

**RFP 23-278 Ancillary Benefits for Dental, Life/AD&D and Long Term Disability,
and Flexible Spending Account Insurance Services – Evaluation Sheet**
Stage 1 (55%)(Must have a raw score of 100 or higher and weighted score of 400 or higher to be considered further)

Factor	Points	General Description	Rating							Total Administrative Service (TASC) 2302 International Lane Madison, WI 53704
			Scale 0 (Low) to 5 (High)							
			Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield 740 W. Peachtree Street NW Atlanta, GA 30308	Humana Insurance Company 1100 Employers Boulevard De Pere, Wisconsin 54115	Delta Dental Insurance Company 1130 Sanctuary Parkway Alpharetta, GA 30009	Aflac Benefit Solutions 421 W. Boy Scout Blvd., Suite 295 Tampa, FL 33607	Metropolitan Life Insurance Company/ Met Life Consumer Services, Inc. 200 Park Avenue York, NY 10166	United Concordia Ins. Company 1800 Center Street, Suite 2B 220 Camp Hill, PA 17011	Standard Insurance Company 1100 SW 6th Avenue Portland, OR 97204	
Dental										
PROGRAM DESIGN	10	Ability to meet all RFP requirements	5.0	4.7	5.0	4.3	5.0	5.0	4.3	Non-Compliant
	10	Matched benefit plan designs	4.7	5.0	5.0	5.0	5.0	4.3	4.0	
	5	Creative/Innovative Solutions	4.4	2.7	3.2	2.7	3.5	3.7	4.3	
Points	25		14.1	12.3	13.2	12.0	13.5	13.0	12.7	
PLAN ADMINISTRATION AND SERVICES	4	Reporting capabilities	4.3	4.0	4.0	4.0	4.3	4.0	4.0	
	4	Claim processing service	3.7	4.3	4.3	0.7	4.3	4.3	1.0	
	4	Claim processing timeliness	4.3	4.3	4.3	0.7	4.0	4.0	3.3	
	4	Administration Processes	4.0	3.7	4.3	3.3	4.0	3.3	3.3	
	4	Service/performance guarantees	4.7	4.0	4.3	2.7	4.3	3.7	1.0	
	8	Account Management – Staff Level/Experience	4.3	5.0	5.0	2.7	5.0	4.7	3.7	
	8	Employee/Member Services	5.0	5.0	5.0	3.3	5.0	4.0	3.7	
	5	Administration Resources	4.7	3.3	4.3	2.3	4.3	4.3	2.7	
	5	Technological Capabilities	4.7	4.7	5.0	3.3	4.3	3.7	3.3	
	4	Communication materials	4.3	4.3	4.0	2.3	4.0	3.3	3.3	
Points	50		44.0	42.7	44.7	25.3	43.7	39.3	29.3	
PROSPECTIVE CONTRACTOR'S CREDENTIALS AND RESPONSIVENESS	8	Experience related to performance of requested services	5.0	4.7	5.0	2.3	5.3	5.0	4.0	
	5	Financial/Administrative Stability	4.3	3.7	4.0	3.3	4.7	3.7	3.7	
	3	RFP Quality/Completeness	3.7	3.7	3.7	2.3	3.7	3.7	2.7	
	4	Character, Reputation, References	3.0	3.7	3.7	2.3	4.0	4.3	1.0	
	5	Overall Value Proposition	4.0	3.7	4.7	2.7	4.3	3.7	2.7	
Points	25		20.0	19.3	21.0	13.0	22.0	20.3	14.0	
Total Phase 1	100		78.1	74.3	78.8	50.3	79.2	72.7	56.0	
Phase 2 (45%) (Must have a minimum weighted score of 400 in Stage 1 to be considered in Stage 2) (Interview Evaluation Criteria (Optional) Presentation and Q&A Response)										
Interview Evaluation and Fees	10	Presentation by Team (Optional)								
	5	Q&A Response to Panel Questions (Optional)								
		Lowest Cost/Fee/ Projected Savings. Proposal (10 points) Enclosed in a separate sealed envelope. Will NOT be disclosed in any part of the RFP								
	10	a. Lowest Cost/Fee – 10			5					
	6	b. Second 6						5		
	4	c. Third 4	5							
	2	d. Fourth 2					5			
1	a. Fifth 1		5							
Total Phase 2	25	Cumulative Total (Total Possible Score 125)	5.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	
Total Phase 1 and 2	125	The cumulative evaluation scores will be calculated utilizing the following percentage.	83.1	79.3	83.8	50.3	84.2	77.7	56.0	

Evaluator: Cumulative Date: 9/25/23

Procurement Department Representative: Nancy Williams

Procurement Department Completion Date: 9/25/23

**RFP 23-278 Ancillary Benefits for Dental, Life/AD&D and Long Term Disability,
and Flexible Spending Account Insurance Services – Evaluation Sheet**
Stage 1 (55%)(Must have a raw score of 100 or higher and weighted score of 400 or higher to be considered further)

Factor	Points	General Description	Weighted Scores							Total Administrative Service (TASC) 2302 International Lane Madison, WI 53704
			Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield 740 W. Peachtree Street NW Atlanta, GA 30308	Humana Insurance Company 1100 Employers Boulevard De Pere, Wisconsin 54115	Delta Dental Insurance Company 1130 Sanctuary Parkway Alpharetta, GA 30009	Aflac Benefit Solutions 421 W. Boy Scout Blvd., Suite 295 Tampa, FL 33607	Metropolitan Life Insurance Company/ Met Life Consumer Services, Inc. 200 Park Avenue York, NY 10166	United Concordia Ins. Company 1800 Center Street, Suite 2B 220 Camp Hill, PA 17011	Standard Insurance Company 1100 SW 6th Avenue Portland, OR 97204	
Dental										
PROGRAM DESIGN	10	Ability to meet all RFP requirements	50.0	46.7	50.0	43.3	50.0	50.0	43.3	Non-Compliant
	10	Matched benefit plan designs	46.7	50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0	43.3	40.0	
	5	Creative/Innovative Solutions	22.1	13.3	15.8	13.3	17.5	18.3	21.7	
Points	25		118.8	110.0	115.8	106.7	117.5	111.7	105.0	
PLAN ADMINISTRATION AND SERVICES	4	Reporting capabilities	17.3	16.0	16.0	16.0	17.3	16.0	16.0	
	4	Claim processing service	14.7	17.3	17.3	2.7	17.3	17.3	4.0	
	4	Claim processing timeliness	17.3	17.3	17.3	2.7	16.0	16.0	13.3	
	4	Administration Processes	16.0	14.7	17.3	13.3	16.0	13.3	13.3	
	4	Service/performance guarantees	18.7	16.0	17.3	10.7	17.3	14.7	4.0	
	8	Account Management – Staff Level/Experience	34.7	40.0	40.0	21.3	40.0	37.3	29.3	
	8	Employee/Member Services	40.0	40.0	40.0	26.7	40.0	32.0	29.3	
	5	Administration Resources	23.3	16.7	21.7	11.7	21.7	21.7	13.3	
	5	Technological Capabilities	23.3	23.3	25.0	16.7	21.7	18.3	16.7	
Points	50		222.7	218.7	228.0	131.0	223.3	200.0	152.7	
PROSPECTIVE CONTRACTOR'S CREDENTIALS AND RESPONSIVENESS	8	Experience related to performance of requested services	40.0	37.3	40.0	18.7	42.7	40.0	32.0	
	5	Financial/Administrative Stability	21.7	18.3	20.0	16.7	23.3	18.3	18.3	
	3	RFP Quality/Completeness	11.0	11.0	11.0	7.0	11.0	11.0	8.0	
	4	Character, Reputation, References	12.0	14.7	14.7	9.3	16.0	17.3	4.0	
	5	Overall Value Proposition	20.0	18.3	23.3	13.3	21.7	18.3	13.3	
Points	25		104.7	99.7	109.0	65.0	114.7	105.0	75.7	
Total Phase 1	100		446.1	428.3	452.8	302.7	455.5	416.7	333.3	
Phase 2 (45%) (Must have a minimum a minimum weighted score of 400 in Stage 1 to be considered in Stage 2) (Interview Evaluation Criteria (Optional) Presentation and Q&A Response)										
Interview Evaluation and Fees	10	Presentation by Team (Optional)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
	5	Q&A Response to Panel Questions (Optional)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
		Lowest Cost/Fee/ Projected Savings. Proposal (10 points) Enclosed in a separate sealed envelope. Will NOT be disclosed in any part of the RFP								
		a. Lowest Cost/Fee – 10	0	0	50	0	0	0	0	0
		b. Second 6	0	0	0	0	0	30	0	0
		c. Third 4	20	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	d. Fourth 2	0	0	0	0	10	0	0	0	
	a. Fifth 1	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Total Phase 2	25	Cumulative Total (Total Possible Score 125)	20.0	5.0	50.0	0.0	10.0	30.0	0.0	
Total Phase 1 and 2		The cumulative evaluation scores will be calculated utilizing the following percentage. Phase 1 is 55% and Phase 2 is 45% = Total possible score 331.25	254.3	237.8	271.6	166.5	255.0	242.7	183.3	

Evaluator: Cumulative Date: 9/25/23

Procurement Department Representative: Nancy Williams

Procurement Department Completion Date: 9/25/23