CITY OF COLUMBIA HEIGHTS
ERP SYSTEMS COMPARISON
2019-2021

technical assistance provider (USI)	tyler technologies	BS&A SOFTWARE Service, Solutions, Support...Satisfaction	civicsystems strong software, strong community	GovSense
Product:	Munis	BS&A Software	Caselle Connect - Utility & Financial Software	NetSuite, Oracle
Vendor:	Tyler Technologies	Bellefeuil, Szur & Associates, Inc.	Civic Systems	GovSense
Founded:	1966, Cloud solutions, 2000	1987	1984	2014
Headquarters:	Plano, TX	Bath, MI	Madison, WI	Alpharetta, GA
Ownership:	Publicly Traded	Private	Private	Private
Customers:	5,000	1,000 plus	180	300
Deployment Model:	Cloud, or On-Premise	On-Premise	Cloud, or On-Premise	Cloud
Intended Governments:	Medium, Large	Small, Medium	Small, Medium	Medium, Large, Enterprsie
Pros:	A very customizable solution with a modern UI that will have a higher adoption rate. This is the only company that isn't at some risk for being sold and changing the terms of the agreement after only a handful of years.	Comprehensive ERP software for mid-size municipalities looking to keep and maintain a premise-based solution, strong implementation and customer support teams.	Easy to navigate and relatively customizable. Customer support team appears very strong technically, including in utility billing. Offers intensive individualized hands-on instruction at their Madison, Wisconsin training facility.	NetSuite's breadth affords robust functionality, and its scalability gives it long-term value as a company grows.
Cons:	Usually requires a very long implementation process of up to 18 months. While that allows users to learn one module at a time, it requires a lot of duplicative effort to manually share information between the new and the old system during that 18 months. All current MN users are larger cities (Edina, Bloomington, etc.)	UI is arguably dated, but this is somewhat by design to resemble Microsoft Excel. H/R and timekeeping features are very basic, so additional third-party software for things like complex timesheets and online job applications will be required.	UI is arguably dated, but this is somewhat by design to resemble Microsoft Excel. Quite similar to BS&A but with a much smaller customer base. Almost all peer Cities in MN that are implementing this style of ERP at this time are choosing BS&A instead. Self-serve employee timesheets may not work well on smartphones.	Based heavily on integration with third-party platforms. Bugs with this have caused downtime. This is by far the most custom of all the products, so much that major parts of their proposal could not be shown at the demonstration, because they would have to be built and paid for before they could be demonstrated!
Bottom Line:	This is the premier product in the market. Unlike the others, Tyler includes an integrated content management system that competes with the Laserfiche content management system used by the City of Columbia Heights. Tyler is even their own credit card processor if you want them to be. No third-party software is required for anything a city might do. Although Tyler can be paired with third-party tools, doing so isn't their business model. So to really get the advantages it offers, it helps to adopt it for nearly everything a government does.	A robust, scalable ERP solution for Small to Medium Municipalities, which can be customized to meet Financial and Accounting needs. Widely-published customer list with a large number MN cities similar in size to Columbia Heights.	Flexible ERP solution with a customizable source code and different modules to streamline processes for small and mid-sized municipalities. Slightly better at HR than BS&A.	NetSuite ERP may lead the market in financials/ERP functionality, but it is not without some frustrating drawbacks.
1st Year Cost excluding cashiering equipment	$365,000 plus $5,000 if complex timesheets and scheduling included	$273,000. Includes a fair estimate of the number of days of implementation and training required. Price will be reduced if fewer days or less travel required.	$210,00 plus certain costs of webstore. The number of days of implementation and training included in this price appears less than likely will be necessary.	$609,000. Proposal provides very little detail compared to other vendors.

OTHER ERP SYSTEMS REVIEWED:

City staff reviewed three other ERP systems in addition to the four listed above. These other systems were eliminated relatively early in the review process, before the final review that provided the table above. These systems and the primary reasons for their early exclusion are:

Tyler Techologies - Incode. This is a Tyler ERP system that has fewer features and is more "off-the-shelf" than Tyler Munis listed above. Although Incode has the advantage of being used by a number of similar sized MN cities, such as Fridley, it still has the same inherent resistance to non-Tyler products or user-driven reporting changes. In addition, Tyler aggressively discounted its price proposal for their superior system, so that the initial cost of Munis was only $50,000 higher than Incode, and the subsequent annual support cost of both Tyler products was substantially the same.

Accela - Springbrook. This was a desirable offering with a comparable price to BS&A, and with a substantial number of small to mid-size MN city customers. Unfortunately during the review process, Springbrook was purchased by Accela to add to Accela's other existing government software programs. As as a result of this, Springbrook is no longer sold to cities with populations under 100,000.

LOGIS - JD Edwards. The joint powers entity LOGIS is well-established as a benchmark for many aspects of information systems in MN local government. Unfortunately at this time, the ERP solution they are providing to LOGIS members is an older legacy system that is nearly as antiquated as the City of Columbia Heights' existing system. LOGIS has just recently contracted with the Government Finance Officers Assn to begin a search for a replacement ERP system. At this time, it is uncertain what that new system will cost or when it may be implemented. Based on pricing LOGIS provided for their existing ERP, it is does not appear that an economy of scale is being achieved by the LOGIS cooperative purchasing approach, compared to the City of Columbia Heights just contracting directly with the current ERP mid-size market leaders. In addition, flexibility for configuring the ERP in ways that the City of Columbia Heights might desire could potentially be limited in some instances by the LOGIS governing structure.