

| RFP 23-278 Ancillary Benefits for Dental, Life/AD&D and Long Term Disability, and Flexible Spending Account Insurance Services – Evaluation Sheet                                      |            |   |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
|--|------------|---|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|---|
| Stage 1 (55%)(Must have a raw score of 100 or higher and weighted score of 400 or higher to be considered further)   |            |   |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
| Factor   | Points     | General Description   | Rating   |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
|  |            |   | Scale 0 (Low) to 5 (High)  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
|  |            |   | Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield<br>740 W. Peachtree Street NW<br>Atlanta, GA 30308 | Humana Insurance Company<br>1100 Employers Boulevard<br>De Pere, Wisconsin 54115 | Delta Dental Insurance Company<br>1130 Sanctuary Parkway<br>Alpharetta, GA 30009 | Aflac Benefit Solutions<br>421 W. Boy Scout Blvd., Suite 295<br>Tampa, FL 33607 | Metropolitan Life Insurance Company/ Met Life Consumer Services, Inc.<br>200 Park AvenueYork, NY 10166 | United Concordia Ins. Company<br>1800 Center Street, Suite 2B 220<br>Camp Hill, PA 17011 | Standard Insurance Company<br>1100 SW 6th Avenue<br>Portland, OR 97204 | Total Administrative Service (TASC)<br>2302 International Lane<br>Madison, WI 53704 |
|  |            |   | Dental   |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
| PROGRAM DESIGN   | 10         | Ability to meet all RFP requirements  | 5.0  | 4.7  | 5.0  | 4.3   | 5.0  | 5.0  | 4.3  | Non-Compliant   |
|  | 10         | Matched benefit plan designs  | 4.7  | 5.0  | 5.0  | 5.0   | 5.0  | 4.3  | 4.0  |   |
|  | 5          | Creative/Innovative Solutions   | 4.4  | 2.7  | 3.2  | 2.7   | 3.5  | 3.7  | 4.3  |   |
| Points   | 25         |   | 14.1   | 12.3   | 13.2   | 12.0  | 13.5   | 13.0   | 12.7   |   |
| PLAN ADMINISTRATION AND SERVICES   | 4          | Reporting capabilities  | 4.3  | 4.0  | 4.0  | 4.0   | 4.3  | 4.0  | 4.0  |   |
|  | 4          | Claim processing service  | 3.7  | 4.3  | 4.3  | 0.7   | 4.3  | 4.3  | 1.0  |   |
|  | 4          | Claim processing timeliness   | 4.3  | 4.3  | 4.3  | 0.7   | 4.0  | 4.0  | 3.3  |   |
|  | 4          | Administration Processes  | 4.0  | 3.7  | 4.3  | 3.3   | 4.0  | 3.3  | 3.3  |   |
|  | 4          | Service/performance guarantees  | 4.7  | 4.0  | 4.3  | 2.7   | 4.3  | 3.7  | 1.0  |   |
|  | 8          | Account Management – Staff Level/Experience   | 4.3  | 5.0  | 5.0  | 2.7   | 5.0  | 4.7  | 3.7  |   |
|  | 8          | Employee/Member Services  | 5.0  | 5.0  | 5.0  | 3.3   | 5.0  | 4.0  | 3.7  |   |
|  | 5          | Administration Resources  | 4.7  | 3.3  | 4.3  | 2.3   | 4.3  | 4.3  | 2.7  |   |
|  | 5          | Technological Capabilities  | 4.7  | 4.7  | 5.0  | 3.3   | 4.3  | 3.7  | 3.3  |   |
|  | 4          | Communication materials   | 4.3  | 4.3  | 4.0  | 2.3   | 4.0  | 3.3  | 3.3  |   |
|  | Points     | 50  |  | 44.0   | 42.7   | 44.7  | 25.3   | 43.7   | 39.3   | 29.3  |
| PROSPECTIVE CONTRACTOR'S CREDENTIALS AND RESPONSIVENESS  | 8          | Experience related to performance of requested services   | 5.0  | 4.7  | 5.0  | 2.3   | 5.3  | 5.0  | 4.0  |   |
|  | 5          | Financial/Administrative Stability  | 4.3  | 3.7  | 4.0  | 3.3   | 4.7  | 3.7  | 3.7  |   |
|  | 3          | RFP Quality/Completeness  | 3.7  | 3.7  | 3.7  | 2.3   | 3.7  | 3.7  | 2.7  |   |
|  | 4          | Character, Reputation, References   | 3.0  | 3.7  | 3.7  | 2.3   | 4.0  | 4.3  | 1.0  |   |
|  | 5          | Overall Value Proposition   | 4.0  | 3.7  | 4.7  | 2.7   | 4.3  | 3.7  | 2.7  |   |
| Points   | 25         |   | 20.0   | 19.3   | 21.0   | 13.0  | 22.0   | 20.3   | 14.0   |   |
| Total Phase 1  | 100        |   | 78.1   | 74.3   | 78.8   | 50.3  | 79.2   | 72.7   | 56.0   |   |
| Phase 2 (45%)<br>(Must have a minimumminimum weighted score of 400 in Stage 1 to be considered in Stage 2)<br>(Interview Evaluation Criteria (Optional) Presentation and Q&A Response) |            |   |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
| Interview Evaluation and Fees  | 10         | Presentation by Team (Optional)   |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
|  | 5          | Q&A Response to Panel Questions (Optional)  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
|  |            | Lowest Cost/Fee/ Projected Savings. Proposal (10 points) Enclosed in a separate sealed envelope. Will NOT be disclosed in any part of the RFP |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
|  | 10         | a. Lowest Cost/Fee – 10   |  |  | 5  |   |  |  |  |   |
|  | 6          | b. Second 6   |  |  |  |   |  | 5  |  |   |
|  | 4          | c. Third 4  | 5  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
|  | 2          | d. Fourth 2   |  |  |  |   | 5  |  |  |   |
| 1  | a. Fifth 1 |   | 5  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
| Total Phase 2  | 25         | Cumulative Total (Total Possible Score 125)   | 5.0  | 5.0  | 5.0  | 0.0   | 5.0  | 5.0  | 0.0  |   |
| Total Phase 1 and 2  | 125        | The cumulative evaluation scores will be calculated utilizing the following percentage.   | 83.1   | 79.3   | 83.8   | 50.3  | 84.2   | 77.7   | 56.0   |   |
| Evaluator: Cumulative Date: 9/25/23  |            |   |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
| Procurement DepartmentRepresentative:____Nancy Williams_____   |            |   |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |
| Procurement Department Completion Date: 9/25/23  |            |   |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |

| RFP 23-278 Ancillary Benefits for Dental, Life/AD&D and Long Term Disability, and Flexible Spending Account Insurance Services – Evaluation Sheet   |         |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |
|---|---------|--|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|---|--|
| Stage 1 (55%)(Must have a raw score of 100 or higher and weighted score of 400 or higher to be considered further)  |         |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |
| Factor  | Points  | General Description  | Weighted Scores  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |
|   |         |  | Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield<br>740 W. Peachtree Street NW<br>Atlanta, GA 30308 | Humana Insurance Company<br>1100 Employers Boulevard<br>De Pere, Wisconsin 54115 | Delta Dental Insurance Company<br>1130 Sanctuary Parkway<br>Alpharetta, GA 30009 | Aflac Benefit Solutions<br>421 W. Boy Scout Blvd., Suite 295<br>Tampa, FL 33607 | Metropolitan Life Insurance Company/ Met Life Consumer Services, Inc.<br>200 Park AvenueYork, NY 10166 | United Concordia Ins. Company<br>1800 Center Street, Suite 2B 220<br>Camp Hill, PA 17011 | Standard Insurance Company<br>1100 SW 6th Avenue<br>Portland, OR 97204 | Total Administrative Service (TASC)<br>2302 International Lane<br>Madison, WI 53704 |  |
|   |         |  | Dental   |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |
| PROGRAM DESIGN  | 10      | Ability to meet all RFP requirements   | 50.0   | 46.7   | 50.0   | 43.3  | 50.0   | 50.0   | 43.3   | Non-Compliant   |  |
|   | 10      | Matched benefit plan designs   | 46.7   | 50.0   | 50.0   | 50.0  | 50.0   | 43.3   | 40.0   |   |  |
|   | 5       | Creative/Innovative Solutions  | 22.1   | 13.3   | 15.8   | 13.3  | 17.5   | 18.3   | 21.7   |   |  |
| Points  | 25      |  | 118.8  | 110.0  | 115.8  | 106.7   | 117.5  | 111.7  | 105.0  |   |  |
| PLAN ADMINISTRATION AND SERVICES  | 4       | Reporting capabilities   | 17.3   | 16.0   | 16.0   | 16.0  | 17.3   | 16.0   | 16.0   |   |  |
|   | 4       | Claim processing service   | 14.7   | 17.3   | 17.3   | 2.7   | 17.3   | 17.3   | 4.0  |   |  |
|   | 4       | Claim processing timeliness  | 17.3   | 17.3   | 17.3   | 2.7   | 16.0   | 16.0   | 13.3   |   |  |
|   | 4       | Administration Processes   | 16.0   | 14.7   | 17.3   | 13.3  | 16.0   | 13.3   | 13.3   |   |  |
|   | 4       | Service/performance guarantees   | 18.7   | 16.0   | 17.3   | 10.7  | 17.3   | 14.7   | 4.0  |   |  |
|   | 8       | Account Management – Staff Level/Experience  | 34.7   | 40.0   | 40.0   | 21.3  | 40.0   | 37.3   | 29.3   |   |  |
|   | 8       | Employee/Member Services   | 40.0   | 40.0   | 40.0   | 26.7  | 40.0   | 32.0   | 29.3   |   |  |
|   | 5       | Administration Resources   | 23.3   | 16.7   | 21.7   | 11.7  | 21.7   | 21.7   | 13.3   |   |  |
|   | 5       | Technological Capabilities   | 23.3   | 23.3   | 25.0   | 16.7  | 21.7   | 18.3   | 16.7   |   |  |
|   | 4       | Communication materials  | 17.3   | 17.3   | 16.0   | 9.3   | 16.0   | 13.3   | 13.3   |   |  |
| Points  | 50      |  | 222.7  | 218.7  | 228.0  | 131.0   | 223.3  | 200.0  | 152.7  |   |  |
| PROSPECTIVE CONTRACTOR'S CREDENTIALS AND RESPONSIVENESS   | 8       | Experience related to performance of requested services  | 40.0   | 37.3   | 40.0   | 18.7  | 42.7   | 40.0   | 32.0   |   |  |
|   | 5       | Financial/Administrative Stability   | 21.7   | 18.3   | 20.0   | 16.7  | 23.3   | 18.3   | 18.3   |   |  |
|   | 3       | RFP Quality/Completeness   | 11.0   | 11.0   | 11.0   | 7.0   | 11.0   | 11.0   | 8.0  |   |  |
|   | 4       | Character, Reputation, References  | 12.0   | 14.7   | 14.7   | 9.3   | 16.0   | 17.3   | 4.0  |   |  |
|   | 5       | Overall Value Proposition  | 20.0   | 18.3   | 23.3   | 13.3  | 21.7   | 18.3   | 13.3   |   |  |
| Points  | 25      |  | 104.7  | 99.7   | 109.0  | 65.0  | 114.7  | 105.0  | 75.7   |   |  |
| Total Phase 1   | 100     |  | 446.1  | 428.3  | 452.8  | 302.7   | 455.5  | 416.7  | 333.3  |   |  |
| Phase 2 (45%)<br>(Must have a minimum a minimum weighted score of 400 in Stage 1 to be considered in Stage 2)<br>(Interview Evaluation Criteria (Optional) Presentation and Q&A Response) |         |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |
| Interview Evaluation and Fees   | 10      | Presentation by Team (Optional)  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0  | 0  |   |  |
|   | 5       | Q&A Response to Panel Questions (Optional)   | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0  | 0  |   |  |
|   |         | Lowest Cost/Fee/ Projected Savings. Proposal (10 points) <b>Enclosed in a separate sealed envelope.</b> Will NOT be disclosed in any part of the RFP       |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |
|   |         | a.   | Lowest Cost/Fee – 10   | 0  | 0  | 50  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0   |  |
|   |         | b.   | Second 6   | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0  | 30   | 0   |  |
|   |         | c.   | Third 4  | 20   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0   |  |
|   |         | d.   | Fourth 2   | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0  | 10   | 0  | 0   |  |
| a.  | Fifth 1 | 0  | 5  | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0  |  |   |  |
| Total Phase 2   | 25      | Cumulative Total (Total Possible Score 125)  | 20.0   | 5.0  | 50.0   | 0.0   | 10.0   | 30.0   | 0.0  |   |  |
| Total Phase 1 and 2   |         | The cumulative evaluation scores will be calculated utilizing the following percentage.<br>Phase 1 is 55% and Phase 2 is 45% = Total possible score 331.25 | 254.3  | 237.8  | 271.6  | 166.5   | 255.0  | 242.7  | 183.3  |   |  |
| Evaluator: Cumulative Date: 9/25/23   |         |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |
| Procurement DepartmentRepresentative: __Nancy Williams_____   |         |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |
| Procurement Department Completion Date: 9/25/23   |         |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |   |  |