

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



STAFF REPORT

Department of Growth Management

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| MEETING DATE: | February 5, 2025 |
| PROJECT: | 34 Tabby Shell Road, Lot 18 - New Construction: Single-Family and Carriage House |
| APPLICANT: | Sea Island Construction Group |
| PROPERTY OWNER: | William Glover |
| PROJECT MANAGER: | Charlotte Moore, AICP, Principal Planner |

APPLICATION REQUEST: The Applicant, Sea Island Construction Group, on behalf of the owner, William Glover, requests that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) approve the following application:

COFA-03-24-019047. A Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the construction of a new two-story Single-Family Residential structure of approximately 2,874 SF and an attached Carriage House of approximately 1,100 SF located at 34 Tabby Shell Road, Lot 18 of the Tabby Roads Development, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood General-HD.

Note: This application was initially heard at the November 6, 2024 HPC meeting but continued to allow the Applicant an opportunity to make revisions discussed at the meeting. Additional revisions were required at the January 8, 2025 HPC meeting, to be reviewed with the Historic Preservation Review Committee (HPRC) prior to returning to the HPC. The Applicant met with the HPRC on January 23, 2025 and provided the revised drawings based on discussion from that meeting (Attachment 3).

INTRODUCTION: The Applicant has proposed the construction of a two-story single-family structure with an attached two-story Carriage House in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The proposed primary structure, of approximately 2,324 SF has the characteristics of a Center Hall House which must comply with the requirements for the Building Type within the Neighborhood General-HD zoning district.

The primary structure features a double front porch with a hipped roof. The east side elevation features a partial enclosed, screened porch. The attached Carriage House features a second story rear-facing hipped roof, and a two-bay garage. The structure is proposed to have horizontal Hardie lap siding on the first floor and Hardie shake siding on the second floor.

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the April 15, 2024 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 7). The Tabby Roads Habitat and Architectural Review Board provided its last review comments in July, 2024 (Attachment 8).

REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS: In its review of this COFA-HD application, Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) Section 3.18.3 (COFA-HD, New Construction and Alterations), applying the standards and guidelines of UDO Sec. 5.15, Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The intent of the standards and guidelines is, in part, to provide guidance and ensure predictable and compatible development and architecture without discouraging creativity or forcing the replication of historic models.

The applicable criteria of UDO Sec.3.18.3 are provided below followed by a Staff Finding based upon review of the application submittals to date

1. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan and Town of Bluffton Comprehensive Plan.

- a. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also include the adoption of a form-based code that included architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
- b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of a proposed single-family structure and Carriage House add to the district and helps provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.

2. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.

- a. *Findings.* Town Staff finds that if the conditions noted below are met, the proposed construction will be in conformance with applicable architectural design provisions provided in Article 5:
 - 1) **Windows.** Provide a window schedule to show compliance with permitted materials (wood, aluminum, copper, steel, vinyl, clad wood, fiberglass) (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.l.2.a.).

- 2) **Doors.** Provide a door schedule, including garage doors, to show compliance with permitted materials (wood, metal and metal-clad). Identify the type of composite material identified for the garage doors on the project sheet. The HPC may approve the use of wood composite if the doors are consistent with the character of the Historic District and the materials to be used are of equal or better quality than traditional building materials. (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.I.2.b.)
 - 3) **Railings and Balusters.** Powder-coated steel is proposed for the second- floor porch railings. UDO compliant materials include wood, painted or natural wrought or cast iron. The Historic Preservation Commission must determine that steel is an acceptable alternate material. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.H.3.)
 - 4) **Roofs and Gutters.**
 - a. A standing seam metal roof is proposed but the finish has not been identified. Acceptable materials include galvanized, copper, aluminum and zinc-alum and must be identified with the final submission. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.J.2.a.)
 - b. Metal half-round gutters will be provided but the type of metal material type is not shown. Provide information to show compliance with one of the following permitted material types: copper, galvanized steel, aluminum, 14-18 gauge. Downspouts must match gutters. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.J.2.c.)
 - 5) **Service Yard.** With the final submission, identify the location of electric panels, which must be screened from public view. If panels are located within the service yard, the gate must be removed as free access is required by the utility company.
 - 6) **Landscape Plan.**
 - a. A tree canopy with a minimum of 75% lot coverage, not including roof tops shall be provided where land disturbance is proposed for sites less than one (1) acre. The Landscape Plan canopy coverage calculations do not accurately reflect the proposed plantings for the calculations. Provide updated canopy coverage calculations to ensure the 75% lot coverage is met. (UDO Sec. 5.3.3.G.)
 - b. Per the Applications Manual, a Tree Removal Permit will be required.
3. **Demonstration of a compatible visual relationship between new construction or alterations and existing buildings, streetscapes and open spaces. A compatible visual relationship must be generally of a similar structural mass,**

scale, height, proportion, directional expression of the principal elevation and rhythm of spacing, as applicable.

Finding. If the conditions noted in #2 of this report are met, a compatible visual relationship will be demonstrated with surrounding properties, streetscapes and open spaces.

4. Compliance with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.

Finding. The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete except for the applicable items in #2.

Finding. The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete; however, there are several trees being proposed for removal which require a tree removal permit which must be submitted, reviewed, and approved prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Provide a window schedule to show compliance with permitted materials (wood, aluminum, copper, steel, vinyl, clad wood, fiberglass) (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.I.2.a.).
2. Provide a door schedule, including garage doors, to show compliance with permitted materials (wood, metal and metal-clad)(UDO Sec. 5.15.6.I.2.b.).
3. Identify the type of standing seam metal to be used (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.J.2.a.).
4. Identify the type of material to be used for the gutters and show consistent materials for the downspouts. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.J.2.c.)
5. Show location of electric panels and ensure they are screened from public view (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.F.10).
6. Show that 75% tree canopy coverage will be provided (UDO Sec. 5.3.3.G.).
7. Provide a Tree Removal Permit per the Applications Manual.

Further, Town Staff requests a determination by the Historic Preservation Commission regarding the following:

1. The use of powder-coated steel as an alternate material for the second-floor porch railing (top rail and balusters) (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.H.3.).

2. The use of wood composite as an alternate material for the garage doors (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.I.2.b.).

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS: As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
2. Approve the application with conditions; or
3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Location & Zoning Map
2. Cover Letter & Application
3. Revised Drawings – 01.28.2025
4. Tree Removal Narrative
5. Landscape Plan
6. HPRC Comments, April 2024