

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



## STAFF REPORT

### Department of Growth Management

<b>MEETING DATE:</b>	June 5, 2024
<b>PROJECT:</b>	28 Stock Farm Road, Lot 33- New Construction: Single-Family Residential
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	RFD Construction
<b>PROJECT MANAGER:</b>	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

**APPLICATION REQUEST:** The Applicant, RFD Construction, on behalf of the owners, Hunter and Sue Hansen, requests the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-03-24-019041.** A Certificate of Appropriateness-HD to allow the construction of a new 1.5-story Single Family Residential Structure of approximately 2,619 SF Carriage House structure of approximately 1,123 SF, located at 28 Stock Farm Road, Lot 33 in the Stock Farm Development, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District, within the Neighborhood General-HD zoning district.

**INTRODUCTION:** The Applicant has proposed the construction of a one and a half-story single-family structure and two-story attached Carriage House in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The proposed primary structure, of approximately 2,619 SF has some characteristics of a Vernacular House, but does not feature a full-length front porch, so it has been classified as an Additional Building Type within the Neighborhood General-HD zoning district, however, the setbacks are determined by the Stock Farm Development Plan.

The primary structure features a two-story main mass with a side-facing gable and a one-story addition on the south with a side-facing gable, forward facing gabled ell, and a small, shed roof addition. To the north, the primary structure connects to an attached Carriage House via a one-story gable roof. The Carriage House features a double side-facing gable roof, and both structures have shed dormers along the front and rear elevations. The materials include a combination of horizontal cement board lap siding and vertical cement board and batten siding, standing seam roofs, and a Tabby Stucco foundation and chimney. The Carriage House, of approximately 1,123 SF, features many of the same details including the materials, and similar columns and trim.

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the April 8, 2024 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 6).

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS:** As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
2. Approve the application with conditions; or
3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

**REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS:** Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

1. Section 3.18.3.B. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.
  - a. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives include the adoption of a form-based code that includes architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
  - b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of the residential structure and Carriage House will add to the district and help provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.
2. Section 3.18.3.C. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.

- a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the conditions noted below are met, the proposed addition will be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5:
1. Section 5.15.5.F.1.c. General Standards. Residential structures shall have a first finished floor height raised a minimum of 3' above average adjacent sidewalk grade. The finished floor height is proposed at approximately 30" above average adjacent sidewalk grade and must be revised to meet the minimum height requirement.
  2. Section 5.15.5.F.4. Building Composition (Proportion, Alignment, Rhythm, and Spacing) and Traditional Construction Patterns Section 32. Overall building proportions and individual building features shall have a proportional relationship with one another. For example, features such as porches, chimneys, cornices, windows and doors must be proportional to other features of the building as well as the overall building form. The application proposes the use of 10 different types of windows and doors with 10 different windowpane proportions. Windowpane proportions should be limited to a few similar proportions. A reasonable and achievable standard for the windows is a maximum variation for vernacular designs is 20 percent in pane size (12 percent for classical architectural design). The number of windows and the pane proportion variation must be reduced to provide a better proportional relationship with one another.
  3. Section 5.15.6.E.5. Porches. Porches shall have a minimum height of 30" from grade to top of stairs. The porch is proposed at approximately 26" and must be revised to meet the minimum height requirement.
  4. Section 5.15.6.I.2.b. Windows and Doors. Doors are permitted to be wood, metal, or metal clad. All of the exterior doors, except the main front door, are proposed to be Marvin Fiberglass clad doors. Revise to a permitted material.
  5. Section 5.15.6.N.7. Corners and Water Tables. Drip boards and skirt boards shall be a minimum of 5/4 stock. The sections for both the primary structure and carriage house have the drip boards and skirt boards drawn as a 1x material. Revise the drip board and skirt boards to a minimum of 5/4 stock.
  6. Section 5.15.6.P.10. Cornice, Soffit and Frieze. Rough sawn wood and/or plywood are not permitted materials for soffit or

cornice detailing. The areas with open rafter soffits are proposed as T1-11 tongue in groove, which is a rough sawn wood material. Revise soffit to a permitted material.

3. Section 3.18.3.D. Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.
  - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the architectural and landscaping items in Section 2 have been met, the nature and character of the new construction will be consistent with that of the surrounding neighborhood.
4. Section 3.18.3.F. The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.
  - a. *Finding.* The Applicant seeks approval for the construction of a new structure in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions in section 2 of this report are met, the proposed plans will be sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic resources; therefore, the structure, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.
5. Section 3.18.3.H. The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.
  - a. *Finding.* The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Per UDO Section 5.15.5.F.1.c., the first finished floor height must be raised to meet the minimum height requirement of 3' above average adjacent sidewalk grade.
2. Per Section 5.15.5.F.4. of the UDO, the number of windows and the pane proportion variation must be reduced to provide a better proportional relationship with one another.
3. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.E.5., the porch shall be raised to have a minimum height of 30" from grade to top of stairs.

4. Per UDO Section 5.5.6.P.10., revise the soffit material from T1-11 T&G to a permitted material.
5. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.I.2.b., revise all exterior doors to be wood, metal or metal clad.
6. Per UDO Section 5.15.6.N.7., revise the drip board and skirt boards to be a minimum of 5/4 stock.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Location Map and Zoning Maps
2. Application and Narrative
3. Site Plan & Elevations
4. Landscape Plan & Canopy Coverage
5. ARB Letter
6. HPRC Comments