



TOWN OF ALPINE, WYOMING

Consultant Evaluation & Ranking Summary

SS4A Transportation Safety Action Plan &

Highway 89 Demonstration Project

Procurement Overview: The Town of Alpine issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) for professional consulting services to complete the Safe Streets and Roads for All (SS4A) Transportation Safety Action Plan and Highway 89 Demonstration Project.

Three responsive proposals were received:

- Kimley-Horn
- Avenue Consultants (with Cushing Terrell)
- Fehr & Peers (with Jorgensen Associates)

Evaluation Methodology: Proposals were evaluated using only the criteria and weighted point values published directly in the RFP. All firms were scored consistently and objectively under those established categories.

The evaluation categories were:

1. Project Understanding & Alignment (20 points)
2. Technical Approach & Methodology (25 points)
3. Experience & Qualifications of the Firm (15 points)
4. Experience & Qualifications of Key Personnel (15 points)
5. Public Engagement & Stakeholder Coordination (10 points)
6. Project Schedule & Ability to Meet Federal Milestones (10 points)
7. Cost Proposal (5 points)

Total possible score: 100 points.

Interview Process: After review of written proposals, all three firms were invited to participate in in-person interviews.

Interviews were conducted by:

- Mayor
- Town Clerk/Treasurer
- Assistant Clerk
- Public Works Director

Each consultant provided a formal presentation and responded to questions regarding:

- Technical methodology
- Federal compliance strategy
- Demonstration project implementation
- Schedule management
- WYDOT and FHWA coordination
- Team structure and continuity

Interviews served to clarify and confirm information presented in the written proposals. Final scoring remained based on the published RFP criteria.

Proposal Scoring Matrix:

Evaluation Category	Max Points	Fehr & Peers	Avenue	Kimley-Horn
Project Understanding & Alignment	20	18	19	19
Technical Approach & Methodology	25	21	22	24
Experience & Qualifications of Firm	15	13	13	15
Experience & Qualifications of Key Personnel	15	14	14	15
Public Engagement & Stakeholder Coordination	10	9	10	9
Project Schedule & Federal Milestones	10	9	9	10
Cost Proposal	5	5	5	5
TOTAL SCORE	100	89	92	97

Final Ranking:

1. **Kimley-Horn — 97 points**
2. **Avenue Consultants — 92 points**
3. **Fehr & Peers — 89 points**

All three firms were qualified and competitive. Differences in scoring were driven primarily by performance within the highest-weighted evaluation category.

Determining Evaluation Factor:

The category carrying the greatest weight in the RFP was:

Technical Approach & Methodology (25 points)

This category evaluates:

- Organization and feasibility of the proposed approach
- Demonstrated understanding of NEPA and FHWA coordination
- Data-driven safety analysis appropriate to a rural community
- Demonstration Project implementation strategy
- Alignment with required federal milestone deadlines

Kimley-Horn received the highest score in this category.

The firm's proposal demonstrated:

- A clearly structured methodology aligned with federal SS4A guidance
- A detailed schedule tied directly to required federal milestones
- Extensive experience delivering SS4A-compliant Safety Action Plans
- A defined process for Demonstration Project development and evaluation

Because Technical Approach & Methodology carries the highest point value under the RFP, performance in this category was the primary differentiator among proposals.

Summary of Comparative Strengths:

Avenue Consultants scored strongly due to:

- Demonstrated familiarity with Alpine through recent local planning efforts
- A robust community engagement strategy tailored to small rural communities
- Established working relationships with WYDOT

Fehr & Peers demonstrated:

- Regional safety planning experience
- Strong stakeholder coordination background
- Qualified personnel and relevant rural project experience

All firms were considered capable of performing the work. Final ranking reflects total points earned under the published RFP criteria.

Staff Recommendation:

Based on scoring using the evaluation criteria published in the RFP, Kimley-Horn received the highest total score.

Staff therefore recommends awarding the SS4A Transportation Safety Action Plan and Highway 89 Demonstration Project contract to Kimley-Horn.