 02:12:19.740

Cooper City Hall: that the city pays for the health insurance. Is that what you're thinking?

853

02:12:20.590 --> 02:12:22.899

Cooper City Hall: The contributions from the individual

854

02:12:23.490 --> 02:12:35.369

Cooper City Hall: back to the city will be equal to the amount that the city pays. So whatever or the city is going to provide, some percentage of the city will provide a percentage of that. And the

855

02:12:36.246 --> 02:13:02.439

Cooper City Hall: elected official will provide a percentage. It's what we currently do with our staff. The staff that has that takes the city's health insurance. Correct me if I'm wrong. They take the health insurance. The city is obligated to pay a portion of their of their election, I I mean, of their health benefits, and they have to contribute, and that number is about 75, 25.

856

02:13:02.440 --> 02:13:13.519

Cooper City Hall: So whatever 75%, whatever that number and whatever that number is, it's consistent with what the policies are in place for this for the employees. Okay, thank you.

857

02:13:14.280 --> 02:13:19.849

Cooper City Hall: We could do that. But currently, the number is not exactly set in stone, because I'm a

858

02:13:19.860 --> 02:13:22.529

Cooper City Hall: I'm subject to that amount somehow.

859

02:13:22.580 --> 02:13:28.150

Cooper City Hall: Commission at 100%. Yes, to run how that happened. Well, we said, moving forward.

860

02:13:28.230 --> 02:13:35.370

Cooper City Hall: we said, moving forward, no, I'm just saying when we say what's currently in place, we have to actually spell it out because there's multiple currently in places.

861

02:13:37.350 --> 02:13:38.370

Cooper City Hall: So

862

02:13:39.720 --> 02:13:40.520

Cooper City Hall: right.

863

02:13:40.870 --> 02:13:42.690

Cooper City Hall: there's more than one currently in place.

864

02:13:42.830 --> 02:13:44.430

Cooper City Hall: Okay, did our

865

02:13:44.720 --> 02:13:47.349

Cooper City Hall: people that are currently vested.

866

02:13:47.730 --> 02:13:51.459

Cooper City Hall: And they're on the quote, quote, unquote the retirement plan.

867

02:13:51.580 --> 02:14:02.350

Cooper City Hall: Those people get a hundred percent of their insurance pay by the city. But but what is it? But no, no, you say 100%. It's what they get. But the rule says it should just be 100% of them and their spouse.

868

02:14:02.470 --> 02:14:05.390

Cooper City Hall: Yes, but don't tell you what currently we're doing.

869

02:14:05.580 --> 02:14:08.920

Cooper City Hall: they're getting a hundred percent of that amount. So

870

02:14:09.370 --> 02:14:10.260

Cooper City Hall: yeah.

871

02:14:10.380 --> 02:14:27.580

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Malosi, sorry to to you 2 as an example. But you are getting 100% of the cost of that insurance. The when I leave I will get 100% of the cost of that. And you when you leave, you get 100% of the cost of that. And when I leave, what am I going to get? A plaque and a plaque?

02:14:27.630 --> 02:14:51.840

Cooper City Hall: People that are yeah, people that are currently here today, that are not, that are not retired, that are getting health insurance get the same percentage as the employees are are getting. So they don't get 100%. They get 77% of that pay by the city. They contribute the rest towards towards the plan. Yeah. Now, over the years that number

873

02:14:51.920 --> 02:15:01.590

Cooper City Hall: and that contribution ratio has changed. Okay? And and I think that's part of what we need to clarify that if you're going to pay

874

02:15:01.640 --> 02:15:04.340

Cooper City Hall: the contributions for future commissioners

875

02:15:04.540 --> 02:15:05.790

Cooper City Hall: to be

876

02:15:05.850 --> 02:15:23.670

Cooper City Hall: the same amount that we're doing for the employees that will provide some guidance for future finance directors to know that. Okay, if we're doing 77, 2023 or 75, 25, you you know what the numbers are going to be allocated. Because right now, yeah.

877

02:15:24.210 --> 02:15:32.640

Cooper City Hall: Aside from the legal aspect, there's really very little guidance as to how to treat benefits for future commissions. Because

02:15:32.800 --> 02:15:35.250

Cooper City Hall: we're we're we're treating you and her

879

02:15:35.520 --> 02:15:43.580

Cooper City Hall: differently. Simply 45, not just because she's vested. No, and not because she's vested, because under the vesting you don't get your dependents paid for

880

02:15:43.710 --> 02:15:54.559

Cooper City Hall: correct, but hers are being paid for because we we haven't. We haven't maintained a plan that provides for that. Right? So we're just somebody just decided to

881

02:15:54.680 --> 02:15:57.310

Cooper City Hall: click. You got free free. Yeah.

882

02:15:57.700 --> 02:16:04.579

Cooper City Hall: I mean, and this isn't personal. I just don't understand how we would be said it again, like I was saying, somebody cause

883

02:16:04.620 --> 02:16:06.100

Cooper City Hall: the manager just said that

884

02:16:06.670 --> 02:16:07.730

Cooper City Hall: under the

02:16:07.960 --> 02:16:11.820

Cooper City Hall: protocol is, it's supposed to be the employee and spouse.

886

02:16:11.890 --> 02:16:17.209

Cooper City Hall: But if if there's more than the employee and spouse, it should not be free, but that some people are getting

887

02:16:17.670 --> 02:16:34.559

Cooper City Hall: more than that. So we don't have a spousal plan because we don't, because we don't have a spousal plan. That's correct. Oh, so spouses bundled with children, employee and family, that's what it is. It's not just spouse, right? But it includes. But that's family.

888

02:16:35.092 --> 02:16:46.069

Cooper City Hall: Okay. You. You work for a large organization, and you, you have 3 3 levels, employee, employee, spouse and employee family. No, we have employee, single

889

02:16:46.070 --> 02:17:05.190

Cooper City Hall: an employee and family. When I, when I was in the county, which is large organization, 30,000 employees, we had 3 levels employee employee, spouse and employee. Farmer. Yeah, it's not uncommon to have those those 3 levels. I don't know when he change and drop the employee spouse level.

890

02:17:05.360 --> 02:17:10.279

Cooper City Hall: So when that happened, they just started giving all of the retired

02:17:10.360 --> 02:17:11.980 Cooper City Hall: employee family

892

02:17:12.110 --> 02:17:12.870

Cooper City Hall: done.

893

02:17:13.129 --> 02:17:40.340

Cooper City Hall: And so. But the issue is, it does cost more, because the employee only, or single only 2 of those, is still to 2 of Greg Ross's is still cheaper than the family plan. Right? So if I put Commissioner Malosi on us on an individual plan, and her husband on an individual plan, it would still be cheaper than the family plan. Correct. Now, the vested benefit does not include say it includes dependents. It's a little bit more complicated than that, because people who are on Medicare.

894

02:17:40.610 --> 02:17:41.520 Cooper City Hall: Okay.

895

02:17:41.639 --> 02:17:43.879

Cooper City Hall: if they bought on Medicare, then.

896

02:17:43.940 --> 02:17:47.270

Cooper City Hall: is only the employee and the spouse, because Medicare

02:17:47.559 --> 02:17:49.969

Cooper City Hall: has the number for each individual.

898

02:17:50.139 --> 02:17:53.499

Cooper City Hall: Right? So people that are 65 and over.

899

02:17:53.549 --> 02:17:56.950

Cooper City Hall: we only we don't do family. We just do employee spouse

900

02:17:57.129 --> 02:17:58.880

Cooper City Hall: because Medicare provides for that.

901

02:18:00.469 --> 02:18:10.009

Cooper City Hall: But if but if they are now, now, I understand what Commissioner Green is saying is that we want to provide a benefit that is equivalent to what the employees

902

02:18:10.260 --> 02:18:20.429

Cooper City Hall: get on any given year in terms of their contribution towards family, so that number is 77, 23, and next year 70, 75, 25, and next year is 80 20.

903

02:18:20.459 --> 02:18:22.599

Cooper City Hall: I think that's what you're proposing.

02:18:22.860 --> 02:18:27.029

Cooper City Hall: I'm proposing that for those from 2,012

905

02:18:27.110 --> 02:18:28.949

Cooper City Hall: forward, forward, correct

906

02:18:29.110 --> 02:18:34.890

Cooper City Hall: everything before that is still under 100%. Right? Okay, may I ask you a question?

907

02:18:35.000 --> 02:18:38.569

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, folks go ahead. Do you mean when you say forward? Do you mean?

908

02:18:39.240 --> 02:18:41.350

Cooper City Hall: I mean, after January.

909

02:18:41.620 --> 02:18:43.520

Cooper City Hall: Jeffrey? Okay, yeah.

910

02:18:43.639 --> 02:18:45.250

Cooper City Hall: After January

02:18:45.400 --> 02:18:47.200

Cooper City Hall: 1, st 2,012,

912

02:18:48.389 --> 02:18:53.440

Cooper City Hall: right? That's what we're talking about moving forward. I just didn't know if you just met 2,012

913

02:18:53.450 --> 02:18:55.989

Cooper City Hall: at the time of vesting you, just you.

914

02:18:56.330 --> 02:18:57.780

Cooper City Hall: I just wanted to clarify.

915

02:18:58.150 --> 02:19:12.470

Cooper City Hall: He's he's taking care of the current literally and the future. Okay, well, we say future. They, the future commissions can change. But yes, I just wanted to understand what you were saying. Right? Yeah, no, no, from 2,012 moving forward.

916

02:19:12.709 --> 02:19:22.580

Cooper City Hall: That would be. That would be Mayor Ross moving forward. That would be which would include which would include commissioner Cassman, Commissioner Schroeder.

917

02:19:23.520 --> 02:19:28.069

Cooper City Hall: who Commissioner, elect Jason Smith. Whoever wins the mayor, the mayor's race

02:19:28.290 --> 02:19:34.019

Cooper City Hall: future. Future. Now the Commission can come in and decide something completely different.

919

02:19:34.129 --> 02:19:40.399

Cooper City Hall: But as of right now, can they? Though? Because if it's a vested, none of these are vested, they're not so. It's not vested.

920

02:19:41.770 --> 02:19:50.690

Cooper City Hall: At least we're going to do it. Well, we vote this. I'll be arguing, you know, 10 years. Well, we can do it, so do I. Do. I have that in the form of a motion Commissioner.

921

02:19:51.480 --> 02:19:53.760

Cooper City Hall: I'll motion. I make that motion.

922

02:19:54.090 --> 02:19:58.759

Cooper City Hall: and this is 1st reading, because it'll come back. I want to correct and make that correct. I'll make the motion

923

02:19:59.070 --> 02:20:01.830

Cooper City Hall: that the health benefit

02:20:02.950 --> 02:20:07.790

Cooper City Hall: remain the same for everyone prior to 2,012,

925

02:20:09.340 --> 02:20:15.209

Cooper City Hall: consistent with what the policy manuals were dating back to 1,999

926

02:20:15.850 --> 02:20:19.990

Cooper City Hall: will remain intact and moving forward

927

02:20:20.240 --> 02:20:28.480

Cooper City Hall: from January 1, st 2,012, moving forward in perpetuity. Is that the right, the legal term that you lawyers like to use?

928

02:20:28.972 --> 02:20:37.780

Cooper City Hall: That the city look at all of those that make that meet the criteria of being a minimum of 50 years of age.

929

02:20:38.040 --> 02:20:44.390

Cooper City Hall: and having been elected to 4, I mean 3, because I was elected 4 times here in Cooper city

930

02:20:44.530 --> 02:20:47.929

Cooper City Hall: being elected to 3 consecutive terms.

02:20:49.630 --> 02:20:50.900

Cooper City Hall: have that

932

02:20:51.090 --> 02:20:52.730

Cooper City Hall: as a benefit.

933

02:20:53.900 --> 02:20:59.720

Cooper City Hall: And the staff comes up with what the ratio is, gonna be the cities, the cities.

934

02:20:59.950 --> 02:21:01.399

Cooper City Hall: a percentage.

935

02:21:01.460 --> 02:21:11.450

Cooper City Hall: a contribution to that. And then the the employees consistent with the level that employees get consistent with that. Yes, that's do. I have a second in the motion.

936

02:21:12.570 --> 02:21:14.129

Cooper City Hall: I'll second the motion.

937

02:21:15.160 --> 02:21:16.509

Cooper City Hall: Anything further.

02:21:16.630 --> 02:21:22.179

Cooper City Hall: I I would say, instead of us doing it on that I would ask that we

939

02:21:24.210 --> 02:21:25.900

Cooper City Hall: defer the item

940

02:21:26.000 --> 02:21:33.229

Cooper City Hall: until next meeting and come back. Come back with an analysis based on what he, what he proposed. Because I have to really see that in writing, you know.

941

02:21:33.960 --> 02:21:34.980

Cooper City Hall: like it's

942

02:21:35.020 --> 02:21:41.679

Cooper City Hall: I really have to. And I would need to know the financial impact like I would, I would need. I would want to. I I wouldn't want to know the financial impact.

943

02:21:43.390 --> 02:21:46.550

Cooper City Hall: So I have a motion to table it.

944

02:21:47.160 --> 02:21:52.609

Cooper City Hall: Well, yeah, well, if you I'm I'm just. I'm throwing it motion to table it, then second

02:21:53.040 --> 02:22:06.659

Cooper City Hall: to to then call the vote on motion to table. But just sorry. Just motion tables, an intervening motion direct precedent over Commissioner. That's why I'm calling the motion to table. But the next, then the our next meeting is next Tuesday, a week from tonight. Correct. Okay. So

946

02:22:07.230 --> 02:22:09.309

Cooper City Hall: one week from one week fortnight.

947

02:22:09.920 --> 02:22:24.169

Cooper City Hall: Okay, yeah, yeah. So let me just clarify. We would just table the whole item if it passes, and then I would ask for staff to come back with an analysis on his proposal. Is that fine?

948

02:22:24.450 --> 02:22:28.240

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, like, be separate? Well, the motion table, then it'd be separate direction. Staff.

949

02:22:28.700 --> 02:22:29.789

Cooper City Hall: What are you asking?

950

02:22:30.160 --> 02:22:46.650

Cooper City Hall: We table the thing till next meeting, and we just have Staff come back with that analysis on this proposal versus us voting on something about an analysis. But it'll still be the technically the 1st reading. That's correct. Can you have that information?

02:22:47.020 --> 02:22:47.790

Cooper City Hall: Yeah. But

952

02:22:48.500 --> 02:22:51.650

Cooper City Hall: all the vote on the motion or table. Can I just ask one

953

02:22:51.720 --> 02:22:53.620

Cooper City Hall: question on? Yep. So

954

02:22:53.780 --> 02:22:54.460

Cooper City Hall: the

955

02:22:54.950 --> 02:23:11.180

Cooper City Hall: how can we have a financial impact when we don't know what the we don't? We don't know what the cost costs in X amount of time. But we know what under this current thing like, if we go to single player plan in America, there'll be no cost right? But this would at least tell us. You know, currently, we're spending 50,000

956

02:23:11.240 --> 02:23:17.529

Cooper City Hall: per employee for this plan. If under this scenario, this is what it could cost. If you know. Yeah, maybe give us a few scenarios

957

02:23:17.770 --> 02:23:34.539

Cooper City Hall: like, I'll give you example. That sounds multiple scenario now like that. That sounds like his proposal. Oh, it'd just be equivalent to whatever your employees get right. But you know what we could then do if we wanted to adjust that in the, in the, in the future you come up with multiple plans, and you have this

958

02:23:34.640 --> 02:23:42.540

Cooper City Hall: high payer plan that nobody would take, and you're offering it to meet. So that's what I'm saying. I have to see it written out, and I have to see the analysis, you know just the

959

02:23:42.830 --> 02:23:45.550

Cooper City Hall: and you know, both vote to table.

960

02:23:45.830 --> 02:23:51.860

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi, Commissioner Katzman, Commissioner Schroeder. Yes, Commissioner Green. Yes, Mayor Ross. Yes.

961

02:23:53.390 --> 02:23:55.430

Cooper City Hall: Any other motions on that issue

962

02:23:56.410 --> 02:24:04.700

Cooper City Hall: moving on to item number 18, ordinance on second reading, which is, in fact, a public hearing, and it's ordinance 2421. Jacob.

963

02:24:06.200 --> 02:24:25.419

Cooper City Hall: Thank you. Mayor Commission for the Record ordinance 2421 is an ordinance of the city of Cooper City, Florida, ratifying and confirming the benefit plans for the city's elected officials in accordance with section 3.0 6, the city charter fighting for conflicts, severability and fighting for an effective date motion motion to table this until after the November 5th elections.

964

02:24:27.870 --> 02:24:29.679

Cooper City Hall: I have a motion to table

965

02:24:29.720 --> 02:24:35.560

Cooper City Hall: further discussion, hearing none. Call the vote. Oh, you want discussion. I'm sorry.

966

02:24:35.860 --> 02:24:36.830

Cooper City Hall: Hold the vote.

967

02:24:38.260 --> 02:24:44.550

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi. Yes, Commissioner Katzman, no Commissioner Schroeder. No, Commissioner Green. Yes, Mayor Ross. No.

968

02:24:44.920 --> 02:24:55.569

Cooper City Hall: So this is not about. So you you really can't table this because our current benefits we're getting are not legal, so we'd all have to stop our benefits

969

02:24:55.700 --> 02:25:08.439

Cooper City Hall: because it wasn't adopted by ordinance. So the last one we just talked about was the retirement ones. Now, it's talking about what we're currently receiving. So the health insurance, the stipend you receive, all those things are not legal.

970

02:25:08.710 --> 02:25:25.519

Cooper City Hall: For 21 years they've not been legal correct. Okay? So so for 21 years. So then, an extra 3 months is gonna kill us. You're okay violating the charter, are you okay? Giving up your benefits 3 months. Okay, 3 months. So no.

971

02:25:25.630 --> 02:25:27.510

Cooper City Hall: that's that's my opinion.

972

02:25:27.730 --> 02:25:37.360

Cooper City Hall: So does the city attorney have an opinion, because this is the one that I care about. Okay, what's the question, Commissioner? The question is, if this waits until January first, st

973

02:25:37.620 --> 02:25:39.159

Cooper City Hall: in order to.

974

02:25:39.480 --> 02:25:42.470

Cooper City Hall: in order to be discussed, this item

975

02:25:43.610 --> 02:26:10.300

Cooper City Hall: is, is I going to fall? The only comment I would offer with regards to that is, to the extent that the Commission was adjusting its compensation under our charter. Any adjustment to the

compensation takes effect at the next election, so any action taken with regards to compensation after the November 5th election will not take effect for 2 years that aside, you'll be in no different position than you're in today, Commissioner. Oh, you're okay. If I deal with this. Come, January first.st

976

02:26:10.340 --> 02:26:21.100

Cooper City Hall: The as Commissioner Schroeder indicated. The Commission's benefits need to be adopted by ordinance. They haven't been adopted by ordinance since 2,002. So I'm okay. If it waits till January first.st

977

02:26:21.650 --> 02:26:35.670

Cooper City Hall: Why do you want to take? I'm asking the attorney. He just told you it's not legal, but he's saying that it hasn't been adopted since 2,002. So since I pay him a boatload of money, his opinion is the one that I care about.

978

02:26:35.670 --> 02:26:59.650

Cooper City Hall: You will be in no different position come, January, than you are in today. Your benefits have currently have not been properly adopted. You'll you'll be just as illegal then as you are now. So I'm okay. Waiting until January. Just never do it. Let's just slide in in the personnel manual. Let's put it in the personnel manual. Why do you want to wait? Because if I wait until January, then I don't have. In my opinion, I'm going to agree with Commissioner Green, and I think that

979

02:26:59.650 --> 02:27:13.359

Cooper City Hall: that the only reason this is being brought up now is that we are messing with people and an election. So let's talk about that. Why do you think that? I? Why do I think that? Yeah. Because for 21 years this sat dormant. And now, all of a sudden.

980

02:27:13.630 --> 02:27:22.480

Cooper City Hall: heck is gonna freeze over, and we have to deal with this. Now this that will mess with the a poor candidate. Why do you think it messes with him?

981

02:27:22.890 --> 02:27:36.270

Cooper City Hall: You get an opinion. No, but just be, have open dialogue. Why do you think so? What do you think so, Commissioner Melosi? If I may, I'm sorry. Go ahead. Commissioner Green we have.

982

02:27:36.700 --> 02:27:38.900

Cooper City Hall: we have. This is only

983

02:27:39.130 --> 02:27:41.449

Cooper City Hall: this has only come about

984

02:27:41.890 --> 02:27:43.480

Cooper City Hall: within the last

985

02:27:43.920 --> 02:27:45.450

Cooper City Hall: month or so

986

02:27:45.660 --> 02:27:49.759

Cooper City Hall: as a result of the the of the current elections

02:27:49.830 --> 02:27:52.130

Cooper City Hall: that are going on in this city.

988

02:27:52.810 --> 02:27:55.830

Cooper City Hall: and everybody knows that.

989

02:27:56.090 --> 02:28:05.850

Cooper City Hall: No, no, you're wrong. Because I called Commissioner Curran. I respectfully disagree with you. I'm going to ask

990

02:28:05.960 --> 02:28:08.519

Cooper City Hall: very nicely that the

991

02:28:08.570 --> 02:28:21.210

Cooper City Hall: public remain quiet. You've had your chance. You'll have another. You will have another chance. You will have another chance if you let me finish.

992

02:28:22.050 --> 02:28:25.739

Cooper City Hall: you will have another chance.

993

02:28:25.860 --> 02:28:29.059

Cooper City Hall: public hearing and rebuttal.

02:28:29.400 --> 02:28:31.799

Cooper City Hall: But I won't tolerate calling out.

995

02:28:32.910 --> 02:28:33.940

Cooper City Hall: Continue

996

02:28:34.190 --> 02:28:42.220

Cooper City Hall: so. This all has come about as a result of the ongoing elections or the mayor's race.

997

02:28:42.490 --> 02:28:44.879 Cooper City Hall: Up here in Cooper City.

998

02:28:45.850 --> 02:28:50.269

Cooper City Hall: 3 of the elected officials up here are supporting

999

02:28:50.370 --> 02:28:51.670

Cooper City Hall: one candidate.

1000

02:28:51.880 --> 02:28:59.150

Cooper City Hall: 2 elected officials are supporting the other candidate. Who who am I supporting?

02:28:59.620 --> 02:29:00.340

Cooper City Hall: Yeah.

1002

02:29:02.220 --> 02:29:03.999

Cooper City Hall: we know that. That is.

1003

02:29:04.320 --> 02:29:06.430

Cooper City Hall: we know that that is going on.

1004

02:29:06.880 --> 02:29:08.789

Cooper City Hall: We know that this ordinance

1005

02:29:08.860 --> 02:29:10.200 Cooper City Hall: came at

1006

02:29:10.340 --> 02:29:16.759

Cooper City Hall: this came out of nowhere. I understand that we have an obligation

1007 02:29:17.100 --> 02:29:18.140

Cooper City Hall: to

1008

02:29:19.470 --> 02:29:29.799

Cooper City Hall: by ordinance, according to what you've said, Commissioner Schroeder, by ordinance to ratify this. But it it hasn't been. It's been illegal.

1009

02:29:29.810 --> 02:29:38.929

Cooper City Hall: your your term, it's been illegal for 21 years. What I have. What what I've simply said, is

1010 02:29:39.470 --> 02:29:43.539 Cooper City Hall: table this until after to to

1011

02:29:43.590 --> 02:29:44.990

Cooper City Hall: put aside

1012

02:29:45.640 --> 02:29:48.520

Cooper City Hall: any any inkling.

1013

02:29:48.610 --> 02:29:50.270

Cooper City Hall: any appearance

1014

02:29:50.280 --> 02:29:59.249

Cooper City Hall: that this ordinance doesn't have to do with the current race that is going on in Cooper City. If we wait until

02:30:00.180 --> 02:30:07.080

Cooper City Hall: after November 5, th there is going to be a new commission that's going to be up here.

1016

02:30:07.170 --> 02:30:13.110

Cooper City Hall: They should have. They should be the ones that have the opportunity

1017

02:30:13.460 --> 02:30:18.510

Cooper City Hall: to do the right thing. Moving forward for

1018

02:30:18.580 --> 02:30:23.299

Cooper City Hall: the elected officials. It should not be it we should not.

1019

02:30:24.920 --> 02:30:26.500

Cooper City Hall: we should not.

1020

02:30:28.360 --> 02:30:55.469

Cooper City Hall: inject ourselves into this, and I know that the argument I know that the comment is going to be made. Well, no, we have to do? No, we we we're gonna we have to do this because we've been illegal for 21 years. Well, okay, we've been illegal for 21 years, and we've never as an elected official when we went to Frs. As a municipality, elected officials have never been offered Frs. Until this could until this ordinance

1021

02:30:56.001 --> 02:31:03.680

Cooper City Hall: Includes elected officials in the in the, In. The as a part-time employee consistent with

02:31:03.700 --> 02:31:05.040

Cooper City Hall: the

1023

02:31:05.560 --> 02:31:07.730

Cooper City Hall: camp counselor.

1024

02:31:08.450 --> 02:31:14.110

Cooper City Hall: And let me just stop for a minute there, Mr. Mr. Horowitz or Mr. City manager.

1025

02:31:14.420 --> 02:31:19.079

Cooper City Hall: do our part time employees have have access? Do they get

1026

02:31:19.120 --> 02:31:22.529

Cooper City Hall: Frs pension benefits as a part-time employee?

1027

02:31:22.750 --> 02:31:28.310

Cooper City Hall: No, no, I want to hear from them. I want to know part time employees do seasonal employees do not

1028

02:31:28.400 --> 02:31:39.249

Cooper City Hall: part-time employees do seasonal employees like count counselors do not. Okay, thank thank you, Mr. Horowitz. The next question is is to Mr. Horowitz, Mr. Horowitz.

1029

02:31:39.910 --> 02:31:41.050

Cooper City Hall: currently

1030

02:31:41.880 --> 02:31:51.020

Cooper City Hall: the city of Cooper City is an Frs. Municipality, is it not? Yes, it is, Commissioner. Currently, as an Frs. Municipality

1031

02:31:51.610 --> 02:31:53.730

Cooper City Hall: do. Elected officials

1032

02:31:53.830 --> 02:32:18.309

Cooper City Hall: get access to have pension benefits from Frs. Not currently Commissioner. They don't have them currently. And so what this ordinance does. It aligns an elected official with that of a part Time camp counselor that has access to Frs pension benefits. And in my mind what that, what that is saying is that we are trying to. We are

1033

02:32:18.700 --> 02:32:21.810

Cooper City Hall: hindering someone's OP. Someone's

1034

02:32:22.680 --> 02:32:26.010

Cooper City Hall: constitutional right to run for office.

02:32:26.110 --> 02:32:30.890

Cooper City Hall: We're interfering with it in my mind. It's election interference. And that's all I'm going to say about it.

1036

02:32:31.520 --> 02:32:32.369

Cooper City Hall: Thank you.

1037

02:32:32.570 --> 02:32:34.309

Cooper City Hall: Commission, Charlotte.

1038

02:32:34.570 --> 02:32:37.490

Cooper City Hall: Yeah, it's it's like.

1039

02:32:38.500 --> 02:32:47.549

Cooper City Hall: It's a complex issue. So I I don't want to say you have absolutely no idea what you just spoke about, because it is very complex. It's extremely hard.

1040

02:32:47.580 --> 02:33:01.979

Cooper City Hall: It's extremely hard to understand. But you have no idea what you spoke about what that's why I conf. That's why I conferred with the city attorney before. Okay? So the question was, are we compulsory members, or is the elected officials compulsory members of the Frs. And

02:33:02.950 --> 02:33:20.399

Cooper City Hall: do you have the answer to that I I know, Commissioner, you and I spoke about that a little bit today. My my understanding under Chapter 121, because elected officials for the elected official class have the ability to opt out of participation. Frs. I. I do not believe, as we sit here this evening, that is a compulsory requirement. So.

1042

02:33:20.610 --> 02:33:22.140

Cooper City Hall: Aka.

1043

02:33:22.390 --> 02:33:26.909

Cooper City Hall: if the elected official is going to get it, they can opt out, and it won't affect somebody who

1044

02:33:27.000 --> 02:33:38.750

Cooper City Hall: is in the drop. But that's really not that EII let me finish. That's not that easy of a question. It's very technical. But so for you to say, it's election interference. It's not. What happened was this thing literally came up

1045

02:33:39.000 --> 02:33:46.790

Cooper City Hall: in July. I asked Tedra and Jenna to send me a copy a copy of the compensation thing and the benefits when I was asked to reimburse.

1046

02:33:47.030 --> 02:33:52.610

Cooper City Hall: I mean, I thought it was June. But my email says July, which led to this as soon as I found out about it.

02:33:52.640 --> 02:33:58.439

Cooper City Hall: I then called Commissioner Kern and told him, you may want to get an opinion. Okay.

1048

02:33:58.570 --> 02:34:02.710

Cooper City Hall: what you can do because it's a very complex issue, right

1049

02:34:02.780 --> 02:34:15.480

Cooper City Hall: is right to the department of what? What is it? A FA. Dms. Or something like that, and get an advisory opinion as to whether it affects him. And I I don't know if he did that he should do that. Okay.

1050

02:34:15.600 --> 02:34:45.369

Cooper City Hall: because that's what you should do. And so so, for everyone in the general public doesn't understand. Commissioner Curran retired from the Frs. And you can't reemploy with the Frs. For 6 months, and his 6 months isn't up. So what he's concerned about is, if he's elected and he comes on board, and this ordinance, what he thinks is, if this ordinance passes. He then has to give up his drop money. But the real issue is, we don't know the answer to that question, because under some interpretations you can do you? You have an advisory opinion.

1051

02:34:46.140 --> 02:34:57.390

Cooper City Hall: No, I'm serious. Did you? Did you get the opinion? Because I know when I asked our attorney, he said, that they're trying to get the the answer from Frs. He, he said. He spoke to Commissioner Kern and told him to seek an advisory opinion.

1052

02:34:57.640 --> 02:34:58.510

Cooper City Hall: Right?

02:34:58.810 --> 02:35:02.849

Cooper City Hall: Did you get the advisory opinion, Jacob, I have not seen an advisory. Yeah.

1054

02:35:03.040 --> 02:35:04.110

Cooper City Hall: So

1055

02:35:04.630 --> 02:35:05.810

Cooper City Hall: you know.

1056

02:35:05.920 --> 02:35:14.780

Cooper City Hall: But the end of the day we can't not ratify something that's legal because of one person. Now I think he he would have no clue if it wasn't for me. Is that correct?

1057

02:35:15.210 --> 02:35:40.049

Cooper City Hall: Is that correct, Commissioner? Yes, no, no, he wouldn't have had any clue, and when I told him, despite I should have, I said, I really don't want to tell you, because you're going to blame me. No, no, no! Give me a solution. What do you think? And I, said, Jamie, I would hire a lawyer that deals with Frs. And call them and find out, and then now you should an election interference. It's an election. Well, so I thank you, Mr. Green. Bear with me for a moment.

1058

02:35:40.410 --> 02:35:43.019

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Schroder, are you through? So

02:35:43.710 --> 02:36:00.479

Cooper City Hall: neither Jamie nor Jacob can tell you right now whether it's gonna be an issue or not. The only person who could do it by statute is the the division dms. They're they're requested all the time, and that's why I would have done it if I were him in July. But you can't ask us

1060

02:36:00.480 --> 02:36:23.879

Cooper City Hall: to not ratify benefits that are that that are not currently being conferred upon the Commission, because a potential candidate might have a problem when he was tipped off and he should get an answer to it. Thank you, Commissioner Schrod. I appreciate that, Mr. Horowitz. I'm sorry, Mayor Ross. I'm so I'm sorry, Mayor Ross. I my apologies.

1061

02:36:23.910 --> 02:36:24.620

Cooper City Hall: Okay.

1062

02:36:25.190 --> 02:36:26.390

Cooper City Hall: thank you, Mayor.

1063

02:36:27.050 --> 02:36:29.389

Cooper City Hall: so I have some questions for Mr. Horowitz.

1064

02:36:30.450 --> 02:36:49.150

Cooper City Hall: and it was brought up earlier, but my understanding is section 303.0 6 of the charter says, any benefit plans to be provided to the mayor and Commissioner shall 1st be established by ordinance, said ordinance, to be effective immediately upon its passage and final adoption.

02:36:49.180 --> 02:36:56.720

Cooper City Hall: Is that correct? That is, that that is correct for that section. The next section, with regards to compensation, takes effect after the next election.

1066

02:36:56.810 --> 02:37:08.539

Cooper City Hall: Okay, so benefits benefits take effect immediately. That's correct, Commissioner. Okay? And we do not currently have an ordinance defining benefits of commissioners. With the exception of compensation, there is not currently an ordinance that is correct, right? So

1067

02:37:10.560 --> 02:37:15.349

Cooper City Hall: I have a hard time tabling anything when we're violating our charter.

1068

02:37:15.730 --> 02:37:24.270

Cooper City Hall: It doesn't say what the benefits have to be. It doesn't say anything. We but we do have to follow our charter. We're up here. We swore an oath to it.

1069

02:37:24.620 --> 02:37:29.789

Cooper City Hall: Were you guys there when we swore the oath? Because I apparently I'm getting some, some not the other way.

1070

02:37:31.390 --> 02:37:33.180

Cooper City Hall: so we need to have an ordinance.

1071

02:37:34.230 --> 02:37:38.450

Cooper City Hall: and I think it's our duty now that we're aware whether why we're aware

1072

02:37:38.790 --> 02:37:39.879

Cooper City Hall: is not.

1073

02:37:40.080 --> 02:37:53.729

Cooper City Hall: should not be of concern. We are aware that there is no ordinance that defines the benefits of the Commission. Our charter, our voters said in 2,002, that we should have an ordinance, that we are required to have an ordinance period.

1074

02:37:58.760 --> 02:38:00.060

Cooper City Hall: Next question.

1075

02:38:01.560 --> 02:38:04.819

Cooper City Hall: does the proposed ordinance? That's on the agenda

1076

02:38:05.120 --> 02:38:07.500

Cooper City Hall: as an attachment prevent anybody

1077

02:38:08.510 --> 02:38:10.749

Cooper City Hall: who who is currently a candidate

02:38:11.360 --> 02:38:12.979

Cooper City Hall: from running for office.

1079

02:38:13.260 --> 02:38:14.170

Cooper City Hall: No, sir.

1080

02:38:14.550 --> 02:38:15.220

Cooper City Hall: okay.

1081

02:38:20.370 --> 02:38:21.789

Cooper City Hall: I want to repeat that

1082

02:38:22.350 --> 02:38:27.930

Cooper City Hall: the ordinance in the agenda does not prevent anybody from running for office period.

1083

02:38:28.760 --> 02:38:32.459

Cooper City Hall: so people can spread rumors or make up whatever they want.

1084

02:38:32.810 --> 02:38:35.750

Cooper City Hall: But the truth is, there is not one

1085

02:38:36.420 --> 02:38:39.760

Cooper City Hall: element in the ordinance that says

1086

02:38:41.520 --> 02:38:47.919

Cooper City Hall: that neither of the current candidates or any other proposed candidate cannot run for office.

1087

02:38:51.550 --> 02:38:52.859

Cooper City Hall: Do we know

1088

02:38:52.920 --> 02:38:58.130

Cooper City Hall: if if or how this would impact any of the candidates currently seeking office in Cooper City.

1089

02:38:59.210 --> 02:39:26.219

Cooper City Hall: This proposal I do not personally know the answer to that question. I I will offer just one comment. I just want to make sure. The Commission is aware to go to what the city manager indicated. The ordinance before the Commission would provide the city with benefits. The same insurance pension and other benefits offered to the lowest paid full time employee, which is a camp counselor, position, a seasonal position that does not currently receive Frs.

1090

02:39:27.380 --> 02:39:31.790

Cooper City Hall: so that wouldn't impact anybody. It would not impact. To the best of my knowledge it would not impact anybody. So

1091

02:39:32.020 --> 02:39:41.540

Cooper City Hall: no. But that's so. I want to. Okay, hold on. Hold on. Hold on. Yeah. Mentioned catchment. Are you through for now.

1092

02:39:41.710 --> 02:39:43.360

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi.

1093

02:39:46.010 --> 02:39:46.930

Cooper City Hall: okay.

1094

02:39:47.800 --> 02:39:48.660

Cooper City Hall: One.

1095

02:39:49.230 --> 02:39:50.570

Cooper City Hall: This ordinance is

1096

02:39:51.100 --> 02:39:52.740

Cooper City Hall: 21 years

1097

02:39:54.860 --> 02:39:55.890

Cooper City Hall: wrong.

1098

02:39:57.230 --> 02:40:00.110

Cooper City Hall: So this ordinance has been wrong. For 21 years

1099

```
02:40:00.380 --> 02:40:06.100
```

Cooper City Hall: this ordinance has been wrong for so long that if it had legs, it can walk into a bar and drink.

1100

02:40:06.800 --> 02:40:09.869

Cooper City Hall: So the extra 2 months, whether we have a

1101

02:40:10.240 --> 02:40:12.610

Cooper City Hall: fiduciary duty or not

1102

02:40:14.140 --> 02:40:17.709

Cooper City Hall: is not going to make or break us. Yes, we all swore an oath.

1103

02:40:18.200 --> 02:40:22.250

Cooper City Hall: but in my opinion it's the appearance of impropriety.

1104

02:40:23.510 --> 02:40:25.790

Cooper City Hall: I feel that

1105

02:40:26.220 --> 02:40:29.270

Cooper City Hall: this is wrong. 110%.

1106

02:40:29.660 --> 02:40:30.920

Cooper City Hall: You have

1107

02:40:31.030 --> 02:40:35.719

Cooper City Hall: several people on social media sitting there saying that if

1108

02:40:36.030 --> 02:40:48.589

Cooper City Hall: Jamie Curran gets elected for mayor, that this is going to cost the city this amount of money this is going to cost him. He cannot, he will not be able to accept this. Permit this job, and

1109

02:40:48.930 --> 02:40:54.910

Cooper City Hall: the opponent and the people that are in the opponent's air Quote Camp are using this

1110

02:40:55.050 --> 02:40:56.220

Cooper City Hall: against

1111

02:40:56.980 --> 02:40:58.940

Cooper City Hall: former Commissioner Curran.

1112

02:40:58.950 --> 02:41:01.829

Cooper City Hall: mayoral candidate current. However, you want to

1113

02:41:01.960 --> 02:41:03.230

Cooper City Hall: describe him.

1114

02:41:04.430 --> 02:41:07.960

Cooper City Hall: so that in and of itself is a problem.

1115

02:41:08.630 --> 02:41:10.010

Cooper City Hall: in my opinion.

1116

02:41:10.810 --> 02:41:11.950

Cooper City Hall: Number one.

1117

02:41:12.270 --> 02:41:15.059

Cooper City Hall: shake your head. No, whatever you want that's up to you.

1118

02:41:17.270 --> 02:41:21.570

Cooper City Hall: The rumors that circulate in reference to this.

1119

02:41:22.070 --> 02:41:23.909

Cooper City Hall: and in reference to

02:41:24.400 --> 02:41:26.349

Cooper City Hall: Jamie Curran running for mayor

1121

02:41:26.650 --> 02:41:28.810

Cooper City Hall: that have come out of this

1122

02:41:29.090 --> 02:41:31.380

Cooper City Hall: are also a problem.

1123

02:41:31.460 --> 02:41:35.379

Cooper City Hall: If this were put to bed, even if it's temporary.

1124

02:41:35.640 --> 02:41:37.730

Cooper City Hall: Those rumors stop

1125

02:41:38.620 --> 02:41:41.880

Cooper City Hall: so that stops it, and it makes it a level playing field.

1126

02:41:42.030 --> 02:41:45.500

Cooper City Hall: In my opinion I don't care who wins.

02:41:45.890 --> 02:41:47.780

Cooper City Hall: No, you laugh.

1128

02:41:48.510 --> 02:41:53.720

Cooper City Hall: I want. I want a fair race, and I don't want the Bs. That's what that's happening.

1129

02:41:54.550 --> 02:42:24.009

Cooper City Hall: I I haven't endorsed, contributed. Put a sign up, done anything I drive by your house. I see signs, so don't say that I that is my constitutional right. I voted to fire the other candidate as the magistrate, and I, and I was with you because I thought she was an act. I'm the one who called the Gap and said, Check out! Call the State and make sure you're not gonna lose it. And and he did exactly what I told him on the phone. You're gonna blame me. I won't do that, brother. And next thing you know oh, you made this up

1130

02:42:24.250 --> 02:42:25.739

Cooper City Hall: so again, dude

1131

02:42:26.500 --> 02:42:27.830

Cooper City Hall: I again

1132

02:42:27.890 --> 02:42:30.090

Cooper City Hall: kudos to you for bringing this up.

02:42:30.690 --> 02:42:33.999

Cooper City Hall: I'd pat you on the back, but you're too far away. My arms aren't that long?

1134

02:42:34.710 --> 02:42:52.179

Cooper City Hall: Why don't we just give them the 300,000 you lose, and then we don't have to go for it, Ryan, take it out of your city. Take it out of your funds. We could do it. Just make a little, you know. Exception, Ryan. Let her finish, please. Again. I want to see a fair race. I don't want things thrown in.

1135

02:42:52.460 --> 02:42:59.730

Cooper City Hall: I don't want to give people fodder to throw out there in all the social media that's out there, and we stop it.

1136

02:42:59.810 --> 02:43:01.420

Cooper City Hall: End of story.

1137

02:43:01.440 --> 02:43:03.450

Cooper City Hall: If you delay this.

1138

02:43:04.610 --> 02:43:07.479

Cooper City Hall: you're not doing anything

1139

02:43:07.750 --> 02:43:12.459

Cooper City Hall: but clearing the playing field and stopping rumors.

02:43:12.630 --> 02:43:14.210

Cooper City Hall: In my opinion.

1141

02:43:15.180 --> 02:43:16.590

Cooper City Hall: That's part of that.

1142

02:43:16.810 --> 02:43:17.880

Cooper City Hall: Then

1143

02:43:19.520 --> 02:43:23.499

Cooper City Hall: you're allowing people to run on their own merit.

1144

02:43:24.470 --> 02:43:26.240

Cooper City Hall: And that's what we all want.

1145

02:43:29.540 --> 02:43:35.790

Cooper City Hall: No no comment about that. No, he's letting you finish. Oh, okay, well, then, I'm happy that you're letting me finish. Thank you for that.

1146

02:43:36.360 --> 02:43:37.690

Cooper City Hall: That's all for now.

02:43:38.350 --> 02:43:39.330

Cooper City Hall: Thank you.

1148

02:43:40.200 --> 02:43:42.630

Cooper City Hall: You. 4 commissioners

1149

02:43:42.880 --> 02:43:47.500

Cooper City Hall: have a fiduciary duty to the residents out there

1150

02:43:47.720 --> 02:44:06.890

Cooper City Hall: to do what is necessary, and when it comes to our attention. And you're right, Commissioner Katzman. I don't care how it came to our attention. I'm glad that it did. Now we get to rectify it, Commissioner Melosi, for you to say. To leave it to another commission makes us irrelevant. We are not.

1151

02:44:06.940 --> 02:44:10.279

Cooper City Hall: We are here to perform our duties.

1152

02:44:10.600 --> 02:44:14.700

Cooper City Hall: and to do it in an expeditious manner.

1153

02:44:15.110 --> 02:44:24.779

Cooper City Hall: That is what I intend to do. This is not about one candidate or 2 candidates. This is about a policy of what is needed to be done.

1154

02:44:26.140 --> 02:44:27.549

Cooper City Hall: based on that.

1155

02:44:29.370 --> 02:44:32.500

Cooper City Hall: I will go around again, Commissioner Green. Thank you, Mayor Ross.

1156

02:44:34.520 --> 02:44:36.380

Cooper City Hall: couple of questions for

1157

02:44:37.160 --> 02:44:39.789

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Horowitz and Mr. Ray.

1158

02:44:39.910 --> 02:44:40.910

Cooper City Hall: because.

1159

02:44:41.490 --> 02:44:48.029

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Ray, 1st you, Mr. Ray. I believe you said that a camp counselor position is a seasonal position. Correct?

02:44:48.060 --> 02:44:50.440

Cooper City Hall: So as a seasonal position.

1161

02:44:50.800 --> 02:44:53.620

Cooper City Hall: it's a it's seasonal, so they don't have.

1162

02:44:53.870 --> 02:44:55.070

Cooper City Hall: They don't get

1163

02:44:55.723 --> 02:45:02.979

Cooper City Hall: Frs. They don't, they don't. That's not an option for them to have Frs pension benefits. Correct. Okay.

1164

02:45:04.680 --> 02:45:10.299

Cooper City Hall: the next question is this, and it's either for Mr. Horowitz or or you, Mr. Ray.

1165

02:45:11.360 --> 02:45:13.950

Cooper City Hall: What is the ordinance that we have

1166

02:45:13.990 --> 02:45:15.440

Cooper City Hall: in place

02:45:15.480 --> 02:45:16.689

Cooper City Hall: right now?

1168

02:45:17.501 --> 02:45:34.219

Cooper City Hall: It it says in here. Camp counselor, it says, elected officials, compensation shall be equivalent to the midpoint of the lowest employee grade currently pay grade 10101 dash camp counselor.

1169

02:45:34.410 --> 02:45:43.230

Cooper City Hall: an elects, an elected official shall be entitled to the same insurance pension and other benefits offered to the lowest

1170

02:45:43.310 --> 02:45:46.519

Cooper City Hall: full time employee, and you all

1171

02:45:46.620 --> 02:45:50.349

Cooper City Hall: the staff puts in there. You all say that that

1172

02:45:50.450 --> 02:45:54.510

Cooper City Hall: that position is the camp counselor. Position.

1173 02:45:54.920 --> 02:45:56.210 Cooper City Hall: Is that correct?

02:45:56.350 --> 02:46:01.430

Cooper City Hall: The lowest level position that we have in our pay plan

1175

02:46:01.870 --> 02:46:05.120

Cooper City Hall: is Count counselor is, the is is level

1176

02:46:05.130 --> 02:46:10.320

Cooper City Hall: 1, 0 1, yes, and it is the only position in that level.

1177

02:46:10.430 --> 02:46:28.539

Cooper City Hall: So what I'm hearing tonight is that elected officials in this ordinance right now the elected officials would be in the same category as that camp counselor position, and as such would not have access to Frs pension benefits. Is that correct?

1178

02:46:28.610 --> 02:46:40.329

Cooper City Hall: That that is correct? I mean, the attorney can't confirm. But that's Mr. Horowitz. Is that correct? Again. That is, that is correct. Yes, you just said 2 separate things

1179

02:46:41.100 --> 02:46:52.439

Cooper City Hall: is Commissioner. It's Mayor Ross. I want to be respectful. I appreciate it. Are you done, Commissioner. I'm not because she she's wanting to ask a question, but you will have an opportunity. Okay.

02:46:52.640 --> 02:46:53.510

Cooper City Hall: all right.

1181

02:46:53.970 --> 02:46:55.390

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Horowitz.

1182

02:46:56.070 --> 02:46:58.180

Cooper City Hall: Based on the discussion tonight.

1183

02:46:58.700 --> 02:47:04.559

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Curran, because he's in the room. He's running for the mayor's position here.

1184

02:47:04.670 --> 02:47:07.649 Cooper City Hall: and he wins the election

1185

02:47:09.860 --> 02:47:14.830

Cooper City Hall: according to in this, and if this ordinance passes

1186

02:47:15.120 --> 02:47:22.230

Cooper City Hall: he? He would. He would not be subjected to any Frs

1187

02:47:22.360 --> 02:47:50.739

Cooper City Hall: pension penalties based on this adoption, just ordinance or opinion. How it's how. No, it's it's I'm looking at what you all have written in this Ordinance Commissioner, if I if I may try and I'm gonna be a little delicate in my answer, because, as you can imagine, both. You know, my office in the city really doesn't have a role or a stake in the city's politics or the electoral process for this particular race. Okay, so let me stop you right there, Mr. Horowitz, let me ask you this question. Okay.

1188

02:47:50.990 --> 02:47:52.310

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Horowitz.

1189

02:47:53.010 --> 02:47:55.064

Cooper City Hall: The the the

1190

02:47:56.190 --> 02:47:58.820

Cooper City Hall: the document that you provided to

1191

02:47:58.870 --> 02:48:05.180

Cooper City Hall: the City Commission on August 29th that came that had come from Frs.

1192

02:48:05.370 --> 02:48:15.650

Cooper City Hall: That said in that in that document that recognized that Cooper City is an Frs. Municipality.

1193

02:48:15.870 --> 02:48:18.390

Cooper City Hall: But elected officials

02:48:19.183 --> 02:48:22.900

Cooper City Hall: they don't have access. They they as a benefit.

1195

02:48:22.970 --> 02:48:26.869

Cooper City Hall: They don't get Frs. Pension benefits

1196

02:48:29.210 --> 02:48:53.190

Cooper City Hall: so couple of other that you sent to us on August 29, th sir, you're referring, I believe, Commissioner to the email that was sent. It was an email from the general counsel's office at Frs. To Robert Closner. Bob Klausner, who is the city's pension counsel. Yes, handles our Frs. Yes, sir, I'm just going to read that email. It's not a particularly long email. This was again from Lee

1197

02:48:53.470 --> 02:49:04.879

Cooper City Hall: Demesus, who is the managing attorney for Frs. Directed to Mr. Klausner, quote unquote elected officials. Yes, sir, are not a covered group in the Frs. For Cooper City.

1198

02:49:05.130 --> 02:49:16.419

Cooper City Hall: As such. Cooper City is not a Frs. Participating employer for the elected officials class. We don't need to analyze any of the other issues below, since they would not apply

1199

02:49:16.910 --> 02:49:24.439

Cooper City Hall: that, that is, from the Frs. General counsel's office to the city's Pension Council on on the 29th of August. And so, with that being said.

02:49:24.590 --> 02:49:30.349

Cooper City Hall: this ordinance would be consistent with what was provided to us

1201

02:49:30.460 --> 02:49:33.799

Cooper City Hall: by Lee. Whoever that gentleman was from Frs.

1202

02:49:33.980 --> 02:49:45.160

Cooper City Hall: This ordinance, as proposed, would not change the Commission status, as it relates to Frs. The position that's identified in the ordinance does not currently receive. Frs.

1203

02:49:45.270 --> 02:49:46.630

Cooper City Hall: okay, thank you.

1204

02:49:48.260 --> 02:49:50.929

Cooper City Hall: Point of view, charter point of clarification. Alright.

1205

02:49:51.230 --> 02:49:55.120

Cooper City Hall: So a few things one. I wouldn't rely on that, email because

1206

02:49:55.140 --> 02:50:03.889

Cooper City Hall: it'd be a lot of money to risk. So I would go through the administrative process and actually get a binding opinion. That's what I would do right. Number 2.

02:50:04.590 --> 02:50:16.440

Cooper City Hall: The way the ordinance is written does not say that, because what's in brackets is is describing, the position is not the binding one. It's what's not in brackets. So it says, lowest paid full time employee.

1208

02:50:16.500 --> 02:50:17.510

Cooper City Hall: So

1209

02:50:17.680 --> 02:50:28.019

Cooper City Hall: that yeah, the statutory construction on that is that it would be Frs benefits. I could tell you. No, you know. Make everyone happy out there for Jamie, but then I'd be tricking you, and I'm

1210

02:50:28.310 --> 02:50:51.799

Cooper City Hall: try not to trick you. So this one would, I would argue that this, that it, the operative thing, is not what's in brackets. This ordinance provides for the elected officials shall be entitled to the same insurance pension and other benefits offered to the lowest paid full time employee. Yeah. The fact that it's in brackets described incorrectly is not the binding part so

1211

02:50:51.900 --> 02:50:58.269

Cooper City Hall: that could change every day. So I'm trying to say, is trickery. I would say, Oh, no, you don't have a problem.

1212

02:50:58.400 --> 02:51:01.119

Cooper City Hall: but I would be misleading. Okay?

02:51:01.390 --> 02:51:26.059

Cooper City Hall: The answer that that you got from the Frs general counsel, I I pretty smart, and I spent a lot of time reading this, and I can't figure it out myself, and I don't think you have to get a binding opinion. That's it. So the general counsel, saying, you don't have a problem because the elected officials are not in that class. But you would be a fool telling you in front of the whole world to rely on that without an actual written, declaratory statement. But it's an easy process.

1214

02:51:26.070 --> 02:51:41.819

Cooper City Hall: You submit a thing to them, and they'll literally tell you whether you have an issue or you don't, because there's also a statute that Jacob threw at me today. That says you can elect out which maybe that it's very, very complicated. It is a complicated issue. But what I'm trying to say is, that's why I gave Commissioner Kern a heads up in July

1215

02:51:42.070 --> 02:51:44.099

Cooper City Hall: and said, Call and find out.

1216

02:51:45.550 --> 02:51:47.659

Cooper City Hall: I would call and find out if it were me.

1217

02:51:47.760 --> 02:51:55.480

Cooper City Hall: because it's a lot of money, but I don't think that gets to stop us. I I could have just put this on, and nobody would ever have been the wiser.

1218

02:51:56.250 --> 02:52:02.129

Cooper City Hall: But I I felt well, really wasn't me. It was Steve Lawson. It felt bad for Jamie, and and made me call him and tell him.

1219

02:52:02.240 --> 02:52:09.849

Cooper City Hall: Otherwise I wouldn't have done that. And I said, Steve, he's gonna blame me, and oh, you better call him. You're doing the right thing, and then what it I get blamed.

1220

02:52:09.960 --> 02:52:18.149

Cooper City Hall: So I'm just saying there's an easy process for him to find out. The administrative procedure allows it, but as written that

1221

02:52:18.260 --> 02:52:27.120

Cooper City Hall: I would be misleading you. If you guys are trying to say, Oh, that that camp counselor, because what's in brackets describing it is not the binding part. The binding part is the full time.

1222

02:52:27.310 --> 02:52:29.800

Cooper City Hall: you know, so I hate to mislead you guys.

1223

02:52:30.050 --> 02:52:32.679

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Katzman, I'll come back to you.

1224

02:52:40.490 --> 02:52:42.680

Cooper City Hall: I mean, I go back to the point of

02:52:43.510 --> 02:52:45.890

Cooper City Hall: we found out we're violating the charter.

1226

02:52:46.010 --> 02:52:56.610

Cooper City Hall: We need to have an ordinance. I'm not saying the ordinance benefits anybody doesn't benefit anybody. I don't really think we should be voting on ordinances based on one individual, anyways.

1227

02:52:56.640 --> 02:53:07.049

Cooper City Hall: but I think we should have an ordinance that follows the charter end of story. I'm open to ideas, whatever the Commission wants to do with with the ordinance, but

1228

02:53:07.500 --> 02:53:14.510

Cooper City Hall: we need to pass an ordinance, so that we're in compliance with our own charter that we sworn with to. That's all I'm going to say.

1229

02:53:15.640 --> 02:53:16.670

Cooper City Hall: So.

1230

02:53:17.470 --> 02:53:18.400

Cooper City Hall: Jacob.

1231

02:53:19.060 --> 02:53:21.040

Cooper City Hall: What you had said before.

1232

02:53:21.370 --> 02:53:24.589

Cooper City Hall: in reference to the full time employee

1233

02:53:25.570 --> 02:53:27.400

Cooper City Hall: read that again.

1234

02:53:27.430 --> 02:53:29.080

Cooper City Hall: Elected officials

1235

02:53:29.120 --> 02:53:42.299

Cooper City Hall: shall be entitled to the same insurance pension and other benefits offered to the lowest paid full time employee. That's the item the ordinance that was passed on 1st reading, I understand. So this is the problem.

1236

02:53:43.140 --> 02:53:47.330

Cooper City Hall: The 10, 1 category. The camp counselors.

1237

02:53:48.320 --> 02:53:51.420

Cooper City Hall: That is what everybody is comparing it to

02:53:52.100 --> 02:53:54.049

Cooper City Hall: the problem that I see.

1239

02:53:54.280 --> 02:54:13.450

Cooper City Hall: and I hate to bring this up, because if we stuck with 1, 0 1! Everything would be hunky Dory, but I know that he has an evil twisted mind, and while he seems like he's evil and innocent now he's not. I will tell you next time when it comes up on you. You're you're just so angelic. I see the wings. So

1240

02:54:13.840 --> 02:54:20.649

Cooper City Hall: the problem is better friend than enemy. That's yes, you're just. I see the White Wings cough come to your point.

1241

02:54:21.810 --> 02:54:24.359

Cooper City Hall: The problem is 10, 1

1242

02:54:24.620 --> 02:54:27.670

Cooper City Hall: is a part-time camp counselor.

1243

02:54:28.200 --> 02:54:32.089

Cooper City Hall: Where's Stacey? I saw her. Are you still here, Stacey? Okay.

1244

02:54:32.400 --> 02:54:35.340

Cooper City Hall: Can you come? I hate to put you on the spot.

02:54:36.080 --> 02:54:51.790

Cooper City Hall: The the description has nothing to do. I'm not stop, because if I interrupted you, okay, well, I'm sorry that it takes her long to walk. I'm she's recovering. You're awesome. I appreciate you. Your hair looks great.

1246

02:54:52.540 --> 02:55:08.487

Cooper City Hall: Thank you. Okay, so, Stacy, just, I know that normally, this is what Anthony does. But I'm going to harass you because I know you know it hopefully. The camp counselors are part time. They're seasonal or part. They're part time employees. They

1247

02:55:09.170 --> 02:55:23.339

Cooper City Hall: do not get Frs because they are part time. Employees correct, they are seasonal, they are seasonal employees, so they are not a full time. Employee correct. They are. Category 1 0 1, correct.

1248

02:55:23.400 --> 02:55:24.460

Cooper City Hall: The

1249

02:55:26.000 --> 02:55:40.639

Cooper City Hall: category above them is 1 0, 6, if I remember correctly. And okay, I thought it was 1 0 6. But so they but they are the full time employees.

1250

02:55:40.740 --> 02:55:43.240

Cooper City Hall: and they get Frs.

02:55:43.540 --> 02:55:46.383

Cooper City Hall: They're permanent part time employee, I mean

1252

02:55:46.900 --> 02:55:52.620

Cooper City Hall: In one or 2 you got park and rec attendant and swimming coaches.

1253

02:55:52.890 --> 02:56:01.649

Cooper City Hall: which I believe swimming coaches are part-timers, right? Either one of them could be permanent part time. Yes, the pay grade is yeah. The but the reference to full time

1254

02:56:01.680 --> 02:56:03.220

Cooper City Hall: is because

1255

02:56:03.520 --> 02:56:11.350

Cooper City Hall: one on ones are part timers, and they get \$14 an hour right? But it's not the. It's not the hourly. It's that the

1256

02:56:11.630 --> 02:56:19.880

Cooper City Hall: what Jacob is reading is full time. What we are being compared to is part time.

1257

02:56:20.000 --> 02:56:26.450

Cooper City Hall: but full time rate. Is that what really is the applicable piece here the midpoint

02:56:26.500 --> 02:56:27.590

Cooper City Hall: or

1259

02:56:28.010 --> 02:56:30.829

Cooper City Hall: a camp council, if he was to work full time.

1260

02:56:31.140 --> 02:56:35.640

Cooper City Hall: will be 30, \$37,120 a year.

1261

02:56:35.940 --> 02:56:39.649

Cooper City Hall: Okay, so we need to have a reference if we just say

1262

02:56:39.870 --> 02:56:49.139

Cooper City Hall: a account counselor, and we don't say for how many hours, then we wouldn't know what value of benefits to give you, because

1263

02:56:49.450 --> 02:56:52.639

Cooper City Hall: 1 h is \$14. So you have to assume that

1264

02:56:53.240 --> 02:57:00.929

Cooper City Hall: full time is 2,080 h is going to be the 37,000 talking about the benefits. But I'm talking about. I'm not talking about that aspect.

1265

02:57:01.010 --> 02:57:05.820

Cooper City Hall: God, I'm agreeing with you. Lord help me! What I'm talking about is because

1266

02:57:06.240 --> 02:57:15.160

Cooper City Hall: the way he, the way it is phrased, is a full time, the lowest full time. So a camp counselor is not

1267

02:57:15.420 --> 02:57:16.410

Cooper City Hall: what

1268

02:57:16.690 --> 02:57:25.940

Cooper City Hall: we are being what we should be compared to. And I'm not trying to get more money in any way, shape or form. It's not there, but we're moved past it. That's but

1269

02:57:25.970 --> 02:57:53.640

Cooper City Hall: I am, I'm afraid, because again, I don't trust you as far as I can throw you. I'm afraid that you're going to twist this, and I just want to get ahead of that beforehand. But twist what every position includes. Frs. I'm not trying to say it doesn't. It includes Frs. Lisa. There's nothing hidden. Yes, it's going to include Frs. It's not a trick. I don't want us to include. Frs. Didn't say that. But like you're talking to the Rec. Director over Frs. I just wanted. I want that clarified for the records. Frs.

1270

02:57:53.640 --> 02:58:01.059

Cooper City Hall: let me let me make this even more complicated right. Now, if we don't pass this, can you guarantee that we're not compulsory members?

1271

02:58:01.840 --> 02:58:05.700

Cooper City Hall: I cannot guarantee that. So right now, Commissioner Kern might have a problem.

1272

02:58:05.880 --> 02:58:06.680

Cooper City Hall: Why?

1273

02:58:06.940 --> 02:58:09.400

Cooper City Hall: Because we might be compulsory members

1274

02:58:09.440 --> 02:58:21.579

Cooper City Hall: of Frs. If we are already not in Frs. It's very technical. So it goes back to certain classes. I understand that it's technical. But I also understand. No, because I've also researched this.

1275

02:58:21.820 --> 02:58:28.280

Cooper City Hall: And just because you went to law school doesn't mean that you can understand the technicality, and I can, I can assure you I understand it better than you.

1276

02:58:28.590 --> 02:58:42.830

Cooper City Hall: Of course you can. So maybe it's because let's start with this. There's social. The social security started back. Social security. Okay? No, no, seriously. So, states were exempt from social security. And and I think we had a postal employee here.

02:58:43.240 --> 02:58:56.700

Cooper City Hall: okay. But a lot of the Federal Government doesn't pay public social security either, because they have Federal pensions. Right? So States have the same thing. So Cooper City back in 1,964, exempted us under this section 218.

1278

02:58:57.090 --> 02:59:00.990

Cooper City Hall: Okay, so elected positions are exempt from it. And that's and that

1279

02:59:01.120 --> 02:59:15.659

Cooper City Hall: it was submitted with the Frs. Paperwork. So we're still trying to determine whether we are exempt or not from the Frs. There might be a determination that we're not. It could be an issue as of now. Okay, so if we not in Frs.

1280

02:59:17.320 --> 02:59:31.319

Cooper City Hall: If we are currently not in Frs. Jacob, let me pose this question to you. Maybe maybe you're as smart as Commissioner Schroeder, we'll see. But if we are currently not in Frs as elected officials.

1281 02:59:32.410 --> 02:59:33.790 Cooper City Hall: whether this

1282

02:59:33.940 --> 02:59:36.199

Cooper City Hall: comes to fruition or not.

02:59:37.960 --> 02:59:40.600

Cooper City Hall: how does that impact us

1284

02:59:40.670 --> 02:59:44.740

Cooper City Hall: potentially being thrown into Frs.

1285

02:59:45.190 --> 02:59:46.240

Cooper City Hall: Jacob

1286

02:59:46.330 --> 02:59:50.100

Cooper City Hall: Horowitz, my city attorney, we we know a couple things

1287

02:59:50.120 --> 02:59:57.070

Cooper City Hall: we know that Frs chapter 121 absolutely allows an elected official to opt out of

1288

02:59:57.080 --> 02:59:58.640

Cooper City Hall: the Frs process.

1289

02:59:58.740 --> 03:00:02.164

Cooper City Hall: Alright. We also know that.

1290

03:00:03.210 --> 03:00:14.599

Cooper City Hall: well, I'll say it this way. I can't, and I'm not sure anybody up here can guarantee that even if a member of the Commission who is otherwise participating in Frs were to opt out

1291

03:00:14.650 --> 03:00:18.049

Cooper City Hall: that that would be a cure for the issue that we're talking about.

1292

03:00:18.300 --> 03:00:27.370

Cooper City Hall: Right? I think that Commissioner Schroeder is correct, that the only way to really get a determination is to get a determination from Frs.

1293

03:00:27.400 --> 03:00:40.880

Cooper City Hall: Right now we do have a opinion of the general counsel's office from Frs. Which is a good start, and I'd I'd rather have that opinion than not, because it does provide some clarity. But it's not a binding opinion on anybody

1294

03:00:40.930 --> 03:00:42.919

Cooper City Hall: that doesn't bind Frs.

1295

03:00:43.110 --> 03:01:09.419

Cooper City Hall: I'm sorry, Commissioner. Go ahead. No, no, I was just listening, but I was gonna so. And Commissioner Schrader's point again. You know, we we spent quite a bit of time both today and over the past several weeks looking at the issue. It is a complicated issue. I think it is debatable whether or not the members of the Commission are compulsor or mandatory participants in Frs. I'm not suggesting that that is the case, because, again under the statute you have the ability to opt out.

1296

03:01:09.450 --> 03:01:33.530

Cooper City Hall: but even if you have the ability to opt out, it would start with the premise that you were required to participate, subject to that opting out. That's what I don't understand. And maybe I'm having a blank wall moment. If we are not as elected officials currently in Frs. Maybe we're supposed to be, but I think that's commission. But if we're supposed to be, then why hasn't Frs come back

1297

03:01:33.530 --> 03:01:46.840

Cooper City Hall: hanging down on our door. They don't know about us, and if we they don't know that, so when you submit the names, they only know the names you submit. So, Mr. Horowitz? If we? If so, there is uncertainty in terms of

1298

03:01:46.840 --> 03:01:51.160

Cooper City Hall: if elected officials. If we're part of Frs. Or not.

1299

03:01:51.160 --> 03:01:58.049

Cooper City Hall: If Frs. Comes back to you the city attorney and says, Oh, by the way, elected officials.

1300

03:01:58.451 --> 03:02:22.930

Cooper City Hall: since you all have become an Frs. City elected officials yeah. Are part of the pension. Then Mr. Horowitz, the city of Cooper City, owes me a great deal of money, because I have never. The city has never, ever. When we transitioned when we closed the Pension Fund and we moved to Frs. We never we never, as a collective

1301

03:02:22.930 --> 03:02:40.019

Cooper City Hall: voted to have elected officials, be a part of the pension process. But what I'm hearing now is well, we don't know if that was true or not, and you know that was a benefit, and you all didn't opt out. You didn't opt out of it.

03:02:40.150 --> 03:02:43.299

Cooper City Hall: We never made it available to elected officials.

1303

03:02:43.310 --> 03:02:47.080

Cooper City Hall: When when we transition, we adopted the paperwork, we said.

1304

03:02:48.050 --> 03:02:56.809

Cooper City Hall: we are adopting it. We used a word that is not a term of art for all general employees which is not defined anywhere. So let's not go down a rabbit hole, trying to define that right

1305

03:02:57.200 --> 03:02:58.460

Cooper City Hall: except

1306

03:02:58.560 --> 03:03:03.650

Cooper City Hall: those specifically excluded. And guess what we put on the exclusion list. Nothing.

1307

03:03:04.100 --> 03:03:14.750

Cooper City Hall: So by practice they were not submitting us to Frs. So the question of whether we should have been or we should have been hasn't been answered yet. It could be that Frs. Comes back and says we owe them money.

1308

03:03:14.930 --> 03:03:35.380

Cooper City Hall: or that we're not allowed. We're we're trying to find out that answer, are they? So the F. So, Mr. Horowitz. Just just one other comment. And I think, Commissioner Green, you make a very good point. If Frs. Were to determine that the members of the Commission are mandatory participants in Frs. And that back in 2,012, when we joined Frs.

1309

03:03:35.410 --> 03:03:46.850

Cooper City Hall: They you you all. The commission should have been included at the time you're absolutely right. It it is certainly possible that Frs. Could come knocking on the door for 12 years of unpaid contributions.

1310

03:03:46.850 --> 03:04:12.309

Cooper City Hall: unpaid contributions that would go to the Commission to well, to to go to Frs. To Fr. For the benefit of the Commissioners right? And so that benefit because we never received it. I could then file a lawsuit against city, because I never. You have a contractual agreement with them to not pick and choose who you put. So you're going to put everybody in

1311

03:04:12.460 --> 03:04:23.089

Cooper City Hall: unless you exclude. So the question is whether this group is excluded or not, and it's not an easy question to answer, because it starts back with social security administration.

1312

03:04:23.090 --> 03:04:45.699

Cooper City Hall: Yeah. But you didn't want to listen. And then you said, Oh, I'm gonna so I'm trying to tell you this. So it starts with, it's not an easy question. So we know we're not members of the Frs elected official class. That's a separate class. But we may be compulsory members of the regular class, and the answer to that is not an easy answer, and the only one who can actual, regardless of what's passed tonight, we could have an issue.

1313

03:04:45.790 --> 03:04:59.289

Cooper City Hall: And and the the thing is, you guys are the ones that voted to put the city into. Frs, yeah, we are, Major. No, no, you know I we I absolutely. I absolutely did that because for the public's knowledge.

1314

03:04:59.360 --> 03:05:24.009

Cooper City Hall: when I came on board in 2,010. The City Cooper City's Pension fund was paying 24% to to all of the employees based on their salary. And we closed that Pension fund because it was costing the it was costing it was an undue tax burden on our residents, and so we closed the Cooper City Pension fund those that were already in there. They were vested.

1315

03:05:24.260 --> 03:05:34.489

Cooper City Hall: They had. They had an option to move to Frs. Or to stay in that pension fund. Obviously they opted to stay in that because the city was paying them 24%.

1316

03:05:34.530 --> 03:05:51.940

Cooper City Hall: We moved to Frs where there was a combination of the employees kicking in a percentage. And the city kicking in a percentage which amounted to about 8 or 9%, which was in our miles was better than 24%. So that's why. So that's why we closed

1317

03:05:51.970 --> 03:06:06.820

Cooper City Hall: the Cooper City Pension Fund was to save the city the taxpayers money. That's what they told you and I, and I don't blame you for buying into that. But that's not actually true. So like with the pension plan with Frs. When we pay, then we lose the money. So if someone does invest

1318

03:06:07.477 --> 03:06:32.899

Cooper City Hall: we, we lose the money in our pension plan. If they don't invest, they do 7 years. Our plan keeps the money so you could try. I mean that they they came and told you. That's what they were doing. But when you close the plan it's not it. Our actual Pension Council now says our plan would have

been doing better. That's what Mr. Closure, and told me last time. The city plan would have been cheaper than that for us. So conversations you had with Mr. Closner. Did you ask him if we are vested? If we are, he's trying to find out the answer.

1319

03:06:33.150 --> 03:06:45.040

Cooper City Hall: It's not an easy answer. No, no, so let me let me say we. You want to. Now table something for a single person. So let me let me just tell you my my perspective. Okay, no, no, they know my perspective.

1320

03:06:45.190 --> 03:06:56.160

Cooper City Hall: We are not following the charter. So I say, let's do it right. I gave Mr. Curran the heads up right. I. Mr. Curran, is the one that picked his retirement date. He's the one to put Cooper city in Frs.

1321

03:06:56.250 --> 03:07:22.499

Cooper City Hall: And now we're not even sure if it's going to impact them or not. But you want us to continue to violate the charter, to accommodate that. No. How about you? Just request an advisory opinion. Let me indicate that I would like to have the public weigh in on this issue. But I won't do that until I have a motion on the table. So do I have a motion. Yeah, I want a motion with the revision of the brackets thing. So I want to just strike out the description of the bracket.

1322

03:07:22.850 --> 03:07:37.090

Cooper City Hall: Okay, do I have a second on that? Does that make sense? Because we have now determined that camp counselor isn't the lowest paid one. I'm going to take that out and leave it to say and and let me just justify what happened was, I decided.

1323

03:07:37.090 --> 03:07:56.650

Cooper City Hall: when I put a proposal forward, instead of us having different, you know, insurance for life and stuff like that, we should attach it to the lowest paid full time employee that way. We in the

future, we don't have anything slipped in. If we're not offering to the lowest paid. We're not getting it. So that's how I came up with with that thing. So you don't have to have manuals where you slide things in and

1324

03:07:56.660 --> 03:07:59.399

Cooper City Hall: and have different rates and everything like that, so

1325

03:07:59.640 --> 03:08:13.719

Cooper City Hall: that that was my reasoning behind attaching it similar to the State statute that says the School Board salaries are set at the lowest, you know. The teacher thing. It kind of goes with it, and you don't have to adjust them all the time, you know. So that was my.

1326

03:08:14.000 --> 03:08:30.739

Cooper City Hall: that was my self governing. You know, mechanism in the ordinance, so to say. But my motion is to motion to adopt it, minusing the description that's in the brackets in Section 2. Yeah, okay, do I have a second on that?

1327

03:08:30.860 --> 03:08:34.290

Cooper City Hall: I will go ahead and I will go ahead. And second, that

1328

03:08:34.850 --> 03:08:37.509

Cooper City Hall: I will. We've had discussion.

1329

03:08:37.720 --> 03:09:00.800

Cooper City Hall: Are you passing the gavel since you second it? Because I'm you don't have to pass the gavel on a second. Okay, so we're going around for discussion. Actually, we've had discussion. What I want to do is open it up to the public. Now we've had discussion. So what's the employee? Pay grade, whatever it is? So you said it was 103. It changes tomorrow, whatever it is, whatever the lowest one is so it's the lowest employee. Pay grade is still 101.

1330

03:09:01.250 --> 03:09:04.960

Cooper City Hall: No full time benefits equivalent to lowest

1331

03:09:05.120 --> 03:09:17.570

Cooper City Hall: full time. Employee. I knew you were going to change that because you're I didn't change. I am now going to open up the public hearing anyone wishing to speak. Please step up and or sign any of the

1332

03:09:17.670 --> 03:09:20.080

Cooper City Hall: of papers that we have on the table.

1333

03:09:22.980 --> 03:09:26.040

Cooper City Hall: and if you don't do it 1st and do it after you. Which role

1334

03:09:26.510 --> 03:09:31.010

Cooper City Hall: I'm here as a resident. Thank you. Your name, your name and address, please.

1335

03:09:31.490 --> 03:09:39.150

Cooper City Hall: Full address, not necessary. Okay, thank you, Tina Granite. I'm a resident 20 years Flamingo Gardens. Phase 2.

1336

03:09:42.750 --> 03:10:00.367

Cooper City Hall: Oh, I I thought I had to be sworn in. Okay, I think. That everybody is missing. Maybe an easy solution to this, and that is, there is a on the website for Frs. Where it clearly states that the city of Cooper City opted out not opted out. I'm sorry

1337

03:10:00.720 --> 03:10:02.490

Cooper City Hall: and has a

1338

03:10:02.620 --> 03:10:10.459

Cooper City Hall: point next to it. Sub. 3 or sub. 4. The agency participates in the Frs. For its general employees.

1339

03:10:10.550 --> 03:10:25.869

Cooper City Hall: You can look at City of Hallandale, which has a 3 and a 4. The agency participates in efforts for its elected officials and also its general employees. So why don't you change the ordinance to have the compensation and the benefits match, the lowest

1340

03:10:26.300 --> 03:10:36.839

Cooper City Hall: could be full time and put paid full time, employee, but leave your 401 k. The other, and leave Frs. Out of it.

1341

03:10:37.520 --> 03:10:38.860

Cooper City Hall: I think that

1342

03:10:39.290 --> 03:10:50.690

Cooper City Hall: if you leave it the way it is, and you open it up to interpretation, we don't have an opinion from Frs. The city doesn't have an opinion. I'm not sure what

1343

03:10:50.720 --> 03:10:53.839

Cooper City Hall: the person running for Mayor has, and I don't think.

1344

03:10:54.000 --> 03:11:10.800

Cooper City Hall: And my, what I'm here for is not about him. I'm just about here for the city as far as the residents, and opening the city up for more litigation, possibly having to pay back. I've read up on the Frs. Website that if you, an employer, employ somebody

1345

03:11:10.900 --> 03:11:24.740

Cooper City Hall: within that 6 month timeframe they could be held liable, not an attorney. I'm not an attorney here, but that's what I've read. So why don't the city get an opinion? I think, for now, if we want to pass this, to get in line with the charter.

1346

03:11:25.120 --> 03:11:30.130

Cooper City Hall: Go ahead and change the language so that it clearly leaves out. Frs.

1347

03:11:30.720 --> 03:11:32.139

Cooper City Hall: That's all. Thank you.

03:11:32.720 --> 03:11:35.489

Cooper City Hall: And if you would fill out the form, please. Thank you.

1349

03:11:35.570 --> 03:11:36.580

Cooper City Hall: Anyone else.

1350

03:11:36.900 --> 03:11:38.259

Cooper City Hall: Anyone on virtual

1351

03:11:38.920 --> 03:11:40.999

Cooper City Hall: close publicly. Oh, I'm sorry.

1352

03:11:44.290 --> 03:11:49.590

Cooper City Hall: Hello, Commission Ray Bryant. 1, 2, 1 0. 2 Park drive, been a resident of Cooper City

1353

03:11:49.720 --> 03:11:55.399

Cooper City Hall: 30 plus years. Been a friend to many of you that sit up here on this dais.

1354

03:11:55.540 --> 03:12:04.139

Cooper City Hall: I view this as a city manager form of government, where we should rely on those that are the people that are put in position

03:12:04.300 --> 03:12:08.779

Cooper City Hall: to give us the recommendations that will help us make decisions. As a city.

1356

03:12:08.840 --> 03:12:37.619

Cooper City Hall: Earlier today, we heard about the fiscal crisis that may exist because we've had numbers throughout the years that have accumulated, and it was 1.3 something 1 million based on a lifetime of work from commissioners, people that put a lot of time, sweat, and equity into it. I don't. I encourage them, and I and I do support that number, regardless of what that number was revealed, because it goes over a lifetime. I don't use it as an opportunity to. Now, bash.

1357

03:12:37.920 --> 03:12:46.140

Cooper City Hall: I say that to say that the same situation seems to be occurring right now back in 1,999 or 2,012, whenever it was a decision was made.

1358

03:12:46.390 --> 03:13:08.580

Cooper City Hall: Looking forward, it was foresight to say, We cannot continue this, so an action. And and just like you are doing exactly right now, an action was made to try to limit that liability. Now today we come back. And now we're trying to explore opportunities for more people. The Golden Rule do unto others as you'd have them do unto you. I appreciate that.

1359

03:13:08.610 --> 03:13:22.969

Cooper City Hall: but it also has to come to reality, that and and for the record. So there's no misconception here. I support Jamie Curran for that position. But I speak here not as a supporter of his, but just as looking at this thing from the smell test.

1360

03:13:23.010 --> 03:13:44.710

Cooper City Hall: it doesn't seem appropriate to me that we should be having this conversation at this stage, and it should not be incumbent upon the person seeking office. It should be incumbent upon the city to seek those clarifications, to seek the guidance. So you don't find yourself in a dilemma or or conflict that might yield a lawsuit for political interference.

1361

03:13:44.890 --> 03:14:05.279

Cooper City Hall: So you should be on better solid grounds. And I would yield that the city attorney and the city manager, since this is a city manager form of government, take that leadership role with the input from very intelligent individuals that are up there that are, I'll just give the benefit of doubt, doing the very best that they can to make a rational, educated decision.

1362

03:14:05.520 --> 03:14:27.720

Cooper City Hall: But I would. I would ask you to table this just as too many decisions, too many questions, too many uncertainties. Does it go back to Frs from 22 years. Will that price tag be several 1 million dollars? You know, it just seems like this needs to be thought through a little bit better. Level heads not have the smell that it's some kind of interference.

1363

03:14:27.720 --> 03:14:50.430

Cooper City Hall: I'm not saying that it is, but I know perception is reality in this case, and there's a lot of strong emotions up there. Anybody that watches these commissions meetings can see the strong emotions that exist on both sides of this. So I think the proper and prudent thing to do is to table this to after the elections and let the city manager and the city attorney help you guys. Thank you.

1364

03:14:50.520 --> 03:14:51.520

Cooper City Hall: Thank you.

1365

03:14:51.920 --> 03:14:54.270

Cooper City Hall: Anyone else. And I respond up, yeah.

1366

03:14:54.310 --> 03:15:06.229

Cooper City Hall: So, Mr. Bryant, the the mayor, Ross. Yeah, the issue with you're saying that the city should find the answer. The issue is, we don't have the standing to find

1367

03:15:06.980 --> 03:15:15.749

Cooper City Hall: the get to to seek the opinion for his particular situation, because he has a particular contractual agreement with

1368

03:15:15.780 --> 03:15:30.919

Cooper City Hall: Frs. But you know the question, Commissioner, you know the question that would be begged to the we. We did ask, and the city attorney says that he has an opinion based on what the attorney for the Frs. That represents him. But that doesn't satisfy.

1369

03:15:30.990 --> 03:15:34.390

Cooper City Hall: No, no, it does. I'm telling him

1370

03:15:34.700 --> 03:15:50.209

Cooper City Hall: I would not rely on that, because that assumption that that attorney made was that the elected official class which we're not talking about, which is the same thing that Tina had brought up that caveat. We know we're not in Number 3, like Hallendale has. We know we're not in that separate class

1371

03:15:50.240 --> 03:16:05.739

Cooper City Hall: that's without a dispute. It's whether or not we're automatically qualifying under that other class. And that question begs that the city manager should. If he's saying that he thinks, or the city attorney feels as if that what the pension attorney has said

1372

03:16:05.740 --> 03:16:34.099

Cooper City Hall: suffices, and then he gets elected and finds out that. That's not the case. That seems like that. We're trying to ask that question. We are, we are. We have Pension, Bob Klauser, which you know you're on the Pension Board. He is seeking these clarifications at the same time, but you know our attorneys can't give a legal opinion to somebody else, and all I would say, Commissioner, all the more reason to table this. And you're asking us to get those you're saying. The prudent thing the prudent thing for us to do is to comply with

1373

03:16:34.100 --> 03:16:42.720

Cooper City Hall: our actual charter obligations. Yes, sir, and soon approve. And my thing so my thing was comply with our our written.

1374

03:16:42.740 --> 03:17:10.009

Cooper City Hall: you know or not. I've written the actual charter, and that's why I let Mr. Curran know who depends on the day a lot of times. I don't care for him. Sometimes I do, but I let him know Jamie, seek out this opinion right? And so 2 things can occur at the same time, Commissioner, I think you could pursue that as well as pause this at the same, not to follow the law? No, I'm not asking you. Pursue it with all your might

1375

03:17:10.640 --> 03:17:11.700

Cooper City Hall: anyone else

1376

03:17:11.840 --> 03:17:13.069

Cooper City Hall: you were getting up.

03:17:14.270 --> 03:17:14.950

Cooper City Hall: I want to do.

1378

03:17:15.070 --> 03:17:16.239

Cooper City Hall: Please hit the mic

1379

03:17:17.730 --> 03:17:24.030

Cooper City Hall: and mentioning your name, Gladys Aguera Ray, don't forget to fill out a form. I did. And, Gladys, thank you.

1380

03:17:24.470 --> 03:17:27.899

Cooper City Hall: I concur with everything you just said.

1381

03:17:27.970 --> 03:17:48.960

Cooper City Hall: and if we haven't and I understand your opinion, you're saying it comes up now, so we have to pass it now. But for 21 years you have not had a problem with this. For 21 years you have kept this the status quo?

1382

03:17:49.130 --> 03:17:52.110

Cooper City Hall: What is 2 months going to do?

1383

03:17:52.400 --> 03:17:53.670

Cooper City Hall: Thank you very much.

1384

03:17:57.310 --> 03:17:58.370

Cooper City Hall: Anyone else

1385

03:17:59.100 --> 03:18:06.570

Cooper City Hall: hearing none. Anyone on virtual? No, sir, we'll close public hearing. We have a motion any further discussion up here, Commissioner Green.

1386

03:18:06.670 --> 03:18:10.819

Cooper City Hall: Thank you. Mayor Ross and I heard what Ms. Granite said as a resident.

1387

03:18:11.360 --> 03:18:23.739

Cooper City Hall: If we're going to her in her mind the easy solution was, leave out the S. Frs portion until we have an advisory opinion that from the Frs.

1388

03:18:23.890 --> 03:18:43.040

Cooper City Hall: Where we can make an intelligent decision where it takes the where it relieves anybody, it relieves everybody of any undue pressure. It it's it says, Hey, we are doing the right thing. Recognizing where we are right now, in an election season, we can remove that

1389

03:18:43.170 --> 03:19:05.550

Cooper City Hall: from that ordinance, and we can always, if the if the opinion comes back and says, whatever it says, then the Commission at that time can can say all right, based on that information that

that opinion that we now have. This is how we're going to move forward. We can leave. We can leave that portion out of this ordinance in good faith.

1390

03:19:05.820 --> 03:19:18.010

Cooper City Hall: doing, accomplishing both, fulfilling our fiduciary responsibility to pass this ordinance while also ensuring that the decision that we make

1391

03:19:18.300 --> 03:19:26.790

Cooper City Hall: is going to be the right one. We're waiting. We're awaiting the the advisory opinion from Frs to shore up

1392

03:19:27.010 --> 03:19:29.870

Cooper City Hall: in everybody's mind. Okay, this is

1393

03:19:30.070 --> 03:19:43.850

Cooper City Hall: we. We want to take every step, every step possible to make sure that we're doing everything by the book, and that the and that the residents perceive that you know what they're doing it the right way.

1394

03:19:43.920 --> 03:19:52.180

Cooper City Hall: That's all I have, Mayor. Thank you, Commissioner Schroeder. Yeah, it's it's not exactly 22 years, because they didn't put us in the Frs. 22 years ago.

1395

03:19:53.620 --> 03:19:58.457

Cooper City Hall: the it was 2,012 that they put us in the Frs.

03:19:58.960 --> 03:20:10.629

Cooper City Hall: but you know, the question is, do we make rules for one person? My opinion is. No, you know we don't. So either. We we I think we need to ratify

1397

03:20:11.170 --> 03:20:31.289

Cooper City Hall: the benefits thing as we're required to do. That's the following, the charter is the prudent thing. So if we had somebody, our charter says you have to have a year resident to run or something, and they're like at 364 days. Well, you know, maybe we should, you know, like there's election interfering. No, like the charter says this is what it is, and that's between

1398

03:20:31.400 --> 03:20:34.920

Cooper City Hall: Mr. Curran and and his, whatever people

1399

03:20:34.960 --> 03:20:39.599

Cooper City Hall: you know the Frs. And I gave them the heads up, and I should, and I won't do it again next time.

1400

03:20:39.750 --> 03:20:44.180

Cooper City Hall: and you know he should seek the advisory opinion, and that's on him, you know.

1401

03:20:44.370 --> 03:20:54.289

Cooper City Hall: Jamie Curran picked when he was going to retire. Jamie Curran put us in Frs. And Jamie Curran was given an option. Get it to get an opinion, and hasn't done it. Instead, he's come out and said, we're trying to take an election away from, that's the truth.

03:20:54.960 --> 03:20:57.009

Cooper City Hall: And I'm not going to make a rule for Jamie Kern.

1403

03:20:57.860 --> 03:20:59.550

Cooper City Hall: Thank you, Commissioner. Catchment

1404

03:21:01.010 --> 03:21:02.230

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi.

1405

03:21:02.610 --> 03:21:05.340

Cooper City Hall: Okay, so there is a

1406

03:21:05.730 --> 03:21:11.340

Cooper City Hall: advisory opinion that has been asked for, and they are waiting.

1407

03:21:11.480 --> 03:21:17.570

Cooper City Hall: There is a declaratory statement from Frs. That they that

1408

03:21:18.350 --> 03:21:20.519

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Curran is waiting on

03:21:21.345 --> 03:21:35.999

Cooper City Hall: so that is in the works. Number one. I agree with Commissioner Green. If you take out that one component, everybody's saying, Oh, the sky is falling, and

1410

03:21:36.530 --> 03:21:41.890

Cooper City Hall: we cannot wait on this, because now we are aware of this. Okay.

1411

03:21:42.920 --> 03:21:44.940

Cooper City Hall: so you don't want to wait on this.

1412

03:21:45.050 --> 03:21:47.899

Cooper City Hall: If you take out the Frs Component.

1413

03:21:48.090 --> 03:21:53.089

Cooper City Hall: The sky now is being held up because you're not waiting on it.

1414

03:21:53.770 --> 03:21:55.669

Cooper City Hall: you're taking care of it.

1415

03:21:55.920 --> 03:22:00.459

Cooper City Hall: But now you have taken out any appearance of impropriety.

03:22:00.550 --> 03:22:05.769

Cooper City Hall: and you have taken out anything. No one can now say, in my opinion.

1417

03:22:05.880 --> 03:22:08.040

Cooper City Hall: that this is hampering

1418

03:22:08.320 --> 03:22:13.230

Cooper City Hall: with any kind of election, because, again, in my opinion, I think it is.

1419

03:22:13.490 --> 03:22:17.130

Cooper City Hall: and I will be the 1st one to scream it out to the rooftops.

1420

03:22:17.260 --> 03:22:19.319

Cooper City Hall: and I will not be alone in that.

1421

03:22:20.180 --> 03:22:23.679

Cooper City Hall: and I know you all don't care, but I'm just letting you know.

1422

03:22:23.760 --> 03:22:27.990

Cooper City Hall: but you lose nothing, and you're doing the right thing.

1423

03:22:28.220 --> 03:22:30.270

Cooper City Hall: so that might be something that

1424

03:22:31.600 --> 03:22:41.209

Cooper City Hall: I'm not with the mayor. Would the mayor want to delay his entry in Frs. No, so it's it's not accurate, you know it's not true. It's again you're not.

1425

03:22:42.290 --> 03:22:50.859

Cooper City Hall: This isn't about any one. Individual. Roles have been changed. I'm sorry I thought you were done. No, I oh, then, please continue, take another breath.

1426

03:22:51.710 --> 03:23:04.140

Cooper City Hall: Rules have been changed. Rules have been like the like, the benefits for life. You guys stop for everybody. What about changing? What about? What about taking an ordinance and

1427

03:23:04.360 --> 03:23:12.849

Cooper City Hall: taking it and changing it so that way you could name Sue Ellen Park, Sue, Ellen Fraudelman.

1428

03:23:12.860 --> 03:23:27.310

Cooper City Hall: because that ordinance was removed. You named a park after Sue Ellen Farm. I didn't do that. I wasn't here. I didn't say I said. Rules have been changed is what I said. Did I say Ryan Schroeder did it? No.

1429

03:23:28.570 --> 03:23:29.710

Cooper City Hall: And then

1430

03:23:29.770 --> 03:23:35.949

Cooper City Hall: it was reinstated. And now you cannot name anything after someone that is alive.

1431

03:23:36.040 --> 03:23:42.320

Cooper City Hall: Robert Becker boulevard. It's was not changed, but it was something that was not normally done.

1432

03:23:42.740 --> 03:23:45.570

Cooper City Hall: and then we changed it so that way.

1433

03:23:45.580 --> 03:23:50.379

Cooper City Hall: We can't be a neat jerk reaction, because we know that that's not the best thing to do.

1434

03:23:51.890 --> 03:23:53.660

Cooper City Hall: Things have been done

1435

03:23:53.960 --> 03:23:56.290

Cooper City Hall: to honor a single person.

1436

03:23:57.970 --> 03:24:01.649

Cooper City Hall: You're doing something here. You're trying to level a playing field.

1437

03:24:02.120 --> 03:24:06.609

Cooper City Hall: So that way you have a fair fight that way. You're not giving fodder

1438

03:24:06.810 --> 03:24:08.729

Cooper City Hall: to social media

1439

03:24:09.470 --> 03:24:12.869

Cooper City Hall: that way. You're ruling out an appearance of impropriety.

1440

03:24:14.670 --> 03:24:19.570

Cooper City Hall: Shake your head. No, I am giving my opinion, that's all I'm doing. I

1441

03:24:19.700 --> 03:24:22.290

Cooper City Hall: you have your 3 votes. I'm trying.

1442

03:24:22.600 --> 03:24:24.020

Cooper City Hall: So I am.

1443

03:24:24.070 --> 03:24:28.219

Cooper City Hall: You want to go around. Go right ahead. Thank you, Mayor Ross.

03:24:28.290 --> 03:24:34.870

Cooper City Hall: I I want to make sure that this is not lost on the residents as well, because this.

1445

03:24:35.030 --> 03:25:04.070

Cooper City Hall: as we look at this ordinance, it's not only about the Frs. Pension benefits, it's also about the salary of this of the elected officials, and the salary is going to go. Currently the elected officials. We make \$1,000 a month, \$12,000 a year, commiserate, commiserate, with the lowest paid part time employee here. The commission salary would go from \$12,000 a year to \$37,125 a year. Mr. Horowitz, or Mr.

1446

03:25:04.120 --> 03:25:10.538

Cooper City Hall: Great because we've talked about consistent with the the pension.

1447

03:25:11.210 --> 03:25:28.300

Cooper City Hall: the the employee, benefits of a camp counselor, or a full time. The lowest paid full time person, the number. I know that you all are taking away the the parentheses, and so it means something else. But as I was, as was explained to me

1448 03:25:29.210 --> 03:25:30.500 Cooper City Hall: repeatedly

1449 03:25:31.000 --> 03:25:32.270

Cooper City Hall: was that

03:25:32.340 --> 03:25:43.180

Cooper City Hall: the Commission salary would now would now go from \$12,000 a year to to \$37,125 a year. Is that correct.

1451

03:25:43.880 --> 03:25:57.300

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner? I don't have the number. The manager may have the details, but the ordinance provides for the midpoint of the lowest employee pay grade, Mr. Ray, which is the number that you just read, which is so our employ. So our our pay

1452

03:25:57.860 --> 03:26:00.810

Cooper City Hall: would go from 37,000,

1453

03:26:01.260 --> 03:26:11.309

Cooper City Hall: \$125 a year, plus whatever the Frs. Pension benefits would be.

1454

03:26:11.420 --> 03:26:14.499

Cooper City Hall: And so my question, Mr. Horowitz.

1455

03:26:14.780 --> 03:26:26.549

Cooper City Hall: if the Commission pass, I'm surprised that other folks are not are not here screaming about the \$25,000 pay increase, because when Commissioner Green and I did support

1456

03:26:26.550 --> 03:26:51.239

Cooper City Hall: a \$500 a month, pay increase, going from \$500 a month to a thousand dollars a month they were, they were ready to. They were ready to crucify me for doing that. And now those same people, they're not even here raising an eyebrow about the fact that our salary is going to increase by \$25,000. So I'm I'm perplexed.

1457

03:26:51.240 --> 03:26:55.569

Cooper City Hall: I'm sure that's I'm sure that's what they what they what they think.

1458

03:26:55.570 --> 03:26:59.929

Cooper City Hall: However, however, Mr. Horowitz, if this passes.

1459

03:27:00.570 --> 03:27:01.620

Cooper City Hall: would.

1460

03:27:02.880 --> 03:27:18.809

Cooper City Hall: would after the if this passes, and I'm letting everybody know I am not supporting it, because I truly like Commissioner Melosi. I truly believe that there is an there is election interference going on here. And I'm just gonna and that's my personal opinion. And I'm entitled to my personal opinion.

1461

03:27:19.060 --> 03:27:21.039

Cooper City Hall: If this passes

1462

03:27:22.910 --> 03:27:30.570

Cooper City Hall: the \$37,000, \$37,125. That means that

03:27:31.360 --> 03:27:32.150

Cooper City Hall: yep.

1464

03:27:32.520 --> 03:27:37.109

Cooper City Hall: Frs. As an elected official, am I going to be able to

1465

03:27:37.300 --> 03:27:39.590

Cooper City Hall: opt out of Frs.

1466

03:27:41.370 --> 03:27:57.740

Cooper City Hall: so a couple of things, if if the Commission is participating in the elected officials class and we don't know that correct, we do not know that the statute does allow for members of the Commission to opt out the answer is yes. And so any future

1467

03:27:57.950 --> 03:28:03.450

Cooper City Hall: elected officials, if this passes, if they get elected.

1468

03:28:03.880 --> 03:28:09.420

Cooper City Hall: they, too, would have the ability to opt out of Frs. Is that correct? That is correct.

1469

03:28:10.240 --> 03:28:19.289

Cooper City Hall: even if they are an Frs. If they were in Frs. Previous prior, they would be able to to opt out. Commissioner, I'll tell you this, and I'm I'm

1470

03:28:19.380 --> 03:28:49.349

Cooper City Hall: certainly not comfortable giving legal advice to any particular individual or any candidate. So, but I will offer this as a general premise. Members of the Commission who participate in the elected officers class under Chapter 121, have the option of opting out. So I would like to have an advisory. I'd I'd like to have an opinion for a current elected official me because I'm still in office until November, and I'd like for the city I'd like for the city to provide me with an opinion as what we have talked about tonight.

1471

03:28:49.350 --> 03:28:59.819

Cooper City Hall: That's all I have. Thank you, Mr. Horowitz, and if I may just to follow Commissioner, I'm just going to read, this is from section 121 0 5 2, which speaks to the membership class of elected officials.

1472

03:28:59.960 --> 03:29:08.979

Cooper City Hall: Subsection d. 1. It is 121.0 5 2 membership class of elected officers.

1473

03:29:09.290 --> 03:29:10.930

Cooper City Hall: Subsection

1474

03:29:12.070 --> 03:29:25.119

Cooper City Hall: 3, which is entitled Participation and Withdrawal sub d. 1. Any elected officer may elect to withdraw from participating in the Florida retirement system in any manner whatsoever.

1475

03:29:25.170 --> 03:29:35.469

Cooper City Hall: Upon assuming office, the member shall have a period of 6 months to notify the administrator of his or her decision to withdraw from the Florida retirement decision. Altogether.

1476

03:29:35.520 --> 03:29:40.220

Cooper City Hall: Such elections shall be made in writing, and a copy shall be filed with the employer.

1477

03:29:40.530 --> 03:29:47.520

Cooper City Hall: Subsection d. 1 of 121, 0 5, 2, Commissioner. That's correct.

1478

03:29:47.700 --> 03:29:48.649

Cooper City Hall: Go ahead.

1479

03:29:49.020 --> 03:29:51.409

Cooper City Hall: So am I, understanding correctly that.

1480

03:29:52.090 --> 03:29:55.549

Cooper City Hall: based on what you all just discussed that it wouldn't even

1481

03:29:55.710 --> 03:29:57.000

Cooper City Hall: impact

1482

03:29:57.350 --> 03:29:58.600

Cooper City Hall: potential

1483

03:29:58.860 --> 03:30:00.980

Cooper City Hall: office holders who

1484

03:30:01.760 --> 03:30:15.249

Cooper City Hall: might be an Frs. I'm not suggesting, Commissioner that that is a cure to the issue that we've been discussing, but it but the statute provides for an opt out. Only Frs. Can give that opinion as to whether or not it will address the issue.

1485

03:30:16.180 --> 03:30:18.240

Cooper City Hall: Can't say that. Excuse me

1486

03:30:18.350 --> 03:30:20.290

Cooper City Hall: anything else on this issue.

1487

03:30:20.320 --> 03:30:30.259

Cooper City Hall: Hearing none call the vote, if if I may just very quickly commission the the ordinance that you're prepared to vote on provides for certain benefits, including participation. Frs.

1488

03:30:30.669 --> 03:30:50.769

Cooper City Hall: I would like the opportunity, if this were to pass, to speak with the finance director and the manager. There may be some procedural steps. With regards to Frs enrollment. With the

Commission's permission, I'd like to incorporate those into the ordinance should it become necessary? I don't think there's any objection to that, Commissioners. You have any objection to that?

1489

03:30:51.480 --> 03:30:56.500

Cooper City Hall: Excuse me mentioning Green any objection to that? His.

1490

03:30:57.750 --> 03:31:18.020

Cooper City Hall: again, if this item were to pass and the Commission were to vote to include itself as participants in Frs. Under the Frs. Rules, there may be certain procedural requirements that need to take place to complete that application. If the in the event that it became necessary to amend the ordinance to embrace that process. I'm just asking for the Commission's authorization to make that change

1491

03:31:18.600 --> 03:31:20.269

Cooper City Hall: any objection by anyone.

1492

03:31:20.520 --> 03:31:25.380

Cooper City Hall: Thank you. You got it. I had a question for Jacob. Am I allowed to ask. I called the vote.

1493

03:31:25.910 --> 03:31:27.729

Cooper City Hall: You can ask them later.

1494

03:31:27.800 --> 03:31:28.930

Cooper City Hall: Call the votes.

03:31:31.560 --> 03:31:34.979

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Melosi. No, Commissioner Katzman.

1496

03:31:35.160 --> 03:31:40.170

Cooper City Hall: Yes, Commissioner Schroeder. Yes, Commissioner Green, no. Mayor Ross. Yes.

1497

03:31:40.770 --> 03:31:44.889

Cooper City Hall: moving on to City manager's report, Mr. Ray.

1498

03:31:45.200 --> 03:32:03.339

Cooper City Hall: Nothing to report today, sir. Thank you. City attorneys report. I do have one just one very quick item, Mayor Commission. We've been working on this item with Captain D. Giovanni and his team Commission may recall about 90 days ago, round numbers the Commission adopted an ordinance on second reading with regards to Swale parking.

1499

03:32:03.340 --> 03:32:27.990

Cooper City Hall: there was a scriveners issue in that ordinance. I know it was the intent of the Commission. It was also the intent and recommendation of your police chief to require that all swell parking be in the same direction as the traffic. That language was not embraced in the final version of the document. We're going to make that change and provide it to the codifier. I just wanted the record to reflect the the update and clarification of the ordinance, that's all I have there. Thank you. Thank you. Commissioner. Concerns Commissioner Green.

1500

03:32:28.460 --> 03:32:29.829

Cooper City Hall: I'm good, sir. Thank you.

03:32:29.960 --> 03:32:31.760

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Schroeder.

1502

03:32:32.065 --> 03:32:35.089

Cooper City Hall: The only thing I was gonna say on that ordinance, yeah.

1503

03:32:35.430 --> 03:32:43.160

Cooper City Hall: Can you put it on just on the minutes? Not just to codify so that you go, because we'll never find your oral statement. Yes, no, all right.

1504

03:32:43.200 --> 03:32:44.430 Cooper City Hall: Where's your catchment?

1505

03:32:44.870 --> 03:32:48.040

Cooper City Hall: I just wanted to commend the

1506

03:32:48.050 --> 03:32:51.440

Cooper City Hall: budget truck event. I thought they did a really good job. Thank you.

1507

03:32:51.510 --> 03:32:53.040

Cooper City Hall: Commissioner Malosi.

03:32:54.220 --> 03:32:56.910

Cooper City Hall: I want to thank Staff for touch a truck.

1509

03:32:57.230 --> 03:33:09.150

Cooper City Hall: I think they did a phenomenal job, and it was so hot out there, and also I had my driver's license renewed today, and I used the flow mobile

1510

03:33:09.230 --> 03:33:17.689

Cooper City Hall: that was at city, at the community center, and I just want to thank everybody that brought that here. And

1511

03:33:17.730 --> 03:33:27.369

Cooper City Hall: the the room was jam packed with our residents, and they were so appreciative. It was a breeze to go in there and get everything done.

1512

03:33:27.470 --> 03:33:32.861

Cooper City Hall: The the people from Dmv. Were just phenomenal and

1513

03:33:33.520 --> 03:33:37.190

Cooper City Hall: I did it through the city, and it was just.

1514

03:33:37.300 --> 03:33:46.069

Cooper City Hall: It was so peaceful. It was wonderful. There was no chaos. There was no 8,000 h waiting, and

1515

03:33:46.140 --> 03:34:06.700

Cooper City Hall: I don't know if that's a if that's a recreation thing, or whoever brings it here. But you're fantastic, and all of the residents that were there. They were all saying how wonderful it was, and how much they appreciated it. So if it's you, Stacey, that does it. Thank you. And thank Gina because it was just.

1516

03:34:06.850 --> 03:34:17.850

Cooper City Hall: I cannot tell you what a breeze it was, and how fantastic it was. So you guys rock and thank you very much. Thank you. Additional public comments. Do we have anyone signed up

1517

03:34:18.280 --> 03:34:19.650

Cooper City Hall: anyone on virtual?

1518

03:34:19.840 --> 03:34:21.090

Cooper City Hall: Do I have a motion?

1519

03:34:21.260 --> 03:34:23.029

Cooper City Hall: Oh, what's this thing here

1520

03:34:23.060 --> 03:34:24.320

Cooper City Hall: was this for us.

03:34:25.120 --> 03:34:28.156

Cooper City Hall: this part of the backup? So we voted on it.

1522

03:34:28.630 --> 03:34:31.490

Cooper City Hall: gotcha! It was on the consent agenda.

1523

03:34:31.730 --> 03:34:33.970

Cooper City Hall: No, I didn't have time to read the 20 second.

1524

03:34:34.080 --> 03:34:34.830

Cooper City Hall: Yeah.