

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA **FILED** IN THE GENERAL COURT OF JUSTICE
SUPERIOR COURT DIVISION

COUNTY OF NEW HANOVER 2020 SEP 21 A. 9:58 20-CVS-1444

NEW HANOVER CO. C.310.

IN RE REQUEST BY CBYC, LLC,)
BY _____)

Petitioner,)

v.)

TOWN OF CAROLINA BEACH, a North)
Carolina Municipal Corporation and)
Body Politic,)

Respondent,)

OCEANA OWNERS ASSOCIATION,)
INC.)

Intervenor-Respondent.)
_____)

CONSENT ORDER

THIS MATTER appears before the Court for entry of a Consent Order granting the application and request for a conditional use permit submitted to the Respondent Town of Carolina Beach ("Town") by Petitioner CBYC, LLC ("CBYC") (collectively, "Consent Order").

ALL PARTIES, including Intervenor Oceana Owners Association, Inc. ("Oceana"), now consent, by and through their undersigned counsel, to the granting of this Consent Order and CBYC's application and request for a conditional use permit that was submitted to the Respondent on or about 25 September 2019, premised upon the following:

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Jurisdiction and venue of this action are properly before this Court.
2. By virtue of that General Warranty deed dated 31 July 2019 and recorded on 2 August 2019 in Book 6235 at Page 2175 of the New Hanover Country Registry of Deeds

A TRUE COPY
CLERK OF SUPERIOR COURT
NEW HANOVER COUNTY
BY: *Leni M. Knowles*
Deputy Clerk

("Registry"), CBYC owns the real property located at 401 Marina Street in New Hanover County, North Carolina ("Property").

3. On or about 25 September 2019, CBYC applied to the Town for a conditional use permit (hereinafter "Permit") for certain limited improvements to its Property.

4. CBYC's Property consists of an existing commercial marina including fuel docks, a ship store, an office, residential unit, parking, and related facilities which have been in place for more than 20 continuous years preceding CBYC's Permit application (collectively, "Marina").

5. CBYC's Permit application seeks to (i) extend and widen its existing fuel dock; (ii) add and relocate its fuel pumps; (iii) place a barge adjacent to CBYC's existing dock, where the existing office and ship store will be relocated; (iv) add thirteen (13) parking spaces, a designated loading zone, and two (2) ADA compliant parking spaces within the Property's existing boundary; and, (v) add an outdoor eating establishment to serve hot food and drinks to the Marina's patrons.

6. The 2007 Town of Carolina Beach CAMA Land Use Plan sets forth the Town's desire to encourage "low intensity water-oriented restaurant or other low intensity water-oriented commercial services with public docking and water access."

7. The Town's existing Code of Ordinances permits restaurants, bars, eateries, retail sales, office space, and other marina related uses in the MB-1 zoning district in which CBYC's Property is located.

8. The Town's Ordinances require an applicant for a conditional use permit to meet seven (7) specific and four (4) general standards before being approved. *Carolina Beach, N.C. Code of Ordinances*, § 40-327(c) and (d).

9. The Town's Ordinances also set forth standards for particular uses such as eating and/or drinking establishments, which are specifically permissive uses within the Property's MB-1 zoning district. *Id.* § 40-261.

10. On 14 January 2020, a quasi-judicial hearing was held on CBYC's application for its Permit.

11. At the hearing, CBYC and Oceana presented evidence concerning the seven (7) specific and four (4) general standards before being approved. *Carolina Beach, N.C. Code of Ordinances*, § 40-327(c) and (d).

12. On 30 March 2020, the Town issued its written Order denying CBYC's Permit application based on the 2-2 tied vote of the Town's Council's vote.

13. On 29 April 2020, CBYC timely and properly filed its Petition for Writ of Certiorari to this Court seeking to appeal the Town's Order denying its Permit application.

14. On 29 April 2020, CBYC's Petition for Writ of Certiorari was granted; the Town submitted the record for the appeal; and this Court was scheduled to conduct the appellate hearing on CBYC's appeal on 23 September 2020.

15. On 29 May 2020, Oceana filed its Verified Motion to Intervene of Oceana Owners Association, Inc., and its proposed Response of Intervenor-Respondent Oceana Owners Association, Inc (collectively, "Intervention Motion").

16. On September 15, 2020, Oceana filed an Objection to Notice of Hearing and Motion to Continue the noticed appeal hearing. Thereafter, counsel for CBYC informed counsel for Oceana that CBYC would consent to Oceana's Intervention Motion to keep the noticed date for the appeal hearing.

17. Ultimately, the hearing on CBYC's appeal was canceled based upon the parties' agreement and resolution of the matters between them.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, the parties and this Court agree to the following Conclusions of Law:

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this proceeding.
2. Oceana's Intervention Motion is hereby granted, thus binding Oceana to the rights and obligations of this Consent Order.
3. Conditional use permits are issued for uses that an ordinance expressly permits in a designated zone. *Humble Oil & Refining Co. v. Bd. of Aldermen*, 284 N.C. 458, 467, 202 S.E.2d 129, 136 (1974).
4. To effectuate the parties' settlement and the entry of this Consent Order, the parties agree that CBYC produced competent, material, and substantial evidence establishing that CBYC's Permit application met all relevant standards, specifications, and requirements set forth under the Town's Ordinances for issuance of a conditional use permit.

Based upon the foregoing, including the consent and request of the parties, and upon a review of the terms herein, the Court believes that the entry of this Consent Order is fair, in the interests of justice, and should be entered.


NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows:

1. CBYC's application for a Permit shall be and the same is hereby GRANTED upon the following conditions/restrictions:

- a. All of the terms and provisions contained in CBYC's Permit Application, except as may be expressly modified hereinbelow and said modifications shall supplement and amend CBYC's Permit Application.
 - b. CBYC shall fully comply with all Town, New Hanover County, State, and/or Federal rules and regulations, including the departments and agencies of each such entity.
 - c. CBYC shall not play music, whether recorded or live, before 12:00 p.m. each day, will stop playing any such music one (1) hour before closing time each day, and will at all times comply with the Town's noise ordinance.
 - d. CBYC's store, restaurant, fueling and other sales and activities shall cease by 9:00 p.m. beginning on the Friday of Memorial Day weekend of each calendar year through and including the Labor Day holiday of each calendar year. At all other times (i.e., the off-season), said activities shall cease by 7:00 p.m.
 - e. CBYC's restaurant operations will open on a daily basis no earlier than 7 a.m.
 - f. Any newly installed lighting within CBYC's Marina shall be directed downward and away from the residential homes in the Oceana Subdivision.
 - g. CBYC will ensure that trash is picked-up on a daily basis within all areas of its operation, including along its walkways along the Marina and also within the parking lot and spaces owned by CBYC within the Oceana Subdivision.
 - h. Any future conditional or special use permit application by CBYC requesting additional uses of the Property not contemplated in the current Permit may be contested by Oceana notwithstanding this Consent Order. Alternatively, Oceana may choose to require the same restrictions specified herein to be imposed on the use proposed by any such future conditional or special use permit application.
2. Nothing herein shall be construed so as to waive, limit or otherwise prejudice CBYC and its successors and assigns from seeking additional uses and/or improvements to its subject property and marina as may be allowed by the Town's ordinances. Nothing herein shall be construed so as to waive, limit or otherwise prejudice the legal and/or factual arguments of any opponents possessing legal standing to any future applications by CBYC and/or its successors and assigns to make any additional uses and/or improvements to its subject property.

3. The terms and provisions of this Order shall be fully enforceable by the Court with all of its authority including, without limitation, the Court's powers of contempt, including an award of attorney's fees for any prevailing party.
4. Each party shall bear its own respective costs and attorneys' fees, except in any proceedings under Paragraph 3.
5. The provisions of this Consent Order shall be binding upon and inure to the benefit of the parties' respective successors and assigns.

So ORDERED this the 21st day of December 2020.



THE HONORABLE George F. Jones
Resident Superior Court Judge Presiding
New Hanover County, North Carolina


WE CONSENT:



G. Grady Richardson, Jr.
Counsel for Petitioner, CBYC, LLC



Charlotte Noel Fox
Counsel for Respondent Town of Carolina Beach



C. Wes Hodges, II
*Counsel for Intervenor-Respondent,
Oceana Owners Association, Inc.*