



12141 Wickchester Lane
Suite 200
Houston, TX 77079
TEL 713.491.8333
FAX 713.395.5486
www.GarverUSA.com

March 22, 2023

City of Bay City
1901 5th St
Bay City, Texas 77414

Re: City of Bay City
Bay City WWTP Improvements
Garver Project No. 20W09156
TWDB CWSRF Project No. 73896
Recommendation of Award

Dear Mr. Calhoun:

Garver recommends that LEM Construction be awarded the construction contract for the above referenced project at a construction contract value of \$28,775,000 based on a revised project scope.

Proposals were received for the "Bay City WWTP Improvements" project on September 29th, 2022. A total of two (2) proposals were received on the project. The proposals have been checked for accuracy and for compliance with the contract documents. A tabulation of the proposals received is enclosed with this letter.

Through the Competitive Sealed Proposal (CSP) process, the evaluation committee determined that LEM Construction submitted the best value proposal for the project. After LEM was notified as the apparent best value contractor, LEM, the Garver Design Team, and City Staff coordinated potential design optimizations and scope modifications to bring the project within the TWDB-Authorized budget. Garver anticipates modifying the Contract Documents to reflect the design optimization and scope modifications prior to issuance of LEM's Contractor Notice to Proceed.

Please call me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

GARVER, LLC

Dan Olson, P.E.
Project Manager

Attachments: Bid Tabulation

Bid Tabulation

Project	Bay City WWTP Improvements
Project No.	20W09156
Date of Bid	September 29, 2022

Cash Allowance		
Item No.	Description	Allowance
1	Pre-negotiated firm price for Screens and Washer/ Compactors	\$ 675,000
2	Pre-negotiated firm price for Submersible Pumps and Dry-Pit Submersible	\$ 443,000
Lump Sum for Cash Allowances		\$ 1,118,000
Contingency Allowance		
Item No.	Description	Allowance
1	Work Change Directives	\$ 1,000,000
2	Security/ Camera System	\$ 150,000
3	Power Company and other Utility Company Utility Work	\$ 250,000
4	Structural Repairs	\$ 300,000
5	Startup, Commissioning, and Additional Bypass	\$ 300,000
6	Office Furniture	\$ 200,000
7	Additional Field Trailer Equipment for Construction Observer	\$ 25,000
8	Temporary Power for Maintenance of Plant Operations	\$ 275,000
Lump Sum for Contingency Allowances		\$ 2,500,000
Flintco Industrial		LEM Construction

WWTP Improvement Base Proposal									
Item No.	Description	Quantity	Units	Unit Price	Price	Quantity	Units	Unit Price	Price
1	Offsite Cottonwood Lift Station Improvements	1	LS	\$ 1,038,700.00	\$ 1,038,700.00	1	LS	\$ 1,000,000.00	\$ 1,000,000.00
2	WWTP Improvements	1	LS	\$ 63,319,800.00	\$ 63,319,800.00	1	LS	\$ 51,900,000.00	\$ 51,900,000.00
3	Administration Building	1	LS	\$ 3,311,300.00	\$ 3,311,300.00	1	LS	\$ 3,400,000.00	\$ 3,400,000.00
4	Trench Safety	5000	LF	\$ 10.00	\$ 50,000.00	5000	LF	\$ 1.00	\$ 5,000.00
5	Additional 8-Hour Days of Vendor Training	10	Days	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 15,000.00	10	Days	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 25,000.00
6	Additional Removal and Disposal of Accumulated Solids	200	Wet tons	\$ 275.00	\$ 55,000.00	200	Wet tons	\$ 350.00	\$ 70,000.00
7	Concrete Crack Injection	2500	LF	\$ 62.00	\$ 155,000.00	2500	LF	\$ 60.00	\$ 150,000.00
8	Low Pressure Concrete Spray Mortar	5000	SF	\$ 17.00	\$ 85,000.00	5000	SF	\$ 17.00	\$ 85,000.00
9	High Pressure Water Blasting	5000	SF	\$ 1.00	\$ 5,000.00	5000	SF	\$ 1.00	\$ 5,000.00
WWTP Improvement Total Base Proposal Price				\$	68,034,800.00	\$			56,640,000.00

Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation Base Proposal									
Item No.	Description	Quantity	Units	Unit Price	Price	Quantity	Units	Unit Price	Price
1	Manhole Coating	500	VF	\$ 685.00	\$ 342,500.00	500	VF	\$ 460.00	\$ 230,000.00
2	Manhole Adjustment	7	EA	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 14,000.00	7	EA	\$ 1,100.00	\$ 7,700.00
3	36" CIPP Liner	2100	LF	\$ 272.00	\$ 571,200.00	2100	LF	\$ 320.00	\$ 672,000.00
4	30" CIPP Liner	1200	LF	\$ 232.00	\$ 278,400.00	1200	LF	\$ 270.00	\$ 324,000.00
5	27" CIPP Liner	1400	LF	\$ 215.00	\$ 301,000.00	1400	LF	\$ 210.00	\$ 294,000.00
6	36" Vinyl Ester CIPP Liner	950	LF	\$ 345.00	\$ 327,750.00	950	LF	\$ 450.00	\$ 427,500.00
7	30" Vinyl Ester CIPP Liner	120	LF	\$ 325.00	\$ 39,000.00	120	LF	\$ 610.00	\$ 73,200.00
8	Trench Safety	20	LF	\$ 150.00	\$ 3,000.00	20	LF	\$ 60.00	\$ 1,200.00
9	Open Cut Replace 20 LF of 27" RCP with 27" PVC-SDR 26	1	EA	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	1	EA	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00
10	Flow Management	1	LS	\$ 302,000.00	\$ 302,000.00	1	LS	\$ 615,000.00	\$ 615,000.00
11	Pre-Construction Video Documentation	5770	LF	\$ 12.50	\$ 72,125.00	5770	LF	\$ 15.00	\$ 86,550.00
12	Site Restoration	5770	LF	\$ 35.00	\$ 201,950.00	5770	LF	\$ 5.00	\$ 28,850.00
13	Asphalt Pavement Replacement Including Base and Subgrade	50	SY	\$ 350.00	\$ 17,500.00	50	SY	\$ 105.00	\$ 5,250.00
14	Concrete Pavement Replacement Including Base and Subgrade	12	SY	\$ 650.00	\$ 7,800.00	12	SY	\$ 205.00	\$ 2,460.00
15	Stabilized Construction Entrance	750	SY	\$ 90.00	\$ 67,500.00	750	SY	\$ 30.00	\$ 22,500.00
16	Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan	1	LS	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	1	LS	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00
17	Traffic Control Plan	1	LS	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	1	LS	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00
18	Dewatering Along Project Limits	1	LS	\$ 44,000.00	\$ 44,000.00	1	LS	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00
19	Manhole Drop (4")	3	EA	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 7,500.00	3	EA	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 15,000.00
20	Manhole Drop (8")	1	EA	\$ 4,500.00	\$ 4,500.00	1	EA	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00
21	Remove and Reinstall Fence	100	LF	\$ 40.00	\$ 4,000.00	100	LF	\$ 50.00	\$ 5,000.00
22	Mobilization	1	LS	\$ 75,000.00	\$ 75,000.00	1	LS	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00
23	Heavy Pipe Cleaning	5770	LF	\$ 12.50	\$ 72,125.00	5770	LF	\$ 15.00	\$ 86,550.00
24	Extra Polymer Concrete Manholes	2	EA	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 70,000.00	2	EA	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 40,000.00
Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation Total Base Proposal Price				\$	2,861,850.00	\$			3,192,760.00

WWTP Improvement Proposal Alternatives			
Alternative	Description	Alternate Price	Alternate Price
CWLS1	Cottonwood Lift Station Top Slab Replacement and Associated Upgrades	\$ 301,370.00	\$ 140,000.00
WW1	Deductive alternative for deletion of new Administration Building	\$ (3,311,300.00)	\$ (3,400,000.00)
WW2	Alternative to install PVC yard piping in lieu of ductile iron	Base Bid	No Bid
WW3	Alternative to install Centrifugally Cast Fiber Reinforced Polymer Mortar (CCFRPM) piping in lieu of ductile iron	No Bid	No Bid

Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation Proposal Alternates			
Alternative	Description	Alternate Price	Alternate Price
TS1	Deductive alternate to remove all Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation	\$ (2,861,850.00)	\$ (3,192,760.00)
TS2	Alternate to reduce Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation Scope	\$ (544,485.00)	\$ (1,171,550.00)

Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation Alternative No. 2 Proposal Price Items (TS2)									
Item No.	Description	Quantity	Units	Unit Price	Price	Quantity	Units	Unit Price	Price
1	Manhole Coating	30	VF	\$ 750.00	\$ 22,500.00	30	VF	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 45,000.00
2	Manhole Adjustment	3	LF	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	3	LF	\$ 1,200.00	\$ 3,600.00
3	30" CIPP Liner	350	LF	\$ 265.00	\$ 92,750.00	350	LF	\$ 720.00	\$ 252,000.00
4	27" CIPP Liner	620	LF	\$ 238.00	\$ 147,560.00	620	LF	\$ 520.00	\$ 322,400.00
5	Trench Safety	20	LF	\$ 150.00	\$ 3,000.00	20	LF	\$ 65.00	\$ 1,300.00
6	Open Cut Replace 20 LF of 27" RCP with 27" PVC-SDR 26	1	EA	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	1	EA	\$ 2,600.00	\$ 2,600.00
7	Flow Management	1	LS	\$ 94,000.00	\$ 94,000.00	1	LS	\$ 240,000.00	\$ 240,000.00
8	Pre-Construction Video Documentation	5770	LF	\$ 12.50	\$ 72,125.00	5770	LF	\$ 15.00	\$ 86,550.00
9	Site Restoration	970	LF	\$ 15.00	\$ 14,550.00	970	LF	\$ 10.00	\$ 9,700.00
10	Asphalt Pavement Replacement Including Base and Subgrade	15	SY	\$ 650.00	\$ 9,750.00	15	SY	\$ 110.00	\$ 1,650.00
11	Concrete Pavement Replacement Including Base and Subgrade	15	SY	\$ 650.00	\$ 9,750.00	15	SY	\$ 210.00	\$ 3,150.00
12	Stabilized Construction Entrance	120	LS	\$ 100.00	\$ 12,000.00	120	LS	\$ 30.00	\$ 3,600.00
13	Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan	1	LS	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 3,500.00	1	LS	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00
14	Traffic Control Plan	1	LS	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 3,500.00	1	LS	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00
15	Dewatering Along Project Limits	1	LS	\$ 14,000.00	\$ 14,000.00	1	LS	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00
16	Manhole Drop (4")	1	EA	\$ 4,500.00	\$ 4,500.00	1	EA	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00
17	Mobilization	1	LS	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	1	LS	\$ 140,000.00	\$ 140,000.00
Total Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation Alternate No. 2 (TS2) Proposal Price				\$	544,485.00	\$			1,171,550.00
Major Equipment Alternate Item									
Alternative	Description	Amount (Added/Deducted From Base Bid)			Amount (Added/Deducted From Base Bid)				
ME1	Lone Star Aeration Blowers				Base Bid		Base Bid		
ME1	Gardner Denver				No Bid		No Bid		
ME1	Continental	\$			157,890.00		\$	125,000.00	
ME2	WesTech				Base Bid		Base Bid		
ME2	Ovivo				No Bid		No Bid		
ME2	Walker Process	\$			495,130.00		\$	500,000.00	
ME3	Fournier				Base Bid		Base Bid		
ME3	Prime Solutions, Inc. (PSI)	\$			995,325.00		\$	1,050,000.00	
Overall Project Proposal Summary									
Base Proposal Component	Description	Proposal Total			Proposal Total				
5.01	Cash Allowances	\$			1,118,000.00		\$	1,118,000.00	
5.02	Contingency Allowances	\$			2,500,000.00		\$	2,500,000.00	
5.03	WWTP Improvements Base Proposal	\$			68,034,800.00		\$	56,640,000.00	
5.04	Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation	\$			2,861,860.00		\$	3,192,760.00	
Overall Project Base Proposal		\$			74,514,660.00		\$	63,450,760.00	
Adjustments for Alternates and Major Equipment Alternates									
Base Proposal Component	Description	Proposal Total		Accepted?	Proposal Total		Accepted?		
5.05 CWLS1	Adjustment for Alternate to perform Cottonwood LS Top Slab and Associated Repairs	\$	301,370.00		Yes	\$	140,000.00		Yes
5.05 WW1	Adjustment for Deletion of Administration Building	\$	(3,311,300.00)		Yes	\$	(3,400,000.00)		Yes
5.05 WW2	Adjustment for Alternate to install PVC yard piping in lieu of ductile iron	Base Bid		No	No Bid		No		
5.05 WW3	Adjustment for Alternate to install CCFRPM piping in lieu of ductile iron	No Bid		No	No Bid		No		
5.05 TS1	Adjustment for Deletion of Trunk Sewer Repairs	\$	(2,861,850.00)		Yes	\$	(3,192,760.00)		Yes
5.05 TS2	Adjustment, in combination with 5.05 TS1, for Modified Trunk Sewer Repair Scope	\$	(544,485.00)		No	\$	(1,171,550.00)		No
5.06 ME1	Adjustment for Alternate Blower/ Blower Control System Manufacturer from Base Proposal	\$	157,890.00		No	\$	125,000.00		No
5.06 ME2	Adjustment for Alternate Clarifier Mechanism Manufacturer from Base Proposal	\$	495,130.00		No	\$	500,000.00		No
5.06 ME3	Adjustment for Alternate Rotary Fan Press and Appurtenances from Base Proposal	\$	995,325.00		No	\$	1,050,000.00		No
Overall Project Adjusted Proposal		\$			68,642,880.00		\$	56,998,000.00	