



PLAN REVIEW COMMENTS FOR COFA-04-24-019070

Town of Bluffton
Department of Growth Management
20 Bridge Street P.O. Box 386 Bluffton, South Carolina 29910
Telephone 843-706-4522
OLD TOWN

Plan Type: Historic District **Apply Date:** 04/01/2024
Plan Status: Active **Plan Address:** 42 Wharf St Street
BLUFFTON, SC 29910
Case Manager: Charlotte Moore **Plan PIN #:** R610 039 00A 185A 0000
Plan Description: A request by John Montgomery, for review of a Certificate of Appropriateness-Historic District, to allow construction of a new 2-story Single Family Structure (approximately 2,120 SF) and 2-story Carriage House structure (approximately 1,120 SF) located at 42 Wharf Street (Parcel R610 039 00A 185A 0000). The property is within the Old Town Historic District and is zoned Neighborhood General-Historic District (NG-HD). STATUS (04.17.2025): New Concept scheduled for review at April 28 HPRC meeting.

Application History

04.22.2024: Application reviewed at HPRC meeting. Awaiting final submission.
9/16/2024: Conceptual application under review and will be placed on the September 30, 2024 HPRC Agenda.
09.30.2024: Application reviewed at HPRC meeting. Awaiting final submission.
03.26.2025: Final submission submitted but requires revisions. May return to HPRC depending on changes.
04.22.2025: Third submission scheduled for April 28 HPRC meeting.

Staff Review (HD)

Submission #: 1 Received: 04/01/2024 Completed: 04/19/2024

Reviewing Dept.	Complete Date	Reviewer	Status
Growth Management Dept Review (HD)	04/19/2024	Katie Peterson	Revisions Required

Comments:

- During the site planning for any property, consideration shall be given to the existing tree canopy and every reasonable effort made to maximize the preservation of the existing canopy. Site plan shows removal of the large oak tree in the middle of the site. This tree needs to be retained, or if unhealthy an arborist report from a certified arborist provided indicating as much. Note the report must be provided for the health of the tree in it's current condition without construction. (UDO 5.3.3.C.)
- Should the tree need to be removed and the appropriate arborist report provided, regardless of the health or condition of the tree(s), a Tree Removal Permit is required to remove any tree, 8 inches in diameter at breast height ("DBH") or greater or any American holly, dogwood, redbud, southern magnolia, or red buckeye 4 inches in DBH or greater. (UDO3.22.)
- Railing and Balustrades are permitted to be wood (termite resistant), painted or natural wrought or cast Iron. The Application lists the baluster material as wood and PVC. Revise to a permitted material. (UDO 5.15.6.H.)
- Confirm lofted area shown during Pre Application in Carriage House has been fully removed, or provide additional information on this space to ensure square footage and story requirements are still met.
- At time of final submittal, provide landscape plan showing foundation plantings, street trees, and canopy coverage calculations. (Applications Manual)
- At time of final submittal, provide detail of the piers and underpinning on the porch, a section through the wall and eave showing the materials and configuration, section through the screened porch, corner board detail, water table detail, window and door tables.

HPRC Review	04/19/2024	Katie Peterson	Revisions Required
-------------	------------	----------------	--------------------

Comments:

1. At time of final submittal provide service yard locations - specifically for the locations of the HVAC equipment for Carriage House. (UDO 5.15.5.F.10.)
2. Overall building proportions and Individual building features shall have a proportional relationship with one another. For example, features such as porches, chimneys, cornices, windows and doors must be proportional to other features of the building as well as the overall building form. Restudy the proportion of the Master Bedroom, Mudroom, & Rear Upstairs Bedroom windows to make them more consistent with the rest of the home. They are considerably more vertical in proportion than the other windows. (UDO 5.15.5.F.4.a)
3. Additions, connective wings, and outbuildings shall be secondary to the primary building form. Further, overall building proportions and Individual building features shall have a proportional relationship with one another. The proportions of the main gable of the Carriage House are uncomfortable and too vertical relative to the house. Carriage House is too tall in comparison to the Main House and needs to be revised to be clearly secondary in nature to the Main House structure Study a lower bearing height. (UDO 5.15.5.F.4.a and b.)
4. Restudy window configurations at the cross gables on the Left Elevation to provide consistency between all three gables. (UDO 5.15.5.F.4.a and b.)
5. Building elements and the spaces between them shall be organized into a logical sequential manner. The gable end window on the rear elevation of the carriage house should be subordinate in size to the window below similar to the one shown on the front elevation. (UDO 5.15.5.F.4.c.)
6. Bluffton vernacular architecture and construction is straightforward and functional, and draws its ornament and variety from the traditional assembly of genuine materials. Reconsider the columns, which are too wide in proportion to other elements of the house per historic examples in the Old Town area. Revise to be more in keeping with local vernacular examples.

Growth Management Dept Review 04/24/2025
(HD)

Charlotte Moore

Approved with Conditions

Comments:

1. Properly identify all elevations for the Carriage House. The “left elevation,” for example, should be the “front elevation” at it faces Wharf Street, according to the site plan. Is it possible that the Carriage House is intended for the northwest corner of the property not the southwest?
2. The main house is reviewed as a Medium House type. Provide footprint total square footage and overall square footage for the Carriage House and the main house based on interior space, not heated space. (Applications Manual). A door from Bedroom 3 opens into the attic space suggesting additional square footage that must be accounted for.
3. A service yard is not shown for the Carriage House, only the main house. Will they be shared? Provide details to show compliance with UDO Sec. 5.15.5.F.9. Electric meters must be screened from public view.
4. The height of the Carriage House is nearly the same height as the main house and could be reduced to be better distinguished from the main residence.
5. Upper floor balconies for the Carriage House must have a minimum depth of four feet (or a depth that is proportionate to the height and width of the building) per UDO Sec. 5.15.6.E.1.a.
6. If any portion of the Carriage House foundation is exposed, it must comply with the tabby shell foundation to be used for the main house (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.G.).
7. Provide details for balustrade material and configuration for both the main house and Carriage House to show compliance with UDO Sec. 5.15.6.H.
8. Provide window and door details and ensure they meet the applicable UDO requirements (Sec. 5.15.6.I.).
9. For the Carriage House: the smaller “garage doors” are somewhat odd as they differ from the second-floor French doors and lack a similar transparency. Is a landing or patio proposed in front of these doors?
10. A window in the rear second floor elevation would break up the blank wall; likewise, for the main house, a window on the left ground floor elevation would break up the wall.
11. For the main house, shutters are not provided for the second-floor window on the right elevation while shutters are provided on all other windows on the same elevation. Shutters must be provided on all windows that can accept them. As shutters are proposed for the main residence, shutters must also be applied to the Carriage House that conform with UDO Sec. 5.15.6.M.
12. For the Carriage House, the area above the garage/carport doors is unclear. Is this an expression line or a roof? If it is an expression line, it lacks the details of the adjacent expression line. Also, the spacing of the battens below this area does not match the spacing of the battens above it. The area on the side of the garage/carport doors is unclear and a clearer detail must be provided.
13. For the Carriage House, provide column details for the carport, including showing the alignment with the beam above. The placement of the screening louvers, including the horizontal band, must be placed behind the columns (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.H. and O). For the main house, the side porch columns appear to be spaced farther apart than they are tall from the elevation view (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.H.1.a.). Consider moving the columns closer together to line up with the stairs. On the first-floor plan view, there appear to be three columns on each side of the stairs, which seem too many. If the porch is to be screened, the screen placement must be located behind the columns. Provide front porch column spacing dimensions.
14. Provide gutter details and ensure they meet the applicable UDO requirements (Sec. 5.15.6.J.).
15. Provide wall section through eave to identify materials and details for both main and carriage houses. Ensure compliance with the UDO (corners and water tables, UDO Sec. 5.15.6.N.) and (cornice, soffit and frieze, Sec. 5.15.6.P.) and provide dimensions.
16. Brick is shown to be used for the chimney. Brick must be salvaged or locally produced. (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.G.)
17. An unconcealed metal spark arrestor is shown for the main house. UDO Sec. 5.15.6.E.8.d. requires arrestors to be concealed within a masonry architectural feature, such as a bishop’s cap, and screened from the street.
18. Specify 5V roofing metal type. Permitted metal roofing materials are galvanized, copper, aluminum and zinc-aluminum. (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.J.)
19. Regardless of health or condition, a tree removal permit is required for the removal of any tree that is 14 inches diameter at breast height (UDO Sec. 3.22.2.A).
20. Provide an updated Landscape Plan showing the main house and Carriage House, noting required foundation plantings (UDO Sec. 5.3.7.E.) and 75% tree canopy coverage at maturity of all trees (UDO Sec. 5.3.3.G.1.). Also, show sidewalk from stairs to property line. On Tree Protection/Tree Removal page, remove “unknown tree type” and replace with “dogwood” per arborist letter. The submitted Landscape Plan shows a 50-gal dry well located in proposed Carriage house footprint, potentially impacting stormwater mitigation. Revise full landscape to include stormwater revision and location of magnolia tree to be preserved.
21. Provide the most recent property survey that is separate from the Site Plan.
22. Submit all required materials with the Final Plan, including all details required by the COFA-HD application checklist. Failure to provide complete items could delay scheduling the Final Plan for HPC review.

HPRC Review

04/24/2025

Charlotte Moore

Approved with Conditions

Comments:

From HPRC members:

1. Porch columns cannot extend beyond the foundation. Suggest that the foundation be extended at least 3 inches or so beyond the column base.
2. Consider false shutters at the first-floor left side elevation at the stairs to help with the blank wall.
3. For the screened porch, the 8x8 middle columns do not appear necessary. Suggest placing them to the side. Show the columns for screen doors as well as the screen.
4. Add a window at the second floor on the right elevation of the Carriage House.

Comments:

1. The proposed building is identified as a Cottage but is reviewed as an Additional Building Type as it exceeds the permitted building footprint of 900 sf maximum (1,206 proposed) and the maximum size range of 1,500 sf (2,006 sf proposed). Additionally, it appears to have a combination of styles. (UDO Sec. 5.15.8.I. and 5.15.5.C.)
 2. Show the front build-to zone, which is 10 minimum and 20 feet maximum. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.C)
 3. The separately accessed unit is an attached accessory dwelling unit. Only one ADU is permitted per lot (in case there are future plans to build a separate Carriage House). (UDO Sec. 4.4.1.A.)
 4. Height: a.) Building heights and widths shall be visually similar to those in the neighboring vicinity. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.F.1.a.) b) The first-floor finish height must be three (3) feet above the average adjacent sidewalk grade. Provide elevation of adjacent sidewalk grade to confirm that the finished floor is 36" above grade. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.F.1.c.)
 5. Roof: Roofs must correspond to the major massing of the building and complicated rooflines are to be avoided. The portion of the structure to enclose the stairwell creates another roofline and gives the appearance of a two-story lean-to addition. This treatment is atypical of Old Town Bluffton. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5)
 6. Windows: For the first floor front elevation windows, consider moving windows on either side of the door to be in center of left and right bays. "Vertical rhythms should be established in the façade through alignment of windows, openings, pilasters, and columns." (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.F.4.e.)
 7. Service Yard: With the Final Plan, provide materials for the service yard screening. The area must be large enough to include HVAC units, utilities and receptacles for both residences. Utility meters must be screened from public view. (UDO Sec. 5.15.5.F.10.)
- Section 5.15.6 Architectural Standards
8. Porch: The porch height must be a minimum of 30 inches from grade to top of stairs. Plan shows as a maximum. Maximum permitted height is 96 inches. Remove "minimum." (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.E.5.c.)
 9. Building Walls: Stucco on concrete block is identified on the application. For the Final Plan, identify the type of permitted stucco to be used. Stucco on foundation walls must be tabby (mixed shell size only) or true stucco with a steel trowel or sand finish. (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.F.1.a.) For the wall material, identify all siding materials proposed on the Final Plan. Permitted materials for building walls include wood (termite resistant, 50-year siding product), cement fiber siding (50-year siding product). (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.F.3.)
 10. Columns, Balustrades: Show that wood columns are proposed on the Final Plan. Provide column detail to show alignment with beam. (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.H.3.) Provide an architectural detail of the railing and baluster configuration, noting the spacing between the balusters. The site porch lacks a handrail.
 11. Windows and Doors: Provide window and door details with Final Plan. All windows and doors must be operational; false shutters (i.e, the closed shutters on the left elevation) are not permitted. (UDO Sec. 5.15.6.I.3. and 5.15.6.F.4.c.) Show operation of doors/windows on right elevation and remove the false shutters on the left elevation.
 12. Roofs and Gutters: A 5-V metal roof is proposed but the specific metal is not identified. On the Final Plan, show compliance with UDO Sec. 5.15.6.J.2. and J.3. If gutters are to be provided, compliance with this UDO sub-section is also required.
 13. Shutters: On Final Plan, identify that shutters are proposed to be durable wood. Provide shutter details per UDO Section 5.15.6.F.M.1.e.
 14. Corners and Water Tables: On Final Plan, provide corner and water table trim details to show compliance with UDO Sec. 5.15.6.N. Any material changes must occur at interior corners.
 15. Skirting and Underpinning: On Final Plan, provide skirting details to show compliance with UDO Sec. 5.15.6.O.
 16. Cornice, Soffit and Frieze: On Final Plan, provide details to show compliance with UDO Sec. 5.15.6.P.
 17. The Landscape Plan and the Site Plan do not match. The Site Plan shows a future garage (Note: accessory structures in Old Town are Carriage House per UDO Sec. 5.15.8.F.). Provide correction.
 18. Per the Applications Manual, a site plan (survey) indicating location, species, and caliper of existing trees and trees to be removed must be provided. An arborist report has been provided, but that information is supplemental to the survey. The canopy plan shows multiple trees to be removed, including those not located on the subject property or on the property line. Trees not under ownership of the property owner cannot be removed. A Town of Bluffton Tree Removal Permit is required for any tree 14" (DBH) or greater located on single family lot a proposed for removal. (Applications Manual and UDO Section 3.22.2.A.) Replacement trees will be required as specified in UDO Sec. 5.3.7.F.4. Additionally, a tree canopy of 75% lot coverage,

not including roof tops, must be provided. (UDO Sec. 5.3.7.G.) UDO Sec. 5.3.7.A. requires at least one large canopy street tree. A foundation planting area at least eight feet in width must be provided at the front elevation per UDO Sec. 5.3.7.E. Identify the pervious material to be used for the driveway.

19. For Final Plan submittal, provide architectural details for the following: roof, windows, doors, railings and balustrade, skirting, water table trim, corner board trim; a wall section through the eave showing the materials, configuration and dimensions. Use call outs to identify materials on the plans including existing building materials to ensure consistency. A complete submittal package will help expedite review by the Historic Preservation Commission. (Applications Manual)

Watershed Management Review	09/19/2024	Samantha Crotty	Approved with Conditions
Comments: Comments may be provided at time of building permit/stormwater permit submittal.			
Beaufort Jasper Water and Sewer Review	04/16/2024	Matthew Michaels	Approved with Conditions
Comments: 1. Water and Sewer services appear to be installed at property corner. Please reach out to Mandy Anderson (BJWSA's New Service Coordinator) at mandy.anderson@bjwsa.org to set up the account and pay fees.			
Watershed Management Review	04/19/2024	Samantha Crotty	Approved with Conditions
Comments: Comments may be provided at time of stormwater permit/building permit submittal.			
Beaufort Jasper Water and Sewer Review	04/24/2025	Matthew Michaels	Approved
Comments: Comments may be provided with Final Plan			
Transportation Department Review - HD	04/24/2025	Mark Maxwell	Approved
Watershed Management Review	04/24/2025	Samantha Crotty	Approved
Comments: Comments may be provided at time of building permit/stormwater permit submittal.			
Beaufort Jasper Water and Sewer Review	09/26/2024	Matthew Michaels	Approved
Comments: BJWSA comments not provided but may be provided at time of Final Plan submission.			
HPRC Review	09/26/2024	Charlotte Moore	Approved
Comments: 1. Recommendation: Study lowering the front porch roof as there is a large amount of wall space above the living room windows.			
Transportation Department Review - HD	09/06/2024	Megan James	Approved
Comments: No comments			
Transportation Department Review - HD	04/02/2024	Megan James	Approved
Comments: No comments			

Plan Review Case Notes: