

CITY OF BELLE ISLE, FL

1600 NELA AVENUE, BELLE ISLE, FL 32809 * TEL 407-851-7730

MEMORANDUM

From the Desk of Bob Francis, City Manager

To:

Mayor and Council

Date:

March 17, 2020

Re:

Lancaster House

At the January 21 Council meeting, the City Council wanted some clarification on a statement that I made regarding the historic significance of the Lancaster House staying on the current site at 5903 Randolph (the intersection of Randolph and Waltham). Last year, I reported to the Council that the Lancaster House would lose its historic significance if it was moved from the current location. This was based on a statement by a State Historic Preservation Architect and PCHS that this was the original location of the house and therefore it was considered a homestead. Based on this assumption, the City Council passed a motion allowing the house to remain at its current location. As it turns out, based on additional research, this may not be the case.

To verify that my information was correct, I again contacted the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) to ask them about this issue. I spoke to Andrew Waber, Historic Preservationist in the Survey and Registration Division. His email on the process is attached, as well as an information packet on the Historic Places Program Description. Mr. Waber pointed out that a building can still be listed on the National Registry depending on other criteria that SHPO uses to evaluate an application. There is no application currently at the SHPO office for the Lancaster House.

Under Criteria Considerations (page 5), structures that have been moved from their original locations shall not be considered eligible for the National Register. However, such properties will qualify if they are integral parts of districts that do meet the criteria or if they fall within the certain categories. One of those categories is "a building or structure removed from its original location but which is significant primarily for architectural value, or which is the surviving structure most importantly associated with a historic person or event."

According to Mr. Waber, other variables will be considered, such as distance to be moved, character of the place it is moving. I asked Mr. Waber if it is moved within the Pine Castle Urban Preservation District, would it be considered eligible. I explained that the Pine Castle Urban Preservation District is a preservation district that has existing historical and residential communities which form a cohesive whole. He said it's possible, but was clear stating that until an application is submitted to SHPO for evaluation, a decision cannot be made on whether the house should remain or it can be moved.

PCHS came to the City Council a year ago asking that the house be turned over the PCHS so they could save it. The City Council agreed to donate the house to PCHS and gave the PCHS a year to provide the City Council with a plan to move the house. The deadline was March 2020. Since that time, it was discovered that there was a problem with donating the house as it was part of the 2012 Bond issue. The City and CCA had to go through the legal channels of getting this house off the "books" because it was part of the 2012 bond issue. That issue has been cleared up. The house could be now turned over to PCHS.

The initial information from SHPO now seems to be in error regarding whether or not the house could be moved and retain its historic significance. Additionally, PCHS stated that CCA would want to use the house once renovated which is not the case. However, CCA has offered to assist in moving the house.

Therefore the City Council might want to consider having PCHS develop a plan for moving the house. PCHS moved the Crawford House, so they should be able to apply this plan to the Lancaster House as the initial location, route and final destination are all similar to the Crawford House move.

The City should request PCHS to:

- Submit the SHPO application for the Lancaster House by April 30, 2020. They should make note on the
 application that the house needs to be moved to a new location, but within the Pine Castle Urban
 Preservation District. As the City is still the owner of the house, the City will have to sign the
 application.
- Develop a plan for moving the Lancaster House (PCHS could use the plan that was developed for the Crawford House.) The plan will include cost, sources of funds, project leader, and moving date. If the City assisted in the Crawford House move, it should provide those same services for the Lancaster House move.
- 3. Provide a copy of the SHPO application and the moving plan to the City by May 12, 2020.
- 4. Provide a funding plan for the rehabilitation of the Lancaster House by June 1, 2020. The plan will include:
 - a. List of rehabilitation items
 - b. Cost of rehabilitation list
 - c. Sources of funding
 - d. Project Leader
 - e. Contractor
 - f. Expected completion date
- 5. Stipulate that PCHS cannot transfer, sell, or deed the Lancaster House to any other entity without City Council approval.



Preliminary Site Information Questionnaire

Waber, Andrew J. <Andrew.Waber@dos.myflorida.com>
To: "bfrancis@belleislefl.gov" <bfrancis@belleislefl.gov>

Wed, Feb 12, 2020 at 1:19 PN

Mr. Francis

Thank you for reaching out to us regarding the National Register process. In order to start the nomination process, we will need for you to first complete a Preliminary Site Information Questionnaire (PSIQ), which you can find at http://dos.myflorida.com/media/30809/psiqrevised2013.pdf. We will need a signature from the official owner of record of the property; current photographs of the exterior and interior of the building; any historical photographs, even recent historical photographs for the sake of comparison (if they can be found); a location map (a simple Google map printout should suffice); and proof of ownership (a simple property appraiser printout should suffice). If the building is owned by a for-profit or non-profit organization, we would also like to have proof that the individual signing on behalf of the organization is authorized to do so. If there is more about this building you would like to tell us than would fit onto this single piece of paper, please do not hesitate to include continuation sheets. Keep in mind, when we evaluate a building for NR eligibility, we are not only assessing significance, but also integrity. So any changes that have taken place to the building over time should be noted.

Once we receive the proposal, it will undergo staff review and we will notify you if the proposal is either preliminarily approved, rejected, or we need more information. If approved, you will be receiving a Florida Nomination Proposal (FNP) packet, and we will assist you further in preparing the proposal for presentation before the state National Register Review Board. If rejected, we will state the reason why. Please let me know if you have any further questions.

Also attached is an information packet on the National Register program.

Andrew Waber

Historic Preservationist | Survey & Registration | Division of Historical Resources | Florida Department of State | 500 South Bronough Street | Tallahassee, Florida 32399 | 850.245.6430 | 1.800.847.7278 | Fax: 850.245.6439 | Andrew.Waber@DOS.MyFlorida.com | www.flheritage.com



NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES PROGRAM DESCRIPTION

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF STATE - LAUREL M. LEE - SECRETARY OF STATE

The National Register of Historic Places is an official listing of historically significant sites and properties throughout the country. It is maintained by the National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior. It includes districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that have been identified and documented as being significant in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering or culture. These sites and properties reflect the prehistoric occupation and historical development of our nation, state, and local communities.

Listing in the National Register does not, in itself, impose any obligation on the property owner, or restrict the owner's basic right to use and dispose of the property as he or she sees fit. It does, however, encourage the preservation of significant historic resources in three ways.:

- 1. by providing official recognition of the historic significance of the property and encouraging consideration of its historic value in future development planning,
- 2. by imposing limited protection from activities involving funding, licensing, or assistance by Federal agencies that could result in damage or loss of its historic values, and
- 3. by making the property eligible for Federal financial incentives for historic preservation

Redevelopment of a listed property which involves Federal funding, licensing, or assistance will be subject to review by the State Historic Preservation officer and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation to assure that adequate and appropriate consideration is given to the preservation of the historic qualities for which it was originally listed. This review requirement will also apply to any Federally funded, licensed, or assisted activities undertaken by others that could have an adverse effect on the property.

Federal financial incentives for historic preservation include eligibility for direct matching grants and investment tax credits for the rehabilitation of income producing properties.

For further information on the National Register program, please contact us at the address or phone number below.

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES RESULTS OF LISTING IN FLORIDA

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF STATE - LAUREL M. LEE - SECRETARY OF STATE

The National Register of Historic Places is an official listing of properties throughout the country that reflect the prehistoric occupation and historic development of our nation, states, and local communities. The Register is maintained by the National Park Service under the Secretary of the Interior. It is used primarily as a planning tool in making decisions concerning the development of our communities to ensure, as much as possible, the preservation of buildings, sites, structures, and objects that are significant aspects of our cultural and historic heritage. Sometimes there are misunderstandings as to what listing in the National Register will mean for a property owner. The following is an outline of what it will do and what it will not do.

WILL DO

- The National Register provides recognition that the property is deemed by the
 federal and state governments to be significant in our history at the national, state,
 and/or local levels. Most properties are significant because of their local significance.
- The National Register identifies the properties that local, state, and federal planners should carefully consider when developing projects. Projects involving federal funding, permitting, licensing, or assistance and that may result in damage or loss of the historic values of a property that is listed in the National Register or is eligible for listing are reviewed by the State Historic Preservation Office and the federal Advisory Council on Historic Preservation. A similar review takes place under state law for state or state-assisted undertakings. A typical example of projects that are given such review is road construction or improvement. For more information, call the Compliance Review Section of the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation at (850) 245-6333.
- Listing may make a property eligible for a **Federal Income Tax Credit**. If a registered property that is income producing undergoes a substantial rehabilitation carried out according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the owner may apply for a 20% income tax credit. The credit amounts to 20% of the cost of the rehabilitation. For more information, contact the Architectural Preservation Services Section of the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation at (850) 245-6333.

- In 1992, the Florida Legislature passed legislation that allows counties or cities to grant ad valorem tax relief for owners of properties that are listed or eligible for listing in the National Register or in a local district. When a property is improved its value is increased and the assessment is raised accordingly. The ad valorem tax legislation provides that the increase in assessed value of the improved property will be exempted for up to 10 years from taxation for those portions of the tax bill affected by local option county or municipal exemption ordinances. This provision is available for both income and non-income producing properties. Contact your local property appraiser to see if this provision is available.
- Listing may make a property exempt from certain Federal Emergency Management
 Act (FEMA) requirements and eligible for some American Disabilities Act (ADA)
 and building safety code adjustments. For more information, call the Architectural
 Preservation Services Section of the Bureau of Historic Preservation at (850) 245-6333.
- Listing or being determined eligible for listing is not required for receiving **state preservation grants**. The competition for the grants is intense, however, and this official recognition adds weight to the argument that a property is significant and should be awarded a grant. For more information, call the Grants and Education Section of the Bureau of Historic Preservation at (850) 245-6333.

WILL NOT DO

- Listing in the National Register or being determined eligible for listing does not automatically preserve a building, and does not keep a property from being modified or even destroyed.
- Unless an undertaking is state or federally funded, or regulated by local ordinance, private property owners may deal with their property in any way they see fit. Architects in the Bureau of Historic Preservation are available to provide advice concerning the best ways to approach rehabilitation needs while maintaining the historic character of a property. For more information, call the Architectural Preservation Services Section at (850) 245-6333.
- Private owners are not required to open their listed property to the public for visitation.
- The federal and state governments will not attach restrictive covenants to a property or seek to acquire it because of its listing in the National Register.

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATION PROCEDURE

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF STATE - LAUREL M. LEE - SECRETARY OF STATE

The National Register of Historic Places is an official listing of sites and properties throughout the country that reflect the prehistoric occupation and historical development of our nation, states, and local communities. It is maintained by the Keeper of the National Register, National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior.

The nomination of historic resources in Florida for listing in the National Register is a function of the State Historic Preservation Officer, Florida Division of Historical Resources. Anyone interested in having a particular property listed may submit a nomination proposal to the State Historic Preservation Office. The nomination proposal must meet National Register standards. It is the responsibility of the person submitting the proposal to provide the necessary information and materials. The staff of the Division is available for consultation on preparation of proposals.

Upon receipt of a nomination proposal, the following procedures will be carried out.

- 1. The nomination proposal and all accompanying documentation will be evaluated by the professional staff of the Bureau of Historic Preservation. If possible, a staff member will visit the site as a part of the evaluation process.
- 2. The owner(s) of the property and the chief local elected officials will be notified in writing that the property is being proposed for nomination and given the opportunity to comment on the property.
- 3. The proposal will be submitted for consideration and recommendation by the Florida National Register Review Board which is charged with reviewing all nomination proposals to the National Register of Historic Places from the State of Florida.
- 4. Upon the favorable recommendation of the Review Board, a formal nomination will be prepared for the submission by the State Historic Preservation Officer to the Keeper of the National Register in Washington, D.C. Special procedures also exist for processing proposals when the Board and the State Historic Preservation Officer do not agree on the eligibility of the property for listing.
- 5. The Keeper of the National Register and his staff undertake the final review and make the final decision whether or not to list the property. If the owner of a private property objects to the nomination, the property will not be listed, but the site may be submitted to the Keeper of the National Register for a formal determination of eligibility for listing.
- 6. The owner is then notified in writing as to the final decision.

For further information about the National Register nomination process, please contact us at the address or phone number below.

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES CRITERIA FOR LISTING

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF STATE - LAUREL M. LEE - SECRETARY OF STATE

The *National Register of Historic Places* is an official listing of sites and properties throughout the United States that reflect the prehistoric occupation and historical development of our nation, states, and local communities. It is maintained by the Keeper of the National Register, National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior.

The following criteria are used by the State Historic Preservation Officer and the Keeper of the National Register in evaluating properties for eligibility for listing in the *National Register*.

Criteria for Evaluation:

- 1) Districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects may be considered to have significance in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and/or culture if they possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:
- a) are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; and/or
- b) are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; and/or
- embody the distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; and/or
- d) have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Criteria Considerations:

- 2) Ordinarily cemeteries, birthplaces, or graves of historical figures; properties owned by religious institutions or used for religious purposes; structures that have been moved from their original locations; reconstructed historic buildings; properties primarily commemorative in nature; and properties that have achieved significance within the past 50 years shall not be considered eligible for the *National Register*. However, such properties will qualify if they are integral parts of districts that do meet the criteria or if they fall within the following categories:
 - a) a religious property deriving its primary significance from architectural or artistic distinction or historical importance; or
 - b) a building or structure removed from its original location but which is significant primarily for architectural value, or which is the surviving structure most importantly associated with a historic person or event; or
 - c) a birthplace or grave of an historical figure of outstanding importance if there is no appropriate site or building directly associated with his productive life; or
 - d) a cemetery which derives its primary significance from graves of persons of transcendent importance, from age, distinctive design features, or association with historic events; or
 - e) a reconstructed building, when it is accurately executed in a suitable environment and

- presented in a dignified manner as part of a restoration master plan, and no other building or structure with the same association has survived; or
- f) a property primarily commemorative in intent, if design, age, tradition, or symbolic value has invested it with its own exceptional significance; or
- g) a property achieving significance within the past 50 years, if it is of exceptional importance.

For further information on the *National Register* criteria for listing, please contact us at the address or phone number below.