

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



STAFF REPORT

Department of Growth Management

MEETING DATE:	February 1, 2023
PROJECT:	4 Wild Spartina Street - New Construction: Single-Family and Carriage House
APPLICANT:	Ansley H. Manuel, Architect
PROJECT MANAGER:	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

APPLICATION REQUEST: The Applicant, Ansley H. Manuel, Architect, on behalf of the owners, Brad and Jacki Rechtferdig, requests that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-05-22-016795.** A Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the construction of a new 2 story Single-Family Residential structure of approximately 2,070 SF and Carriage House of approximately 1,158 SF located at 4 Wild Spartina Street, Lot 42 of the Tabby Roads Development, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood General-HD.

INTRODUCTION: The Applicant has proposed the construction of a two-story single-family structure with an attached two-story Carriage House in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The proposed primary structure, of approximately 2,070 SF has the characteristics of a Village House which must meet the requirements for the Building Type within the Neighborhood General-HD zoning district, however, the setbacks are determined by the Tabby Roads Development Plan.

The primary structure features a forward-facing gabled roof with a near full façade one-story front porch under a hip roof. The rear elevation features a full-length two-story, screened porch. The Carriage House features a lower forward-facing gable roof, a balcony on the front and rear elevations and is connected to the primary structure by a gabled connector. The structures are proposed to have horizontal Hardie lap siding with Hardie shingle in the gabled ends. Bracket detailing is proposed along the eave, and the balustrades for both structures feature a decorative design.

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the June 20, 2022 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 7).

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS: As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;

2. Approve the application with conditions; or
3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS: Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

1. Section 3.18.3.B. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.
 - a. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also include the adoption of a form-based code that included architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
 - b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of a proposed single-family structure and Carriage House add to the district and helps provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.
2. Section 3.18.3.C. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.
 - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the conditions noted below are met, the proposed construction will be in conformance with applicable architectural design provisions provided in Article 5:
 - 1) Section 5.15.6.G. Building Walls. Exposed foundation walls (below the first-floor elevations), if concrete, may be Tabby, sand finished, or steel trowel. The elevations indicate stucco, but do not specify the finish, and the Wall Section @ Main House detail (Detail A/A8) shows the foundation as an optional solid pour concrete. Clarify the foundation finish to ensure it meets the material requirements.

- 2) Section 5.15.7.H. Garages. Driveways shall be a maximum of 10 feet wide in front of the principal plane of the building. The proposed driveway is 11 feet wide in front of the principal plane of the building. The driveway width must be reduced to no more than 10 feet in front of the principal plane of the building.
 - 3) Section 5.15.6.I. Windows and Doors. Doors may be single or double hung, casement, industrial, tilt or fixed-frame. The Application proposes the use of awning windows. The awning windows must be revised to a permitted operation.
 - 4) Section 5.3.3.G. Replacement of Protected Trees. A tree canopy with a minimum of 75% lot coverage, not including roof tops, shall be provided where land disturbance is proposed for sites less than one (1) acre. The Landscape Plan canopy coverage calculations do not accurately reflect the proposed plantings for the calculations. Further, the total lot square footage should be 4,891.6 SF. Provide updated canopy coverage calculations to ensure the 75% lot coverage is met.
 - 5) Section 5.15.5.F.4. Building Composition (Proportion, Alignment, Rhythm, and Spacing) and Traditional Construction Patterns Section 32. Overall building proportions and individual building features shall have a proportional relationship with one another. For example, features such as porches, chimneys, cornices, windows and doors must be proportional to other features of the building as well as the overall building form. The application proposes the use of nine (9) different types of windows all with different windowpane proportions. Windowpane proportions should be limited to a few similar proportions. A reasonable and achievable standard for the windows is a maximum variation for vernacular designs is 20 percent in pane size (12 percent for classical architectural design). Currently, without consideration for the square window, there is a 23 percent variation pane proportion. The number of windows and the pane proportion variation must be reduced to provide a better proportional relationship with one another.
 - 6) Provide rear elevation behind screens as not enough information was provided to complete the review.
3. Section 3.18.3.D. Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.

Finding. Town Staff finds the nature and character of the new construction is consistent with that of the surrounding neighborhood.

4. Section 3.18.3.F. The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.

Finding. The Applicant seeks approval for the construction of a new structure in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions in section 2 of this

report are met, the proposed plans are sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic resources; therefore, the structure, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.

5. Section 3.18.3.H. The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.

Finding. The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete; however, there are several trees being proposed for removal which require a tree removal permit which must be submitted, reviewed, and approved prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Further, the Tabby Roads HARB issued conditional approval of the proposed architecture, which included the following items which must be addressed:

1. The window lites must be changed to an acceptable configuration per the architectural guides (2/2 or 2/1 configurations. Currently the windows are shown as 6 lites and Window lites must be 2/2 or 2/1.
2. Per the submitted landscape plan there are trees being removed that are off the property boundaries. No trees should be removed that are not on Lot 42 itself without written authorization from adjacent property ownership.
3. Due to expanse of rear carriage house lower-level siding façade with no window presence, the committee requires a higher density of landscaping present. It is suggested that five Florida Sunshine Anise be planted instead of the indicated three on the current landscaping plan. The committee would also consider any alternate means to increase landscaping density at this location.
4. Per the architectural guidelines when present, shutters must be operable and occupy every window on a home that may accept them. The small gable windows do not have shutters. The committee requires these gable windows be slightly enlarged as they were deemed to be disproportionately small as compared to the other windows on their respective elevations. An alternate change would be accepted where the window is changed to a louver design (this louver design would be similar to the crawl space and would not require shutters. Permissible to leave the louver design size as submitted).

Changes to the plans to reflect the above, and sign off from the HARB that these conditions have been met must be provided prior to approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness-HD.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the

conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Per Section 5.15.6.G. of the UDO, additional information on the foundation finish must be provided to ensure it meets the material requirements.
2. Per Section 5.15.7.H. of the UDO, the driveway width must be reduced to no more than 10 feet in front of the principal plane of the building.
3. Per Section 5.15.6.I., of the UDO, the awning windows must be revised to a permitted operation.
4. Per Section 5.3.3.G. of the UDO, provide updated canopy coverage calculations to ensure the 75% lot coverage is met.
5. Per Section 5.15.5.F.4. of the UDO, the number of windows and the pane proportion variation must be reduced to provide a better proportional relationship with one another.
6. Provide rear elevation behind screens as not enough information was provided to complete the review.
7. Window lite pattern must be changed to HARB approved version or HARB Letter of Approval indicating the lite pattern is permitted as submitted.
8. HARB Approval of trees off the lot must be provided prior to Town Staff prior to issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.
9. HARB Approval of the landscape modifications to the rear elevation must be submitted prior to issuance of the Certificate of Appropriates.
10. The window in the gable must be increased in size and shutter added to the window in the gable, per HARB letter, or revised HARB Letter of Approval provided.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Location Map
2. Zoning Map
3. Application and Narrative
4. Site Plan & Elevations
5. Landscape Plan & Canopy Coverage
6. HPRC Report