

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



## STAFF REPORT

### Department of Growth Management

<b>MEETING DATE:</b>	January 3, 2024
<b>PROJECT:</b>	26 Tabby Shell Road, Lot 14- New Construction: Single-Family Residential
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	William Court
<b>PROJECT MANAGER:</b>	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

**APPLICATION REQUEST:** The Applicant, William Court, on behalf of the owners, David and Susan Sewell, requests the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-10-23-018547.** A Certificate of Appropriateness- HD to construct a new two-story single-family residential structure of approximately 2,477 SF and a new two-story Carriage House of approximately 905 SF to be located at 26 Tabby Shell Road, Lot 14 in the Tabby Roads development, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood General-HD.

**INTRODUCTION:** The Applicant has proposed the construction of a one and a half-story single-family structure and two-story Carriage House in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The proposed primary structure, of approximately 2,477 SF has some characteristics of a Vernacular House, but does not feature a full-length front porch and is not quite as wide as a typical Vernacular House, so it has been classified as an Additional Building Type within the Neighborhood General-HD zoning district, however, the setbacks are determined by the Tabby Roads Development Plan.

The primary structure features a side-facing gable roof with a forward-facing gable addition to the front. It has gabled dormers on the front elevation and a partial façade front porch under a shed roof. The rear elevation features a nearly full-façade porch under a shed roof. The materials include Hardie straight edge shake siding, Hardie plank lap siding with 7" exposure, a combination of asphalt shingle and standing seam metal roofs, and a Tabby Stucco foundation and chimney. The Carriage House, of approximately 905 SF, features many of the same details including the gabled primary mass with a shed roof over the carport area, shake and horizontal Hardie siding, and similar columns and trim.

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the November 6, 2023 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 9).

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS:** As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
2. Approve the application with conditions; or
3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

**REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS:** Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

1. Section 3.18.3.B. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.
  - a. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives include the adoption of a form-based code that includes architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
  - b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of the residential structure and Carriage House will add to the district and help provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.
2. Section 3.18.3.C. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.
  - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the conditions noted below are met, the proposed addition will be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5:

1. Section 5.3.3. Tree Conservation During Construction. Tree protection fencing shall consist of 4 to 6 feet high orange laminated plastic or chain link fence and be mounted on sturdy posts (wooden or metal) spaced no more than 10 feet apart. Tree protection fencing shall be erected before demolition, grading, or construction begins and remain in place until final inspection and approval of the project by the UDO Administrator. Tree Protection Zone shall be around the drip line of the trees. Indicate the Tree Protection Zone surrounding the conservation easement on the Landscape Plan, and indicate fence installation practices which will most effectively protect the root systems of the protected trees.
2. Section 5.3.4.D. General Tree and Landscape Material Standards. Large and Medium Canopy Tree species shall be a minimum of 12 feet in height and have a caliper of at least 2.5 inches at time of planting. The Live Oak and Tuscarora Crape Myrtle are indicated as 10'-12' in height. Increase the minimum height to 12' to meet the minimum height requirement at time of planting.
3. Section 5.15.5.F.1.c. General Standards. Residential structures shall have a first finished floor height raised a minimum of 3' above average adjacent sidewalk grade. The finished floor height is proposed at approximately 30" above average adjacent sidewalk grade and must be revised to meet the minimum height requirement.
4. Section 5.15.5.F.4.e. General Standards and 5.15.6.E.7. Dormers. Vertical rhythms should be established in the façade through alignment of windows, openings, pilasters, and columns. Dormer centerlines shall align with the building elements below (centered between columns or directly above windows). The front door, and dormer above are not centered over the columns of the front porch, and neither set of French doors on the rear elevation are not centered between columns. The doors and dormer should be centered to establish vertical rhythms through their alignment.
5. Section 5.15.6.E.5. Porches. Porches shall have a minimum height of 30" from grade to top of stairs. The porch is proposed at 26" and must be revised to meet the minimum height requirement.
6. Section 5.15.6.E.8. Chimneys, Roof Appurtenances, and Roof Penetrations. In keeping with masonry building technology, metal spark arrestors, exposed metal flues, or pre-fabricated chimney caps are not permitted. The application proposes the use of a metal windscreen. Revise to a permitted material.

7. Section 5.15.6.H.2.a. Columns. Columns are permitted to be wood (termite resistant), cast iron (painted or natural), concrete with smooth finish, brick, stone, steel or tabby. The Applicant has proposed the use of Boral, a bio-based polymer and coal-combustion byproduct blend. The HPC must make a determination on the appropriateness of the use of Boral as a substitute for those materials listed in Section 5.15.6.H.2.a of the UDO.
8. Section 5.15.6.H.2.d. Railings and Balusters. Railings and Balusters are permitted to be wood (termite resistant), wrought or cast iron (painted or natural). The application and elevations indicate the use of wrought iron railings, but detail 3/A5.1 indicates the use of powder coated aluminum. Revise detail 3/A5.1 to match the application and elevations which show a permitted material.
9. Section 5.15.6.M.1.e. Shutters. Shutters shall be constructed of durable wood. Except in the case of a Contributing Structure, the UDO Administrator may approve of the use of Wood Composite material for shutters provided the UDO Administrator determines that the shutters will be consistent with the character of the Historic District and the materials used are of equal or better quality than traditional building materials. The Applicant has proposed composite shutters. No materials have been provided for UDO Administrator review. Shutter material must be revised to durable wood.

Further, shutter dogs may be the standard "S" hook, rat-tail hooks, generally less decorative iron butterfly, or other style shutter dog typical of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District's period of significance. A shutter dog detail must be provided.

3. Section 3.18.3.D. Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.
  - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the architectural and landscaping items in Section 2 have been met, the nature and character of the new construction will be consistent with that of the surrounding neighborhood.
4. Section 3.18.3.F. The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.
  - a. *Finding.* The Applicant seeks approval for the construction of a new structure in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions in section 2 of this report are met, the proposed plans will be sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic

resources; therefore, the structure, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.

5. Section 3.18.3.H. The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.
  - a. *Finding.* The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete; however, as there are several trees being proposed for removal which require a tree removal permit which must be submitted, reviewed, and approved prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Additionally, the Building Data portion of the Application must be updated to include all enclosed square footage for the Carriage House, and Site Coverage to reflect all areas under rooftops, except porches, which should be captured under the open/covered patios section.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Per the Applications Manual, a Town of Bluffton Tree Removal Permit is required.
2. Update the Building Data on the application to include all enclosed square footage for the Carriage House (both stories) and Site Coverage to reflect all areas under roofs for footprints, except porches, which should be listed under open/covered patios.
3. Per UDO Section 5.3.3., indicate the Tree Protection Zone surrounding the conservation easement on the Landscape Plan, and indicate fence installation practices which will most effectively protect the root systems of the protected trees.
4. Per UDO Section 5.3.4.D., increase the minimum height of the Tuscarora Crape Myrtle and Live Oak to 12' to meet the minimum height requirement at time of planting.
5. Per UDO Section 5.15.5.F.1.c., the first finished floor height must be raised to meet the minimum height requirement of 3' above average adjacent sidewalk grade.
6. Per UDO Sections 5.15.5.F.4.e. and 5.15.6.E.7, vertical rhythms should be established in the façade through alignment of the front door and dormer between the columns and both sets of French doors on the rear elevation between the columns.
7. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.E.5., the porch shall be raised to have a minimum height of 30" from grade to top of stairs.
8. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.E.8., the metal windscreen must be revised to a permitted material.

9. The HPC must make a determination on the appropriateness of the use of Boral as a substitute for those materials listed in Section 5.15.6.H.2.a of the UDO.
10. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.H.2.d., revise detail 3/A5.1 to match the application and elevations which show wrought iron, a permitted material for the railings.
11. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.M., shutter material must be revised to durable wood.
12. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.M., a shutter dog detail must be provided to ensure the profile is appropriate.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Location Map and Zoning Maps
2. Application and Narrative
3. Site Plan & Elevations
4. Landscape Plan & Canopy Coverage
5. Roof Cutsheet
6. Trim Cutsheet
7. Color and Material Information
8. HARB Letter
9. HPRC Comments