

RFP No. 2023-09 Construction Manager at Risk - Rating Sheet

Name of Respondent: Butler - Cohen Design

Date of Ranking: 12/04/2023

Evaluator's Name: Evaluator 1

Rate the Respondent of the RFP by awarding points up to the maximum listed for each factor.

Firm Financial Capability

Factors

1. Current assets and liabilities
2. Capital Accounts and retained earnings (e.g. capital, stock etc)

	Max Pts	
	5	<u>5</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>10</u>	<u>10</u>

Qualifications of Project Team

Factors

1. Ability to develop accurate estimates and schedules
2. Staff level/Adequacy of Resources
3. Competence and skills of leading large projects
4. Completing projects within approved construction budget

	Max Pts	
	10	<u>10</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
	10	<u>10</u>
Subtotal	<u>30</u>	<u>30</u>

Ability to Establish Budgets and Control Costs

Factors

1. Ability to effectively administer project controls and processes
2. Experience/ability to manage scope/budget

	Max Pts	
	10	<u>10</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>15</u>	<u>15</u>

Relevant Experience as a CMAR

Factors

1. Extent of experience in project construction management
2. The concept for the disposition of savings during construction.
3. A strategy that assures pricing is consistent with the market.
4. Past projects completed on schedule

	Max Pts	
	10	<u>10</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
	10	<u>10</u>
Subtotal	<u>30</u>	<u>30</u>

Safety Records

Factors

1. Firm's safety risks and its approach to eliminating construction accidents.

	Max Pts	
	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>5</u>	<u>5</u>

References

Factors

1. Feedback from past clients on municipal/public projects.

	Max Pts	
	5	5
Subtotal	5	5

Relevant Experience in Angleton

Factors

1. Has worked on projects that were located in the City of Angleton.

	Max Pts	
	5	—
Subtotal	5	—

Factors

Firm Financial Capability

Qualifications of Project Team

Ability to Establish Budget and Control Costs

Relevant Experience as a CMAR

Safety Records

References

Relevant Experience in Angleton

Total Score

	Max Pts	Score
Firm Financial Capability	10	10
Qualifications of Project Team	30	30
Ability to Establish Budget and Control Costs	15	15
Relevant Experience as a CMAR	30	30
Safety Records	5	5
References	5	5
Relevant Experience in Angleton	5	—
Total Score	100	95

Notes:

1) 10,000
2) 3.25

70/30 savings

Founded 2014

Experience 10 yrs, 40 yrs

CMAR ✓

Presentation Very Well Done

RFP No. 2023-09 Construction Manager at Risk - Rating Sheet

Name of Respondent: Butler - Cohen Design

Date of Ranking: 12/04/2023

Evaluator's Name: Evaluator 2

Rate the Respondent of the RFP by awarding points up to the maximum listed for each factor.

Firm Financial Capability

Factors

1. Current assets and liabilities
2. Capital Accounts and retained earnings (e.g. capital, stock etc)

	Max Pts		
	5	<u>5</u>	
	5	<u>5</u>	
Subtotal	<u>10</u>	<u>10</u>	

Qualifications of Project Team

Factors

1. Ability to develop accurate estimates and schedules
2. Staff level/Adequacy of Resources
3. Competence and skills of leading large projects
4. Completing projects within approved construction budget

	Max Pts		
	10	<u>10</u>	
	5	<u>5</u>	
	5	<u>5</u>	
	<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	
Subtotal	30	<u>28</u>	

Ability to Establish Budgets and Control Costs

Factors

1. Ability to effectively administer project controls and processes
2. Experience/ability to manage scope/budget

	Max Pts		
	10	<u>10</u>	
	5	<u>5</u>	
Subtotal	<u>15</u>	<u>15</u>	

Relevant Experience as a CMAR

Factors

1. Extent of experience in project construction management
2. The concept for the disposition of savings during construction.
3. A strategy that assures pricing is consistent with the market.
4. Past projects completed on schedule

	Max Pts		
	10	<u>8</u>	
	5	<u>3</u>	
	5	<u>5</u>	
	<u>10</u>	<u>10</u>	
Subtotal	30	<u>26</u>	

Safety Records

Factors

1. Firm's safety risks and its approach to eliminating construction accidents.

	Max Pts		
	5	<u>5</u>	
Subtotal	<u>5</u>	<u>5</u>	

References

Factors

1. Feedback from past clients on municipal/public projects.

	Max Pts	
	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>5</u>	<u>5</u>

Relevant Experience in Angleton

Factors

1. Has worked on projects that were located in the City of Angleton.

	Max Pts	
	5	<u>0</u>
Subtotal	<u>5</u>	<u>0</u>

Factors

	Max Pts	Score
Firm Financial Capability	10	<u>10</u>
Qualifications of Project Team	30	<u>28</u>
Ability to Establish Budget and Control Costs	15	<u>13</u>
Relevant Experience as a CMAR	30	<u>26</u>
Safety Records	5	<u>5</u>
References	5	<u>5</u>
Relevant Experience in Angleton	5	<u>0</u>
Total Score	<u>100</u>	<u>89</u>

Notes: 9 yrs old, CM only

\$10K + 3.25% * split ??

RFP No. 2023-09 Construction Manager at Risk - Rating Sheet

Name of Respondent: Butler - Cohen Design

Date of Ranking: 12/04/2023

Evaluator's Name: Evaluator 3

Rate the Respondent of the RFP by awarding points up to the maximum listed for each factor.

Firm Financial Capability

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Current assets and liabilities	5	<u>5</u>
2. Capital Accounts and retained earnings (e.g. capital, stock etc)	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	10	<u>10</u>

Qualifications of Project Team

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Ability to develop accurate estimates and schedules	10	<u>10</u>
2. Staff level/Adequacy of Resources	5	<u>5</u>
3. Competence and skills of leading large projects	5	<u>5</u>
4. Completing projects within approved construction budget	10	<u>10</u>
Subtotal	30	<u>30</u>

Ability to Establish Budgets and Control Costs

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Ability to effectively administer project controls and processes	10	<u>10</u>
2. Experience/ability to manage scope/budget	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	15	<u>15</u>

Relevant Experience as a CMAR

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Extent of experience in project construction management	10	<u>10</u>
2. The concept for the disposition of savings during construction.	5	<u>4</u>
3. A strategy that assures pricing is consistent with the market.	5	<u>5</u>
4. Past projects completed on schedule	10	<u>10</u>
Subtotal	30	<u>29</u>

Safety Records

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Firm's safety risks and its approach to eliminating construction accidents.	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	5	<u>5</u>

References

Factors

1. Feedback from past clients on municipal/public projects.

	Max Pts	
	5	5
Subtotal	5	5

Relevant Experience in Angleton

Factors

1. Has worked on projects that were located in the City of Angleton.

	Max Pts	
	5	4
Subtotal	5	4

Factors

Firm Financial Capability

Max Pts	Score
10	10

Qualifications of Project Team

30	30
----	----

Ability to Establish Budget and Control Costs

15	15
----	----

Relevant Experience as a CMAR

30	30
----	----

Safety Records

5	5
---	---

References

5	5
---	---

Relevant Experience in Angleton

5	4
---	---

Total Score

100	98 99
------------	------------------

Notes: Best safety record / larger company / more experience

RFP No. 2023-09 Construction Manager at Risk - Rating Sheet

Name of Respondent: Butler - Cohen Design

Date of Ranking: 12/04/2023

Evaluator's Name: Evaluator 4

Rate the Respondent of the RFP by awarding points up to the maximum listed for each factor.

Firm Financial Capability

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Current assets and liabilities	5	<u>4</u>
2. Capital Accounts and retained earnings (e.g. capital, stock etc)	5	<u>4</u>
Subtotal	<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>

Qualifications of Project Team

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Ability to develop accurate estimates and schedules	10	<u>10</u>
2. Staff level/Adequacy of Resources	5	<u>4</u>
3. Competence and skills of leading large projects	5	<u>4</u>
4. Completing projects within approved construction budget	10	<u>9</u>
Subtotal	<u>30</u>	<u>27</u>

Ability to Establish Budgets and Control Costs

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Ability to effectively administer project controls and processes	10	<u>10</u>
2. Experience/ability to manage scope/budget	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>15</u>	<u>15</u> good

Relevant Experience as a CMAR

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Extent of experience in project construction management	10	<u>9</u>
2. The concept for the disposition of savings during construction.	5	<u>5</u>
3. A strategy that assures pricing is consistent with the market.	5	<u>5</u>
4. Past projects completed on schedule	10	<u>10</u>
Subtotal	<u>30</u>	<u>29</u> good

Safety Records

Factors

	Max Pts	
1. Firm's safety risks and its approach to eliminating construction accidents.	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>5</u>	<u>5</u>

References

Factors

1. Feedback from past clients on municipal/public projects.

	Max Pts	
	<u>5</u>	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	5	<u>5</u>

Relevant Experience in Angleton

Factors

1. Has worked on projects that were located in the City of Angleton.

	Max Pts	
	<u>5</u>	<u>0</u>
Subtotal	5	<u>0</u>

Factors

Firm Financial Capability

Max Pts	Score
10	<u>8</u>

Qualifications of Project Team

30	<u>27</u>
----	-----------

Ability to Establish Budget and Control Costs

15	<u>15</u>
----	-----------

Relevant Experience as a CMAR

30	<u>29</u>
----	-----------

Safety Records

5	<u>5</u>
---	----------

References

5	<u>5</u>
---	----------

Relevant Experience in Angleton

<u>5</u>	<u>0</u>
----------	----------

Total Score

<u>100</u>	<u>89</u>
------------	-----------

Notes:

RFP No. 2023-09 Construction Manager at Risk - Rating Sheet

Name of Respondent: Butler - Cohen Design

Date of Ranking: 12/04/2023

Evaluator's Name: Evaluator 5

Rate the Respondent of the RFP by awarding points up to the maximum listed for each factor.

Firm Financial Capability

Factors

1. Current assets and liabilities
2. Capital Accounts and retained earnings (e.g. capital, stock etc)

	Max Pts	
	5	<u>5</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>10</u>	<u>10</u>

Qualifications of Project Team

Factors

1. Ability to develop accurate estimates and schedules
2. Staff level/Adequacy of Resources
3. Competence and skills of leading large projects
4. Completing projects within approved construction budget

	Max Pts	
	10	<u>5</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
	5	<u>5</u>
	10	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>30</u>	<u>20</u>

Ability to Establish Budgets and Control Costs

Factors

1. Ability to effectively administer project controls and processes
2. Experience/ability to manage scope/budget

	Max Pts	
	10	<u>5</u>
	5	<u>3</u>
Subtotal	<u>15</u>	<u>8</u>

Relevant Experience as a CMAR

Factors

1. Extent of experience in project construction management
2. The concept for the disposition of savings during construction.
3. A strategy that assures pricing is consistent with the market.
4. Past projects completed on schedule

	Max Pts	
	10	<u>10</u>
	5	<u>3</u>
	5	<u>1</u>
	10	<u>0</u>
Subtotal	<u>30</u>	<u>14</u>

Safety Records

Factors

1. Firm's safety risks and its approach to eliminating construction accidents.

	Max Pts	
	5	<u>5</u>
Subtotal	<u>5</u>	<u>5</u>

References

Factors

1. Feedback from past clients on municipal/public projects.

	Max Pts	
	5	<u>4</u>
Subtotal	5	<u>4</u>

Relevant Experience in Angleton

Factors

1. Has worked on projects that were located in the City of Angleton.

	Max Pts	
	5	<u>0</u>
Subtotal	5	<u>0</u>

Factors

	Max Pts	Score
Firm Financial Capability	10	<u>10</u> -
Qualifications of Project Team	30	<u>20</u> -
Ability to Establish Budget and Control Costs	15	<u>8</u> -
Relevant Experience as a CMAR	30	<u>14</u> -
Safety Records	5	<u>5</u> -
References	5	<u>4</u> -
Relevant Experience in Angleton	5	<u>0</u> -
Total Score	<u>100</u>	<u>61</u>

Notes: * LOWEST % FOR CONSTRUCTION COSTS

* HIGHEST PERCENTAGE PUT FOR SCUMERS (70/30) PAST MERIT IF NO STUMERS ARE REALIZED

* LOWEST PRECONSTRUCTION FEE \$19000

* VERY YOUNG COMPANY

* LONG & SHORT-TERM STAFF FOR CITY PROJECT OVERNIGHT (2015 & 2017)

* PROFESSIONAL PRESENTATION

* NO PENDING LEGAL ACTION