

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



STAFF REPORT

Department of Growth Management

MEETING DATE:	August 7, 2024
PROJECT:	5783 Yaupon Road Place, Lot 38 – New Construction: Single Family Residential
APPLICANT:	Southern Coastal Homes
PROJECT MANAGER:	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

APPLICATION REQUEST: The Applicant, Southern Coastal Homes, on behalf of the Owners Nathalie and Andrew Hintz, requests that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-04-23-017854.** A Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the Construction of a new 1-story Single Family Residential Structure of approximately 1,818 SF and Carriage House of approximately 1,165 SF at 5783 Yaupon Road, Lot 38 in the Stock Farm Development, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood General-HD.

INTRODUCTION: The Applicant is proposing the construction of a 1-story single family residential structure of approximately 1,818 SF and Carriage House of approximately 1,165 SF in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The proposed primary building is a one-story structure featuring a side facing gable roof, with a full façade first-floor porch under a shed roof, which wraps the right side over an enclosed addition. The structure has a large rear addition under a gable roof and a shed roofed gable on the front elevation. The structure combines characteristics of several building types, and therefore, is reviewed as an Additional Building Type in accordance with the allowable building types for the Neighborhood General-HD zoning district. In addition to the primary structure, the Applicant has proposed a Carriage House which meets the design standards for a Carriage House Building Type. It features a side gable roof, with shed dormers on the front and rear elevation. Both structures feature horizontal Hardi siding, asphalt architectural shingle roofs and share architectural detailing.

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the June 10, 2024 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 4).

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS: As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
2. Approve the application with conditions; or

3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS: Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

1. Section 3.18.3.B. Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.

- a. *Finding.* The application is consistent with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan. The Old Town Master Plan states that, "The built environment, in particular the historic structures scattered throughout Old Town, should be protected and enhanced. While it is of great importance to save and restore historic structures, it is just as important to add to the built environment in a way that makes Old Town more complete."

The Applicant proposes to construct a new residential structure and Carriage House within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District, a locally and nationally designated historic district. The buildings have been designed to be sympathetic to the architectural character of the neighboring historic structures, so their addition to the architectural diorama will both protect the integrity of the existing historic structures and enhance the neighborhood by adding architectural variety.

- b. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also include the adoption of a form-based code that included architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
- c. *Finding.* The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of the proposed residential structures add to the district as well as help provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.

2. Section 3.18.3.C. The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.
 - a. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that the design of the primary structure falls within the category of Additional Building Type as allowed in the Neighborhood General- Historic District per Section 5.15.5.C. Additional Building Types are permissible. As has been past practice, the Town Staff requests the Historic Preservation Commission review and make a final determination regarding the appropriateness of the Additional Building Type.
 - b. *Finding.* Town Staff finds that if the conditions noted below are met, the proposed addition will be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5:
 - 1) Section 5.15.6.N. Corners and Water Tables. Material changes must take place at an interior corner. The porch on the rear elevation changes material at an exterior corner. Revise.
 - 2) Section 5.15.5.P.10 Cornice, Soffit and Frieze. Rough sawn wood, plywood and aluminum are not permitted materials for soffit or cornice detailing. Several of the sections indicate plywood soffit material. Revise to a permitted material.
 - 3) Section 5.15.5.E.5. Porches. Porches are required to be a minimum of 30" from grade to top of stairs. Porch is labeled as 29 ½ inches MAX. Revise to meet minimum height requirement.
 - 4) Section 5.15.5.M.1. Shutters. Shutters, when proposed, must fit the opening which they cover, be made of durable wood, be operable and be applied to all windows which can accept them. Revise shutter size to fit the openings which they cover and provide detail showing the material and operational, or remove.
 - 5) Section 5.15.5.H. Columns, Arches, Piers, Railings, Balustrades. Columns and porch posts shall be spaced no farther apart than they are tall as measured from the centerlines of the columns ("o.c"). Piers shall be placed directly below the columns or posts which they support. the columns on the front porch end bays are 8'8" tall, and are spaced 9'4" apart on center. Revise to be no further apart than they are tall.
 - 6) Section 5.3.3.C. Tree Conservation During Site Planning. During the site planning for any property, consideration shall be given to the existing tree canopy and every reasonable effort made to maximize the preservation of the existing canopy. While it appears consideration has been given to some of the trees, consider the placement of the structure on the site with relation some of the more sturdy/desirable trees (Live Oaks, magnolias, maples and laurel oaks, etc.) vs. those which tend to decline more quickly adjacent to development (water oaks, etc.).
 - 7) Section 5.3.3. Replacement of Protected Trees. A tree canopy with a minimum of 75% lot coverage, not including roof tops, shall be provided where land disturbance is proposed for sites less than one (1) acre. Tree canopy is the mature canopy of any existing

trees to be saved, including trees located within a required buffer, together with the mature canopy of proposed replacement trees. An exhibit showing the canopy coverage for the site must be provided, as not enough information was provided to complete the review.

3. Section 3.18.3.D. Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.

Finding. Town Staff finds the nature and character of the new construction to be consistent and harmonious with that of the surrounding neighborhood. The mass and scale of the structures are appropriate for their location and the architectural detailing, with revisions to address the items in section 2 above, will be sensitive to the neighboring properties.

4. Section 3.18.3.F. The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.

Finding. The Applicant seeks approval for the construction of new structures in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions section 2 of this report are met, the proposed plans are sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic resources; therefore, the structures, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.

5. Section 3.18.3.H. The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.

Finding. The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be incomplete. As the property is located within the Stock Farm development, a letter of approval from the Stock Farm ARB is required prior to approval.

As there are several trees 14 inches in diameter at breast height or greater being proposed for removal, a tree removal permit is required.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Per the Applications Manual, a Town of Bluffton Tree Removal Permit is required.
2. Per the Applications Manual, approval from the Stock Farm POA is required prior to approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness- HD.

3. Per Section 5.15.6.N., revise the location of the material change at the rear porch to take place at an interior corner.
4. Per Section 5.15.5.P.10., revise plywood soffit material to a permitted material.
5. Per Section 5.15.5.E.5., revise porch height to meet minimum height requirement.
6. Per Section 5.15.5.M.1., revise shutter size to fit the openings which they cover and provide detail showing the material and operational hardware or remove.
7. Per Section 5.15.5.H., revise the columns on the front porch end bays to be no further apart than they are tall.
8. Per Section 5.3.3.C., provide additional information on the health of the more sturdy/desirable trees (Live Oaks, magnolias, maples and laurel oaks, etc.) vs. those which tend to decline more quickly adjacent to development (water oaks, etc.) to determine if the house should be shifted within the site.
9. Per Section 5.3.3. provide exhibit showing the canopy coverage calculations for the site as not enough information was provided to complete the review.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Location and Zoning Map
2. Application and Narrative
3. Site Plan & Elevations and Landscape Plans
4. HPRC Report