

Capitola Planning Commission

Agenda Report



Meeting: March 7, 2024

From: Community Development Department

Address: 417 Riverview Avenue

Project Description: Historic Alteration Permit #23-0487 for repair and modifications to a historic single-family residence. The project is located within the R-1 (Single-Family Neighborhood) zoning district, APN: 035-132-06.

This project is in the Coastal Zone but does not require a Coastal Development Permit.

Recommended Action: Consider Permit #23-0487 and approve the project based on the attached Conditions and Findings for Approval.

Property Owner: Bridget Taylor

Representative: Cade Bell, Filed: 10.31.23

Background:

In January 2023, the storms and flooding caused property damage to the site including damage to a raised deck along Soquel Creek.

Discussion: 417 Riverview Avenue is a historic, one-story, single-family residence located in the Riverview Terrace neighborhood, abutting Soquel Creek, and surrounded by one- and two-story residences. The property is within the Old Riverview Historic District and is identified as a contributing resource. The home has experienced significant water-related damage and weathering. The applicant seeks to repair and renovate the home with contemporary amenities, improve on-site drainage, and minimize future environmental damage to the home. The project will not result in new square footage or habitable space and does not require a design permit.

An extensive list of work is included in the project overview (Attachment 2). In addition to internal and structural renovation, the project includes:

- Raising the structure approximately one foot with a new perimeter foundation. The existing foundation is partially below grade.
- Replace the existing horizontal shiplap boards with new siding to match the existing pattern and appearance.
- Construct a new gabled front porch.
- Replace the existing, non-original rear staircase and add railings.
- Remove the existing fireplace and chimney and construct a new false chimney with brick-veneer over a wooden frame.

Historic Alteration Permit:

The project involves substantial alterations to the existing historic structure and therefore requires approval of a Historic Alteration Permit by the Planning Commission. Also, historic resources are identified as environmental resources within the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Any modification to a historic resource must comply with the Secretary of Interior Standards to qualify for a CEQA exemption.

The residence is estimated to have been constructed around 1930 in the vernacular bungalow style. Architectural Historian Seth Bergstein evaluated the proposed design for compatibility with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* (Attachment 5). During the initial site inspection with the

applicant, planning staff and Mr. Bergstein concurred that the structure showed substantial deterioration. Initial exploratory demolition revealed poor conditions in the foundation, flooring, framing, roof, and exterior cladding; much of which require replacement or retrofit. Mr. Berstein identified character-defining features which include:

- Gable roof with exposed rafter ends.
- Banked windows on rear (west) elevation facing Soquel Creek.
- Wood-sash windows on side elevations.
- South elevation chimney.

Based on the evaluation of the proposed project by Mr. Bergstein, *Standards* 6 and 8 are most applicable to the project. The severity of deterioration and necessity for replacement of existing materials was demonstrated and new cladding materials were selected that could both match the existing board pattern and provide better durability. The new front covered porch was designed with consideration of the structure's existing character and scale, with a matching gable roof pitch and simplified columns. The new rear staircase replaces a nonhistorical brick staircase to match the new floor height and meet the building code. A simple guardrail was selected to reduce the visual impact on the more significant creek-facing elevation.

Mr. Bergstein provided a final review letter, dated February 21, 2024, with findings that the current design is consistent with the *Standards* for historic rehabilitation. The review includes recommendations regarding exterior door replacements, chimney recreation, and exterior cladding, which are reflected in Condition #21.

CEQA Determination:

Section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines exempts projects limited to maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation, or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings. The project involves rehabilitation of a historic single-family residence with no new floor area within the R-1 (single-family residential) zoning district. The project has been found to be consistent with Section 15300.2(f) regarding modifications to historical resources. Therefore, the project qualifies for this CEQA exemption.

Historic Alteration Permit Findings:

- A. The historic character of a property is retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize the property is avoided.**

Community Development Staff and the Planning Commission have reviewed the proposed modifications to a single-family residence and determined it will retain and preserve the appearance of the creek-facing elevation, maintain spatial relationships, and allow the structure to continue the existing residential use.

- B. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of fine craftsmanship that characterize a property are preserved.**

Community Development Staff and the Planning Commission have reviewed the proposed rehabilitation and determined that the replacement exterior cladding and false chimney will match and preserve the original appearance of the residence.

- C. Any new additions complement the historic character of the existing structure. New building components and materials for the addition are similar in scale and size to those of the existing structure.**

Community Development Staff and the Planning Commission have reviewed the proposed rehabilitation and determined that it will not add new massing except for the front porch, which is in scale with the existing structure.

D. Deteriorated historic features are repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature matches the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials.

The severely deteriorated materials will be replaced to match the original design. New siding material will utilize modern alternatives for enhanced durability against the riparian and flood-prone setting.

E. Archeological resources are protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures are undertaken.

The project affects previously disturbed areas and will not impact archeological resources.

F. The proposed project is consistent with the general plan, any applicable specific plan, the zoning code, and the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and is subject to Section 753.5 of Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations.

Section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines exempts projects limited to maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation, or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings. The project involves rehabilitation of a historic single-family residence with no new floor area within the R-1 (single-family residential) zoning district. The project has been found to be consistent with Section 15300.2(f) regarding modifications to historical resources and no adverse environmental impacts were discovered during review.

Conditions of Approval:

1. The project approval includes a Historic Alteration Permit for the renovation and rehabilitation of a historic single-story, single-family residence. The project will not result in an increase of floor area. The proposed project is approved as indicated on the final plans reviewed and approved by the Planning Commission on March 7, 2024, except as modified through conditions imposed by the Planning Commission during the hearing.
2. Prior to construction, a building permit shall be secured for any new construction or modifications to structures authorized by this permit. Final building plans shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Planning Commission. All construction and site improvements shall be completed according to the approved plans.
3. At time of submittal for building permit review, the Conditions of Approval must be printed in full on the cover sheet of the construction plans.
4. At time of submittal for building permit review, Public Works Standard Detail SMP STRM shall be printed in full and incorporated as a sheet into the construction plans. All construction shall be done in accordance with the Public Works Standard Detail BMP STRM.
5. Prior to making any changes to approved plans, modifications must be specifically requested and submitted in writing to the Community Development Department. Any significant changes to the size or exterior appearance of the structure shall require Planning Commission approval.
6. Prior to issuance of building permit, a landscape plan shall be submitted and approved by the Community Development Department. The landscape plan can be produced by the property owner, landscape professional, or landscape architect. Landscape plans shall reflect the

Planning Commission approval and shall identify type, size, and location of species and details of any proposed (but not required) irrigation systems.

7. Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the applicant shall complete landscape work to reflect the approval of the Planning Commission. Specifically, required landscape areas, all required tree plantings, privacy mitigations, erosion controls, irrigation systems, and any other required measures shall be addressed to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director.
8. Prior to issuance of building permit, all Planning fees associated with permit #23-0487 shall be paid in full.
9. Prior to issuance of a building permit, the applicant must provide documentation of plan approval by the following entities: Santa Cruz County Sanitation Department, Soquel Water District, and Central Fire Protection District.
10. Prior to issuance of building permits, a drainage plan, grading, sediment and erosion control plan, shall be submitted to the City and approved by Public Works. The plans shall be in compliance with the requirements specified in Capitola Municipal Code Chapter 13.16 Storm Water Pollution Prevention and Protection.
11. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall submit a stormwater management plan to the satisfaction of the Director of Public Works which implements all applicable Post Construction Requirements (PCRs) and Public Works Standard Details, including all standards relating to low impact development (LID).
12. Prior to any land disturbance, a pre-site inspection must be conducted by the grading official to verify compliance with the approved erosion and sediment control plan.
13. Prior to any work in the City road right of way, an encroachment permit shall be acquired by the contractor performing the work. No material or equipment storage may be placed in the road right-of-way.
14. During construction, any construction activity shall be subject to a construction noise curfew, except when otherwise specified in the building permit issued by the City. Construction noise shall be prohibited between the hours of nine p.m. and seven-thirty a.m. on weekdays. Construction noise shall be prohibited on weekends with the exception of Saturday work between nine a.m. and four p.m. or emergency work approved by the building official. §9.12.010B
15. Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, compliance with all conditions of approval shall be demonstrated to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director. Upon evidence of non-compliance with conditions of approval or applicable municipal code provisions, the applicant shall remedy the non-compliance to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director or shall file an application for a permit amendment for Planning Commission consideration. Failure to remedy a non-compliance in a timely manner may result in permit revocation.
16. This permit shall expire 24 months from the date of issuance. The applicant shall have an approved building permit and construction underway before this date to prevent permit expiration. Applications for extension may be submitted by the applicant prior to expiration pursuant to Municipal Code section 17.156.080.
17. The planning and infrastructure review and approval are transferable with the title to the underlying property so that an approved project may be conveyed or assigned by the applicant to

others without losing the approval. The permit cannot be transferred off the site on which the approval was granted.

18. Upon receipt of certificate of occupancy, garbage and recycling containers shall be placed out of public view on non-collection days.
19. Outdoor lighting shall comply with all relevant standards pursuant to Municipal Code Section 17.96.110, including that all outdoor lighting shall be shielded and directed downward such that the lighting is not directly visible from the public right-of-way or adjoining properties.
20. Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, or reconstruction shall be followed.
 - a. Prior to the remodeling of the historic residence, the applicant shall catalog all existing details of the structure.
 - b. The applicant and/or contractor shall field verify all existing conditions on historic buildings and match replacement elements and materials according to the approved plans. Any discrepancies found between approved plans, replacement features and existing elements must be reported to the Community Development Department for further direction, prior to construction.
21. The project shall reflect recommendations made in the historic evaluation letter, including:
 - a. Final selection of replacement exterior doors.
 - b. Documentation of the existing chimney and construction of the chimney panels.
 - c. Composite siding matching the existing siding boards. The Community Development Department may approve alternative products or materials. The key consideration is matching the original siding appearance.

Attachments:

1. 417 Riverview Avenue – Plan Set
2. 417 Riverview Avenue – Project Overview
3. 417 Riverview Avenue – Photos of Existing Conditions
4. 417 Riverview Avenue – Supplemental
5. 417 Riverview Avenue – SOI Standards Review Letter

Report Prepared By: Sean Sesanto, Associate Planner

Reviewed By: Austin Westly, Deputy City Clerk

Approved By: Katie Herlihy, Community Development Director