

From: [Joseph Napoli](#)
Subject: Utility Bills
Date: Monday, November 21, 2022 8:46:50 AM

Mr. Mayor and Commissioners,

I was just informed that the printing company sent out old utility bills (January 21) for the current cycle. We are determining what occurred and will be sending out corrected versions as soon as possible. We will also be letting the customers know. **This is the old company as the new one is starting in December.** Will keep you posted.

Joe

From: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
To: [Aaron Kendrick](#)
Subject: FW: Utility Bills
Date: Monday, November 21, 2022 9:09:00 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Good morning Aaron,

Did the **vendor** make the **error or did our staff send** the vendor the **wrong data file?**

Thank you,



Ryan Shrouder
Commissioner

City of Cooper City
9090 SW 50th Place
Cooper City, FL 33328
Tel: 954-434-4300 #260
Mobile: 954-298-6846
Email: Rshrouder@coopercityfl.org

From: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
To: [Monica Mcnaughton](#)
Subject: Fwd: Utility Bills
Date: Monday, November 21, 2022 10:33:37 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Hi Monica,

I heard Aaron is out of town, so I was wondering if you know the answers to the below email I sent.

Thank you,

Ryan Shrouder

Commissioner

City of Cooper City

[9090 SW 50thPlace](#)

[Cooper City, FL 33328](#)

Mobile: [954-298-6846](#)

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Ryan Shrouder <RShrouder@coopercity.gov>
Date: November 21, 2022 at 9:09:00 AM EST
To: Aaron Kendrick <AKendrick@coopercity.gov>
Subject: FW: Utility Bills

Good morning Aaron,

Did the vendor make the error or did our staff send the vendor the wrong data file?

Thank you,



Ryan Shrouder
Commissioner

City of Cooper City

9090 SW 50th Place

Cooper City, FL 33328

Tel: 954-434-4300 #260

Mobile: 954-298-6846

Email: Rshrouder@coopercityfl.org

From: [Aron Kendrick](#)
To: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
Cc: [Joseph Napoli](#)
Subject: RE: Utility Bills
Date: Monday, November 21, 2022 1:56:17 PM
Attachments: [image002.png](#)
[image003.png](#)
[image004.png](#)

Commissioner, sorry for the delayed response, but I just saw your message. I'm in Jacksonville today on bereavement leave due to a death in the family. I have spoken with staff and it appears this is a completely random mistake on the part of the printing company. The billing file they sent out was from January 2021. We are trying to get a better explanation, but that is what we know at this point. I will update you as we get additional information.

Regards,



Aaron Kendrick, CPA
Chief Financial Officer

City of Cooper City
9090 SW 50th Place
Cooper City, FL 33328-4227
Tel: 954-434-4300 #228
Email: AKendrick@CooperCityFL.org



@CooperCityFL



www.CooperCityFL.org



@CooperCityGov

From: Ryan Shrouder <RShrouder@coopercity.gov>
Sent: Monday, November 21, 2022 9:10 AM
To: Aaron Kendrick <AKendrick@coopercity.gov>
Subject: FW: Utility Bills

Good morning Aaron,

Did the vendor make the error or did our staff send the vendor the wrong data file?

Thank you,

Ryan Shrouder
Commissioner

City of Cooper City
9090 SW 50th Place
Cooper City, FL 33328
Tel: 954-434-4300 #260
Mobile: 954-298-6846

From: [Monica Mcnaughton](#)
To: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
Cc: [Aaron Kendrick](#)
Subject: Re: Utility Bills
Date: Monday, November 21, 2022 4:27:37 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Good afternoon Commissioner Shrouder,

Thank you for reaching out.

Let me get the details and I will follow up with you on this.

Thank you,

Monica McNaughton

From: [Monica Mcnaughton](#)
To: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
Cc: [Aaron Kendrick](#)
Subject: FW: Utility Bills
Date: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 10:00:08 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Good morning Commissioner Shrouder,

This was a vendor error. They were not able to give us a reason as to why this occurred but are working to correct it and provide new bills.

Thank you,

Monica

From: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
To: [Monica Mcnaughton](#)
Cc: [Aaron Kendrick](#)
Subject: Re: Utility Bills
Date: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 10:11:40 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Thank you. Can you [send me the vendor contact information](#), I'd like to speak with them.

Thank you,

Ryan Shrouder
Commissioner
City of Cooper City
[9090 SW 50thPlace](#)
[Cooper City, FL 33328](#)
Mobile: [954-298-6846](#)
Sent from my iPhone

From: [Joseph Napoli](#)
To: [Joseph Napoli](#)
Subject: RE: Utility Bills
Date: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 10:17:03 AM

Mr. Mayor and Commissioners,

As a follow-up to this issue, our staff just received confirmation that this was an error on our part. The wrong file was inadvertently transferred. Unfortunately last week, the Printing Company's file upload processing website was down (FTP Voyager) and the normal upload process was not used. Corrective measures have been put in place to ensure this does not occur in the future.

Joe

From: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
To: [Monica Mcnaughton](#)
Cc: [Aaron Kendrick](#); [Jacob Horowitz](#)
Bcc: [DG DEPARTMENT HEADS](#); [Christopher DeGiovanni](#); [DG COMMISSIONERS](#)
Subject: RE: Utility Bills
Date: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 11:47:00 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Hi Monica,

Exactly five minutes after I requested the vendor's contact information to call them, I received an email from Joe now stating it wasn't the vendor's fault, but rather the finance department staff who made the mistake. Can you please advise who spoke to the vendor (as indicated in your email below), because it appears someone was untruthful?

Yours truly,



Ryan Shrouder
Commissioner

City of Cooper City
9090 SW 50th Place
Cooper City, FL 33328
Tel: 954-434-4300 #260
Mobile: 954-298-6846
Email: Rshrouder@CooperCity.gov

From: Monica Mcnaughton <MMcnaughton@coopercity.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 10:00 AM
To: Ryan Shrouder <RShrouder@coopercity.gov>
Cc: Aaron Kendrick <AKendrick@coopercity.gov>
Subject: FW: Utility Bills

Good morning Commissioner Shrouder,

This was a vendor error. They were not able to give us a reason as to why this occurred but are working to correct it and provide new bills.

Thank you,

Monica

From: [Monica Mcnaughton](#)
To: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
Cc: [Aaron Kendrick](#); [Jacob Horowitz](#); [Joseph Napoli](#); [Marcia Morin](#)
Subject: Re: Utility Bills
Date: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 12:18:08 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Good afternoon Sir,

I apologize for the confusion. We pride ourselves in honest communication and we are working diligently as a team to resolve this for our residents.

At the time I sent this message, this was the most up to date information. Shortly after this, I was informed that there was an update. We made an error made internally due to the file upload site being down. Also, **the vendor should have caught the issue so it was two fold.** We realize the frustration this may have caused our residents and we are really sorry for this.

We have worked with the vendor on a resolution and will provide an update once this is completed.

The vendor name and contact information is below.

Jodie Freeman

Customer Service Manager

Doxim

C: 205-317-0760

Jodie.freeman@doxim.com

Out of Office: December 12-16

Doxim closed: December 23; December 26

Thank you,

Monica McNaughton

From: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
To: [Monica Mcnaughton](#)
Cc: [Aaron Kendrick](#); [Jacob Horowitz](#); [Marcia Morin](#)
Bcc: [DG DEPARTMENT HEADS](#); [DG COMMISSIONERS](#)
Subject: Re: Utility Bills
Date: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 12:32:19 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image001.png](#)
[image001.png](#)

Monica, I understand mistakes are inevitable.

For me, this issue is less about the mistake and more about truthfulness. I am just wondering which specific staff member told you that he/ she spoke to the vendor, which resulted in you informing me that "They (the vendor) were not able to give us (the City) a reason as to why this occurred but are working to correct it and provide new bills."

Jacob can correct me if I am wrong, but I believe the City Charter specifically allows me to inquire as to who the specific employee is that told you he/she spoke to the printing company.

Thank you,

Ryan Shrouder
Commissioner
City of Cooper City
9090 SW 50thPlace
Cooper City, FL 33328
Mobile: 954-298-6846
Sent from my iPhone

From: [Jacob G. Horowitz](#)
To: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
Cc: [Monica Mcnaughton](#); [Aaron Kendrick](#); [Marcia Morin](#)
Subject: Re: Utility Bills
Date: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 3:03:29 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

CAUTION: This email originated from outside the City of Cooper City. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender **and** expect the content.

Commissioner,

Sec 3.11 of the charter allows for inquires and investigations by members of the commission into all aspects of city government operations.

I hope that helps clarify.

Jacob G. Horowitz



3099 East Commercial Boulevard, Suite 200

Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33308

Telephone: (954) 771-4500 x 5055 | (561) 276-9400 x 5055 | Fax: (954) 771-4923

Email: JHorowitz@gorencherof.com | www.GorenCherof.com

FRAUD ALERT – WE DO NOT ACCEPT OR REQUEST CHANGES TO WIRING INSTRUCTIONS VIA EMAIL OR FAX. ALWAYS CALL OUR OFFICE TO VERIFY.

Disclaimer: This E-Mail is covered by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C. §§ 2510-2521 and is legally privileged. The information contained in this E-Mail is intended only for use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you receive this E-Mail in error, please notify the sender immediately at the phone number above and delete the information from your computer. Please do not copy or use it for any purpose nor disclose its contents to any other person.

From: [Aaron Kendrick](#)
To: [Ryan Shrouder](#)
Cc: [Monica Mcnaughton](#); [Marcia Morin](#); [Jacob Horowitz](#); [Joseph Napoli](#)
Subject: Re: Utility Bills
Date: Tuesday, November 22, 2022 5:43:46 PM

Commissioner Shrouder, after discovering there was a problem with the utility billing printing, Alexis reached out to the vendor to determine what had occurred. At that time the vendor did not know why they printed a batch dated January 14 ,2021. As such, they opened an internal investigative ticket. Cooper City employees not knowing how this occurred **assumed it was the vendor's error**, and in an effort to provide timely feedback to the understandable flurry of inquiries they were receiving responded as such. In hindsight, they should have said they did not know what happened, but would provide an update as soon as information became clear.

I fully understand the need for complete transparency and I believe we are getting it. I think what has occurred here is what often happens in the fog of war, the first report is often wrong.

However, what happens in finance is ultimately my responsibility, and as such I offer my sincere apology for this mistake and my assurance that we will put controls in place to ensure it doesn't happen again.

If you have any further questions, please let me know. If I become aware of any additional information, I will provide and update.

As always, thank you for your passion, concern, and support.

Aaron