

# Evaluator No. 1



## Audit Proposal Evaluation Matrix

This tool can assist in evaluating the various proposals from CPA firms interested in performing your audit engagement. Keep in mind that low cost should not overshadow value and audit quality. This tool is customizable, so add or delete criteria based on your organization's unique needs.

### Step 1: Grade the various criteria outlined in the proposal. Assign points based on the range recommended.

Proposal Criteria		Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
<b>Approach to Audit Quality</b>		<b>25 points max</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>24</b>	
	The proposal outlines an audit approach that is tailored based on obtaining an understanding of the organization's activities, operating systems, personnel and special needs.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal indicates an audit approach that is tailored based on the firm's advanced understanding of your organization's industry.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal outlines the firm's processes for ensuring an efficient and effective audit process.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal showcases the firm's commitment to providing quality audit services by voluntarily adhering to higher standards of audit quality. This is evidenced by sharing their current unqualified peer review report resulting from the American Institute of CPAs external peer review process.	0-5	5	0	5	4 (2021)	
	The proposal indicates the firm is a dedicated member of one or more of the following firm-based voluntary membership quality centers for firms that perform audits: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• AICPA Center for Audit Quality</li> <li>• AICPA Private Companies Practice Center (PCPS)</li> <li>• AICPA Governmental Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPS Employee Benefit Plan Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPA PCPS Center for Plain English Accounting</li> </ul>	0-5	4	4	5	5	
<b>Team Knowledge and Experience</b>		<b>30 points max</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>28</b>	
	The proposal highlights the firms commitment to professional training and staff continuity.	0-5	4	2	5	4	
	The proposal outlines qualifications, industry experience, licenses and strengths for all partners.	0-5	3	4	4	4	
	The proposal specifies the strengths of assigned team members as well as their years of prior experience in the particular industry and type of engagement.	0-5	4	3	5	5	
	The proposal identifies how the firm will comply with applicable industry reporting regulations, if applicable	0-5	5	5	5	5	



Proposal Criteria		Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
	The proposal provides the firm's background, client base, licensing information and years in business.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	If the firm does not have relevant experience in your particular industry, the proposal specifies that the firm has identified a firm with the applicable expertise/specialty to affiliate with to assist with this engagement and provides the affiliate firm's qualifications, background and experience.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
<b>Unique Qualifications</b>		<b>10 points max</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>3</b>	
	The proposal conveys a positive and confident feeling derived from the firm's business beliefs, communication practices and unique qualifications of which lays the foundation for a trusted relationship.	0-10	5	5	5	3	
<b>Value Added Services</b>		<b>10 points max</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>2</b>	
	The proposal provides a listing of additional value added services the firm provides beyond the audit engagement. (e.g. proactively monitor and communicate topics relevant to your financial and business operations all year long that may impact your future success)	0-5	1	2	3	0	
	It is evident that the firm understands our business and our challenges. The firm is committed to being our business advisor, beyond the audit engagement	0-5	3	2	5	2	
<b>Scope and Pricing of the Engagement</b>		<b>25 points max</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>20</b>	
	The proposal clearly provides a framework for the scope, timing, steps and resources to complete the engagement.	0-5	3	5	3	3	
X	The proposal specifies the price for the engagement and how it will be billed.	0-5	5	<del>5</del>	5	5	
Y	The proposal specifies fees to be paid to specialists for the engagement (if any).	0-5	5	<del>5</del>	5	5	
	The proposal addresses all items requested by us whether verbally or in the RFP	0-5	2	2	3	2	
Y	The proposed fee is reasonable based on the experience, unique value and knowledge the firm brings to the engagement.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
<b>Total Points</b>		<b>100</b>	<b>79</b>	<b>74</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>78</b>	

**Step 2: Based on the above grading, document your decision to award the engagement to the proposal with the highest points.**



# Evaluator No. 2



## Audit Proposal Evaluation Matrix

This tool can assist in evaluating the various proposals from CPA firms interested in performing your audit engagement. Keep in mind that low cost should not overshadow value and audit quality. This tool is customizable, so add or delete criteria based on your organization's unique needs.

### Step 1: Grade the various criteria outlined in the proposal. Assign points based on the range recommended.

Proposal Criteria		Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
<b>Approach to Audit Quality</b>		<b>25 points max</b>	<b>23</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>21</b>	
The proposal outlines an audit approach that is tailored based on obtaining an understanding of the organization's activities, operating systems, personnel and special needs.	0-5	4	4	4	4		
The proposal indicates an audit approach that is tailored based on the firm's advanced understanding of your organization's industry.	0-5	4	4	4	4		
The proposal outlines the firm's processes for ensuring an efficient and effective audit process.	0-5	5	4	4	4	<del>B</del>	
The proposal showcases the firm's commitment to providing quality audit services by voluntarily adhering to higher standards of audit quality. This is evidenced by sharing their current unqualified peer review report resulting from the American Institute of CPAs external peer review process.	0-5	5	4	4	4		
The proposal indicates the firm is a dedicated member of one or more of the following firm-based voluntary membership quality centers for firms that perform audits: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• AICPA Center for Audit Quality</li> <li>• AICPA Private Companies Practice Center (PCPS)</li> <li>• AICPA Governmental Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPS Employee Benefit Plan Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPA/PCPS Center for Plain English Accounting</li> </ul>	0-5	5	4	4	5		
<b>Team Knowledge and Experience</b>		<b>30 points max</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>26</b>	
The proposal highlights the firms commitment to professional training and staff continuity.	0-5	5	5	4	5		
The proposal outlines qualifications, industry experience, licenses and strengths for all partners.	0-5	4	5	4	5		
The proposal specifies the strengths of assigned team members as well as their years of prior experience in the particular industry and type of engagement.	0-5	4	5	4	4		
The proposal identifies how the firm will comply with applicable industry reporting regulations, if applicable	0-5	4	4	4	4		



Proposal Criteria		Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
	The proposal provides the firm's background, client base, licensing information and years in business.	0-5	4	5	4	4	
	If the firm does not have relevant experience in your particular industry, the proposal specifies that the firm has identified a firm with the applicable expertise/specialty to affiliate with to assist with this engagement and provides the affiliate firm's qualifications, background and experience.	0-5	5	5	4	4	
<b>Unique Qualifications</b>		<b>10 points max</b>	9	9	8	8	
	The proposal conveys a positive and confident feeling derived from the firm's business beliefs, communication practices and unique qualifications of which lays the foundation for a trusted relationship.	0-10	9	9	8	8	GOOD PORTAL / TECHNICAL ACCESS AT UPRAVER
<b>Value Added Services</b>		<b>10 points max</b>	10	6	8	6	
	The proposal provides a listing of additional value added services the firm provides beyond the audit engagement. (e.g. proactively monitor and communicate topics relevant to your financial and business operations all year long that may impact your future success)	0-5	5	3	4	3	SOME WERE NOT OBVIOUS BEYOND THE AUDIT.
	It is evident that the firm understands our business and our challenges. The firm is committed to being our business advisor, beyond the audit engagement	0-5	5	3	4	3	
<b>Scope and Pricing of the Engagement</b>		<b>25 points max</b>	25	25	25	25	
	The proposal clearly provides a framework for the scope, timing, steps and resources to complete the engagement.	0-5	5	5	5	5	N/A
	The proposal specifies the price for the engagement and how it will be billed.	0-5	5	5	5	5	N/A
	The proposal specifies fees to be paid to specialists for the engagement (if any).	0-5	5	5	5	5	N/A
	The proposal addresses all items requested by us whether verbally or in the RFP	0-5	5	5	5	5	N/A
	The proposed fee is reasonable based on the experience, unique value and knowledge the firm brings to the engagement.	0-5	5	5	10	5	N/A
<b>Total Points</b>		<b>100 *</b>	93	89	85	86	

**Step 2: Based on the above grading, document your decision to award the engagement to the proposal with the highest points.**



# Audit Proposal Evaluation Matrix

## Evaluator No. 3



This tool can assist in evaluating the various proposals from CPA firms interested in performing your audit engagement. Keep in mind that low cost should not overshadow value and audit quality. This tool is customizable, so add or delete criteria based on your organization's unique needs.

### Step 1: Grade the various criteria outlined in the proposal. Assign points based on the range recommended.

Proposal Criteria		Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks - Watson	Comments
<b>Approach to Audit Quality</b>		<b>25 points max</b>	19	20	17	20	
The proposal outlines an audit approach that is tailored based on obtaining an understanding of the organization's activities, operating systems, personnel and special needs.	0-5	4	4	3	4		
The proposal indicates an audit approach that is tailored based on the firm's advanced understanding of your organization's industry.	0-5	4	5	5	4		
The proposal outlines the firm's processes for ensuring an efficient and effective audit process.	0-5	5	5	5	5		
The proposal showcases the firm's commitment to providing quality audit services by voluntarily adhering to higher standards of audit quality. This is evidenced by sharing their current unqualified peer review report resulting from the American Institute of CPAs external peer review process.	0-5	4	5	3	4		
The proposal indicates the firm is a dedicated member of one or more of the following firm-based voluntary membership quality centers for firms that perform audits: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• AICPA Center for Audit Quality</li> <li>• AICPA Private Companies Practice Center (PCPS)</li> <li>• AICPA Governmental Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPS Employee Benefit Plan Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPA/PCPS Center for Plain English Accounting</li> </ul>	0-5	2	1	1	3		
<b>Team Knowledge and Experience</b>		<b>30 points max</b>	30	20	24	30	
The proposal highlights the firms commitment to professional training and staff continuity.	0-5	5	1	5	5		
The proposal outlines qualifications, industry experience, licenses and strengths for all partners.	0-5	5	4	3	5		
The proposal specifies the strengths of assigned team members as well as their years of prior experience in the particular industry and type of engagement.	0-5	5	2	3	5		
The proposal identifies how the firm will comply with applicable industry reporting regulations, if applicable	0-5	5	4	4	5		



Proposal Criteria		Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
	The proposal provides the firm's background, client base, licensing information and years in business.	0-5	5	4	4	5	
	If the firm does not have relevant experience in your particular industry, the proposal specifies that the firm has identified a firm with the applicable expertise/specialty to affiliate with to assist with this engagement and provides the affiliate firm's qualifications, background and experience.	0-5	<del>4</del> 5	5	5	5	
<b>Unique Qualifications</b>		<b>10 points max</b>	10	7	6	10	
	The proposal conveys a positive and confident feeling derived from the firm's business beliefs, communication practices and unique qualifications of which lays the foundation for a trusted relationship.	0-10	10	7	6	10	Belt wrong mayor @ research
<b>Value Added Services</b>		<b>10 points max</b>	10	5	2	8	
	The proposal provides a listing of additional value added services the firm provides beyond the audit engagement. (e.g. proactively monitor and communicate topics relevant to your financial and business operations all year long that may impact your future success)	0-5	5	3	0	4	0 - None noted
	It is evident that the firm understands our business and our challenges. The firm is committed to being our business advisor, beyond the audit engagement	0-5	5	2	2	4	Didn't seem strong + outside support
<b>Scope and Pricing of the Engagement</b>		<b>25 points max</b>	25	24	23	25	
	The proposal clearly provides a framework for the scope, timing, steps and resources to complete the engagement.	0-5	5	4	3	5	
✓	The proposal specifies the price for the engagement and how it will be billed.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
✓	The proposal specifies fees to be paid to specialists for the engagement (if any).	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal addresses all items requested by us whether verbally or in the RFP	0-5	5	5	5	5	
-	The proposed fee is reasonable based on the experience, unique value and knowledge the firm brings to the engagement.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
<b>Total Points</b>		<b>100</b>	94 ✓	<del>100</del> 76	72	93	

**Step 2: Based on the above grading, document your decision to award the engagement to the proposal with the highest points.**



# Evaluator No. 4



## Audit Proposal Evaluation Matrix

This tool can assist in evaluating the various proposals from CPA firms interested in performing your audit engagement. Keep in mind that low cost should not overshadow value and audit quality. This tool is customizable, so add or delete criteria based on your organization's unique needs.

### Step 1: Grade the various criteria outlined in the proposal. Assign points based on the range recommended.

Proposal Criteria	Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
<b>Approach to Audit Quality</b>	<b>25 points max</b>	24	25	25	25	
The proposal outlines an audit approach that is tailored based on obtaining an understanding of the organization's activities, operating systems, personnel and special needs.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
The proposal indicates an audit approach that is tailored based on the firm's advanced understanding of your organization's industry.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
The proposal outlines the firm's processes for ensuring an efficient and effective audit process.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
The proposal showcases the firm's commitment to providing quality audit services by voluntarily adhering to higher standards of audit quality. This is evidenced by sharing their current unqualified peer review report resulting from the American Institute of CPAs external peer review process.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
The proposal indicates the firm is a dedicated member of one or more of the following firm-based voluntary membership quality centers for firms that perform audits: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• AICPA Center for Audit Quality</li> <li>• AICPA Private Companies Practice Center (PCPS)</li> <li>• AICPA Governmental Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPS Employee Benefit Plan Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPA PCPS Center for Plain English Accounting</li> </ul>	0-5	4	5	5	5	
<b>Team Knowledge and Experience</b>	<b>30 points max</b>	27	29	30	30	
The proposal highlights the firms commitment to professional training and staff continuity.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
The proposal outlines qualifications, industry experience, licenses and strengths for all partners.	0-5	4	5	5	5	
The proposal specifies the strengths of assigned team members as well as their years of prior experience in the particular industry and type of engagement.	0-5	3	4	5*	5	
The proposal identifies how the firm will comply with applicable industry reporting regulations, if applicable	0-5	5	5	5	5	



Proposal Criteria		Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
	The proposal provides the firm's background, client base, licensing information and years in business.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	If the firm does not have relevant experience in your particular industry, the proposal specifies that the firm has identified a firm with the applicable expertise/specialty to affiliate with to assist with this engagement and provides the affiliate firm's qualifications, background and experience.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
<b>Unique Qualifications</b>		<b>10 points max</b>	4	4	5	4	
	The proposal conveys a positive and confident feeling derived from the firm's business beliefs, communication practices and unique qualifications of which lays the foundation for a trusted relationship.	0-10	4	4 <del>5</del>	5	4	
<b>Value Added Services</b>		<b>10 points max</b>	9	9	10	9	
	The proposal provides a listing of additional value added services the firm provides beyond the audit engagement. (e.g. proactively monitor and communicate topics relevant to your financial and business operations all year long that may impact your future success)	0-5	4	4	5	4	
	It is evident that the firm understands our business and our challenges. The firm is committed to being our business advisor, beyond the audit engagement	0-5	5	5	5	5	
<b>Scope and Pricing of the Engagement</b>		<b>25 points max</b>	25	25	25	25	
	The proposal clearly provides a framework for the scope, timing, steps and resources to complete the engagement.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal specifies the price for the engagement and how it will be billed.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal specifies fees to be paid to specialists for the engagement (if any).	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal addresses all items requested by us whether verbally or in the RFP	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposed fee is reasonable based on the experience, unique value and knowledge the firm brings to the engagement.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
<b>Total Points</b>		<b>100</b>	89	92	96	93	
			94	97	100	98	

**Step 2: Based on the above grading, document your decision to award the engagement to the proposal with the highest points.**



# Evaluator No. 5



## Audit Proposal Evaluation Matrix

This tool can assist in evaluating the various proposals from CPA firms interested in performing your audit engagement. Keep in mind that low cost should not overshadow value and audit quality. This tool is customizable, so add or delete criteria based on your organization's unique needs.

### Step 1: Grade the various criteria outlined in the proposal. Assign points based on the range recommended.

Proposal Criteria		Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
<b>Approach to Audit Quality</b>		<b>25 points max</b>	24	23	24	23	
	The proposal outlines an audit approach that is tailored based on obtaining an understanding of the organization's activities, operating systems, personnel and special needs.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal indicates an audit approach that is tailored based on the firm's advanced understanding of your organization's industry.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal outlines the firm's processes for ensuring an efficient and effective audit process.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal showcases the firm's commitment to providing quality audit services by voluntarily adhering to higher standards of audit quality. This is evidenced by sharing their current unqualified peer review report resulting from the American Institute of CPAs external peer review process.	0-5	4	4	5	4	only audits B-H
	The proposal indicates the firm is a dedicated member of one or more of the following firm-based voluntary membership quality centers for firms that perform audits: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• AICPA Center for Audit Quality</li> <li>• AICPA Private Companies Practice Center (PCPS)</li> <li>• AICPA Governmental Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPS Employee Benefit Plan Audit Quality Center</li> <li>• AICPA/PCPS Center for Plain English Accounting</li> </ul>	0-5	5	4	4	4	
<b>Team Knowledge and Experience</b>		<b>30 points max</b>	30	30 (29)	30	30 (29)	
	The proposal highlights the firms commitment to professional training and staff continuity.	0-5	5	4	5	4	
	The proposal outlines qualifications, industry experience, licenses and strengths for all partners.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal specifies the strengths of assigned team members as well as their years of prior experience in the particular industry and type of engagement.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
	The proposal identifies how the firm will comply with applicable industry reporting regulations, if applicable	0-5	5	5	5	5	



Proposal Criteria	Points	Weaver	Whitley Penn	Belt Harris	Brooks Watson	Comments
The proposal provides the firm's background, client base, licensing information and years in business.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
If the firm does not have relevant experience in your particular industry, the proposal specifies that the firm has identified a firm with the applicable expertise/specialty to affiliate with to assist with this engagement and provides the affiliate firm's qualifications, background and experience.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
<b>Unique Qualifications</b>	<b>10 points max</b>	8	7	9	8	
The proposal conveys a positive and confident feeling derived from the firm's business beliefs, communication practices and unique qualifications of which lays the foundation for a trusted relationship.	0-10	8	7	9	8	
<b>Value Added Services</b>	<b>10 points max</b>	8	8	9	9	
The proposal provides a listing of additional value added services the firm provides beyond the audit engagement. (e.g. proactively monitor and communicate topics relevant to your financial and business operations all year long that may impact your future success)	0-5	3	4	4	4	
It is evident that the firm understands our business and our challenges. The firm is committed to being our business advisor, beyond the audit engagement	0-5	5	<del>4</del> 4	5	5	
<b>Scope and Pricing of the Engagement</b>	<b>25 points max</b>	24	23	24	24	
The proposal clearly provides a framework for the scope, timing, steps and resources to complete the engagement.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
The proposal specifies the price for the engagement and how it will be billed.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
The proposal specifies fees to be paid to specialists for the engagement (if any).	0-5	5	5	5	5	
The proposal addresses all items requested by us whether verbally or in the RFP	0-5	4	3	4	4	
The proposed fee is reasonable based on the experience, unique value and knowledge the firm brings to the engagement.	0-5	5	5	5	5	
<b>Total Points</b>	<b>100</b>	94 ✓	89 (90)	96 ✓	94 (93)	

**Step 2: Based on the above grading, document your decision to award the engagement to the proposal with the highest points.**