

**Columbus Consolidated Government  
Council Meeting Agenda Item**

<b>TO:</b>	Mayor and Councilors
<b>AGENDA SUBJECT:</b>	Real Estate Appraisal Services (Annual Contract) – RFP No. 22-0017
<b>INITIATED BY:</b>	Finance Department

---

It is requested that Council approve the annual contract for Real Estate Appraisal Services with Norris Appraisal Group, LLC (Cataula, GA), Primary Contractor, and Carter-Hazel & Associates, Inc. (Ellenwood, GA), Secondary Contractor, for Option 1: Community Reinvestment; as well as, Norris Appraisal Group, LLC (Cataula, GA), Primary Contractor, and CBRE, Inc. – Valuation & Advisory Services (Atlanta, GA), Secondary Contractor, for Option 2: Right-of-Way. The firms will provide all labor, supervision, and materials required to perform real estate appraisal services, on an “as needed basis”, for various projects involving land acquisition and disposition.

Option 1: Community Reinvestment – Norris Appraisal Group, LLC and Carter-Hazel & Associates, Inc. will perform real estate appraisal services for the Department of Community Reinvestment in accordance with standards contained in the Department of Housing and Urban Development Handbook 1378 5-3; 49 CAR 24.103 and Appendix 20.

Option 2: Right-of-Way – Norris Appraisal Group, LLC and CBRE, Inc. – Valuation & Advisory Services will perform appraisal services for Right of Way projects that are State/Federal projects approved by the Georgia Department of Transportation (GDOT) and appraisers must be classified as Level I, II, III or IV. As required by GDOT, all Appraisers are on the approved list of Pre-qualified for Right of Way related services.

The initial term of the contract will be for one year with the option to renew for four (4) additional twelve-month periods. Contract renewal will be contingent upon the mutual agreement of the City and the Contractor(s).

**Annual Contract History:**

The current five-year contract with Norris Appraisal Group, LLC and Appraisal Enterprises, Inc., was awarded on October 13, 2015 (Resolution No. 294-15), to perform real estate appraisal services for various projects involving land acquisition and disposition on an “as needed basis”.

**RFP Advertisement and Receipt of Proposals:**

RFP specifications were posted on DemandStar and the web pages of the Purchasing Division and the Georgia Procurement Registry on November 18, 2021. This RFP has been advertised, opened, and evaluated. Proposals were received on February 11, 2022 from the following three (3) vendors:

**Norris Appraisal Group, LLC (Cataula, GA)**  
**Carter-Hazel & Associates, Inc. (Ellenwood, GA)**  
**CBRE, Inc. – Valuation & Advisory Services (Atlanta, GA)**

The following events took place after receipt of proposals:

<b>RFP MEETINGS/EVENTS</b>		
<b>Description</b>	<b>Date Held</b>	<b>Agenda/Action</b>
Pre-Evaluation Meeting	03/23/2022	The Purchasing Manager advised evaluation committee members of the RFP rules and regulations. Project Managers provided overview and expectations of the contracted vendor(s).  Proposals were disbursed to each committee member for review.
1 <sup>st</sup> Evaluation Meeting	04/06/2022	Committee discussed each of the three (3) proposals received. Clarification was needed as well as a request for a specification change and a Best and Final Offer from all vendors.
Clarification Request	04/11/22	Request for clarification was forwarded to the vendors.
Clarification Received	06/01/22	The vendors submitted the requested clarification information, which was forwarded to the Committee.  The Committee indicated they were ready to begin evaluations.
Evaluation Forms Sent	06/02/22	Evaluation forms were forwarded to voting committee members.
Evaluation Forms Received	06/15/22	The last set of evaluation forms were returned to the Purchasing Division.
Evaluation Results	07/07/22	The evaluation results were forwarded to the Committee. The Committee was asked to confirm if they wished to meet and discuss the evaluations or if they were ready to vote. The Committee indicated they wished to meet and discuss the evaluations.
2 <sup>nd</sup> Evaluation Meeting	07/12/22	The Committee discussed the evaluation results and indicated they were ready to vote.
Final Ballot	07/12/22	Ballots were forwarded to the Voters for a final vote.
Ballots Results	07/13/22	The final ballots were received and resulted in an award recommendation to Norris Appraisal Group, LLC (Primary Contractor) and Carter-Hazel & Associates, Inc. (Secondary Contractor) for Option 1; and Norris Appraisal Group, Inc. (Primary Contractor) and CBRE, Inc. – Valuation & Advisory Services (Secondary Contractor for Option 2.

### **Evaluation Committee:**

Proposals were reviewed by the Evaluation Committee members, which consisted of one representative from Community Reinvestment, and two representatives from Planning, who served as the three voting members.

One representative from Community Reinvestment and one representative from Engineering served as alternate voters.

One representative from Community Reinvestment and one representative from Planning served as non-voting advisory members.

### **Award Recommendation:**

There are two options to the contract and each option is to be awarded to a Primary and a Secondary Contractor. Based on the final evaluation results, the Committee unanimously recommends award for Option 1 to Norris Appraisal Group, LLC as the Primary Contractor, and Carter-Hazel & Associates, Inc. as the Secondary Contractor; and unanimously recommends award for Option 2 to Norris Appraisal Group, LLC as the Primary Contractor, and CBRE, Inc. – Valuation & Advisory Services as the Secondary Contractor.

### **Option 1: Community Reinvestment:**

#### **Norris Appraisal Group, LLC. (Primary Contractor)**

#### **Qualifications/Experience:**

- The vendor has performed appraisals for the Columbus Consolidated Government and for the Georgia Department of Transportation since approximately 1993.
- Vendor has performed appraisals for different kinds of organizations and many different types of appraisals from residential, commercial, and vacant properties.
- The vendor has experience as an expert witness.
- Rick Norris is the Owner of Norris Appraisal Group, LLC, May, 2009 to present. Harris County Board of Tax Assessors, Chairman, 2004, 2006 and 2008 to 2015.
- Limited Partner – Cliatt & Norris Appraisals, LLP January, 2000 to May, 2009. Qualified as Level IV appraiser with the Georgia Department of Transportation, which is now known as a Level III (GDOT Reclassification).
- Independent Fee Appraiser – Cliatt Appraisal Company, May, 1993 through December, 1999. Appraisals completed include commercial and manufacturing properties, rural acreage, farmland and residential properties. Qualified as a Level III appraiser with the Georgia Department of Transportation.
- Commercial Appraiser – Columbus Consolidated Government, October, 1987 through May, 1993. Conducted field work and valuation analysis for commercial real property. Defended valuations before the Muscogee County Board of Tax Assessors and Board of Equalizations. Member of the Georgia Association of Assessing Officials 1989-1993. Qualified as a Level II Appraiser with the Georgia Department of Revenue.
- Rick Norris is a Certified General Real Property Appraiser in both Georgia and Alabama.

### **Client Work History:**

- Columbus Consolidated Government (Columbus, GA) – Provided appraisal services; 1993-Present. Contract Amount: Variable.
- City of LaGrange (LaGrange, GA) – Provided appraisal and appraisal review services; July 19, 2021-Present. Contract Amount: Variable.
- Georgia Power (Southern Company) (Atlanta, GA) – Provided appraisal services; January 1, 2021-Present. Contract Amount: Variable.
- CHB Acquisition Services, LLC (Warrenton, GA) – Provided appraisal services. Contract Amount: Variable.

### **Carter-Hazel & Associates, Inc. (Secondary Contractor)**

#### **Qualifications/Experience:**

- The vendor provides professional real estate services including real estate acquisitions, valuations, leasing, disposals, and sales.
- The vendor maintains staff appraisers who have been accepted as expert witness appraisers in Georgia Superior Courts and Florida Superior Courts.
- Performs appraisals of single-family, multi-family, hospitality, office, industrial, and special purpose properties.
- Performs rent comparability studies of residential and commercial properties.
- Specialized experience appraising residential and commercial properties under federal programs such as Community Development Block Grants, Neighborhood Stabilization Programs, and Low Income Housing Tax Credits.
- Provided eminent domain appraisal and court affidavit for the City of Chamblee, GA.
- Provided eminent domain appraisal and court affidavit for the City of Stone Mountain, GA.
- Provided eminent domain appraisal and expert witness testimony for the City of Albany, GA.
- Member of the Cherokee County Board of Equalization (Cherokee County, GA); appointed by the Grand Jury for a 3-year term to hear property tax appeal cases involving commercial, residential, and personal property.
- Conducted hearings on behalf of DeKalb County (DeKalb County, GA) involving commercial property tax appeal cases.
- Provided Neighborhood Stabilization Program (NSP) appraisals for the City of Albany, GA.

### **Client Work History:**

- City of Chamblee, GA (Chamblee, GA) – Provided real estate appraisal services and expert witness testimony; January 2021-March 2021. Contract Amount: \$7,500.00.
- City of Stone Mountain (Stone Mountain, GA) – Provided real estate appraisal services and expert witness testimony; April 2018-August 2018. Contract Amount: \$6,800.00.
- US Real Estate Services (Lake Forest, CA) – Provided HUD/FHA real estate appraisal services; January 2019-Present. Contract Amount: \$500.00 per appraisal.
- Pemco Limited (Atlanta, GA) – Provided HUD/FHA real estate appraisal services; November 2021-November 2022. Contract Amount: \$45,000.00.

**Option 2: Right of Way:**

**Norris Appraisal Group, LLC. (Primary Contractor)**

**Qualifications/Experience:**

Same as above.

**Client Work History:**

Same as above.

**CBRE, Inc. – Valuation & Advisory Services (Secondary Contractor)**

**Qualifications/Experience:**

- Firm was established in 1906, based in Dallas, TX, and operates more than 450 offices worldwide.
- Firm has approximately 30+ appraisers who are state certified.
- Firm has completed approximately 6,700 valuation and advisory assignments in the past 36 months in the state of Georgia.
- Firm has completed numerous eminent domain and governmental related valuation assignments in Georgia.
- Firm's clients include numerous public entity clients (state, county, and local municipalities).

**Client Work History:**

- Georgia Department of Transportation/HDR (Atlanta, GA) – Provided data book, various appraisal types; 2020-2021. Contract Amount: \$65,000.00 – Appraisal Fees.
- City of Palmetto/Gresham Smith (Atlanta, GA) – Provided various appraisal types; 2021-2022. Contract Amount: No set amount.
- TIA-Transportation Investment Act (GDOT) (Warrenton, GA) – Provided various appraisal types; 2021-2022. Contract Amount: \$60,000.00+.

Clayton County Department of Transportation (McDonough, GA) – Provided data book and various appraisal types; 2017-2018. Contract Amount: North of \$150,000.00 – Appraisal Fees

The City's Procurement Ordinance Article 3-110, Competitive Sealed Proposals for the procurement of Equipment, Supplies and Professional Services, governs the RFP Process. During the RFP process, there is no formal opening due to the possibility of negotiated components of the proposal. In the event City Council does not approve the recommended offeror, no proposal responses or any negotiated components are made public until after the award of the contract. Therefore, the evaluation results have been submitted to the City Manager in a separate memo for informational purposes.

Funds will be budgeted each fiscal year for this on-going expense: General Fund – Community Reinvestment – Real Estate – Appraisals, 0101-245-2400-REAL-6373; and Other various projects funded through the Capital Improvement Project Financing.

**A RESOLUTION**

**NO. \_\_\_\_\_**

**A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTION OF ANNUAL CONTRACTS FOR REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL SERVICES, ON AN “AS NEEDED BASIS”, WITH NORRIS APPRAISAL GROUP, LLC (CATAULA, GA), PRIMARY CONTRACTOR, AND CARTER-HAZEL & ASSOCIATES, INC. (ELLENWOOD, GA), SECONDARY CONTRACTOR, FOR OPTION 1: COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT; AS WELL AS NORRIS APPRAISAL GROUP, LLC (CATAULA, GA), PRIMARY CONTRACTOR, AND CBRE, INC. – VALUATION & ADVISORY SERVICES (ATLANTA, GA), SECONDARY CONTRACTOR, FOR OPTION 2: RIGHT-OF-WAY.**

**WHEREAS**, an RFP was administered (RFP No. 22-0017) and three proposals were received; and,

**WHEREAS**, the proposal submitted by Norris Appraisal Group, LLC, as well as Carter-Hazel & Associates, Inc. met all proposal requirements and were evaluated most responsive to the RFP for Option 1: Community Reinvestment; and,

**WHEREAS**, the proposals submitted by Norris Appraisal Group, LLC, as well as CBRE, Inc. – Valuation & Advisory Services met all proposal requirements and were evaluated most responsive to the RFP for Option 2: Right-of-Way; and,

**WHEREAS**, the initial term of the contract shall be for one year, with the option to renew for four (4) additional twelve-month periods. The contract renewal will be contingent upon the mutual agreement of the City and the Contractors.

**NOW, THEREFORE, THE COUNCIL OF COLUMBUS, GEORGIA, HEREBY RESOLVES AS FOLLOWS:**

That the City Manager is hereby authorized to execute annual contracts for real estate appraisal services, on an “as needed basis”, with Norris Appraisal Group, LLC (Columbus, GA) as Primary Contractor, and with Carter-Hazel & Associates, Inc. (Ellenwood, GA) as Secondary Contractor for Option 1: Community Reinvestment; and with Norris Appraisal Group, LLC (Columbus, GA) as Primary Contractor, and with CBRE, Inc. – Valuation & Advisory Services (Atlanta, GA) as Secondary Contractor for Option 2: Right-of-Way. Funds will be budgeted each fiscal year for this on-going expense: General Fund – Community Reinvestment – Real Estate – Appraisals, 0101-245-2400-REAL-6373; and Other various projects funded through the Capital Improvement Project Financing.

Introduced at a regular meeting of the Council of Columbus, Georgia, held the \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2022 and adopted at said meeting by the affirmative vote of \_\_\_\_\_ members of said Council.

- Councilor Allen voting \_\_\_\_\_.
- Councilor Barnes voting \_\_\_\_\_.
- Councilor Crabb voting \_\_\_\_\_.
- Councilor Davis voting \_\_\_\_\_.
- Councilor Garrett voting \_\_\_\_\_.
- Councilor House voting \_\_\_\_\_.
- Councilor Huff voting \_\_\_\_\_.
- Councilor Thomas voting \_\_\_\_\_.
- Councilor Tucker voting \_\_\_\_\_.

Councilor Woodson voting \_\_\_\_\_.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Sandra T. Davis, Clerk of Council

\_\_\_\_\_  
B.H. "Skip" Henderson III, Mayor