

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



STAFF REPORT

Department of Growth Management

MEETING DATE:	October 4, 2023
PROJECT:	12 Tabby Shell Road, Lot 8 – New Construction: Carriage House
APPLICANT:	Pearce Scott Architects
PROJECT MANAGER:	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

APPLICATION REQUEST: The Applicant, Pearce Scott Architects, on behalf of the owners, Matt and Dianne Donovan, requests that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-08-23-018375.** A Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the construction of a new single-family residential Carriage House of approximately 1,056 SF, to be located at 12 Tabby Shell Road, Lot 24 in the Tabby Roads Development, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood General-HD.

INTRODUCTION: On July 17, 2007 at a Special Meeting the Historic Preservation Commission approved the primary structure located at 12 Tabby Shell Road, and on October 3, 2018, a second Certificate of Appropriateness-HD was approved to allow the addition of approximately 155 SF to the existing rear porch.

The application subject to this report is a detached Carriage House of approximately 1,056 SF, located in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The structure has all attributes of the Carriage House building type and meets the placement requirements of the same within the Neighborhood General-HD zoning district.

The 2-story structure is under a hipped roof with a shed roof over the garage doors. It will contain two garage bays with living space above. The proposed materials include lap siding and asphalt shingle roof to match the approved primary structure and uses traditional water table and corner board details which also match the existing structure (Attachment 3).

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the August 28, 2023 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 4).

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS: As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
2. Approve the application with conditions; or
3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS: Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

1. Section 3.18.3.B. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.
 - a. *Finding.* The application is consistent with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan. The Old Town Master Plan states that, “The built environment, in particular the historic structures scattered throughout Old Town, should be protected and enhanced. While it is of great importance to save and restore historic structures, it is just as important to add to the built environment in a way that makes Old Town more complete.”

The Applicant proposes to construct a new Carriage House within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District, a locally and nationally designated historic district. The building has been designed to be sympathetic to the architectural character of the neighboring historic structures, so if the conditions of item 2 of this Section are met, their addition to the architectural diorama will both protect the integrity of the existing historic structures and enhance the neighborhood by adding architectural variety.

- b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also include the adoption of a form-based code that included architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction

proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.

- c. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of the proposed Carriage House adds to the district as well as help provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.
2. Section 3.18.3.C. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.
 - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that the design of the structure falls within the category of Carriage House Type as allowed in the Neighborhood General Historic District per Section 5.15.5.C.
 - b. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that the proposed addition is in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5.
3. Section 3.18.3.D. Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.

Finding. The Carriage House proposed reflects the character of the primary structure, surrounding area and is scaled appropriately.

4. Section 3.18.3.F. The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.

Finding. The Applicant seeks approval for the construction a new accessory structure in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions Section 2 of this report are met, the proposed plans will be sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic resources; therefore, the accessory structure, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.

5. Section 3.18.3.H. The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.

Finding. The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff

finds that the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application as submitted.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Location and Zoning Map
2. Application and Narrative
3. Site Plan & Elevations
4. HPRC Report
5. HARB Approval