# Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties Evaluation of Proposed Alteration

321 Cherry Avenue, Capitola, CA APN 035-181-18

The proposed alterations to the property located at 321 Cherry Avenue, in Capitola, California have been evaluated in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The subject property contains an altered two-story house (circa-1895) constructed in the Vernacular style that is listed as a local historic resource <sup>1</sup>

## **Project Proposal**

The proposed project is the rehabilitation of the subject property, which includes the installation of a new roof, electrical upgrades, structural upgrades, kitchen addition, kitchen and bathroom upgrades, new windows, new HVAC system, new flooring, new sheetrock and insulation, and porch deck. An existing shed in the back yard will be removed to accommodate a 117 square foot addition at the rear of the structure for the kitchen expansion.

The City has reviewed the history of the building and has provided an evaluation of the proposed alteration's in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

### **Existing Site Conditions**

The site contains a modified two-story house (circa-1895) constructed in the Vernacular Style. Photographs of the existing structure have been provided (**Figures 2, 3 and 4**).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> City of Capitola 1986 Architectural Survey by Rowe & Associates.



Figure 2: Font elevation facing Cherry Avenue.



Figure 3: Rear elevation, and area of proposed alteration.

Historical Alteration Permit Evaluation 321 Cherry Avenue, Capitola, CA APN 035-181-18 Page **3** of **7** 



**Figure 3**: Side elevation demonstrating the horizontal boards on the front elevation, partially wrapping on the side, with board-and- batten to finish.

## **Construction Chronology**

Based on the permit records from the City of Capitola Planning Department, the following is the estimated building chronology:

- Circa-1895 Original building constructed
- July 1932 Permit obtained for reframing
- December 1932 Structure was re-roofed
- September 1976 The front porch decking was replaced
- February 1980 Structure was re-roofed
- March 1989 Structure was re-roofed
- April 2017 A demolition permit obtained for a fence, landscaping, rear walkway and stoop
- May 2017 Permit obtained to repair front upper balcony and porch below
- November 2017 New foundation installed
- April 2025 100 amp meter main upgrade

#### **Remaining Character Defining Features**

The remaining character-defining features are:

- Gable roof with gable end facing street
- Wood details, including roof fascia boards, corner boards and wood-window surrounds
- Wood siding of outer walls, including horizontal boards on the front elevation and

Historical Alteration Permit Evaluation 321 Cherry Avenue, Capitola, CA APN 035-181-18 Page **4** of **7** 

board-and-batten with 3-inch battens spaced at 12 inches on the side and rear elevations

### **Summary of Proposed Alterations**

Project plans prepared by Jeffrey E. Finsand, AIA, revision date August 29, 2025, were reviewed for this historic evaluation. Proposed alterations affecting the building exterior include:

- Non-historic shed on the west elevation will be removed;
- On rear elevation and west elevation, add 117 square feet of habitable space. The addition will have a shed roof, and exterior material will include board-and-batten to match existing;
- A window on the east elevation will be removed and infilled with board and batten siding to match existing. A new window will be added in the new addition; and,
- On the rear elevation two new window openings and a door will be added, and the porch deck will be repaired.

## The Secretary of the Interior's Standards

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (Standards) provides the framework for evaluating the impacts of additions and alterations to historic buildings. The Standards describe four treatment approaches: preservation, rehabilitation, restoration and reconstruction. The Standards require that the treatment approach be determined first, as a different set of standards apply to each approach. For the proposed project, the treatment approach is rehabilitation. The Standards describe rehabilitation as:

In *Rehabilitation*, historic building materials and character-defining features are protected and maintained as they are in the treatment Preservation; however, an assumption is made prior to work that existing historic fabric has become damaged or deteriorated over time and, as a result, more repair and replacement will be required. Thus, latitude is given in the Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitation to replace extensively deteriorated, damaged, or missing features using either traditional or substitute materials. Of the four treatments, only Rehabilitation includes an opportunity to make possible an efficient contemporary use through alterations and additions.<sup>2</sup>

### **Evaluation of Proposed Alterations**

For the proposed alterations to the subject building, the following lists the ten

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties: Kay D. Weeks and Anne E. Grimmer, U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, 1995, 62.

Historical Alteration Permit Evaluation 321 Cherry Avenue, Capitola, CA APN 035-181-18 Page **5** of **7** 

Standards for rehabilitation, with an evaluation given below each standard.

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

The proposed alterations will allow the building to continue its residential building use, while retaining the existing character defining features that remain on the building, in keeping with this *Standard*.

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The proposed building alterations do not remove any distinctive materials that characterize the property. Existing spatial relationships will be maintained in conformance with this *Standard*.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

The proposed rehabilitation design does not add conjectural features or elements from other historic properties that would confuse the remaining character-defining features of the existing building, in keeping with this *Standard*.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

This *Standard* does not apply as there are no changes to the property which have achieved historic significance in their own right.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The proposed alterations maintain distinctive materials, features and finishes that characterize the property, including the building's wood character-defining features, in keeping with this *Standard*.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Historical Alteration Permit Evaluation 321 Cherry Avenue, Capitola, CA APN 035-181-18 Page **6** of **7** 

The proposed alterations will replace and match the old design, color and texture. Deteriorated features, such as decayed wood windows will be replaced, and new board-and-batten siding will match existing.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

Physical treatments to repair deteriorated woodwork, including the removal of paint, will be undertaken using methods that will not further damage the historic wood, in keeping with this *Standard*.

8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

This Standard does not apply, as archaeological features are not identified at the site.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Existing conditions and wood character-defining features of the front and primary elevation will be retained. No changes are proposed to this elevation.

The proposed shed roof installation and fenestration modifications are on the rear and non-primary elevation of the building as recommended by this *Standard*. Fenestration modifications on the side elevations are toward the rear of the elevations and are not visible from the street, in accordance with this *Standard*.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

If desired, the proposed alterations could be removed and the building reversed to its original configuration, as the primary elevations are not being impacted by the proposed rehabilitation design. Since the remaining character defining features of the subject building will be maintained, the property will maintain adequate historic integrity and satisfy this *Standard*.

Historical Alteration Permit Evaluation 321 Cherry Avenue, Capitola, CA APN 035-181-18 Page **7** of **7** 

#### Conclusion

In conclusion, the proposed design alterations to 321 Cherry Avenue will comply with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. The proposed changes do not impact the remaining character-defining features or overall historic integrity of the building. Because the proposed alterations to the building meet the *Standards*, the alterations are considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historic resource and do not constitute a substantial adverse change to the historic resource, thus conforming to the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).