HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



STAFF REPORT Department of Growth Management

MEETING DATE:	December 6, 2023
PROJECT:	77 Bridge Street- New Construction: Single-Family and Carriage House
APPLICANT:	Ansley Hester Manuel, Architect
PROJECT MANAGER:	Katie Peterson, AICP, Senior Planner

<u>APPLICATION REQUEST</u>: The Applicant, Ansley Hester Manuel, Architect, on behalf of the owner, Sara Harwell Kelly, requests that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the following application:

1. **COFA-06-23-018189.** A request by Ansley Hester Manuel, Architect, on behalf of the owner, Sara Harwell Kelly, for the review of a Certificate of Appropriateness - HD for the construction of a new one-story single-family residential structure of approximately 1,710 SF and a new one-story Carriage House of approximately 705 SF to be located at 77 Bridge Street, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood Conservation -HD.

INTRODUCTION: The Applicant has proposed the construction of a one-story single-family structure and Carriage House in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. The proposed primary structure, of approximately 1,710 SF has some characteristics of a Cottage building type but exceeds the footprint and therefore has been classified as an Additional Building Type within the Neighborhood Conservation-HD zoning district.

The primary structure features an intersecting gable roof, with a hip roofed porch on the front elevation and a shed roofed service yard area on the rear portion of the left elevation. It features a Tabby stucco foundation with hog board underpinning, 5V metal roof, and vertical board and batten siding. The one-story Carriage House structure features a side-gable roof and the same materials and detailing as the primary structure. It should be noted that this application is dependent on having received approval for the demolition of the structures currently on the site, however, in no way should this application influence the decision of that review (COFA-07-23-018245).

This project was presented to the Historic Preservation Review Committee for conceptual review at the June 7, 2023 meeting and comments were provided to the Applicant (See Attachment 5).

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS: As granted by the powers and duties set forth in Section 2.2.6.E.2, the Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to take the following actions with respect to this application:

- 1. Approve the application as submitted by the Applicant;
- 2. Approve the application with conditions; or
- 3. Deny the application as submitted by the Applicant.

It is important to note that the intent of Section 5.15 Old Town Bluffton Historic District of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) is that the Section be user friendly and informative to the residents and the members of HPC and is not intended to discourage creativity or force the replication of historic models. Rather, it is to set forth a framework in which the diversity that has always characterized Bluffton can continue to grow. The Section also defines guidelines for design and materials similar to that used on structures within the Old Town, and it is the charge of the HPC to assess the interpretation of these guidelines as they pertain to applications using the established review criteria.

<u>REVIEW CRITERIA & ANALYSIS</u>: Town Staff and the Historic Preservation Commission are required to consider the criteria set forth in Section 3.18.3 of the UDO in assessing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic District (HD). The applicable criteria are provided below followed by a Staff Finding(s) based upon review of the application submittals to date.

- 1. <u>Section 3.18.3.B.</u> Consistency with the principles set forth in the Old Town Master Plan.
 - a. *Finding*. The Old Town Master Plan initiatives include the adoption of a form-based code that includes architectural standards for structures located within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. These standards are included in Article 5 of the UDO. The new construction proposed as part of this request will be in conformance with those standards if the conditions noted in item 2 of this Section are met.
 - b. *Finding*. The Old Town Master Plan initiatives also promote preservation and protection of the legacy of the Old Town Bluffton Historic District through additions to the built environment which make Old Town more complete. The addition of a proposed single-family structure and Carriage House adds to the district and helps provide completeness to the neighborhood and overall district.
- 2. <u>Section 3.18.3.C.</u> The application must be in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5, Design Standards.
 - a. *Finding*. Town Staff finds that the proposed structures are in conformance with applicable provisions provided in Article 5.
- 3. <u>Section 3.18.3.D.</u> Consistency with the nature and character of the surrounding area and consistency of the structure with the scale, form and building proportions of the surrounding neighborhood.

Finding. Town Staff finds the nature and character of the new construction is consistent with that of the surrounding neighborhood.

4. <u>Section 3.18.3.F.</u> The historic, architectural, and aesthetic features of the structure including the extent to which its alteration or removal would be detrimental to the public interest.

Finding. The Applicant seeks approval for the construction of a new primary structure and Carriage House in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District. If the conditions in section 2 of this report are met, the proposed plans are sympathetic in design to the neighboring historic and non-historic resources; therefore, the structure, with the revisions noted, will have no adverse effect on the public interest.

5. <u>Section 3.18.3.H.</u> The application must comply with applicable requirements in the Applications Manual.

Finding. The Certificate of Appropriateness Application has been reviewed by Town Staff and has been determined to be complete; however, there are several trees being proposed for removal which require a tree removal permit which must be submitted, reviewed, and approved prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Further, any mitigation required by the Tree Removal Permit must be installed prior to passing a Final-HD inspection.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: It is the charge of the HPC to assess and interpret the standards and guidelines set forth in the UDO as they pertain to applications using the review criteria established in the UDO and to take appropriate action as granted by the powers and duties set forth Section 2.2.6.E.2. Town Staff finds that with the conditions noted below, the requirements of Section 3.18.3 of the Unified Development Ordinance have been met and recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Per the Applications Manual, a Town of Bluffton Tree Removal Permit is required, and any mitigation associated with the permit satisfied prior to Final-HD inspection approval.

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1. Location Map and Zoning Map
- 2. Application and Narrative
- 3. Site Plan & Elevations
- 4. Landscape Plan & Canopy Coverage
- 5. HPRC Report