

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



## STAFF REPORT

### Department of Growth Management

<b>MEETING DATE:</b>	January 3, 2024
<b>PROJECT:</b>	10 Carroll Court- New Construction: Mixed-Use, Office and Residential Unit
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Ansley H. Manuel, Architect
<b>PROJECT MANAGER:</b>	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

**APPLICATION REQUEST:** The Applicant, Ansley H. Manuel, Architect, on behalf of the owner, King Tide Custom Homes, LLC, requests the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-09-23-018484.** A Certificate of Appropriateness- HD to construct a new 2-story mixed-use building of approximately 2,894 SF for office use on the first floor and one dwelling unit above, to be located at 10 Carroll Court, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic district and zoned Neighborhood Core - HD zoning District.

**INTRODUCTION:** The Applicant has proposed the construction of a two-story mixed-use structure with office space on the first floor and a single dwelling unit above. The proposed structure, of approximately 2,894 SF has characteristics of a Main Street building, but as it is not a shopfront building, so it has been reviewed as an Additional Building Type within the Neighborhood Core-HD zoning district. The setbacks, which include a 5-foot front, 25-foot rear and 8-foot side setback are determined by the Carroll Court Development Plan.

The primary structure features a side-facing hipped roof with a nearly full façade colonnade which partially wraps the right-side elevation. The two bays on the first-floor, left side of the front elevation have been enclosed with a louvered wall. The second story of the whole colonnade area, including the area over the louvered wall, is a porch. It has a door under a small shed roofed awning on the rear elevation and a door on the left side elevation. The materials include a sanding seam metal roof, and a combination of Hardi board and batten and horizontal siding.

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the October 10, 2023 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 5).

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS:** As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
2. Approve the application with conditions; or
3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

**REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS:** Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

1. Section 3.18.3.B. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.
  - a. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives include the adoption of a form-based code that includes architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
  - b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of a proposed mixed-use structure will add to the district and help provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.
2. Section 3.18.3.C. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.
  - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the conditions noted below are met, the proposed addition will be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5:
    1. Section 5.3.3. Tree Conservation During Construction. Tree protection fencing shall consist of 4 to 6 feet high orange laminated plastic or chain link fence and be mounted on sturdy posts (wooden or metal) spaced no more than 10 feet apart. Tree protection fencing shall be erected before demolition, grading, or construction begins and remain in place until final

inspection and approval of the project by the UDO Administrator. Tree Protection Zone shall be around the drip line of the trees. Indicate the Tree Protection Zone surrounding the two large trees at the rear of the lot on the Landscape Plan, and indicate fence installation practices which will most effectively protect the root systems of the protected trees.

2. Section 5.3.7.A. Street Trees. All roadways on which development is proposed shall include large canopy street trees that are planted no greater than 50 feet apart. Sassafras trees are considered understory trees. Further, large canopy trees shall be a minimum of 12 feet in height and have a caliper of at least 2.5 inches at time of planting. Change tree type for Street Trees and include minimum height at time of planting.
3. Section 5.15.6.G. Building Walls. Walls are permitted to be wood, cement fiber siding, concrete masonry units with stucco, reinforced concrete with stucco, shingle, vertical board and batten. Composite materials must be located out of reach of pedestrians and visually appear to have a hand trowel finish. Wherever possible, green building materials shall be used in the construction of building walls. The louvered screen walls are proposed as a composite material, which is not permitted as a wall material unless it is a green or recycled material. As requested at HPRC, additional information on the louvered screen wall at the stairs must be provided to ensure the composite material is a green or recycled material, or it be must be revised to a permitted wall material.
4. Section 5.15.6.H. Columns, Arches, Piers, Railings, Balustrades. Railings are proposed as powder coated aluminum. Railings are permitted to be wood (termite resistant), wrought or cast iron (painted or natural). The railing, balusters and handrails must be revised to a permitted material.
5. Section 5.15.6.J. Roofs and Gutters. The Application indicates aluminum gutters, however, they are not shown on the elevations and no profile was provided for review. Gutters need to be shown on the elevation and may be rectangular, square or half-round in section. Provide additional information on the location and profile of the gutters to ensure compliance.
6. Section 5.15.6.K. Garden Walls, Fences, and Hedges. In front yards (in front of the primary structure) the minimum height of a garden wall or fence shall be 24" with a maximum height of 42 inches. The Low Brick Wall is proposed at 18" and must be increased in height to meet the minimum height requirement. Further, the Brick Column Detail shows the height to be 18", however, the scale indicates it to be 6'3", and it is identified as 2' on the Landscape Plan view. Provide revised detail indicating

accurate height.

3. Section 3.18.3.D. Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.
  - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the architectural and landscaping items in Section 2 have been met, the nature and character of the new construction will be consistent with that of the surrounding neighborhood.
4. Section 3.18.3.F. The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.
  - a. *Finding.* The Applicant seeks approval for the construction of a new structure in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions in section 2 of this report are met, the proposed plans will be sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic resources; therefore, the structure, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.
5. Section 3.18.3.H. The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.
  - a. *Finding.* The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete; however, the site coverage data must be updated. The impervious calculations do not appear to include all three of the brick and tabby landings. The open and covered patios have been excluded.

In addition to the Certificate of Appropriateness – HD application, as there are several trees being proposed for removal which require a tree removal permit which must be submitted, reviewed, and approved prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Further, as this site contains commercial use, no signage may be displayed without a Site Feature – HD approval.

Finally, as this site is within the Carroll Court Development Planned area, all infrastructure associated with the Development Plan (DP-03-16-009548) including sidewalk, and required parking associated with this lot must be completed and a Certificate of Construction Compliance issued prior to receiving Final-HD inspection approval during the building process.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified

Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Provided updated Site Coverage calculations to include impervious and porch area calculations on the application.
2. Per the Applications Manual, a Town of Bluffton Tree Removal Permit is required.
3. Per the Applications Manual, no signage may be displayed without a Site Feature – HD approval.
4. A Certificate of Construction Compliance must be issued to ensure infrastructure related to the approved Development Plan has been adequately installed prior to issuance of a Final-HD inspection approval.
5. Per UDO Section 5.3.3., indicate the Tree Protection Zone surrounding the two large trees at the rear of the lot on the Landscape Plan, and indicate fence installation practices which will most effectively protect the root systems of the protected trees.
6. Per UDO Section 5.3.7.A., revise the Sassafras trees to a large canopy overstory tree for the required street tree and include minimum height at time of planting.
7. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.G., information on the louvered wall must be provided to ensure it is green or recycled building material if composite, or it be revised to a permitted wall material.
8. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.H., railing, balusters and handrails must be revised to a permitted material.
9. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.J., provide additional information on the location and profile of the gutters to ensure compliance.
10. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.K., the Low Brick Wall must be increased to meet the 24" minimum height requirement, and the Brick Column Detail revised to meet the height requirement and be consistent across all portions of the plan.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Location Map and Zoning Maps
2. Application and Narrative
3. Site Plan & Elevations
4. Landscape Plan & Canopy Coverage
5. HPRC Report