

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



STAFF REPORT

Department of Growth Management

MEETING DATE:	January 3, 2024
PROJECT:	4 Tabby Shell Road, Lot 4 - New Construction: Carriage House
APPLICANT:	DePauw Architects, Joe DePauw
PROJECT MANAGER:	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

APPLICATION REQUEST: The Applicant, DePauw Architects, on behalf of the owners, Jill and Steve Duncan, request that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-11-23-018622.** A Certificate of Appropriateness- HD to construct a new 1-story Carriage House of approximately 754 SF, to be located at 4 Tabby Shell Road, Lot ,4 in the Tabby Roads Development, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic district and zoned Neighborhood General- HD zoning District.

INTRODUCTION: The Applicant has proposed the construction of a one-story Carriage House in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The proposed structure, of approximately 754 SF has characteristics of a Carriage House Building Type and meets the setbacks for the same. The site is located within the Tabby Roads Development Plan.

The structure features two forward-facing gable roofed masses connected by a main, side-facing gabled roof. The right side contains a 168 SF enclosed storage space, with the remainder of the structure unenclosed. The materials include 5-V metal roof to match the primary structure, smooth Hardie Plank siding and wood slat screening on the open end of the structure.

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the December 4, 2023 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 6).

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS: As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
2. Approve the application with conditions; or
3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user

friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS: Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

1. Section 3.18.3.B. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.
 - a. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives include the adoption of a form-based code that includes architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
 - b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of a Carriage House structure will add to the district and help provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.
2. Section 3.18.3.C. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.
 - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the conditions noted below are met, the proposed addition will be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5:
 1. 5.15.6.F. Carriage House. Carriage House structures must be of the same general character as the primary structure. The primary structure includes brackets perpendicular to the ground in the gabled end, simple 6" columns without caps and bases, and a variety of casement windows with wide horizontal rails for Double Hung appearance. The Carriage House proposes a more truss style bracket detail in the gabled ends, 8" box columns with base, and double hung windows with smooth Hardie panels below. Provide a better relationship between the proposed Carriage House and primary structure through consistency in the detailing of the two structures.

3. Section 3.18.3.D. Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.
 - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the architectural and landscaping items in Section 2 have been met, the nature and character of the new construction will be consistent with that of the surrounding neighborhood.
4. Section 3.18.3.F. The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.
 - a. *Finding.* The Applicant seeks approval for the construction of a new structure in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions in section 2 of this report are met, the proposed plans will be sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic resources; therefore, the structure, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.
5. Section 3.18.3.H. The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.
 - a. *Finding.* The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Provide a better relationship between the proposed Carriage House and primary structure through consistency in the detailing (bracketing, columns, windows) of the two structures.
2. Update Slat Application Concept to indicate left elevation, as reflected on elevations.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Location Map and Zoning Maps
2. Application
3. Narrative
4. Site Plan & Elevations
5. HARB Approval Letter
6. HPRC Report