

P A S T
CONSULTANTS LLC

Seth A. Bergstein
415.515.6224
seth@pastconsultants.com

November 11, 2021

Sean Sesanto, Assistant Planner
City of Capitola Planning Department
420 Capitola Ave.
Capitola, CA 95010

Re: 1410 Prospect Ave., Capitola, CA – SOI Standards Design Review Letter
APN. 034-046-19

Dear Mr. Sesanto:

This letter evaluates the proposed alterations to the property located at 1410 Prospect Avenue, in Capitola, California. The subject property contains a highly altered two-story house (circa-1905) constructed in the Vernacular style that is listed as a local historic resource.

Project Methodology

A preliminary meeting for project review with the City of Capitola's Planning Department was held on July 12, 2021 to discuss the proposed design and historic nature of the site. On August 3, 2021 PAST Consultants, LLC (PAST) visited the subject property to view the existing conditions of the building and neighborhood setting. Design drawings by Derek Van Alstine Residential Design, Inc., dated 8/24/2021 were the design drawings reviewed for this evaluation. The proposed project is the demolition and reconstruction of the highly altered, circa-1905 residence as a historic feature according to the City of Capitola's historic preservation ordinance.

Prior to this meeting, the subject property was reviewed by Leslie Dill, Archives & Architecture and a preliminary historic evaluation issued dated February 18, 2020. The document states:

The property at 1410 Prospect Avenue, identified in 1986 on the City of Capitola Historic Structures List, meets the criteria for designation as a Historic Feature utilizing the City of Capitola Historic Feature Ordinance, Qualities 9 and 10: "The proposed historic feature by its location and setting materially contributes to the historic character of the city, and the proposed historic feature is a long established feature of the city." The property also appears to qualify for listing on the California Register of Historical Resource for its embodiment of the significant

patterns of development history of the City of Capitola. It is not eligible, however, based on its associations with personages, nor for its architectural design, due to alterations on the exterior.¹

On August 10, 2021 the building owner, architect and a representative from PAST attended an additional design review meeting. With recommendations by the City of Capitola Planning Department officials and the design team, the following *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* compliance review letter will suffice as the final historic review document for the subject project.

The following provides a summary of the subject property's historic significance, a description of the historic resource and an evaluation of the proposed reconstruction of the subject house for conformance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*.

Conclusions of the 2020 Historical Evaluation

The Preliminary Historical Evaluation prepared by Archives and Architecture notes:

The parcel at 1410 Prospect Avenue is listed on the 2005 City of Capitola Historic Structures List with the status of 7N. This designation, according the State of California Historical Resource Status Codes, indicates that the property “needs to be reevaluated.” The property was first identified as part of the Capitola Architectural Survey published in 1986 (indicated by the designation “D” on the Historic Structures List), and as shown in the Capitola Architectural Survey.

The evaluation concludes:

The Capitola Historic Features Ordinance (Municipal Code 17.87.030) allows for the designation of local historic resources, known as historic features. The designation requires that a property must “evidence one or more” of 11 qualities, including being representative of an era or style, a rare type of building, is older than most similar buildings, is associated with a rare use, the architect builder is significant, is long-established as a landmark, or that the materials are significantly unusual or remarkable, etc.

Because the house and its immediate setting are “...directly related to Capitola’s architectural chronology...” per the draft Historic Context Statement for the City of Capitola as presented above, it can be found to be a significant physical element of city’s past patterns of history. It can, therefore, be found that the house meets the criteria of the City of Capitola Historic Features Ordinance, using qualities 9 and 10: 9) The proposed historic feature by its location and setting materially contributes to the historic character of the city; and 10) The proposed historic feature is a long established feature of the city.

¹ Dill, Leslie, Archives & Architecture, Preliminary Historical Evaluation – 1410 Prospect Avenue, Capitola, CA, 2/18/20. For a detailed historic context of the subject property, consult this document.

Existing Site Conditions

The site contains a highly modified two-story house (circa-1905) constructed in the Vernacular Style. The building has an altered, asymmetrical primary gable roofline with a west-elevation (Prospect Ave.) dormer addition, a detached, gable-roofed garage, an east elevation containing banked windows, and a mixed fenestration pattern consisting of single-pane fixed and wood-sash windows of varying eras. Wall cladding is primarily square-cut, wood-shingles, with plywood boards finishing the circa-1991 garage (**Figures 1 - 4**).



Figures 1 and 2. Left image shows the Prospect Avenue (west) elevation, as viewed from the street. Right image details the west elevation, showing the false-front, gable-roofed garage.



Figures 3 and 4. Left image shows the asymmetrical roofline of the Monterey Bay (east) elevation. The clipped brick chimney is on the south elevation (arrow). Right image details the banked windows of the east elevation.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards

The *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (Standards)* provides the framework for evaluating the impacts of additions and alterations to historic buildings. The *Standards* describe four treatment approaches: preservation, rehabilitation, restoration and reconstruction. The *Standards* require that the treatment approach be determined first, as a different set of standards apply to each approach. For the proposed project, the treatment approach is reconstruction. The *Standards* describe reconstruction as:

Reconstruction is defined as the act or process of depicting, by means of new construction, the form, features, and detailing of a non-surviving site, landscape, building, structure, or object for the purpose of replicating its appearance at a specific period of time and in its historic location.²

The six *Standards* for reconstruction are:

1. Reconstruction will be used to depict vanished or non-surviving portions of a property when documentary and physical evidence is available to permit accurate reconstruction with minimal conjecture, and such reconstruction is essential to the public understanding of the property.
2. Reconstruction of a landscape, building, structure or object in its historic location will be preceded by a thorough archeological investigation to identify and evaluate those features and artifacts that are essential to an accurate reconstruction. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
3. Reconstruction will include measures to preserve any remaining historic materials, features and spatial relationships.
4. Reconstruction will be based on the accurate duplication of historic features and elements substantiated by documentary or physical evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different features from other historic properties. A reconstructed property will re-create the appearance of the non-surviving historic property in materials, design, color and texture.
5. A reconstruction will be clearly identified as a contemporary re-creation.
6. Designs that were never executed historically will not be constructed.

Goals of Proposed Project

The goal of the reconstruction project is to satisfy the two neighborhood quality characteristics to maintain the historic integrity of the neighborhood setting:

9. The proposed historic feature by its location and setting materially contributes to the historic character of the city; and
10. The proposed historic feature is a long established feature of the city.

² *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*: Kay D. Weeks and Anne E. Grimmer, U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, 1995, 62.

The established visual setting includes the varying pattern of building volumes, largely expressed in wood, that exist along Prospect Avenue. In addition, the variation of historic rooflines of the hillside location, as viewed from Monterey Bay, also represents a long established feature of the city (**Figures 5 and 6**).



Figures 5 and 6. Left image shows the rhythm of gable roofs and false front roofs along Prospect Avenue, looking north, with the subject property indicated by an arrow. Right image views the variety of historic rooflines along the ridge looking northwest from Cliff Drive.

Design drawings by Derek Van Alstine Residential Design, Inc., dated 8/24/2021 were the design drawings reviewed for this evaluation. To satisfy site deficiencies, the proposed project is the demolition and reconstruction of the house within current setback requirements for the property.

Evaluation of Proposed Alterations

For the proposed reconstruction of the subject building, *Standards 4 – 6* are most applicable, with an evaluation given below each standard.

- 4. Reconstruction will be based on the accurate duplication of historic features and elements substantiated by documentary or physical evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different features from other historic properties. A reconstructed property will recreate the appearance of the non-surviving historic property in materials, design, color and texture.*

The reconstructed building will be recreated using existing documentary evidence taken from the site prior to demolition. The new building will match the existing house in scale, massing, design and the use of historic wood materials.

- 5. A reconstruction will be clearly identified as a contemporary re-creation.*
While the reconstruction will match the appearance of the original building, the new building will utilize modern window technology and detailing to clearly identify it as a contemporary re-creation, in keeping with this *Standard*.

- 6. Designs that were never executed historically will not be constructed.*

While the subject house's appearance has been altered substantially over time, its overall scale, massing, materials and placement within the historic Prospect Avenue streetscape are the priorities in this reconstruction. These aspects of the original building will be maintained in the new construction to enable it to contribute to the established historic setting of altering rooflines and building facades along Prospect Avenue.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the proposed reconstruction of the house located at 1410 Prospect Avenue, Capitola, meets the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction*. Because the proposed alterations to the historic neighborhood setting meet the *Standards*, the alterations are considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historic resource and do not constitute a substantial adverse change to the historic resource, thus conforming to the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Please contact me with any questions regarding this design review letter.

Sincerely,



Seth A. Bergstein
Principal