

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



## STAFF REPORT

### Department of Growth Management

<b>MEETING DATE:</b>	June 7, 2023
<b>PROJECT:</b>	58 Pritchard Street - New Construction: Single-Family
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Andrew Pietz
<b>PROJECT MANAGER:</b>	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

**APPLICATION REQUEST:** The Applicant, Andrew Pietz, requests that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-03-23-017752.** A Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the construction of a new single-family residence of approximately 3,291 SF and a Carriage House of approximately 484 SF to be located at 58 Pritchard Street, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood General-HD.

**INTRODUCTION:** The Applicant has proposed the construction of a one and a half-story single-family building and Carriage House in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The proposed building, of approximately 3,291 SF, meets the requirements of an Additional Building Type within the Neighborhood General-HD zoning district. In addition to the primary structure, a Carriage House has been proposed which meets the design standards for a Carriage House Building Type.

The one and a half-story primary structure is primarily under a hip roof with a single-story gabled roof addition to the rear. It features a full-length front porch under a gabled roof, with a shed roofed balcony on the front elevation. It features vertical Hardie siding and a 5-V metal roof. The Carriage House features the same materials and detailing, including exposed rafters and trellis feature as the primary structure.

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the April 3, 2023 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 6).

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS:** As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
2. Approve the application with conditions; or

3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

**REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS:** Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

1. Section 3.18.3.B. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.
  - a. *Finding.* The application is consistent with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan. The Old Town Master Plan states that, “The built environment, in particular the historic structures scattered throughout Old Town, should be protected and enhanced. While it is of great importance to save and restore historic structures, it is just as important to add to the built environment in a way that makes Old Town more complete.”

The Applicant proposes to construct a new single-family structure and Carriage House within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District, a locally and nationally designated historic district. The buildings have been designed to be sympathetic to the architectural character of the neighboring historic structures, so their addition to the architectural diorama will both protect the integrity of the existing historic structures and enhance the neighborhood by adding architectural variety.
  - b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also include the adoption of a form-based code that included architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
  - c. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make

Old Town more complete. The addition of the proposed single-family structure and Carriage House add to the district as well as help provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.

2. Section 3.18.3.C. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.

- a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that the design of the primary structure falls within the category of Additional Building Type as defined in Section 5.15.5.C. It meets the placement standards for this building type.
- b. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the conditions noted below are met, the proposed addition will be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5:
  - 1) Section 5.15.6.H. Columns, Arches, Piers, Railings, Balustrades. Piers shall be placed directly below the columns or posts which they support. While the porches are slab pours, the louvered detailing creates the profile of a pier porch. The porch columns are not centered on the "piers" for the porch. Further, there are a few areas, specifically near the stairs, where the louvered panels are missing. Revise the louvered panel details so that all areas are consistent, and all columns align with the "piers" supporting them.
  - 2) Section 5.15.6.H. Columns, Arches, Piers, Railings, Balustrades. Columns are permitted to be wood (termite resistant), cast iron, concrete with smooth finish, brick, stone, steel or Tabby. The Stair Detail (Sheet A108) indicates the column at the top of the stairs to be a PVC clad post. The detail must be revised to a permitted material which matches the elevations.
  - 3) Section 5.15.8.F. Carriage House and 5.15.5.F. General Standards. Carriage Houses must be of the same general character as the primary structure. Further, overall building proportions and individual building features shall have a proportional relationship with one another. The square windows on the Carriage House are 4-lite and should be revised to the same 2-lite pattern as those on the primary structure.

3. Section 3.18.3.D. Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.

*Finding.* Town Staff finds the nature and character of the new construction to be consistent and harmonious with that of the surrounding neighborhood. The mass and scale of the structures are appropriate for their location and the architectural detailing, with revisions to address the items in section 2 above, will be sensitive to the neighboring properties.

4. Section 3.18.3.F. The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.

*Finding.* The Applicant seeks approval for the construction of new structures in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions in section 2 of this report are met, the proposed plans are sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic resources; therefore, the structures, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.

5. Section 3.18.3.H. The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.

*Finding.* The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete; however, there as there are several trees 14 inches in diameter at breast height or greater, being proposed for removal, a tree removal permit is required. The Site Plan, included with the Architectural Set, does not reflect the Carriage House proposed as a portion of this application. It must be revised to align with the proposed plans.

Pritchard Street is a Town-owned street. A Town of Bluffton Encroachment Permit for the driveway must be approved prior to approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness-HD. It should be noted that one has been received but may not be issued until BJWSA has approved the relocation of the fire hydrant. Finally, as the current location of the fire hydrant would prevent access to the site for parking, the fire hydrant must be relocated prior to issuance of a Building Permit for the site, as failure to relocate would result in not being able to provide adequate parking which meets the standards of the UDO.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Per the Applications Manual, a Town of Bluffton Tree Removal Permit is required.
2. Per the Applications Manual, a Town of Bluffton Encroachment Permit is required.
3. The fire hydrant must be relocated prior to issuance of a Building Permit.

4. The Site Plan (Sheet S100) must be revised to include the driveway and accurate building footprints.
5. Per Sections 5.15.8.F. and 5.15.5.F. the square windows on the Carriage House must be revised to match those on the primary structure.
6. Per Section 5.15.6.H. of the UDO, the PVC clad post shown on stair detail must be revised to a permitted material.
7. Per Section 5.15.6.H. of the UDO, revise the louvered panel details so that all areas are consistent, and all columns align with the "piers" supporting them.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Location Map
2. Zoning Map
3. Application and Narrative
4. Site Plan & Elevations
5. Landscape Plan & Canopy Coverage
6. HPRC Report