



CITY of BRISBANE

Open Space and Ecology Committee Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, October 25, 2023 at 6:30 P.M. • Hybrid Meeting 50 Park Place, Brisbane, CA

CALL TO ORDER – 6:31 PM

ROLL CALL

- A. Consider any request of a committee member to attend the meeting remotely under the “Emergency Circumstances” of AB 2449

Committee members present: Becker, Calmes, Ebel, Fieldman, Nunan, Rogers, Salmon

Staff members present: Sustainability Manager, Etherton; Deputy Director of Public Works, Kinser

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Nunan moved to adopt the agenda and Rogers seconded; the motion was adopted unanimously.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

- B. Minutes of September 27, 2023 – Nunan moved to adopt the agenda and Ebel seconded; the motion was adopted unanimously with Becker and Rogers abstaining.

NEW BUSINESS

- C. Review Dark Skies Ordinance and consider recommending for City Council adoption
- Etherton provided a brief introduction to the topic, the community dark sky survey results and concerns raised, and to John Barentine of Dark Sky Consulting who has assisted the subcommittee and staff with technical elements of the ordinance.
 - John Barentine presented on the impacts of light at night, including detrimental effects on wildlife and human health; concerns about safety and crime and what is known about lighting’s impact on them; and basics of lighting qualities and practices such as shielding, color temperature and curfews.
 - Committee members asked questions about the need for studies before implementing, the expected impacts given our urban surroundings, and the state of the science regarding lighting impacts on human health.
 - Chair Becker presented an outline of the draft ordinance. Fellow dark skies subcommittee members Salmon and Ebel provided some additional perspective and context, noting there were compromises made to balance staff and community concerns.
 - Public comment from Dashiell Leeds, Sierra Club Loma Prieta Chapter: broadly supportive of the ordinance and appreciative of the committee for taking it up; noted other cities on

the peninsula taking up the issue; asked about motion lights on recreational/athletic fields. Etherton and Barentine clarified that these facilities would be on timers to ensure lights did not stay on accidentally after play and would not have motion sensors.

- Calmes mentioned that timers reset in power outages and sometimes afterwards result in lighting coming on at odd hours. Etherton noted that battery backup and/or maintenance protocols could address this concern, and community members could always submit a service request through MyBrisbane.
- Salmon shared feedback regarding the longer compliance timeline for the city and need for a phased approach, temporary construction/emergency lighting, the complexity of the lumen output table, and potential confusion over security lighting requirements. Etherton explained the staff's estimate of upwards of \$1M of upgrades to the streetlights and other public facilities lighting and proposal to systematically make those updates over a longer period of time. After discussion, the group agreed that complexity in the lumen requirements would be best addressed through companion education and outreach materials such as maps and instructions in plain language. The ordinance language regarding temporary and security lighting were also deemed adequate.
- Becker brought up Brisbane Stars and noted that they are currently only exempted from shielding requirements. Etherton shared feedback about stars from the survey which was very mixed and outlined the various elements that they could be subject to or not: shielding, light trespass, lumen output, color temperature, and curfew. Ebel recommended not subject to shielding, trespass and color temperature, but they should be subject to curfew and lumen output. Upon further discussion and remote input from Senior Planner Ayres, the group agreed to not subject them to lumen output.
- Ebel suggested that light trespass onto roads be allowable as it may help with safety concerns. Nunan disagreed. Etherton clarified the definition of light trespass is that the source of the light, the bulb itself, should not be visible from outside the property, and also that enforcement would be complaint-based. The group agreed to keep the current standard.
- Nunan moved to recommend the ordinance to Council, Ebel seconded; the committee voted unanimously in support.
- Etherton asked for input on whether to recommend the council consider financial support for residents with hardship needing assistance with conversions, as had been suggested by multiple responses to the survey. After discussion the group agreed to recommend the council consider that after further community outreach and, if deemed appropriate, as part of the next budget.

STAFF UPDATES

Etherton:

- Pool locker room water heater failed and we were able to get it replaced with a heat pump water heater in just 11 days at no cost to the city through the PG&E GK12 program.
- PG&E has an induction cooktop loaner program; look for details in the City email blast.

SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

- Events (Rogers, Salmon, Nunan) – Salmon reported on Day in the Park, noting that it was hot and our shady area became a nice resting spot, but that no one (except Etherton) did the art activity. The extra habitat day tees were also popular.
- Education and Outreach (Fieldman, Rogers) – no update
- *Building Decarbonization (Becker, Ebel, Fieldman) – Etherton reported that PCE/TRC has a new points-based reach code approach and RICAPS is working on a template Municipal Electric-First Policy; she will send a poll to determine a meeting date.
- *Open Space Plan Update (Calmes, Rogers, Salmon) – Salmon asked Kinser to schedule a meeting for January; Rogers asked for updated documents in advance
- *Crocker Trail Frog Habitat (Rogers, Nunan, Calmes) – Calmes noted the trail upgrade is done; Kinser thought that Paul Bouscal had moved the cut branches serving as edging and was putting it back in place. Kinser will work on setting up the meeting with the property owner.
- *Invasive Species Ordinance (Becker, Fieldman, Nunan) – Fieldman provided an update on the meeting with the city council liaisons the prior day and thought it was useful and provided helpful feedback. The subcommittee should meet to discuss education and outreach and other suggestions and will await further input from staff on compliance and enforcement concerns raised.
 - Rogers noted that she had been investigating goats for addressing gorse, but City Grazing said large infestations could not be addressed by goats and would instead require mastication; there is one other firm she is still awaiting a response from but doesn't expect a different answer.
- *Dark Skies Ordinance (Becker, Ebel, Salmon) – addressed previously
- *Tree Issues (Calmes, Ebel, Salmon) – no updates; would like to meet. Calmes wrote an article on pruning which Etherton noted will be in the November STAR.
- Baylands Specific Plan subcommittees – no updates

CALENDAR ITEMS

Etherton noted the proposed Planting Day on February 3, 2024 and Earth Day on either April 20 or 27, 2024; the committee preferred April 20.

Calmes asked about invasive species letters to nurseries; the group agreed this would be most impactful if we could point to an adopted invasive species ordinance.

CHAIR AND COMMITTEE MEMBER MATTERS – none.

NEXT MEETING: December 13, 2023

ADJOURNMENT – 8:53 PM