

# Historic Preservation Commission

Theodore D. Washington Municipal Building, 20 Bridge Street, Henry "Emmett" McCracken Jr.  
Council Chambers

Wednesday, June 07, 2023 at 6:00 PM

---

## I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Trimbur called the meeting to order at 6pm.

## II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT

Commissioner Kerri Schmelter

Commissioner Mary Vaux Bell

Chairman Bruce Trimbur

Vice Chairman Evan Goodwin

Commissioner Carletha Frazier (Arrived at 6:23pm)

Commissioner Will Guenther

## III. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Commissioner Schmelter made a motion to adopt the agenda.

Seconded by Vice Chairman Goodwin.

Voting Yea: Commissioner Schmelter, Commissioner Vaux Bell, Chairman Trimbur, Vice Chairman Goodwin, Commissioner Guenther

All were in favor and the motion passed.

## IV. ADOPTION OF MINUTES

### 1. April 5, 2023 Minutes

Commissioner Guenther made a motion to adopt the minutes as written.

Seconded by Commissioner Schmelter.

Voting Yea: Commissioner Schmelter, Commissioner Vaux Bell, Chairman Trimbur, Vice Chairman Goodwin, Commissioner Guenther

All were in favor and the motion passed.

## V. PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA\*

Joan Heyward, 95 Boundary St. Ms. Heyward asked that the Campbell Chapel be approved. Ms. Heyward also discussed the Joiner House window type and style discrepancies. She asked that the Commission approve the window.

## VI. OLD BUSINESS

## VII. NEW BUSINESS

1. **Administrative Appeal:** A request by Eugene & Melanie Marks, owner of 9 Bruin Road to appeal the UDO Administrator's decision to fail the Rough-HD inspection associated with Permit RNEW-08-22-2266, as related to non-approved windows associated with COFA-03-22-

016484, on the property located at 9 Bruin Road, commonly referred to as the Joiner House, a Contributing Resource within the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood Core-HD. (ZONE-05-23-017996)

Vice Chairman Goodwin recused himself. Assistant Town Manager Colin presented. Historic Preservation Commission Attorney Richardson LaBruce discussed how the HPC is operating in a quasi-judicial manner and the format for the appeal. Mr. Marks reviewed the Marvin window with what was proposed and the Pella window which was the window in question. Mr. Marks stated there was no vinyl in the Pella.

Commissioner Frazier arrived during the appellant's presentation and Chairman Trimbur verified that both Staff and the Appellant agreed to her sitting through the rest of the case. Both Staff and Mr. Marks agreed that Commissioner Frazier could hear the rest of the case. Mr. Marks discussed why there was a change in the type of windows.

Staff discussed why the project is before the HPC and that the vinyl error can be corrected.

The HPC discussed their opinions on the project. The Commission stated that the windows are a suitable and superior replacement and that there were extenuating circumstances with supply chains to get the original windows.

Commissioner Schmelter made a motion to affirm the UDO Administrator's decision in part given that the windows installed were not the same windows approved by Staff and as specified in the Building Permit (Marvin Elevate windows), Staff was not provided additional information regarding the Pella Lifestyle windows prior to installation; and Staff did not approve them as required by the Certificate of Appropriateness. However, Commissioner Schmelter continued to move to reverse the UDO administrator's decision that the Pella Lifestyle windows installed do not meet the Arm's Length Rule, meaning they are not indistinguishable from the original windows at an arm's length; and the Pella Lifestyle windows installed do not match the old windows in design and texture.

The applicant was allowed to proceed with the current approved Certificate of Appropriateness – HD.

Seconded by Commissioner Frazier.

Voting Yea: Commissioner Schmelter, Commissioner Vaux Bell, Chairman Trimbur, Commissioner Frazier, Commissioner Guenther

All were in favor and the motion passed.

2. **Certificate of Appropriateness:** A request by Andrew Pietz to allow the construction of a new single-family residence of approximately 3,291 SF and a Carriage House of approximately 484 SF to be located at 58 Pritchard Street, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood General-HD. (COFA-03-23-017752) (Staff - Katie Peterson)

Vice Chairman Goodwin returned to the dais.

Staff presented. The applicant was in attendance. The applicant reviewed the staff's conditions and updates. There was discussion about the louvers and the bay window.

Commissioner Schmelter made a motion to approve application with the following conditions:

1. Per the Applications Manual, a Town of Bluffton Tree Removal Permit is required.
2. Per the Applications Manual, a Town of Bluffton Encroachment Permit is required.
3. The fire hydrant must be relocated prior to issuance of a Building Permit.
4. The Site Plan (Sheet S100) must be revised to include the driveway and accurate building footprints.
5. Per Sections 5.15.8.F. and 5.15.5.F. the square windows on the Carriage House must be revised to match those on the primary structure.
6. Per Section 5.15.6.H. of the UDO, the PVC clad post shown on stair detail must be revised to a permitted material.
7. Per Section 5.15.6.H. of the UDO, revise the louvered panel details so that all areas are consistent, and all columns align with the “piers” supporting them.
8. Revise the louvered panel detail on the side elevations to match the front with the mono-slab above the louvered panel.
9. If when structurally considered, the appearance is modified at the rear left corner near the bay window, the modification may be reviewed by Staff for consideration.

Seconded by Vice Chairman Goodwin.

Voting Yea: Commissioner Schmelter, Commissioner Vaux Bell, Chairman Trimbur, Vice Chairman Goodwin, Commissioner Frazier, Commissioner Guenther

All were in favor and the motion passed.

- 3. Certificate of Appropriateness:** A request by Joseph DePauw, AIA, on behalf of the owner Marti Golson of Caramar Rentals & Investments LLC, to allow the renovation and repair of the approximately 690 SF Contributing Resource, known as the Walker House, including the removal of the 250 SF attached carport and the addition of 53 square feet to the south elevation located at 99 Pritchard Street, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood Conservation-HD. (COFA-04-23-017906) (Staff - Katie Peterson)

Staff presented. The applicant was in attendance. There was discussion about the current vinyl on the structure and the location of the service yard.

Vice Chairman Goodwin approved the application as submitted, as vinyl siding is an appropriate material on the addition due to the existing conditions of the site.

Seconded by Commissioner Frazier.

Voting Yea: Commissioner Schmelter, Commissioner Vaux Bell, Chairman Trimbur, Vice Chairman Goodwin, Commissioner Frazier, Commissioner Guenther

All were in favor and the motion passed.

- 4. Certificate of Appropriateness:** A request by James O. McGhee, Architects, P.C., on behalf of owner, the Board of Trustees of the Campbell Chapel A.M.E. Church, to demolish the non-historic, non-contributing portion of approximately 2,307 SF, to allow the construction of a 1-story free-standing addition of approximately 608 SF, and to renovate the historic 1,780 SF Contributing Resource known as Campbell Chapel A.M.E. (Tax Parcel R610-039-00A-0080-0000) located at 23 Boundary Street, in the Old Town Bluffton Historic District and zoned Neighborhood Center-HD. (COFA-04-23-0107894) (Staff - Glen Umberger)

Staff presented. The applicant was in attendance. There was discussion about the existing structure and the materials used, the type of roof being proposed and the design of the proposed front porch.

Vice Chairman Goodwin made a motion to approve the application with the following conditions:

1. Per Sections 3.18.3.A. and Section 5.15.6.J. of the UDO, the use of wood shingles is not permitted.
2. Per Section 3.18.3.A. of the UDO that the installation of exterior shutters is not permitted unless additional documentation is provided for Staff review and approval.
3. A membrane roof for the rear addition be permitted as a substitute for those materials listed in Section 5.15.6.H.2.a. of the UDO.
4. A Landscape Plan has not been reviewed as part of this application and future work beyond the scope of this application will be required to be reviewed.
5. Per Section 3.10 of the UDO, a Development Plan will be required to complete site changes to stormwater, parking layout, circulation, etc. that exceeds the scope of work approved under the Certificate of Appropriateness-HD.

Seconded by Commissioner Vaux Bell.

Voting Yea: Commissioner Schmelter, Commissioner Vaux Bell, Chairman Trimbur, Vice Chairman Goodwin, Commissioner Frazier, Commissioner Guenther

All were in favor and the motion passed.

#### **VIII. DISCUSSION**

Staff thanked Commissioner Bell and Chairman Trimbur for their years of service as this was their last meeting.

#### **IX. ADJOURNMENT**

Commissioner Guenther made a motion to adjourn.

Seconded by Commissioner Vaux Bell.

Voting Yea: Commissioner Schmelter, Commissioner Vaux Bell, Chairman Trimbur, Vice Chairman Goodwin, Commissioner Frazier, Commissioner Guenther

The meeting adjourned at 8:38pm.